



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
June 17, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2661 656 0029. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2661 656 0029  
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**VITUS LEUNG**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meetings use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2661 656 0029.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Excused (Notified Absence)
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salveson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY’S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

Ellen Lee Zhou, she is running for Mayor, San Francisco Department of Human Resources wrongfully terminated unvaccinated employees requesting resolution of 33 cases and the return to work of terminated employees.

Brenda Barros, a 45-year city employee who thinks that is not right for unvaccinated employees being terminated.

Cheryl Thornton, being vaccinated does not prevent you from getting Covid, feels that unvaccinated employees should have not being terminated. Requesting help to get terminated employees back to work, their livelihood is severely impacted.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of June 3, 2024 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Public** Ellen Lee Zhou

**Comment:**

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

None.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director reported on the Career Center in City Hall. Over 1,000 people have visited since the opening. Director Isen urges Commissioners to drop by, they offer core workshops to City employees and applicants, employment pathways, job search strategies and training opportunities to becoming City employees, they are also offering workshops to city departments to highlight opportunities in specific departments and provide career counseling. The career center is prominently placed in City Hall.

**Presentation on the new Personal Service Contract Database and Launch.  
(File No. 0119-24-1) – Possible Action Item**

**Speakers:** Mike Cotter, Department of Human Resources  
Molly Peterson, Office of the City Administrator  
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission

**Action:** Accepted the presentation. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Public Comment:** Ellen Lee Zhou

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, updated the commission on their budget presentation before the Board of Supervisors.  
Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, introduced the CSC summer college interns: Mayra Medrano and Catherine Perez Cruz.

**0114-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.  
(Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41848-23/24	Police	\$500,000	The SFPD is seeking to retain a local evaluator to produce a Local Evaluation Plan (LEP) and Local Evaluation Report (LER). The LEP is a written document that describes how the project will be monitored and evaluated and shows how evaluation results will be used for project improvement and decision making. The LER will document the activities completed with the support of grant funds and the outcomes achieved.	Regular	05/30/2027
49998-23/24	Public Health	\$10,000,000	Contractor(s) will support San Francisco Department of Public Health’s Skilled Nursing Facility Locations in obtaining and sustaining compliance with state and federal regulations for skilled nursing facilities. Specifically, the selected contractor(s) will conduct, at least, quarterly site visits and act as proxies for state and federal regulators and conduct full scale regulatory evaluations to test the sustainability of regulatory compliance. Areas of focus are intended to enable the skilled nursing facility to obtain and sustain compliance with state and federal regulations for skilled nursing facilities.	Regular	12/31/2028
34188-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$160,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission is looking to migrate its aging phone system infrastructure (supporting about 3000 users over multiple counties) to a cloud-based telephony service. The new solution will leverage AT&T Cloud services in combination with Microsoft Teams and is meant to reduce some of the cost and support complexities associated with the current Avaya on-site solutions. We are looking to procure consulting services to help us plan a successful migration to the cloud by formally managing the discovery of existing configuration, identifying needs and risk areas, developing detailed design and engineering documents, and planning the porting of numbers between on-premises and cloud environments.	Regular	12/31/2025

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42240-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$80,000,000	<p>The Water Capital Improvement Program - Program Management Support Services contract (“Contract”) is required to provide expertise and services both for programmatic support and project-level support. Services will be requested over the duration of the Contract by task order to support both programmatic oversight functions and project-level services. For programmatic support, the following types of services may be requested: contract management, program management plan, document management, quality management, programmatic review, long-range capital planning, adaptive management processes, triple bottom line assessments, program safety, program risk management, facilities integration, project labor relations, diversity, equity and inclusion, quality assurance and control, communications and reporting, cost estimating, change management, program deliverability, climate change, standards development and review, procedures development and review, technology transfer and training, emerging technologies review, and sustainability.</p> <p>At the project level, the following types of services may be requested: project planning support, project management support and coordination, special project-specific evaluations, technical advisory panels, seismic evaluations and standards, hydraulic modeling, systems engineering, value engineering, cost estimating, construction as-built drawing support, asset digitalization, operations testing, training and start-up, contracts preparation support, project close-out support, project lessons learned.</p>	Regular	11/01/2034  <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>
43238-19/20	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$850,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$850,000	The contractor(s) will provide interpretation in various languages as needed for on-site interpreting, back-fill for civil service staff on extended leave, and other unanticipated absences. Services will be provided for both DPH staff and patients/clients. Interpreter(s) must be available Monday-Friday, 8:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m. and be willing and able to provide services at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital and other Department facilities, on an as-needed basis. Contractor(s) must be able to provide services in the languages needed by specific patients/clients, and to provide simultaneous interpretation, as needed.	Regular	05/06/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41495-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$249,688 New Total Amount Requested \$749,688	(See attached 'A Concise Description of proposed Work' and A Concise Description of proposed Work – Amended 07/18/23') A General The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA or Agency) is requesting proposals from qualified firms (Proposers) to provide budget support, financial reconciliation, and procedure documentation consulting services (Services) to the Finance & Information Technology Division's Budget, Financial Projections, and Analysis Section (BFPA). The selected Contractor shall support BFPA operations by conducting analyses of operating budget sources and uses to propose budget realignments for each Agency Division, conduct financial reconciliation analysis and assist in clearing the backlog of financial analysis, and assist BFPA in developing, documenting, and refining BFPA related policies and procedures All Services are to be performed in alignment with goals and policies set by the BFPA Section. Proposers must be versed in City and County of San Francisco (City), federal and state statutes regulations governing City, federal and state funding, grants, public benefits, and government programs. Given the nature of the Services, the Proposer's Project Team should have proven subject-matter and industry best-practices expertise in governmental accounting, budgeting, human resources, payroll, and purchasing. Knowledge and experience in budget analysis and realignment methodologies and the City's Oracle PeopleSoft Financials and procurement management system (FSP) is also required. B. Background The SFMTA is responsible for the management of ground transportation in the City. The SFMTA has oversight over the Municipal Railway (Muni), the City's public transit system, as well as paratransit, bicycling, parking, pedestrians, and regulation of taxis. The Agency is organized into 11 Divisions with Fiscal Year (FY) 22-23 operating and capital budgets in the amounts of \$1.364 billion and \$543.3 million. The SFMTA operating budget is partially funded by \$189.1 million in regional, state, and federal grants. In July 2017, the City implemented an Oracle PeopleSoft financials and procurement management system. The Agency's 11 Divisions are: Chief of Staff; Office of Racial Equity and Belonging; Chief Strategy Officer; Communications, Marketing and Outreach; Finance & Technology; Government Affairs; Human Resources; Streets; Safety; Taxis, Access, and Mobility Services (TAMS), and Transit. The BFPA is responsible for preparing the operating and capital budgets on a two-year cycle; managing the budget, including position control budget entries, and capital funding allocations; preparing financial analysis to support financial reporting and strategic decision making; tracking and analyzing the Agency's physical assets to achieve and maintain a state of good repair; identifying and acquiring grants through competitive processes; and administering grants, including collaborating with funding partners, monitoring spending patterns, and financial and administrative activities related to grant close-out. A realigned budget analysis would provide staff the knowledge needed to make strategic daily decisions and prepare for and complete the FY 24-25 and FY 25-26 budget cycle. A realigned budget would reduce the day-to-day workload of the BFPA team by reducing mid-cycle budget transfers. Additionally, staff shortages due to the challenges of hiring in a post-pandemic environment have created a backlog of financial analysis and grant administration tasks, such as grant close outs. Finally, the Agency is seeking assistance in developing documentation of policies and procedures for actions such as position approval, budget adjustments, and contract approval. Documentation of such procedures is a short-term project that requires resources above existing staffing levels.	Modification	12/31/2025

			<p><b>Scope Change:</b>                  The original scope does not need to be modified as all services continue to fall within initial categories outlined; however, there are additional sub-categories of service that will need to be provided. This includes: Within the required service area A3. "Categorization of expenditure types to actuals," the following more detailed analysis has been required: Analysis of historical and current special class labor expenditures such as attrition. Analysis and reconciliation of budget entries and reports to expected amounts. Within the required service area A8. "Preparation of reports and materials that will facilitate knowledge transfer to BFPA and Division staff," the BFPA Manager noticed that with the number of new budget staff hired into the SFMTA A, the envisioned level of documentation was not sufficient to support their learning and growth. As a result, EQ has and continues to need to provide additional personalized assistance to new BFPA staff to ensure they are learning the new budget system and processes. The following more detailed support has been and continues to be required: Preparation and delivery of budget development process training material facilitating budget knowledge transfer to new budget staff. Provision of ad-hoc knowledge transfer regarding budget processes and reports to new budget staff. Additionally, as contractor time more deeply focuses on staff training and support as well as process and procedure documentation, there are elements of the original scope that have been and will continue to be deprioritized. These include: A4 "Analysis of continuing funds to identify active projects and projects that are appropriate to close-out", A5 "Analysis of manual carry-forward to identify active projects and projects that are appropriate to close-out" B1 "Analysis of purchase order to identify purchase orders that can be closed," and B4 "Reconciliation of payroll data to budget to identify corrective action to align labor charges with budgeted positions." There are task that have since been identified as possible to be completed by staff outside of the BFPA and/or may be completed by BFPA staff following training and support by the contractor.</p>		
--	--	--	---	--	--

**Speakers:** Katie Miller and Todd Kyger, from the Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #42240-23/24.

- Action:**
- 1) Approved PSC #42240-23/24 with the condition to report back to the Commission six (6) months after notice to proceed and yearly thereafter. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 2) Adopted the report. Approved the requests for the remaining proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0117-24-8 Report Back on Personal Service Number 42697-21/22 from the Public Utilities Commission. (Item No. 8)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Accept the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0113-24-8 Personal Services Contract Number 2000-07/08 Modification 7 with the Department of Public Health; Conditional Approval 6-month Report Back. (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0118-24-8 Follow-up Report on Personal Services Contract Number 47979-23/24 Fleet Week Coordination from the Department of Emergency Management. (Item No. 10)**

**June 3, 2024:** Approved PSC# 47979-23/24 from Department of Emergency Management with the condition that the vendor provide knowledge transfer to San Francisco City and County staff with the goal of becoming in-housework. Also update the Personal Service Contract to include 0931 and 0932 Classifications and remove contractor name from scope of work.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0102-24-3 Salary Setting for the City and County of San Francisco Board of Supervisors for a Five (5) Year Cycle, Effective July 1, 2024, Through June 30, 2029, in Accordance with Charter Section 2.100. (Item No. 11)**

**June 3, 2024:** Continued to the meeting of June 17, 2024.

**Speakers:** Luz Morganti, Civil Service Commission  
Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
Angela Calvillo, Board of Supervisors  
Edward De Asis, Board of Supervisors

**Action:** Adopted the report; Adjust and set the base salary for Members of the Board of Supervisors for the five-year cycle effective July 1, 2024, to June 30, 2029. Accordingly, the annual salary for Members of the Board of Supervisors commencing the five-year salary-setting cycle under Charter Section 2.100 will be increased by 4%, which shall be **\$170,433 effective July 1, 2024**. Subsequent years provide an adjustment according to the CPI-U at a cap of 5% in a giving year; if CPI-U is below 0 there will be no change in salary. *It should be noted that the \$170,433 is an estimate, and the actual salary will be determined by Class and Compensation methodology consistent with the City's process.* (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0073-21-6 Appeal by Brenda Donald of Human Resources Director's finding that investigation did not substantiate Donald's allegations of discrimination and retaliation. (Item No. 12)**

**Speakers:** Karen Charlton, Department of Human Resources  
Brenda Donald, Appellant  
Joy Chen, Public Utilities Commission

**April 15, 2024:** Postponed to the meeting of June 17, 2024, at the request of the appellant.

**Action:** Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Human Resources Director and denied the appeal by Brenda Donald. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 13)**

Commissioner Vitus Leung, enjoyed the presentation by PUC and would like to see more PSC department representatives attend the CSC meetings in person at City Hall.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 14)**

4:45 p.m.