



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR

Sent via Electronic Mail

April 30, 2024

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

SUBJECT: FOLLOW-UP REPORT ON SAN FRANCISCO HEALTH SERVICE SYSTEM'S HIRING PROGRESS IN THE MEMBER SERVICES DIVISION.

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **May 6, 2024, at 2:00 p.m.**

This item will appear on the Consent Agenda. Please refer to the attached notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is recommended. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

SANDRA ENG
Executive Office

Attachment

Cc: Abbie Yant, Health Service System
Rey Guillen, Health Service System
Iftikhar Hussain, Health Service System
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources
Paul Greene, Department of Human Resources
Stella Choi, Department of Human Resources
Najuawanda Daniels, SEIU Local 1021
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

A. Commission Office

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is civilservice@sfgov.org and the web address is www.sfgov.org/civilservice/. Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

B. Policy Requiring Written Reports

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4th) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement

A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

G. Procedure for Commission Hearings

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at www.sfgov.org/civilservice/.

I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take in-person public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the "Requests to Speak" portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended. People who have received an accommodation due to a disability (as described below) may provide their public comments remotely. The Commission will also allow public comment from members of the public who choose to participate remotely. It is possible that the Commission may experience technical challenges that interfere with the ability of members of the public to participate in the meeting remotely. If that happens, the Commission will attempt to correct the problem, but may continue the hearing so long as people attending in-person are able to observe and offer public comment.

J. Public Comment and Due Process

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Information on Disability Access

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email civilservice@sfgov.org to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: soft@sfgov.org, or on the City's website at www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine.

San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: _____ - _____ -
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: May 6, 2024
3. Check One:
Ratification Agenda
 Consent Agenda
Regular Agenda
Human Resources Directors Report
4. Subject: San Francisco Health Service System's Hiring Progress in the Member Services Division.
5. Recommendation: Accept the Report
6. Report prepared by: William Kudenov, Senior Administrative Analyst
Telephone number: (628) 652-4624
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV. Commission Report Format -A).**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:

Human Resources Director: N/A

Date: N/A
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer
Civil Service Commission
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720
San Francisco, CA 94102**
10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

CSC RECEIPT STAMP

Persons to be Notified

San Francisco Health Service System's Hiring Progress in the Member Services Division

Abbie Yant, RN MA
Executive Director
San Francisco Health Service System
1145 Market Street, #300
San Francisco, CA 94103

Rey Guillen
Chief Operating Officer
San Francisco Health Service System
1145 Market Street, #300
San Francisco, CA 94103

Iftikhar Hussain
Chief Financial Officer
San Francisco Health Service System
1145 Market Street, #300
San Francisco, CA 94103

Shawn Sherburne
Assistant Director, Employment Services
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Paul Greene
Client Services Consulting Manager
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Stella Choi
Senior Human Resources Consultant
Department of Human Resources
One South Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Najuawanda Daniels
Field Representative
SEIU Local 1021
350 Rhode Island Street, Suite 100
San Francisco, CA 94103

**SAN FRANCISCO
HEALTH SERVICE SYSTEM**

San Francisco Health Service System's Hiring Progress in the Member Services Division

Date: April 16, 2024

From: San Francisco Health Service System (SFHSS)

To: Honorable Civil Service Commission

Cc: Abbie Yant, Health Service System
Rey Guillen, Health Service System
Iftikhar Hussain, Health Service System
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources
Paul Greene, Department of Human Resources
Stella Choi, Department of Human Resources
Najuawanda Daniels, SEIU Local 1021

Re: Summary of hiring processes between January 2023 and April 2024 for Member Services Call-Center vacancies.

As requested by the Civil Service Commission on May 1st, 2023, in connection with the approval of PSC #47934 – 22/23 for *As-needed Offsite Call-Center Support for the San Francisco Health Service System Member Services Unit* (**attached hereto as Appendix A**), SFHSS submits the following summary of our hiring processes between January 2023 and April 2024 to address vacancies and attrition rates within our Member Services call-center.

1. SFHSS prioritized department resources to boost hiring Member Services staff.

In response to unanticipated attrition during calendar year 2022, which resulted in a 48% reduction in SFHSS Member Services staffing levels (from 23 member services staff to 12), SFHSS shifted staff and budgetary resources to recruitment during calendar year 2023, resulting in the hiring of three (3) 1209 Benefit Technicians and seven (7) 1210 Benefits Analysts staff.

- a) SFHSS funded one (1) full-time (FTE) 1244 Senior Human Resources Consultant to support our existing (part-time) 1244.
- b) SFHSS transitioned our previously part-time 1244 to a full-time basis.
- c) SFHSS allocated additional management resources (0931, Operations Manager, Member Services) to support recruitment efforts, vetting and interviews.

2. Additional staff and DHR resources and increased hiring efforts successfully resulted in more new hires over the last sixteen (16) months.

Through additional funding and a realignment of internal (SFHSS) and external (DHR) resources, since January 2023, SFHSS filled thirteen (13) total vacancies in 1209 and 1210 positions.

- a) Between January 2023 and April 2023, SFHSS filled one (1) 1209 Benefits Technician and two (2) 1210 Benefits Analysts positions;
- b) Between April and December 2023, SFHSS added back eight (8) 1210 Benefits Analysts and two (2) 1209 Benefits Technicians;
- c) In September 2023, SFHSS promoted one (1) internal 1210 Benefits Analyst to a Senior Benefits Analyst (1813) position; and
- d) In March 2024, SFHSS hired one (1) new 1814 Benefits Supervisor.

3. As of April 2024, SFHSS continues to face high levels of attrition in 1209 and 1210 positions, and our Member Services unit remains understaffed.

As of April 1, 2024, SFHSS has only returned to 82% of our pre-COVID pandemic Member Services staffing level with nineteen (19) total Member Service staff, compared to twenty-three (23) prior to the pandemic.

- a) Between July 2023 and September 2023, one (1) 1209 Benefits Technician and one (1) 1210 Benefits Analyst transitioned to positions in other City departments;

- b) In June 2023, one (1) 1210 Benefits Analyst was let go due to the TEX nature of her position;
- c) In September 2023, one (1) additional 1209 Benefits Technician left City employment; and
- d) In March 2024, one (1) long-tenured 1813 Senior Benefits Analyst, who previously served as a 1210 Benefits Analyst, retired.
- e) Even at pre-COVID pandemic staffing levels, mandatory overtime during periods of high call volume (*i.e.*, annual fall Open Enrollment) was required to keep pace with Member calls, vendor reconciliation reports and written member submissions.
- f) In response to City-wide budget instructions, SFHSS will lose one (1) additional 1210 Benefits Analyst position for fiscal year 2024-2025.

4. SFHSS continues to focus our internal and external resources on hiring new Member Services staff, specifically 1209 and 1210 vacancies and to prepare for any future vacancies.

As of April 2024, SFHSS has two (2) active recruitments ongoing, including:

- a. 1813 Senior Benefits Analyst. One (1) recruitment is in the final stage and offer process.
- b. 1210 Benefits Analysts
 - i. One (1) recruitment is in the final stage and offer process.
 - ii. One (1) position is unavailable for recruitment until August 2024 while it is being held for an employee who is taking a leave of absence to work at a different City department.
- c. A detailed staffing timeline for 2023/2024 can be found in **Appendix B.**

* * *

Despite the challenges SFHSS has experienced with our Member Services attrition and hiring, SFHSS' commitment to serving our Members and supporting our Member Services team remains steadfast.

SFHSS remains confident that with diligent hiring efforts and the ongoing dedication of our Senior Human Resources Consultant, our Department will continue to provide excellent service to our over 126,000 active and retired members of the City and County of San Francisco, Unified School District, Community College District, and SF Superior Court, and their eligible dependents.

Attachments (2):

1. **Appendix A** – Notice of Civil Service Commission Action (May 3rd, 2023)
2. **Appendix B** – SFHSS Member Services Staffing Timeline for 2023/2024

Appendix A

Notice of Civil Service Commission Action (May 3rd, 2023)



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR

Sent via Electronic Mail

May 3, 2023

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ACTION

SUBJECT: APPEAL BY SEIU LOCAL 1021 OF THE REQUEST FOR APPROVAL OF PROPOSED PERSONAL SERVICES CONTRACT NUMBERS 42725-22/23 AND 47934-22/23.

At its meeting on **May 1, 2023**, the Civil Service Commission had for its consideration the above matter.

The Civil Service Commission adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract #47934-22/23 with the condition to report back to the Commission in one (1) year; PSC # 42725-22/23 was withdrawn by the Health Service System. Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration.

If this matter is subject to Code of Civil Procedure (CCP) Section 1094.5, the time within which judicial review must be sought is set forth in CCP Section 1094.

NOTE: It is important that a copy of this action be kept in the department files as you will need it in the future as proof of Civil Service Commission approval. Please share it with everyone responsible for follow-up.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer

Cc: Ifikhar Hussain, Health Service System
Abbie Yant, Health Service System
Rey Guillen, Health Service System
Jonathan Wright, Health Service System
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources
Paul Green, Department of Human Resources
Rie Butler, Department of Human Resources
Najuawanda Daniels, SEIU Local 1021
Commission File
Chron

25 VAN NESS AVENUE, SUITE 720 • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102-6033 • (628) 652-1100 • FAX (628) 652-1109 • www.sf.gov/civilservice

Appendix B

SFHSS Member Services Staffing Timeline for 2023/2024

Year	Month	1209		1210		1813		1814		Total Staff Position Filled	% of Total Staff Positions Filled
		PCS	TEX	PCS	TEX	PCS	TPV	PCS	Acting		
2023	Jan	-	-	9	-	2	1	-	-	12	52%
	Feb	-	-	9	-	1	1	-	1	12	52%
	Mar	1	-	9	-	1	1	-	1	13	57%
	Apr	1	-	8	2	1	1	-	1	14	61%
	May	1	-	8	2	1	1	-	1	14	61%
	Jun	1	-	8	2	1	1	-	1	14	61%
	Jul	1	-	10	-	1	1	-	1	14	61%
	Aug	1	2	13	-	1	1	-	1	19	83%
	Sep	1	-	10	-	1	2	-	1	15	65%
	Oct	1	-	11	-	1	2	-	1	16	70%
	Nov	1	-	12	-	1	2	-	1	17	74%
	Dec	1	-	12	-	1	2	-	1	17	74%
2024	Jan	1	-	12	-	1	2	-	1	17	74%
	Feb	1	-	12	-	1	2	-	1	17	74%
	Mar	2	-	12	-	3	-	1	-	18	78%
	Apr	2	-	13	-	4	-	1	-	20	87%
	May	2	-	13	-	4	-	1	-	20	87%
	Jun	2	-	13	-	4	-	1	-	20	87%
	Jul	2	-	13	-	4	-	1	-	20	87%
	Aug	2	-	14	-	4	-	1	-	21	91%