



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
February 5, 2024**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2663 668 3479. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2663 668 3479
Press # twice to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

F.X. CROWLEY

VITUS LEUNG

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2663 668 3479.

CALL TO ORDER

2:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

1. Ellen Zhou, former public health worker, on behalf unvaccinated city employees being wrongfully terminated, reinstate all the 1168 terminated employees.
2. Steve Zeltzer, United Front Committee for a Labor Party, illegal termination of over 1000 employees that were fired and coerced to retire; massive corruption of non-profit agencies; work is being outsourced with no oversight; public work should be done by public workers; civil service should be protected.
3. Monique Flambures, corruption of non-profit agencies; wrongful termination of 18 employees at Tenderloin Neighborhood Development Corporation.
4. Maria Cristina Gutierrez, employees being terminated for no reason at non-profit agencies who are stealing from the city, stealing citizens' tax money, and corruption.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Special Meeting of January 30, 2024 – 1:00 p.m.

Action: Postponed to the meeting of March 4, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

None.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)

Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources, reported that 1) In preparation for the RN Hiring report they are working with the Department of Public Health on gathering data to submit the report for the meeting of March 4, 2024; 2) Reduced RN vacancies; 3) Eliminated positional barriers; 4) Suspended redacting during post-referral process for RNs.

Public Ellen Zhou
Comment: Steve Zeltzer

EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT

0248-23-1 Fiscal Years 2024-25 and 2025-26 Mayor’s Budget Instructions and Department Budget Preparation Schedule. (Item No. 6)

December 18, 2023: Directed Commission staff to prepare Fiscal Years 2024-26 Budget Request to maintain appropriate staffing levels to meet ongoing and future service needs; continue to negotiate amounts necessary to achieve optimal results; present Budget Request at the Commission meeting of February 5, 2024; incorporate changes made by the Commission by the Budget Request submission deadline; and approve to submit the Fiscal Years 2024-26 Budget Request to the Controller and the Office of the Mayor by February 21, 2024.

Speakers: Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director

Action: Directed Commission staff to prepare Fiscal Years 2024-26 Budget Request to maintain appropriate staffing levels to meet ongoing and future service needs; continue to negotiate amounts necessary to achieve optimal results; incorporate changes made by the Commission by the Budget Request submission deadline; and approve to submit the Fiscal Years 2024-26 Budget Request to the Controller and the Office of the Mayor by February 21, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public Comment: Ellen Zhou

0019-24-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41365-23/24	Controller	\$5,000,000	Provide municipal financing advisory services to Office of Public Finance and other Controller’s Office and City department staff in the following areas: municipal debt financing or other financial advisory services. Consultant experience includes working on general obligation bonds, certificates of participation, lease revenue bonds, special tax bonds, tax allocation revenue bonds commercial paper and other forms of municipal financing.	Regular	1/28/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41315-23/24	Public Health	\$72,000,000	<p>These services will be provided by contractors responding to a new RFP to create Expanded Harm Drop-in Centers, which tests a new paradigm for the organized delivery and linkage of health care services for people who use drugs. Its purpose is to demonstrate how such a system will reduce overdose, reduce overdose disparities, reduce adverse health and social consequences, and promote recovery and wellness.</p> <p>Critical elements include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -- Providing hospitality services in order to ensure that all services are rendered in a warm, welcoming environment that treats clients with compassion and respect and encourages future engagement; -- Providing linkage services in order to ensure the ability to integrate harm reduction with other forms of care provided at the Sites to ensure that the “whole person” needs of clients are met; -- Providing onsite rapid HIV and HCV testing by licensed medical staff, trained staff, or trained peers (DPH HIV HCV Test Counselor training) and follow-up testing at DPH Health Laboratory and follow-up linkage to treatment; -- Providing on-site drug checking on a regularly scheduled basis with the use of infrared spectrometer, or other equivalent technology, that identifies different compounds in a given sample; -- Providing distribution and disposal of harm reduction supplies and education; -- Providing culturally responsive community outreach and engagement to the Priority Population to encourage people disproportionately impacted by substance use to use the program. This can include outreach to other providers, training, and/or street-based outreach. 	Regular	12/31/2028
43520-23/24	Public Works	\$18,000,000	<p>Provide specialized services in Cost Estimating to support Department of Public Works design staff on an as-needed basis. The Consultants will provide expert cost estimating services to ensure that the most up to date cost data are utilized.</p>	Regular	12/31/2031 <i>Any approval will be conditioned on a status report to the Commission in year 4 of the PSC.</i>
46672-22/23	City Administrator	<p>Current Approved Amount \$750,000 Increase Amount Requested \$750,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,500,000</p>	<p>Contractors shall provide set-up/installation and break-down services of barricades, fencing, and other crowd and traffic safety equipment that are rented and at times, may be purchased by City departments, to ensure public safety during various special events (e.g., Pride Parade, Warriors championship parade, Fleet Week) and for other circumstances, including street/sewer paving and repair, vehicular accidents, etc. that require temporary crowd and/or traffic safety control measures.</p>	Modification	10/31/2028

Speakers: Reanna Albert, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #41315-23/24
 Olivia Lee, Department of Public Works spoke on PSC #43520-23/24

0019-24-8 Continued

- Action:**
- 1) Continued PSC #41315-23/24 from the Department of Public Health to the meeting of March 4, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)
 - 2) Approved PSC #43520 – 23/24 from the Department of Public Works with the proviso that the department provide an annual report on the use of the as-needed contract for cost estimation and a report back on the use of the previous contract (approved PSC #48340-20/21) for \$9M. (Vote of 5 to 0)
 - 3) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract: Notify the office of the Controller and the office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public Comment: Ellen Zhou
Steve Zeltzer
Kimberly Cox

0031-22-7 Request for Hearing by Deborah L. Aragon General Laborer (7514) Department of Public Works on Their Future Employment Restrictions. (Item No. 8)

Speakers: None.

Action: Accepted the report and approved the second request from the Department of Public Works to postpone this item to the meeting of March 4, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0196-23-6 Appeal by Peter Kreiden of the Human Resources Director’s determination to administratively close Kreiden’s complaint of harassment, retaliation, and denial of reasonable accommodation. (Item No. 9)

Speakers: None.

Action: Postponed to the meeting of July 1, 2024, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0212-23-7 Request for a Hearing by Ellen Mendelson on Behalf of Stephen Wong former Community Police Services Aide (9209), San Francisco Police Department on their Future Employment Restrictions against all City Departments. (Item No. 10)

Speakers: None.

Action: Postponed to the meeting of March 4, 2024, at the request of the appellant’s attorney. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0004-24-4 Appeal by Chris Ray-Rohan of the Rejection of their Application for the H-30 Captain Examination Administration. (Item No. 11)

Speakers: Jen Lo, Department of Human Resources
Jesusa Bushong, Fire Department
Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources
Chris Ray-Rohan, Appellant

Action: Adopted the report of the Department of Human Resources and denied the appeal by Ray-Rohan. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public Comment: Mailei Maloa

0005-24-4 Appeal by Holly Doudiet of the Rejection of their Application for the H-30 Captain Examination Administration. (Item No. 12)

Speakers: Jen Lo, Department of Human Resources
Holly Doudiet, Appellant
Jesusa Bushong, Fire Department

Action: Adopted the report of the Department of Human Resources and denied the appeal by Doudiet. (Vote of 3 to 2; Commissioners Jacqueline Minor and F.X. Crowley dissented)

Public Comment: Chris Ray-Rohan
Thomas Doudiet

0006-24-4 Appeal by Dale H. Dockery of the Rejection of their Application for the H-30 Captain Examination Administration. (Item No. 13)

Speakers: Jen Lo, Department of Human Resources
Dale H. Dockery, Appellant

Action: Adopted the report of the Department of Human Resources and denied the appeal by Dockery. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0007-24-4 Appeal by Gregory Bruno Bovo of the Rejection of their Application for the H-30 Captain Examination Administration. (Item No. 14)

Speakers: None.

Action: Adopted the report of the Department of Human Resources and denied the appeal by Bovo. Appellant failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0232-23-4 Appeal of Rejection of Application by Maung M Gyi for 7253 Electrical Transit Mechanic Supervisor I (CBT-7253-T00083). (Item No. 15)

Speakers: Shivani Nath, Municipal Transportation Agency
Maung M. Gyi, Appellant
William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency

Action: Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Gyi. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0234-23-4 Appeal of Rejection of Application by Mailei Maloa for 7253 Electrical Transit Mechanic Supervisor I (CBT-7253-T00083). (Item No. 16)

Speakers: William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency
Shivani Nath, Municipal Transportation Agency
Mailei Maloa, Appellant

Action: Continued to the meeting of March 4, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public Comment: Art Gonzalez, Local 1414
Maung M. Gyi

0238-22-6 Appeal by Eric Eliasson of Human Resources Director's determination that SFPUC did not violate the City's EEO Policy in denying Appellant's request for a religious accommodation that would exempt Appellant from the City's Vaccination Policy. (Item No. 17)

August 7, 2023: Approved the request for postponement by the Department of Human Resources due to pending grievance.

Speakers: Marvin Dunson, Department of Human Resources
Eric Eliasson, Appellant

Action: Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Human Resources Director, and denied the appeal by Eric Eliasson. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public Comment: Ellen Zhou
Kimberly Cox

0192-23-7 Request for a Hearing by Reginald Rogers on Their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 18)

Speakers: Yaya Holmes, Municipal Transportation Agency
Reginald Rogers, Appellant
David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency

Action: Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Reginald R. Rogers. Canceled any current examination and eligibility status. Future employment is subject to review and approval of the Human Resources Director after satisfactory completion of three (3) years of verifiable work experience outside City and County service in jobs **not** involving driving and 5 (five) years of verifiable work experience outside of City and County service in jobs requiring driving beginning the date of this action, February 5, 2024. (Vote of 5 to 0)

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 19)

Commissioner F.X. Crowley requested that MTA be in-person at City Hall when representing MTA for appeals.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 20)

7:33 p.m.