

# WORKFORCE INVESTMENT SAN FRANCISCO

Local Workforce Investment Board for the City and County of San Francisco

Draft Minutes of The

September 11, 2024

Meeting of the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) War Memorial

Veterans Building, Green Room, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor

San Francisco, CA 94102

## WISF

### Members Present

Jeanine Cotter, Chair, Luminalt Solar  
Anupama Shekhar, Microsoft  
Angela Tamayo, SEIU-UHW  
Bruce Callander, HUB International  
Charley Lavery, Operating Engineers Local 3  
Christina Sellami, Marriott International  
Iowayna Peña, San Francisco Giants  
Jorge Tapia, EDD  
John Halpin, City College of San Francisco  
Kim Tavaglione, SF Labor Council  
Laurie Thomas, Golden Gate Restaurant Association  
Lori Dunn-Guion, Swinerton

Madison Tam for Matt Dorsey, San Francisco Board of Supervisors  
Michon Coleman, Hospital Council of Northern & Central California  
Tony Delorio, Local Union No. 665  
Alex Hwu for Lynn Mahoney, SFSU  
Shamann Walton, San Francisco Board of Supervisors  
Shanell Williams, UCSF California Preterm Birth Initiative

## WISF

### Members Absent

Alex Wong, Kaiser Permanente  
John Doherty, IBEW Local 6  
Meaghan Mitchell, San Francisco Standard

Sam Rodriguez, Vice-Chair, Rodriguez Strategic Partners, LLC  
Ramon Hernandez, Laborers Local 261  
Vikrum Aiyer, Heirloom

## Ohlone Land Acknowledgement, Announcements & Housekeeping

*(Discussion Item)*

Jeanine Cotter, WISF Chair, introduced herself and called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.  
Secretary Iris Rollins (OEWD) opened the meeting by reciting the Ohlone Land Acknowledgement.

## Roll Call *(Discussion Item)*

Secretary Rollins conducted roll call. Quorum was present.

## Chair's Welcome *(Discussion Item)*

Chair Cotter thanked WISF members and the general public for attending the hybrid WISF meeting at the War Memorial Green Room and remotely on Zoom.

Chair Cotter recognized the service of outgoing Workforce Investment Board members Jonathan Kurup, June So, and Doug Whitney, and welcomed new members Colin Chinery, Ben Tran, and Laura Van.

Chair Cotter provided a summary of the recent California's Workforce Associations Meeting of the Minds 2024 conference, where she was joined by Member Sam Rodriguez and several OEWD staff.

She shared her presentation on Apprenticeships for California’s Clean Energy Workforce, emphasizing the importance of expanding apprenticeship opportunities in this sector.

Additional highlights included presentations by TechSF Manager Orrian Willis, who discussed partnerships in apprenticeship programs, and Jen Hand and Miriam Palma-Trujillo, who led a session on San Francisco Workforce System Alignment.

The conference featured a special track for Workforce Development Board members, which focused on strategic planning and building community-centered programs. Chair Cotter expressed enthusiasm for bringing back key takeaways to WISF, noting the sessions were both inspiring and informative. She concluded by recognizing Workforce Development Month and emphasizing the importance of the Board's work in the community.

**Approval of Minutes from June 5, 2024, Meeting** *(Action Item)*

Chair Cotter invited comments on the minutes from the June 5, 2024 meeting. With no comments or questions, Chair Cotter requested a motion to approve the minutes. Member Tavaglione moved to approve, seconded by Member Delorio. Member Williams abstained, and the motion was passed unanimously.

**Adoption of the Agenda** *(Action Item)*

Chair Cotter called for a motion to adopt the agenda for the September 11, 2024 meeting. Member Tavaglione made the motion which was seconded by Member Callander and passed unanimously.

**Executive Director’s Report** *(Discussion Item)*

Chair Cotter noted that there would not be an Executive Director's report, and an economic development update would be provided at the next meeting in December.

**Workforce Director’s Report** *(Discussion Item)*

Chair Cotter called the Workforce Director’s Report and asked Ken Nim, Director of CityBuild and Interim Director of Workforce Development at Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD), to provide remarks.

Director Nim summarized updated labor market data from the California EDD. The unemployment rate for San Francisco has fluctuated between 3% and 4% over the past year, with a July 2024 rate of 3.9%.

Director Nim reviewed changes in employment by industry, noting that Trade, Transportation, & Utilities sector had been hit hardest during the pandemic, while sectors such as Information, Government, and Private Education and Health Services have experienced growth. From April to June 2024, there has been a net increase of 8,000 jobs across various industries, with the exception of Education and Health Services, which saw slight declines.

**Mega Job Fair**

Director Nim highlighted the success of a recent Mega Job Fair held at 49 South Van Ness, which attracted over 500 participants. The event, organized in collaboration with local partners such as Goodwill, MEDA, Success Centers, and YCD, saw strong employer engagement, with SFO and Teamsters among those actively recruiting.

**Opportunities for All Program**

Director Nim provided an update on the Opportunities for All program, noting that summer internships for students from alternative high schools had begun, and several employers had already hired interns. He emphasized the importance of ongoing engagement with participants throughout the school year and beyond.

**CityBuild Academy**

Director Nim shared news on CityBuild's Cycle 41, which started with 45 students, maintaining a 20% female participation rate. He highlighted the support from labor partners and contractors and announced that the graduation would take place in October.

#### **WorkCon 2024 - California Workforce Association**

Director Nim highlighted Orrian Willis, OEWD's TechSF Manager, who represented OEWD at the California Workforce Association's WorkCon Conference in Palm Springs. The event, attended by members of the U.S. Department of Labor's Apprenticeship Advisory Committee, focused on bridging gaps between programs and improving outcomes to ensure effective community service.

#### **Meeting of the Minds 2024 - California Workforce Association**

Director Nim recognized Chair Cotter, who presented on renewable energy and workforce development at the Meeting of the Minds 2024 conference. Other WISF board members, including Vice Chair Rodriguez, along with OEWD staff, Jen Hand and Miriam Palma-Trujillo, also contributed by presenting on workforce system alignment.

Additionally, Richard Lawrence from the Interstate Renewable Energy Council presented on apprenticeship opportunities for California's clean energy workforce. Director Nim also noted the increasing focus on artificial intelligence's impact on workforce development, as discussed during the conference, and strategies to adapt to these changes.

Chair Cotter called for questions and comments.

Member Tavaglione inquired about the lower unemployment figures in sectors such as leisure and hospitality. Director Nim explained that San Francisco's slow downtown recovery, coupled with the shift to remote work in the tech sector, has impacted local businesses and construction. While there has been some improvement in retail and hospitality, tech layoffs remain a significant factor. Director Nim also noted an increase in job applications for City and County of San Francisco positions, with more details to be shared at the December meeting.

Member Tavaglione inquired about tracking the residency of job seekers at the recent job fair and whether many were from San Francisco or other Bay Area counties. Director Houston confirmed that 79% of attendees at the recent job fair were from San Francisco, with the remaining 21% coming from surrounding Bay Area counties as OEWD continues to serve those displaced from the City who seek to return.

Member Tavaglione further asked about the consistent 3% unemployment rate and whether a skills mismatch exists between job seekers and available jobs. Director Houston responded that OEWD is exploring this question as part of its procurement planning process. The Department is conducting stakeholder and community engagement to identify skills gaps and determine whether the City's current programming addresses emerging industries. Director Houston mentioned that employers and stakeholders would be invited to participate in this engagement over the next six months to help guide future procurement decisions.

Member Tapia commented that while San Francisco unemployment rate typically ranks between the second and third lowest in California, there is still room for improvement. Member Tapia inquired how many job seekers from the recent job fair were offered jobs or follow-up interviews.

Director Houston responded that the data is still being tracked and a detailed report would be provided at the next WISF meeting, as the process from first interview to job offer can take several months. Director Floyd-Rodriguez added that OEWD is working closely with partners to follow up with employers and track retention rates. Director Nim further emphasized that data is gathered on a quarterly basis and supports improvements to employer outreach to increase job placement rates. Member Shekhar inquired about how awareness is created, and job seekers are recruited for job

fairs. Director Houston explained that they rely on a network of over 80 community-based organizations, as well as job centers across the City, to spread the word. OEWD also utilizes email blasts, social media channels, and a dedicated community engagement team to reach potential job seekers, meeting them where they are, including at non-job fair events. Director Floyd-Rodriguez highlighted that for the recent job fair, approximately 100 out of 600 attendees were already connected to OEWD services and had secured early appointments, while the rest were recruited through the aforementioned channels.

Member Tapia asked about the priority of services for veterans at the job fair, specifically if veterans were given early access to employers. Director Floyd-Rodriguez and Houston explained that the job center network which organized the event follows priority of service for veterans, and veterans are included in the priority appointment slots. Additionally, organizations like Swords to Plowshares, which focus on veteran services, are given the opportunity to register veterans for early access before the broader event is opened to the general public.

Seeing no other comments, Chair Cotter closed this agenda item.

**Labor Spotlight**  
*(Discussion Item)*

Chair Cotter introduced Agenda Item #8, the labor spotlight in honor of Workforce Development Month, welcoming Meg-Ann Pryor from the Operating Engineers Local 3.

Ms. Pryor, currently the Apprenticeship Coordinator at Local 3, shared her personal journey, starting as a graduate of CityBuild Cycle 15. She recounted how CityBuild prepared her for the physical demands of construction work and aided in successfully completing an intensive asbestos training. Ms. Pryor reflected on her time as an apprentice with the Operating Engineers, earning recognition as both Apprentice of the Year and Volunteer of the Year. She highlighted her active involvement in her union and her achievement of becoming the first African American Apprenticeship Coordinator at Local 3.

Ms. Pryor expressed her gratitude for CityBuild and Operating Engineers, stating her commitment to giving back and supporting the programs that helped her succeed.

Chair Cotter opened the floor for questions and comments.

Member Tavaglione inquired about Ms. Pryor's experience as a woman of color on construction sites. Ms. Pryor shared that while it was challenging, being the only woman and minority on many job sites, she found strong support from her union, which empowered her to stand up for herself. She also discussed her role with "Sistas with Tools," where she helps recruit women into the trades, offering guidance on staying engaged with the union and seeking support when needed.

Member Lavery inquired about current resources for women in the trades and what additional support could be beneficial in sectors traditionally dominated by men.

Ms. Pryor highlighted several key resources, including pre-apprenticeship programs like CityBuild, YCD, and Success Centers, which offer guidance and ongoing support for women entering the trades. She also mentioned Sistas with Tools, an organization focused on recruiting women into the trades, and her personal outreach efforts to connect women with unions and apprenticeship opportunities. Ms. Pryor emphasized that once individuals are enrolled in a pre-apprenticeship program, they continue to receive support throughout their career journey. Additionally, she noted that there are online platforms that provide information on how to join different union trades, as well as direct support available through union halls.

Director Nim highlighted CityBuild's national recognition, crediting graduates like Ms. Pryor and labor partners like Operating Engineers for mentoring and teaching essential skills to students. Member Lavery praised Ms. Pryor's efforts in reaching underserved communities and providing opportunities

for stable, well-paying careers in the trades. Additionally, Director Nim acknowledged City College and Swinerton for their long-standing partnership with CityBuild.

Chair Cotter thanked Ms. Pryor for her work and emphasized the importance of visible representation in attracting diverse talent to the trades.

Seeing no other comments, Chair Cotter closed this agenda item.

**OEWD Budget  
Update**  
*(Discussion Item)*

Chair Cotter welcomed Director of Workforce Strategy, Chad Houston, to provide an update on the Office of Economic and Workforce Development Budget.

Director Houston provided a high-level update on the Workforce Development Department's budget. San Francisco's total budget for FY 2024-2025 is \$15.9 billion, with \$6.9 billion coming from the City's general fund. The overall budget for the Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) is approximately \$140 million, covering both workforce and economic development initiatives.

Director Houston noted that last fiscal year's Workforce Development budget was \$52.3 million, which has been reduced to \$46.1 million for the current fiscal year, reflecting a City-wide 10% budget reduction mandate. Of the current budget, approximately 10% is comprised of Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) federal funds, totaling \$4.7 million, allocated across WIOA youth, adult, and dislocated worker programs. Director Houston emphasized the flexibility provided by the City's general fund, which supplements federal funds and allows for more diverse programming.

Chair Cotter opened the item for Board questions.

Chair Cotter inquired if the WIOA funding was separate from other funds to which Director Houston clarified that the budget was inclusive of WIOA funding.

Member Hwu asked how the department plans to manage the 10% budget reduction this year and next without sacrificing services to the community.

Director Houston explained that the Department first reviews the performance of programs from the past year, focusing on whether they meet participant needs and lead to jobs or other outcomes. Programs not meeting outcomes are assessed mid-year, with adjustments made accordingly. Additionally, during the next fiscal year and procurement cycle, the Department will re-evaluate community engagement and program alignment to ensure that offerings match community needs and skills development goals.

Chair Cotter asked for clarification on the projected 25% budget reduction for FY 2025-2026 and whether this is part of the regular two-year budget cycle or based on projections.

Director Houston explained that the reduction reflects a potential scenario for FY 2025-2026, subject to revision based on the mid-year assessment. He noted that the final course of action regarding further reductions or adjustments will be clearer by the end of the year.

When asked about the budget process, Director Houston outlined that the department submits a budget following instructions from the Mayor's Office, which is then reviewed by the Board of Supervisors for approval. The finalized budget is ultimately signed off by the Mayor.

Chair Cotter asked how OEWD's budget reductions compared to other City departments. Director Houston explained that the 10% reduction for the current fiscal year, along with the 10% contingency for the following year, was consistent with cuts experienced by other departments.

Chair Cotter then inquired how Board members could assist in advocating for workforce development ahead of the next budget cycle.

Director Houston emphasized the critical role of Board engagement, particularly in the RFP process. He encouraged Board members to participate in the community engagement phase to provide insights from employers, labor organizations, and regional stakeholders. This feedback would help ensure workforce development programs align with future employer needs and address key skills gaps, positioning the Department to better serve the community.

Member Shekhar inquired whether OEWD tracks supplemental funding, or co-investment, that community-based organizations (CBOs) receive from industries or other organizations in addition to the funding provided by OEWD for workforce development programs.

Director Houston confirmed that OEWD does track co-investments through the Workforce Alignment Committee, led by Jen Hand and Miriam Palma-Trujillo. This committee monitors workforce development investments across San Francisco, which total approximately \$180 million, compared to OEWD's \$46 million budget. The Committee comprises 11 City departments, two labor organizations, and four CBOs. An annual inventory is collected to track both workforce programs and their outcomes across 24 City departments. Additionally, during the RFP process, CBOs are required to disclose any leveraged funding they receive.

Seeing no further questions, Chair Cotter closed this agenda item.

**Public Comment on  
Non-Agenda Items**  
*(Discussion Item)*

Chair Cotter opened the meeting for public comment on non-agenda items. Secretary Rollins provided instruction for public comment and shared that those in a virtual space could provide public comment in the chat.

Member Tavaglione announced the completion of the San Francisco sub-regional table of the California Jobs First Initiative, thanking Chad Houston and Jen Hand from OEWD for their support. The Bay Area Catalyst funds are now available through an open procurement for \$9 million., The San Francisco sub-regional table priorities include paid learning, training, and childcare for working families. Anyone interested in partnering on these initiatives is encouraged to contact Member Kim Tavaglione at the Labor Council.

Secretary Rollins thanked the A/V crew at the War Memorial, Corbett and Jamal, for their excellent setup.

Seeing no other in-person or virtual comments, Chair Cotter closed this agenda item.

**Adjournment**  
*(Action Item)*

Chair Cotter directed members' attention to the City Attorney memo regarding upcoming Prop D ethics rule changes, effective October 12, 2024. Key updates include that WISF board members cannot directly receive or sit on boards of organizations receiving funds from any OEWD divisions, along with important revisions to gift rules. Members with follow-up questions were encouraged to reach out to Jen Hand or Chad Houston for further clarification.

Chair Cotter thanked the members for attending and reminded the Board that the next meeting will take place on Wednesday, December 11, 2024.

Chair Cotter called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Member Tavaglione made the motion to adjourn which was seconded by Member Hwu and was unanimous. The meeting adjourned at 10:03 a.m.