



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
July 15, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2660 851 8373. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2660 851 8373  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**KATE FAVETTI  
President**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON  
Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**VITUS LEUNG**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meetings use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2660 851 8373.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Kate Favetti	Present
Vice President Elizabeth Salveson	Excused Absence
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor	Present

President Kate Favetti presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA ((Item No. 2)**

Sienna Dunn, Devon Anderson, and Erica Wright, TWU Local 200 expressed concerns they have with some classifications at the SFMTA not following the Civil Service process when it comes to status rights and the allocation of new positions within classification as required by CSC Rule 409.

Ellen Lee Zhou, feels being terminated for not being vaccinated is unfair.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of July 1, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Item #8 PSC #48746-20/21 from the Airport has been postponed to the meeting of August 5, 2024, at the request of the department.

Item #10 PSC #47099-20/21 from the Municipal Transportation Agency has been postponed to the meeting of October 7, 2024, at the request of the department.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director updated the Commission on the Senate Bill 553 which requires California employers to have a workplace violence prevention plan in place by July 1, 2024. All departments have complied, and a training component has been loaded into eLearning that everyone is required to take. It is approximately a twenty (20) minute video that provides training content in the event the unthinkable happens. The City is taking this requirement seriously and is on track to complete this initial requirement. Director Isen will report back on whether the training will be required annually and if it will be incorporated into the annual policy maker training requirement.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, thanked Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, for managing in her absence, leading the PSC database discussions on behalf of the department, managing the summer interns, and conducting the hiring process for the 1241 while she’s been on vacation. She also reported that the Merit System Audit and the year end report will be presented at the August 19, 2024 meeting.

**0134-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
44999-23/24	City Administrator	\$1,300,000	Contractor will sell City-owned surplus assets such as fleet vehicles, buses, rail vehicles, heavy equipment, forklifts, excavators, compressors, and other light to heavy equipment. Public auctions will be conducted onsite at a contractor-owned facility.	Regular	09 /30/2029
41477-23/24	Fire Department	\$3,000,000	Contractor provides clinical quality assurance services for Fire Department’s Emergency Medical Services (EMS) Division and the Department of Emergency Management’s (DEM) Dispatch Division. The Department currently has a contract with The Regents of the University of California, on behalf of the San Francisco General Hospital Clinical Practice Group for Emergency Medicine Services, to provide these services. This contract expires in December 2024.	Regular	12/31/2029
43877-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$5,000,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) intends to award an approximately \$40 million (\$5 million design and \$35 million construction) Progressive Design Build (PDB) agreement to support SFPUC civil and electrical engineering staff with specialized security design services to upgrade physical security across SFPUC’s wastewater facilities. Locations include Southeast and Oceanside wastewater treatment plants, Northpoint wet-weather facility, and other facilities adjacent to these three major facilities. The \$5,000,000 design portion of the D-B procurement will complete the detailed design utilizing the planning documents (~10% design level) to be provided in the Request for Proposal. The duration of the design portion is approximately 1.5 years, and the duration of engineering supporting during construction is approximately 2 years.	Regular	05/31/2029
45475-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$5,000,000	The work is for the planning, designing, and implementation of complex relocations of San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) staff, equipment, inventory, fleet vehicles, and archival materials from outdated corporation yards, comprised of administration facilities, industrial shops, warehouse, life sciences laboratories, libraries, to newly constructed corporation yards in San Francisco and San Mateo Counties. The complex relocations shall be executed without disruption to the agency’s 24/7 water supply and delivery operations and emergency response responsibilities. The planning, design, and execution of the work shall include development of relocation strategies and plans; communication materials for managers and staff; inventory and condition assessments of existing furniture, fixtures, and equipment; assistance with development of requests for proposals for specialty vendors (e.g. move companies, IT disconnect/connect, Records Management vendor, decommissioning of vacated facilities); developing Move-Day schedules; managing and supervising all Move-Day activities; on-site supervision of all vendors performing specialty services; and set-up and management of Post-Move Day support services (e.g Welcome Center, Move-In Support). For each relocation, the planning and design work is estimated to require 18 to 24 months, and the execution of the relocation work on Move-Day is estimated to require 72 to 48 hours.	Regular	01/05/2030  <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
48145-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,600,000	Maintenance and testing of existing switchgear and switchboard assemblies, including disconnect switches within the assemblies, at various East Bay and West Bay Water Supply and Treatment Facilities. This contract is for maintenance and testing of sixteen (16) switchgear, twenty-two (22) switchboards, seventeen (17) transformers, and the maintenance, inspection. In addition, testing of the two transformers, circuit switchers, protective relays, neutral grounding resistors, and battery system at the 60kV Crystal Springs Substation.	Regular	05/31/2029
45106-23/24	Public Works	\$719,325.55	A portion of the kitchen flooring needs to be replaced while relocating kitchen production to other areas of the kitchen, tray assembly to the cafeteria below and staff food service to the Simon Theater. This proposal is for full design services, including Schematic Design, Design Development, Construction Documents, Entitlement and Construction phases, to replace a designated area of flooring in the kitchen. Consultants engaged to support the scope of work include: Structural; Electrical; Mechanical, Plumbing, and Fire Protection; Waterproofing; Food Service; Cost Estimating; & Specifications.	Regular	02/22/2026
47885-23/24	Public Health	\$4,200,000	Contractor will provide a safe sleeping drop-in site and bed facility in San Francisco's Mission district to accommodate individuals experiencing homelessness and substance use disorders. The contractor will offer hospitality services to its visitors. Overdose Prevention Training will also be provided and will cover identifying a potential overdose, response to overdose, naloxone administration, and connection to care services. Linkage to various services will be offered, including substance use treatment, withdrawal management, residential management, residential treatment, and medications for Opioid Use Disorder. Contractor will provide to the Department of Public Health (DPH) de-identified visitor data and client satisfaction survey results.	Regular	06/30/2026
49509-23/24	Public Health	\$3,000,000	Contractor(s) will provide Transitional Age Youth (TAY) System of Care (SOC) workforce development and capacity building services aimed at enhancing leadership and wellness opportunities for TAY ages 16-24+ in San Francisco, as well as enhancing the capacity of TAY-serving providers and the quality improvement efforts of the TAY SOC, through three programs: 1. The TAY Leaders in Behavioral Health Certificate Program will train and prepare TAY to serve as TAY Peers, providing the basic skills and knowledge for entry-level employment in the behavioral health field and serving as a pipeline into the TAY Leaders in Behavioral Health Employment Program. Training will include educational courses and knowledge of continuum of behavioral health issues, services, and resources, as well as development of skill sets in outreach and engagement, systems navigation, and peer counseling. The program will also provide information about related courses of study at colleges and universities. 2. The TAY Leaders in Behavioral Health Employment Program will take graduates of the TAY Leaders in Behavioral Health Certificate Program and provide internship opportunities as TAY Peers. Focus will be on developing and practicing skills in outreach and engagement, systems navigation, and peer counseling. Training will enable TAY Peers to provide culturally and developmentally responsive service linkages to TAY consumers, including but not limited to: transportation, mentoring, tutoring, career counseling, housing, childcare, primary health care, mental health care, substance misuse care, career counseling, and other needed services in collaboration with the TAY SOC network. 3. The TAY System of Care Network Development and Capacity Building program will support the TAY SOC, its workforce and the TAY SOC quality improvement infrastructure by providing racially and culturally informed foundational trainings and resources for all TAY SOC network members and clinical providers, and support quality improvement planning and activities to inform and shape the development of the TAY workforce and SOC.	Regular	06/30/2029

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49838-23/24	Public Health	\$20,000,000	Contract services are for labor, materials, and equipment necessary to package and remove hazardous waste (including medical waste), including some services that will be on an intermittent and as-needed basis from City work sites and transport these wastes to permitted disposal facilities. The contracts also include management and treatment of hazardous wastes at the disposal facilities and lab analysis, materials testing and specialized environmental services to assess the project site.	Regular	06/30/2029
44370-23/24	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$351,000,000	<p>The Train Control Upgrade Project (TCUP) is a capital project that will procure a new Communications Based Train Control (CBTC) system to replace the aging train control signal system currently installed in the Market Street Subway and expand CBTC to the surface. It will provide operations and service planning staff with the tools necessary to deliver reliable, speedy, high-frequency rail transit to, from, and within downtown San Francisco. When installed, the new CBTC system will cover the entire Muni Metro railway. This system will also require long-term support from the supplier in order to meet SFMTA's requirements and ensure safety, reliability, availability, and maintainability at all times.</p> <p>The CBTC system needs to be designed and engineered to meet SFMTA's requirements and ensure safety, reliability, availability, and maintainability. After preliminary design, train control components will be installed along the Muni Metro trackway and fitted to the LRV4 light rail vehicles in a geographically phased approach. Each phase will feature detailed design and construction, with project completion expected in FY35.</p> <p>This contract includes design and engineering services necessary to develop a CBTC system, new and refurbished parts, and support for the new CBTC system following its final acceptance. The services must be provided by a CBTC system supplier, as a supplier understands the design of their own proprietary system, including access to proprietary design documents and software code. The scope of the proposed personnel services contract includes this design and engineering, refurbishment of defective/worn/damaged parts, software updates, obsolescence management, and spare part management.</p> <p>City employees currently maintain the existing train control system. The SFMTA has a support agreement with our current supplier which covers roughly the same scope of work as will be in the new contract. This contract will continue the status quo where city employees maintain the train control system but are able to use the provisions of this contract to obtain parts and technical support they need from the manufacturer.</p>	Regular	01/16/2053  <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>
47881-18/19	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$4,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$1,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$5,500,000	Provide maintenance, support, and upgrades to the San Francisco International Airport (Airport) Ground Transportation Management System (GTMS). This includes hardware repair and replacement for GTMS subsystem components, such as Automated Vehicle Identification (AVI) readers, license plate recognition (LPR) cameras, and taxi Card Interface Devices (CIDs) for access control. This also includes software support and enhancements for the GTMS operator database, financial management system, vehicle tracking system and system interfaces.	Modification	06/30/2028
45745-23/24	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$1,750,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,250,000 New Total Amount Requested \$4,000,000	Servicing a wide array of City vehicles and equipment, such as ride-on mowers, trailers, etc., for tire services including replacing, repairing, mounting and dismounting, balancing, rotating, aligning, and disposing of wheels and tires. Services may take place where equipment or vehicles are in the field, at the vendor's premises, or at a City yard location.	Modification	08/31/2029

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41452-21/22	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$890,000 Increase Amount Requested \$75,000 New Total Amount Requested \$965,000	This San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) is conducting a grant-funded citywide bicycle master plan, with a grant funding expiration date of February 2024. The SFMTA proposes to contract a planning consultant team to supplement staffing by SFMTA staff and sub-grantee community-based organizations. The consultant will provide planning consulting services for discrete tasks within the larger bike plan scope, including: - Existing Conditions documentation - Technical Analysis, including analysis of the bike network and conducting a statistically significant resident preference survey - Public outreach event staffing, development of online engagement tools, graphic design for outreach materials, and procurement of outreach materials - Development of the draft bike plan recommendations and Draft Plan document - Development of the Final Plan document The sub-grantee organizations will participate in the larger plan process and conduct community-specific outreach in Equity Priority Communities identified in the scope of work. The SFMTA plans to actively staff this project, with consultant work supplementing SFMTA staff work and SFMTA staff providing full oversight of consultant activities.	Modification	10/11/2026
46341-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$300,000 Increase Amount Requested \$700,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,000,000	To provide an off-site facility to collect pre-employment, post-accident, return-to-duty, and reasonable suspicion breath and urine samples during normal working hours and/or after hours for San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) employees and contractors. Also, to provide a mobile on-site facility to collect random, follow-up, reasonable suspicion, and post-accident breath and urine samples in compliance with DOT/FTA Drug and Alcohol Testing Regulations.	Modification	08/31/2029
44782-20/21	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$9,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$8,300,000 New Total Amount Requested \$17,800,000	PSC 49277-19/20 was approved by the Civil Service Commission on October 21, 2019 for the scope of work in this request. PSC 49277-19/20 expired on October 21, 2020, before execution of SFPUC Contract PRO-0164. This request will allow the SFPUC to complete the execution of Contract PRO.0164. The primary objective of the project is to reduce flooding for Lower Alemany area. The scope of proposed work will consist of engineering planning, design, and construction support for San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) Lower Alemany Area Stormwater Improvement Project. This includes large diameter pipes and structures on deep foundations, launching and receiving shafts, and all related site investigation work (e.g. geotechnical and hazardous materials.)	Modification	11/19/2030  <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>
48427-17/18	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$42,800,000 Increase Amount Requested \$23,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$65,800,000	Work will include programs for Transition Age Youth (TAY) (16-24 years of age) who are hard to engage in services or socially excluded. These culturally appropriate mental health services will be provided by multiple contractors, which together form a System of Care to address the broad spectrum of needs and illnesses presented by these clients. Services will include full service partnership and intensive outpatient treatment activities; early psychosis intervention services; mental health assessment services; collateral and community based wrap-around services; and population-specific services for Black/African American, Asian and Pacific Islander, Latino/a and Mayan, homeless, and Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, and questioning individuals. Work also will include providing employment for "peers," behavioral health clients with lived experience of mental illness and the mental health treatment system who perform specific peer-based activities for other clients/consumers of the behavioral health system.	Modification	06/30/2029

**Speakers:** Donald Roger Hay, Department of Public Works spoke on PSC #45106-23/24  
 Reanna Albert, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #s 47885-23/24, 49509-23/24, 49838-23/24, and 48427-17/18  
 David Garcia, Mariana Maguire, and Dan Howard spoke on PSC #44370-23/24

**0134-24-8 Continued****Action:**

- 1) Approved PSC #45106-23/24 from the Department of Public Works on a one-time basis. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 2) Approved PSC #47885-23/24 from the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 3) Approved PSC #49509-23/24 from the Department of Public Health with the condition to remove the extraneous of classifications; only classifications 2587 – Health Worker III, 2588 – Health Worker IV, 2910 – Social Worker, and 2930 – Behavioral Health Clinician apply. Report back to Executive Officer within one week with data on the number of people this PSC will serve and how that number differs from the number of people served under PSC 48427-17/18. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 4) Approved PSC #49838-23/24 from the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 5) Approved PSC #48427-17/18 from the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 6) Approved PSC #44370-23/24 from the Municipal Transportation Agency with the condition of reporting back to the Commission in year three (3), in year four (4), and then every four (4) years thereafter. Report back on the progress of each component, identifies status of any work brought in-house, knowledge transfer and possible training of any staff not just Local 21 members, status and summary of discussions with applicable employee organizations; and any other pertinent factors including but not limited to changes in direction. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 7) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the office of the Controller and the office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0134-24-8 Continued****Public  
Comment:**

Submitted by email from Audrey Garza, IFPTE Local 21, Good Afternoon, IFPTE Local 21 understands the importance of the SFMTA Train Control Upgrade Project, but we want to highlight some concerns that have not yet been addressed. We have been in talks with SFMTA on the project and we appreciate their openness on having on-going discussions, and we look forward to continuing those. As we look at the 28-year PSC of \$316 million, it's crucial for us to work towards a long-term plan to ensure Union jobs are created and maintained, SFMTA/city workers are trained for future design upgrades, and that SFMTA is planning and committed to ensuring quality public services from SFMTA/city workers. Under the current PSC implementation plan, there is no training on the design of the train control system, which is a crucial piece of planning future upgrades. IFPTE Local 21 represents SFMTA electrical engineers and there has not been internal outreach on the project nor has there been outreach to other city agencies. It's crucial SFMTA plans to pull Local 21 represented employees into the fold during the duration of the PSC for training and knowledge transfers that would allow future contracting out needs for design to be mitigated. We ask that ahead of moving forward with the PSC that there be a training plan put in place that addresses the above. IFPTE Local 21 looks forward to working in collaboration with SFMTA in developing the training plan.

Ellen Lee Zhou

**0098-21-8 Review of Request for Approval of Personal Services Contract Number 48746-20/21 from the Airport – Omit Posting. (Item No. 8)**

**June 21, 2021:** Denied the request for PSC #48746-20/21 – Omit Posting. Continued to the meeting of July 19, 2021, for consideration.

**July 19, 2021:** Adopted the report and approved PSC #48746-20/21 – Omit Posting for 5 years with the condition for a classification review. In addition, Airport will provide an annual report on the status of the classification review and discussions between Airport and Local 39. Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postponed to the meeting of August 5, 2024, at the request of the department. (No action taken)



**0135-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Personal Services Contract Number 43388-23/24 from the City Administrator. (Item No. 9)**

**July 1, 2024:** Continued to the meeting of July 15, 2024, with a report to address questions on whether the Hazardous Waste Management work can be done by City employees.

**Speakers:** Lynn Khaw, City Administrator's Office  
Don Jones, City Administrator's Office

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract #43388-23/24; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Public Comment:** Ellen Lee Zhou

**0136-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Personal Services Contract Number 47099-20/21 from the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 10)**

**July 1, 2024:** Continued to the meeting of July 15, 2024; the Municipal Transportation Agency was instructed to reach out to the Department of Human Resources to seek ways of bringing the specialized transportation project work in-house and to report back to the Commission.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postponed to the meeting of October 7, 2024, at the request of the department. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 11)**

Commissioner Favetti requested to follow-up with the Municipal Transportation Agency on TWU Local 200 public comment with regard to the situation on the classification issue.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 12)**

3:46 p.m.