



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
December 2, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2664 430 0924. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2664 430 0924
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

**KATE FAVETTI
President**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON
Vice President**

F.X. CROWLEY

VITUS LEUNG

JACQUELINE MINOR

**SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. **Effective January 1, 2025, public comment received by email or voicemail at least three hours prior to the start of a meeting will be provided to the members of the Civil Service Commission and will be included in the record on the Civil Service Commission website. These public comments will no longer be read aloud at meetings.** During commission meetings, members of the public may use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2664 430 0924.

CALL TO ORDER

2:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

John Dougherty – IBEW Local 6, requesting to reconsider an item heard at the last meeting. DHR stated that no labor union objected to the use of Rule of the List, that was not accurate. Osha Ashworth attended the meet and confer and expressed a problem with Rule of the List, and a preference for the Rule of 3 scores. The union does not advocate for a particular candidate, but the eligible list has a lot of meaning in the hiring and trade halls. The Rule of the List will not fit well with workers in the field. Using Rule of 3 demonstrates there are no political favors in hiring. (IBEW L6 submitted 4 documents for the record. One document shows the union rejected Rule of 7 exam proposal in 2022, a 2012 announcement uses Rule of 3, and SF Chronicle article from the newspaper in the year 1900 reports the use of Rule of 3.)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of November 4, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

Item #11 in Closed Session – Appeal by Cyra Koupal has been postponed to a future meeting.

Items severed from the Ratification Agenda: PSC #DHRPSC0004202 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT

0222-24-1 Report on the Status of De-Identification. (Item No. 5)

Speakers: Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
 Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources
 Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources
 William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency
 Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission

Public Comment: Jesse Stanton, SEIU 1021 and Human Services Agency Employee
 John Daugherty, IBEW L6

Action: Received report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer spoke about updating the Civil Service Adviser on Seniority to align with the rule change establishing seniority is by appointment date rather than certification date. Adviser will be presented at next commission meeting for review, also out of class assignment – combining the old and new advisers to address questions raised by equity leaders.

0219-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004669 v 0.01	Airport	\$6,000,000	The San Francisco International Airport ("Airport") is seeking support and maintenance for the existing Common Use Passenger Processing system that was originally installed in 2000 and later upgraded in 2007 and 2015. The Passenger Processing systems are specialized systems used solely by airports to allow airlines to share common airport resources used for passenger processing, such as passenger check-in, baggage processing, passenger boarding. The system consists of four tightly integrated core vendor-developed components: 1) virtualized Common Use application, 2) Self Service Kiosk application, 3) Resource Management application, and 4) Airport Operational Data Base. The services will also include supporting the Information Display Systems (IDS), which are used to display flight and baggage information.	New	45 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004785 v 0.01	City Administrator	\$300,000	Contractor will act as the central point of contact between the City and the various newspapers through which City advertisements are placed. In this role, Contractor will receive and coordinate the placement of Official Advertisements, Community Outreach Advertisements and Neighborhood Outreach Advertisements with various local newspapers selected by the Board of Supervisors annually through a competitive solicitation issued by the Office of Contract Administration. Duties include: 1) Ad Placement and Distribution: Contractor will coordinate the placement of advertisements, ensuring that ads reach the desired audience in the appropriate formats and locations. 2) Billing and Payment Processing: Contractor will facilitate payment transactions between City and the newspapers. 3) Compliance and Ad Quality Control: Contractor will ensure that ads comply with City regulations and platform-specific guidelines, preventing issues like fraudulent ads or inappropriate content from being displayed.	New	84 months
DHRPSC 0004383 v 0.01	Public Health	\$4,250,000	The Department of Public Health's (DPH) Cancer Navigation Program provides patient navigation/case management services and facilitates ongoing survivor support groups. Patient Navigation/Case Management will involve multilingual Navigator staff who will work onsite to support patients newly diagnosed with cancer. Survivor Support Groups will involve organizing, publicizing and facilitating support groups, and offering education and support to patients in a group setting.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0004792 v 0.01	Public Health	\$2,240,000	The selected contractor shall pick up Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH) resident's personal laundry and apply regulatory compliant Infection Prevention and Control practices to wash, dry, fold, seal, and return all laundry back to the residents. The contractor shall do so daily, while maintaining a 48-hour turnaround time. The work must adhere to Title 22 regulatory and Infection Prevention and Control requirements and compliance standards as outlined in the contract.	New	24 months
DHRPSC 0004147 v 0.01	Public Works	\$7,500,000	Perform as-needed environmental planning assessments and studies to support capital improvement projects. This includes negotiating with regulatory agencies, preparing comprehensive environmental impact reports, risk assessments, and planning documents. Services also encompass field surveys, utility location and specification gathering, and coordination with multiple regulatory bodies to ensure compliance with environmental regulations. The consultant must be capable of addressing various planning-related issues such as land use, zoning, biology, air quality, water quality, noise, historic resources, urban design, transportation, and environmental compliance monitoring. Additionally, the consultant will provide public outreach, professional consultations, and compliance monitoring to ensure adherence to mitigation measures and regulatory requirements.	New	80 months
DHRPSC 0004764 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$250,000	To provide federally mandated urine analysis for safety-sensitive employees with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA).	New	60 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004436 v 0.01	Port	\$660,000	The team that is awarded this contract shall provide the following services and deliverables: · Project Management – perform regular project management tasks including communications, budget tracking, and invoicing. · Monitoring of physical conditions of the gravel beach (visual assessments, photos, surveys). · Biological assessments and documentation of species on site, including but not limited to birds, marsh vegetation (especially the endangered species California Seablite), and oysters. Annual Monitoring Reports – compile data for each calendar year into a comprehensive technical report for Port review, to be submitted to the BRITT and other stakeholders. There is a specific schedule for monitoring and reporting that will be laid out in the solicitation documents and final contract.	New	99 months
DHRPSC 0002262 v 1.01	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$95,800,000 Increase Amount Requested \$24,200,000 New Total Amount Requested \$120,000,000	The contractor will provide refuse collection and disposal services (recyclables, compostables, and trash) for the City and County of San Francisco departments.	Amendment	Increase months 36 Total months 120
DHRPSC 0004801 v 1.01	Fire	Current Approved Amount \$99,000 Increase Amount Requested \$501,000 New Total Amount Requested \$600,000	Contractor shall provide fire code and administrative services for the Fire Department (FIR). Contractor shall manage the compliance reporting process for adopted fire codes and administration of fire and life safety system inspection reports as outlined in the National Fire Protection Association code for life safety systems on behalf of the FIR. Contractor shall manage the reporting of inspection reports annually. Contractor will be provided with a list of existing licensed ITMC (Inspection, Testing and Maintenance Contractor) currently used by the FIR and shall use search methods and search criteria utilization to identify new licensed ITMC. Contractor shall receive Inspection, Testing, and Maintenance reports with adherence to the current official California Code of Regulations, California Fire Codes, City of San Francisco Municipal Codes, and all other adopted local, state, and federal standards as may be applicable. Contractor shall verify Licensed ITMC contact information and license status. Contractor shall request, receive, process, record, and maintain inspection reports from licensed ITMC for fire and life safety system inspection types that include but are not limited to, the following: 1.4.1 Fire Alarm Systems; 1.4.2 Automatic Sprinkler Systems; Including but not limited to Dry Chemical Suppression Systems, Dry Pipe Sprinkler Systems, Pre-Action Systems, Deluge Sprinkler Systems, Special Suppression Systems 1.4.3 Commercial Hood/Duct Cleaning; 1.4.4 Commercial Hood Suppression System; 1.4.5 Standpipe System; 1.4.6 Active Smoke Control System	Amendment	Increase months 0 Total months 36

Note: *New Personal Services Contracts start date may not exceed eighteen (18) months after approval/commission meeting date.*

0219-24-8 Continued

November 18, 2024: Postponed to the meeting of December 2, 2024.

Speakers: Reanna Albert, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #DHRPSC0004792 v 0.01

- Action:**
1. Approved PSC # DHRPSC0004792 v 0.01 from the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 5 to 0)
 2. Adopted the report. Approved the requests for the remaining proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0223-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 8)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004231 v 0.01	City Administrator	\$6,700,000	This Citywide contract is for as-needed landscaping services at various locations throughout the City and County of San Francisco (CCSF) and other locations of City-owned property outside of the geographical City limits. Landscaping services include, but are not limited to, pruning of indigenous and/or invasive plant species and trees; weeding and clearing of invasive plant species and unwanted plant growth; planting indigenous plant species and other plants; mowing overgrown shrubbery; fertilizing plants and trees; applying pesticides as-needed to plants and trees; performing horticultural pest and disease control; performing minor industry-standard irrigation system inspections and maintenance repairs; and maintaining living roofs.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0004705 v 0.01	City Administrator	\$15,000,000	The contractor will provide a comprehensive structural Integrated Pest Management (IPM) program to be implemented Citywide at various City facilities in order to achieve long-term, cost-effective, and environmentally sound pest control. The IPM services will employ a mix of biological, mechanical/physical, educational, and least-toxic chemical strategies and tactics to control pests on City property. The contractor will utilize mechanical, physical, and chemical controls; monitor pest populations; keep records/logs of infestations; comply with the San Francisco IPM ordinance; and control mosquito and rat populations on City streets and in sewers.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0004184 v 0.01	Public Health	\$6,600,000	Community based agencies will provide Sugary Drinks Distributor Tax (SDDT) Community-Based Programs services. These services will be interventions that make Policy/Systems/Environmental (PSE) changes to prevent and mitigate diet-sensitive chronic diseases in priority populations. Services will include: a) Recruitment, training, and engagement of community members and leaders. b) Community members and leaders will conduct research and analysis of healthy eating/active living priorities that impact their communities. c) Community members and leaders will then develop and implement PSE change strategies to create lasting sustainable change. Priority Populations are Black/African Americans, Latinx, Native Hawaiians/Pacific Islanders, Native Americans/American Indians, and Asians/Asian Americans.	New	48 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004690 v 0.01	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$500,000	<p>The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) wishes to solicit formal proposals from interested and qualified proposers for a Video Computer Analytics System for Rail Passenger Vehicles (also called Rail Video-Based Safety System). The goal of the Rail Video-Based Safety System is to enhance overall safety on the SFMTA's Light Rail Vehicle (LRV) fleet. SFMTA is open to consider either a Software-as-a-Service (SaaS) or On-Premise solution. The scope includes the implementation of video technology on SFMTA's Light Rail Vehicles (LRV) to stream audio and video to allow SFMTA to respond to safety situations in the operation of the vehicle.</p> <p>SFMTA's internal stakeholders for this process include Transit, System Safety, Maintenance, and Technology Services & Integration teams.</p> <p>Contractor shall provide all hardware, software, licenses, implementation, post go-live support and training on its Video Computer Analytics System for SFMTA's existing and future Siemens LRV4 passenger vehicle fleet. SFMTA anticipates that all vehicles will be delivered by December 2025, which is subject to change. Contractor shall be responsible for installation on all 219 vehicles (LRVs).</p> <p>For each LRV4 vehicle, Contractor shall provide connection to the power source, perform installation and configuration of wires/cables (power/network cables), installation of brackets, provisioning of the hardware (such as DVR and Cameras). In addition, Contractor shall be responsible for the proposed approach for installation, schematic drawings of the wire/cable runs, troubleshooting guides for hardware and successful continuity test results of the power wire/cables.</p> <p>SFMTA reserves the right to provide oversight for any installation work performed by Contractor. SFMTA shall determine if design provided by the Contractor is accurate, approve method for installation and repeatability of process, provide oversight/Quality Assurance (QA) of implementation phases, approve success of during all phases of implementation and ensure all mounting/calibrations/wirings are accurate before the LRV4s are released for operation. SFMTA also reserves the right to perform the installation work on vehicles (LRV4s) that are no longer under Siemens' warranty.</p> <p>All installed Hardware and associated Software shall have a minimum of 5-year Warranty from the successful completion of the User Acceptance Test (UAT). During the Warranty period, Contractor shall be responsible for maintaining and upkeeping of all Hardware and Software without any additional cost to the Agency.</p>	New	24 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004683 v 0.01	Mayor's Office	\$9,800,000	<p>Midtown Park Apartments ("Midtown") is a 140-unit multifamily rental housing development in Western Addition owned by the City and County of San Francisco. Midtown was built in 1962 and contains 140 units in six (6) buildings. In 2014 or thereafter, one (1) unit was turned into a property management office and community room, which changed the residential units from 140 residential units to 139 residential units. There are laundry rooms in two buildings. Of the 139 units (140 units excluding the property management office and community room), 105-units are currently occupied. Since Midtown's initial construction, no major renovation has occurred, and major systems are failing. Some key health and safety items are in violation of the current code. Because of lack of adequate fire safety, buildings are becoming difficult to insure. Failure of one system could be catastrophic with death, injury and/or large displacement. Extremely low rents of existing tenants cause an annual operations gap, and this operations gap is filled by Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development ("MOHCD").</p> <p>Over the next five years, the Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development or its property management agent, would like to repair or replace failing systems. Depending on available funds, Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development or its property management agent and the property management's vendors would repair or replace failing systems over five years. All six (6) building will undergo repairs or replacement the following systems:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fire Alarm • Fire Sprinklers • Heaters/Hot Water • Structural upgrades • Roof • Windows • Balcony • Paint of exterior and interior units <p>In addition to the above and if Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development has funds, a proposal to add a laundry room at one building and another between 2 buildings could occur. The City and County of San Francisco working through the Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development has three goals it hopes to achieve with the repair and replacement plan for Midtown. The goals are (1) bring Midtown to code and mitigate risk from health and safety issues; (2) rent vacant units after repairs at or near market rates to eliminate ongoing City and County of San Francisco operating subsidy through the Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development to Midtown, and (3) discourage, through lease enforcement, new tenants from installing and using in-unit washers and dryers.</p> <p>Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development is requesting that any and all repair work be done by the property management company that the Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development - MOHCD previously received Civil Service Commission ("CSC") approval in April 2021 (PSC Number 49538-20/21) for a property management contract, or the property management company's vendors and/or consultants, if needed. All proposed work is work that a property management agent could perform and has experience working with occupied residential tenants. Also, the ability to complete these repairs and other necessary repairs is critical to operate and maintain Midtown in manner consistent with state property management laws and reduce the City and County of San Francisco liability. The property management company Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development - MOHCD selected and working with the Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development - MOHCD must have the ability to coordinate the appropriate vendors and consultants to assist with all necessary and required work that cannot be performed by the property managers maintenance staff, and all necessary and required work must be completed in a timely manner.</p>	New	60 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004355 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$2,000,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission operates a no-cost resource center for Local Business Enterprises interested in or currently working on San Francisco Public Utilities Commission contracts. The Contractors Assistance Center supports the agency- and city-wide goals of providing support services to small businesses in San Francisco to assist them in accessing, competing, and performing on contracts, thereby serving the public interest of fostering economic growth and independence for San Francisco and its taxpayers. The contractor will assist Local Business Enterprises who utilize the support services of the Contractors Assistance Center, with reviewing and improving or creating a communications strategy for their business, development of the company's website, promotional materials and other marketing support, in order to increase the participation and success of Local Business Enterprises on San Francisco Public Utilities Commission projects.	New	60 months
DHRPSC 0004636 v 0.01	Public Utilities Commission	\$600,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) seeks to retain the services of three qualified Service Providers to increase the participation of small and micro construction, construction management, and related-professional services firms for the advancement SFPUC projects including the Hetch Hetchy Water Capital Plan, Water Capital Plan, which includes the Regional Water System (East Bay) and (Peninsula/West Bay) projects. Established under San Francisco Administrative Code Chapter 14B, Section B (5), the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission – Local Business Enterprise (PUC-LBE) Certification Program provides opportunities to small regional construction firms, to work on SFPUC projects within the water service territory and outside of the jurisdictional boundaries for San Francisco stretching from Daly City to Hetch Hetchy. Service Providers would perform as-needed research about small and micro construction firms, and qualified disadvantaged business enterprises to engage and expand the pool of qualified contractors for SFPUC construction projects. Service Providers will also perform as-needed administrative support in service of the small business outreach and networking events to increase the engagement and interest among the pool of qualified contractors who seek to compete for and bid on San Francisco Public Utility Commission projects.	New	48 months
DHRPSC 0004714 v 0.01	Status of Women	\$2,500,000	The selected vendor will be responsible for providing comprehensive event planning and production services for events hosted by the Department on the Status of Women, including but not limited to the Department's annual one-day policy summit. The scope of services includes all logistical and operational tasks to ensure a smooth event from planning through post-event wrap-up. The vendor will work with Department representatives to develop an event plan, timeline, and budget, which will include managing costs for key items such as the venue, catering, and equipment. The vendor will handle logistical tasks such as identifying and securing a venue, coordinating contracts, and organizing room setup, seating, event flow, and guest services. They will ensure audio-visual equipment is available and properly set up and will handle stage setup and room design. They will also coordinate live streaming if necessary. Additionally, the vendor will assist with distributing event invitations, producing basic printed materials like programs and signage, and managing on-site registration and guest check-in. Catering services will be coordinated to provide meals and refreshments, including options for various dietary needs. For VIPs and speakers, the vendor will provide support for transportation and accommodation logistics, if necessary, as well as program and speaking details and logistics. After the event, the vendor will manage event breakdown, ensuring that rented equipment is returned and the venue is cleaned. They will also provide a brief post-event summary, covering attendance and basic feedback. All logistical and operational tasks will be managed to ensure a well-organized and successful summit.	New	36 months

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
DHRPSC 0004583 v 1.01	Juvenile Probation	Current Approved Amount \$900,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,800,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,700,000	The department seeks Intensive Services Foster Care (ISFC) placements, licensed by the California Department of Social Services, and associated comprehensive case management and services, for youth ordered to out of home placement, both pre- and post-adjudication, by the San Francisco Juvenile Court With a contract in place, clients will receive adequate and timely programming and services.	Amendment	Increase months 21 Total months 59

Note: New Personal Services Contracts start date may not exceed eighteen (18) months after approval/commission meeting date.

Speakers: None.

Action: Adopted the report. Approved the requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public Comment on all matters pertaining to Item 11, including public comment on whether to hold Item 11 in closed session. (Item No. 9)

None.

Vote on whether to hold Item 11 in closed session. (Item No. 10)

There was no closed session.

0198-24-6 Appeal by Cyra Koupal of the Human Resources Director’s determination to administratively close Koupal’s complaint of harassment, discrimination, and retaliation. (Item No. 11)

Speakers: None.

Action: Postponed to a future meeting at the request of the Department of Public Health (Vote of 5 to 0)

Reconvene in Open Session. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions on Item 11 in closed session (S.F. Admin. Code §67.12 (a)). (Item No. 12)

Action: No action taken.

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 13)

Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson – requested to agendaize potential rules changes related to de-identification and whether there continues to be a need for ongoing DHR annual reporting at a future meeting.

Commissioner Kate Favetti – requested a staff report on Rule of the List based on IBEW's Local 6 request to reconsider. DHR can advise on bargaining history in closed session, if required.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 14)

3:26 p.m.