

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F1	City College did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Disagree partially	While the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee is one vehicle to Citywide workforce coordination, the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) Board is responsible for coordinating investments related to Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act funding and making policy recommendations for the broader San Francisco Workforce Development System. CCSF sits on the WISF board. Additionally, Under Chapter 30 of the City Administrative Code, the Committee on City Workforce Alignment (“Alignment Committee”) comprised of City officials and employees was created. The Alignment Committee was responsible for planning and coordinating Workforce Development Services across City departments in order to increase their effectiveness. The current ad hoc committee is also made up solely of City officials and employees. If the charge of the Workforce Alignment Committee were broadened beyond the coordination of workforce services across City departments, then the inclusion of CCSF would be a logical partner.

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F1	City College did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Partially agree. City College agrees it did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, but City College does participate on other OEWD boards and committees. City College has a seat on the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) Board, and CCSF Board President Williams is the current WISF board member. The CCSF Chancellor and the Dean of Workforce Development also participated in the San Francisco COVID-19 Economic Recovery Task Force and its workforce committee that was led by OEWD. City College also has a formal role in the Workforce Investment and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Partners Committee that meets quarterly. The College has a signed MOU with OEWD that is a record of the partners’ commitment to working together to create a unified service delivery system that best meets the needs of our shared customers such as recipients of public assistance, other low-income individuals, individuals who are basic skills deficient, and individuals with disabilities and other barriers to employment. City College administrators, staff, and faculty participate in various meetings convened by OEWD that pertain to programs such as CityBuild, TechSF, and the HealthCare Academy to promote enrollment in CCSF Career Education programs and student services. These ongoing program coordination activities between OEWD and City College ensure our shared customers have access to employment services, supportive services, training, and education programming that will help these

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F1	City College did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Partially agree. City College agrees it did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, but City College does participate on other OEWD boards and committees. City College has a seat on the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) Board, and CCSF Board President Williams is the current WISF board member. The CCSF Chancellor and the Dean of Workforce Development also participated in the San Francisco COVID-19 Economic Recovery Task Force and its workforce committee that was led by OEWD. City College also has a formal role in the Workforce Investment and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Partners Committee that meets quarterly. The College has a signed MOU with OEWD that is a record of the partners’ commitment to working together to create a unified service delivery system that best meets the needs of our shared customers such as recipients of public assistance, other low-income individuals, individuals who are basic skills deficient, and individuals with disabilities and other barriers to employment. City College administrators, staff, and faculty participate in various meetings convened by OEWD that pertain to programs such as CityBuild, TechSF, and the HealthCare Academy to promote enrollment in CCSF Career Education programs and student services. These ongoing program coordination activities between OEWD and City College ensure our shared customers have access to employment services, supportive services, training, and education programming that will help these

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F1	City College did not have a formal role on the City's Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Disagree partially	City College of San Francisco is not currently part of the Workforce Alignment Committee but collaborates with OEWD in several other spaces, including the Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) Board and meetings convened by OEWD for programs such as CityBuild, TechSF, and the HealthCare Academy.

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F2	City College did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. This finding requires clarification. The Office of Workforce Development at City College of San Francisco (CCSF) works closely with Student Affairs to support Career Education student success. Within Academic Affairs, the Workforce Office supports CTE faculty in their respective schools and disciplines, and the faculty develop and deliver innovative and relevant short- and long-term technical education programs leading to employment and university transfer opportunities. While the CCSF Office of Workforce Development does not have a formal role on the institution’s Curriculum Committee, the faculty and school deans who serve on the Curriculum Committee have direct knowledge of the specific needs of students participating in their respective workforce development programs. The Academic Senate appoints a CTE liaison who participates on both the Curriculum Committee and the CTE Steering Committee. Faculty who develop CTE certificate programs are required to conduct an analysis of workforce supply and demand by engaging the Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research, which is housed in the CCSF Office of Workforce Development. The Dean of Workforce Development, as the CCSF representative on the Bay City College of San Francisco Response to Civil Grand Jury Findings & Recommendations – Page 3 of 6 Area Community College Consortium’s regional curriculum approval process, also plays a role in recommending new CTE certificate

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F2	City College did not have a formal role on the City’s Workforce Alignment Committee while it was active and does not have a role on the current ad hoc committee, and this inhibits effective programmatic coordination between OEWD and City College.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. This finding requires clarification. The Office of Workforce Development at City College of San Francisco (CCSF) works closely with Student Affairs to support Career Education student success. Within Academic Affairs, the Workforce Office supports CTE faculty in their respective schools and disciplines, and the faculty develop and deliver innovative and relevant short- and long-term technical education programs leading to employment and university transfer opportunities. While the CCSF Office of Workforce Development does not have a formal role on the institution’s Curriculum Committee, the faculty and school deans who serve on the Curriculum Committee have direct knowledge of the specific needs of students participating in their respective workforce development programs. The Academic Senate appoints a CTE liaison who participates on both the Curriculum Committee and the CTE Steering Committee. Faculty who develop CTE certificate programs are required to conduct an analysis of workforce supply and demand by engaging the Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research, which is housed in the CCSF Office of Workforce Development. The Dean of Workforce Development, as the CCSF representative on the Bay Area Community College Consortium’s regional curriculum approval process, also plays a role in recommending new CTE certificate

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F3	OEWD's lack of a concerted effort to enroll groups in Eligible Training Provider List programs at City College hurts its ability to maximize limited funds.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Disagree partially	We agree that there is a lack of concerted effort between OEWD and CCSF in enrolling OEWD participants into the ETPL programs offered by CCSF. This is due to WIOA funding requirements for our department that place strict guidelines and adherence to outcomes that are specific to job placement and not inclusive of enrollment in CCSF ETPL programs.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F3	OEWD's lack of a concerted effort to enroll groups in Eligible Training Provider List programs at City College hurts its ability to maximize limited funds.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. This finding requires clarification. OEWD does not directly enroll groups into programs. OEWD funds community-based organizations that either enroll participants in their own training programs or refer participants to programs at City College. However, with increased coordination between OEWD and the College, developing a more efficient delivery model is possible, thereby maximizing limited funds.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F3	OEWD's lack of a concerted effort to enroll groups in Eligible Training Provider List programs at City College hurts its ability to maximize limited funds.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. This finding requires clarification. OEWD does not directly enroll groups into programs. OEWD funds community-based organizations that either enroll participants in their own training programs or refer participants to programs at City College. However, with increased coordination between OEWD and the College, developing a more efficient delivery model is possible, thereby maximizing limited funds.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F3	OEWD's lack of a concerted effort to enroll groups in Eligible Training Provider List programs at City College hurts its ability to maximize limited funds.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Disagree partially	This finding requires clarification. OEWD does not directly enroll groups into programs. CCSF and OEWD should collaborate to provide guidance to community based organizations that will assist with job placement and increase enrollment; however the Board of Supervisors understands that WIOA funding requirements place strict requirements for OEWD regarding adherence to outcomes that are specific to job placement and not inclusive of enrollment in CCSF ETPL programs.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F4	Limited availability of technical courses during City College's summer semester is a contributing factor to OEWD participants pursuing their studies at alternative educational institutions, thereby incurring additional costs.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Agree	We agree with the Finding because students have reported to OEWD providers that CCSF does not offer enough summer courses or evening courses for students who are working and/or participating in our training programs. This has led to students pursuing other options for technical courses due to the time and duration of CCSF programs, juxtaposed to other institutions that offer short-term programs.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F4	Limited availability of technical courses during City College’s summer semester is a contributing factor to OEWD participants pursuing their studies at alternative educational institutions, thereby incurring additional costs.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Agree. City College agrees that more short-term technical courses would benefit OEWD participants, though not necessarily during summer. The offering of courses, including the time frame in which courses can be completed, is within the faculty purview. The College has engaged in discussions about creating more short-term classes, particularly in light of Strong Workforce Program priorities, to support the COVID economic recovery and will continue those conversations. In the 2021-22 school year the Strong Workforce Program is supporting four short-term training programs in Child Development, Custodial, Emergency Medical Technician, and
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F4	Limited availability of technical courses during City College’s summer semester is a contributing factor to OEWD participants pursuing their studies at alternative educational institutions, thereby incurring additional costs.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Agree. City College agrees that more short-term technical courses would benefit OEWD participants, though not necessarily during summer. The offering of courses, including the time frame in which courses can be completed, is within the faculty purview. The College has engaged in discussions about creating more short-term classes, particularly in light of Strong Workforce Program priorities, to support the COVID economic recovery and will continue those conversations. In the 2021-22 school year the Strong Workforce Program is supporting four short-term training programs in Child Development, Custodial, Emergency Medical Technician, and



Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F4	Limited availability of technical courses during City College’s summer semester is a contributing factor to OEWD participants pursuing their studies at alternative educational institutions, thereby incurring additional costs.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Agree	

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F5	Demand for some City College courses and the lack of priority registration for OEWD participants results in their being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Disagree partially	OEWD is not aware of OEWD Program Participants, at scale, being denied enrollment for CCSF courses. However, our participants do encounter the effects of Finding #4, which lead to enrollments in other institutions and programs that offer more flexible short-term programming.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F5	Demand for some City College courses and the lack of priority registration for OEWD participants results in their being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. City College has not received any information on the number of OEWD participants who are being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs. Priority registration is regulated by the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108 as a condition of claiming state apportionment for enrollment in the class. Additionally, priority registration must be approved by the College’s Academic Senate, and other existing priority groups could be adversely impacted unless OEWD participants were added to the last on the list. There would be costs involved in defining and identifying OEWD clients.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F5	Demand for some City College courses and the lack of priority registration for OEWD participants results in their being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. City College has not received any information on the number of OEWD participants who are being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs. Priority registration is regulated by the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108 as a condition of claiming state apportionment for enrollment in the class. Additionally, priority registration must be approved by the College’s Academic Senate, and other existing priority groups could be adversely impacted unless OEWD participants were added to the last on the list. There would be costs involved in defining and identifying OEWD clients.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F5	Demand for some City College courses and the lack of priority registration for OEWD participants results in their being denied enrollment for courses needed for their training programs.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Disagree partially	Priority registration is regulated by the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108 as a condition of claiming state apportionment for enrollment in the class; however, CCSF when able, should prioritize OEWD students to the greatest extent feasible.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F6	Inaccuracies on the Eligible Training Provider List unnecessarily deter OEWD job seekers from taking needed courses.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Agree	The ETPL on the Cal Jobs website shows inaccuracies with CCSF's catalog of courses, and does not equip OEWD participants with the correct information to enroll in many ETPL programs.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F6	Inaccuracies on the Eligible Training Provider List unnecessarily deter OEWD job seekers from taking needed courses.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Agree. City College will check for any inaccuracies on the ETPL. OEWD job seekers who inquire about programs on the ETPL are advised to contact CCSF Academic Counselors and CTE Department Chairs to plan a program of study that meets their needs.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F6	Inaccuracies on the Eligible Training Provider List unnecessarily deter OEWD job seekers from taking needed courses.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Agree. City College will check for any inaccuracies on the ETPL. OEWD job seekers who inquire about programs on the ETPL are advised to contact CCSF Academic Counselors and CTE Department Chairs to plan a program of study that meets their needs.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F6	Inaccuracies on the Eligible Training Provider List unnecessarily deter OEWD job seekers from taking needed courses.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Agree	

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F7	The lack of synchronization and outreach among OEWD, City College, and community-based organizations in promoting Eligible Training Provider List certificate programs at City College results in the underutilization of these programs.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Disagree partially	Currently, our Young Adult Providers coordinate with CCSF's outreach team to better inform our young adult program participants of CCSF offerings. Moreover, we send out e-newsletters that promote CCSF's CTE programs, and CCSF currently performs outreach to OEWD participants and OEWD funded Community Based Organizations. We do, however, believe our OEWD participants would benefit greatly if there was an individual point of contact to assist with admission, financial aid, and

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F7	The lack of synchronization and outreach among OEWD, City College, and community-based organizations in promoting Eligible Training Provider List certificate programs at City College results in the underutilization of these programs.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		<p>Disagree. Clarification is needed for this finding. City College consistently does outreach with OEWD and community-based organizations to promote certificate programs at City College. CCSF conducts a CBO Summit every year and a Career Education Showcase every semester, which are promoted to OEWD and community-based organizations. The CCSF Outreach Office maintains a list of CBOs to do routine outreach emails about CTE programs. OEWD sends out a weekly e-newsletter that frequently promotes CCSF CTE programs. CCSF regularly participates in CBO meetings convened by OEWD to promote CCSF CTE programs. CCSF utilizes the Academic and Career Communities as a framework for navigating its degree and certificate programs. Please note that on p. 11 of the report, the following paragraph is not accurate:</p> <p>“With funding from the state, City College recently implemented a program called Career Communities that includes elements of a learning community. In this program, employment specialists arrange career workshops, teach job search skills, and provide job leads to students within each designated employment sector. Course enrollment at City College does not in itself garner access to the Career Communities program, but enrollment in a certificate program does. This is yet another reason to encourage OEWD participants to enroll in certificate programs and a benefit of enhancing the partnership between OEWD and City College.”</p> <p>To clarify, the College has clustered its certificate and degree programs into “Academic and Career Communities” to help students better navigate the program offerings. In concert with that effort, the College is piloting “Student Success Teams” (official name under consideration) that provide students with access to networks and resources within their designated Academic and Career Community. The College’s Employment Specialists (classified staff assigned to assist with job placement and other career services within the Strong Workforce Program) will play a role in these Student Success Teams to raise awareness of career possibilities and to connect students to employment opportunities (including internships, etc.). The Student Success Teams also include representatives from a variety of support services.</p>

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F7	The lack of synchronization and outreach among OEWD, City College, and community-based organizations in promoting Eligible Training Provider List certificate programs at City College results in the underutilization of these programs.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		<p>Disagree. Clarification is needed for this finding. City College consistently does outreach with OEWD and community-based organizations to promote certificate programs at City College. CCSF conducts a CBO Summit every year and a Career Education Showcase every semester, which are promoted to OEWD and community-based organizations. The CCSF Outreach Office maintains a list of CBOs to do routine outreach emails about CTE programs. OEWD sends out a weekly e-newsletter that frequently promotes CCSF CTE programs. CCSF regularly participates in CBO meetings convened by OEWD to promote CCSF CTE programs. CCSF utilizes the Academic and Career Communities as a framework for navigating its degree and certificate programs. Please note that on p. 11 of the report, the following paragraph is not accurate:</p> <p>“With funding from the state, City College recently implemented a program called Career Communities that includes elements of a learning community. In this program, employment specialists arrange career workshops, teach job search skills, and provide job leads to students within each designated employment sector. Course enrollment at City College does not in itself garner access to the Career Communities program, but enrollment in a certificate program does. This is yet another reason to encourage OEWD participants to enroll in certificate programs and a benefit of enhancing the partnership between OEWD and City College.”</p> <p>To clarify, the College has clustered its certificate and degree programs into “Academic and Career Communities” to help students better navigate the program offerings. In concert with that effort, the College is piloting “Student Success Teams” (official name under consideration) that provide students with access to networks and resources within their designated Academic and Career Community. The College’s Employment Specialists (classified staff assigned to assist with job placement and other career services within the Strong Workforce Program) will play a role in these Student Success Teams to raise awareness of career possibilities and to connect students to employment opportunities (including internships, etc.). The Student Success Teams also include representatives from a variety of support services.</p>

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F7	The lack of synchronization and outreach among OEWD, City College, and community-based organizations in promoting Eligible Training Provider List certificate programs at City College results in the underutilization of these programs.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Disagree partially	There appear to be some efforts by OEWD and community based organizations to promote City College of San Francisco EPTL programs; however, the Board acknowledges that the process should be refined.



2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	F#	Finding	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Finding Response (Agree/ Disagree)	Finding Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F8	City College is underutilizing Contract Education and Instruction programs that provide short-term training programs designed specifically for individual business needs.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Agree. The College is working toward expanding Contraction Education opportunities and plans to continue that work.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	F8	City College is underutilizing Contract Education and Instruction programs that provide short-term training programs designed specifically for individual business needs.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Agree. The College is working toward expanding Contraction Education opportunities and plans to continue that work.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R1 [for F1]	The Board of Supervisors should reinstate the Committee on City Workforce Alignment to Chapter 30 of the Administrative Code and add City College as a member. The reinstatement should be completed no later than February 2022.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	We plan to do the following in response to Recommendation #1: 1. Directly address this finding with our Workforce Alignment Committee at our next meeting tentatively scheduled for the Fall of 2021.2. Inquire with the City Attorney regarding the potential for the Workforce Alignment Committee to allow participation beyond City Departments. This action will take place immediately, and we will be able to offer an update on the aforementioned within 90 days.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R1 [for F1]	The Board of Supervisors should reinstate the Committee on City Workforce Alignment to Chapter 30 of the Administrative Code and add City College as a member. The reinstatement should be completed no later than February 2022.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Agree. City College looks forward to joining the Committee on City Workforce Alignment should it be reinstated by the Board of Supervisors.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R1 [for F1]	The Board of Supervisors should reinstate the Committee on City Workforce Alignment to Chapter 30 of the Administrative Code and add City College as a member. The reinstatement should be completed no later than February 2022.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Agree. City College looks forward to joining the Committee on City Workforce Alignment should it be reinstated by the Board of Supervisors.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R1 [for F1]	The Board of Supervisors should reinstate the Committee on City Workforce Alignment to Chapter 30 of the Administrative Code and add City College as a member. The reinstatement should be completed no later than February 2022.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Has not yet been implemented but will be implemented in the future	Recommendation No. R1 has not been implemented but will be implemented in the future by February 2022.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R2 [for F2]	City College’s Dean for Workforce Development should begin submitting quarterly reports that outline and seek input on specific Career Technical Education program needs to the Curriculum Committee beginning in January 2022.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Partially Agree. City College’s Dean of Workforce Development will attend Curriculum Committee meetings and ask the committee what additional information will be helpful to report.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R2 [for F2]	City College’s Dean for Workforce Development should begin submitting quarterly reports that outline and seek input on specific Career Technical Education program needs to the Curriculum Committee beginning in January 2022.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Partially Agree. City College’s Dean of Workforce Development will attend Curriculum Committee meetings and ask the committee what additional information will be helpful to report.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R3 [for F3]	OEWD should convene a joint working group to review current Career Technical Education course offerings at City College and make recommendations to develop content that aligns with the needs of the OEWD participants by December 2021. The joint working group should include City College’s Dean for Workforce Development, the City’s Director of Sector and Workforce Development, and the Eligible Training Provider List Coordinator for Workforce Development Comprehensive Job Centers.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	We do not think it is necessary to convene an additional working group with CCSF. We currently coordinate with our Workforce Innovation Opportunity Act (WIOA) partners, inclusive of CCSF, by convening quarterly and on an ad-hoc basis. Action to Address Finding— We will work with CCSF to develop content that aligns with the needs of OEWD program participants by December 2021, within the context of our current meeting framework.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R3 [for F3]	OEWD should convene a joint working group to review current Career Technical Education course offerings at City College and make recommendations to develop content that aligns with the needs of the OEWD participants by December 2021. The joint working group should include City College’s Dean for Workforce Development, the City’s Director of Sector and Workforce Development, and the Eligible Training Provider List Coordinator for Workforce Development Comprehensive Job Centers.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Partially Agree. We do not think it is necessary for OEWD to convene an additional working group for this purpose. CCSF can work with OEWD to develop content that aligns with the needs of OEWD participants, within the context of our current meeting framework. This work is ongoing beyond December 2021 to respond to emerging needs.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R3 [for F3]	OEWD should convene a joint working group to review current Career Technical Education course offerings at City College and make recommendations to develop content that aligns with the needs of the OEWD participants by December 2021. The joint working group should include City College’s Dean for Workforce Development, the City’s Director of Sector and Workforce Development, and the Eligible Training Provider List Coordinator for Workforce Development Comprehensive Job Centers.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Partially Agree. We do not think it is necessary for OEWD to convene an additional working group for this purpose. CCSF can work with OEWD to develop content that aligns with the needs of OEWD participants, within the context of our current meeting framework. This work is ongoing beyond December 2021 to respond to emerging needs.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R3 [for F3]	OEWD should convene a joint working group to review current Career Technical Education course offerings at City College and make recommendations to develop content that aligns with the needs of the OEWD participants by December 2021. The joint working group should include City College’s Dean for Workforce Development, the City’s Director of Sector and Workforce Development, and the Eligible Training Provider List Coordinator for Workforce Development Comprehensive Job Centers.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	While the Board agrees that OEWD and City College of San Francisco should collaborate on building Career Technical Education course offerings that aligns with the needs of OEWD participants, OEWD and City College of San Francisco should be allowed to utilize their existing meeting frameworks to perform this work.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R4 [for F4]	City College should enhance its number of short-term certificate training programs by February 2022, and these courses should be developed in collaboration with businesses or community-based organizations receiving OEWD funding. This should include an increase in the number of CTE course offerings during City College’s summer semester to six.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	<p>We believe that if CCSF offered more short-term certificate programs with hours inclusive of evenings, it would assist in removing an enrollment barrier for OEWD participants that are working and/or participating in our workforce system programs. Due to OEWD participant schedules, short-term certificate programs that take place in the evening offer OEWD participants greater access to educational coursework. Additionally, certificate programs assist in upskilling jobseekers and lead to higher earnings. Though we agree with this feedback, this is a recommendation that is specific to CCSF. Due to our inability to implement the Recommendation, we responded to the Recommendation with Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable.</p> <p>Action to Address Finding— We are currently discussing your Recommendation, with CCSF, to enhance the number of courses provided by CCSF. Should CCSF choose to develop additional short-term certificate training programs, we will support and coordinate with CCSF in the creation of those programs.</p>
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R4 [for F4]	City College should enhance its number of short-term certificate training programs by February 2022, and these courses should be developed in collaboration with businesses or community-based organizations receiving OEWD funding. This should include an increase in the number of CTE course offerings during City College’s summer semester to six.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. While the College is engaging in conversations about creating more short-term training opportunities, it may not be feasible to meet the requirement of offering at least six of these short-term programs during summer. Contract Education may be a more feasible approach, due to its flexibility, and timing and scope would depend on the needs of community partners.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R4 [for F4]	City College should enhance its number of short-term certificate training programs by February 2022, and these courses should be developed in collaboration with businesses or community-based organizations receiving OEWD funding. This should include an increase in the number of CTE course offerings during City College’s summer semester to six.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. While the College is engaging in conversations about creating more short-term training opportunities, it may not be feasible to meet the requirement of offering at least six of these short-term programs during summer. Contract Education may be a more feasible approach, due to its flexibility, and timing and scope would depend on the needs of community partners.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R4 [for F4]	City College should enhance its number of short-term certificate training programs by February 2022, and these courses should be developed in collaboration with businesses or community-based organizations receiving OEWD funding. This should include an increase in the number of CTE course offerings during City College’s summer semester to six.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	While the Board of Supervisors agrees that City College of San Francisco should increase the number of short-term training opportunities, it is unclear whether it has sufficient budget allocations to do so at the requested scale, or within the suggested timeline, as of this Board's response.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R5 [for F5]	City College should allow priority registration for OEWD clientele enrolling in certificate program courses on the Eligible Provider Training List. Priority registration should begin with the Fall 2022 semester.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	We responded with Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable because only CCSF can allow priority registration for their classes, and we do not fully agree with the Finding. Moreover, our department is not the only City department that offers workforce development programming— there are approximately 300 workforce development programs administered across 22 departments in San Francisco. If we are to extend priority enrollment for individuals enrolled in workforce development programming, we should extend this across all departments with workforce development programming.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R5 [for F5]	City College should allow priority registration for OEWD clientele enrolling in certificate program courses on the Eligible Provider Training List. Priority registration should begin with the Fall 2022 semester.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. This would be subject to approval by the College’s Academic Senate, and any updates to registration priorities must comply with the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108. While the College could explore this, we are unable to commit to fulfilling this recommendation.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R5 [for F5]	City College should allow priority registration for OEWD clientele enrolling in certificate program courses on the Eligible Provider Training List. Priority registration should begin with the Fall 2022 semester.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. This would be subject to approval by the College’s Academic Senate, and any updates to registration priorities must comply with the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 58108. While the College could explore this, we are unable to commit to fulfilling this recommendation.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R5 [for F5]	City College should allow priority registration for OEWD clientele enrolling in certificate program courses on the Eligible Provider Training List. Priority registration should begin with the Fall 2022 semester.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The recommendation regards policies internal to City College of San Francisco and falls outside of the Board's purview.



2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R6 [for F6]	City College should convene a workgroup to identify and correct inaccuracies in the course descriptions, schedules, and costs included on the Eligible Provider Training List by January 2022.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	It would be helpful to our OEWD participants if the ETPL programs were accurately reflected on the Cal Jobs website. As written, the Recommendation places the responsibility on CCSF to convene a working group. We responded to this Recommendation with Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable because we cannot implement this Recommendation. Action to Address Finding— We will work with City College to support their correction of the inaccuracies in the ETPL. We will also make this Finding a recurring agenda item during our quarterly meetings with WIOA partners and CCSF to address the inaccuracies in the ETPL.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R6 [for F6]	City College should convene a workgroup to identify and correct inaccuracies in the course descriptions, schedules, and costs included on the Eligible Provider Training List by January 2022.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Agree. CCSF staff are already working on verifying and updating information on the Eligible Training Provider List and will complete this work by January 2022.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R6 [for F6]	City College should convene a workgroup to identify and correct inaccuracies in the course descriptions, schedules, and costs included on the Eligible Provider Training List by January 2022.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Agree. CCSF staff are already working on verifying and updating information on the Eligible Training Provider List and will complete this work by January 2022.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R6 [for F6]	City College should convene a workgroup to identify and correct inaccuracies in the course descriptions, schedules, and costs included on the Eligible Provider Training List by January 2022.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	The recommendation asks City College of San Francisco to convene an internal workgroup, which falls outside of the Board's purview. The Board of Supervisors concur with the recommendation that any inaccuracies are promptly corrected, but defers to CCSF as to the process for achieving that result.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R7 [for F7]	OEWD should work with stakeholders who coordinate the Eligible Provider Training List to develop an outreach program that encourages clientele to pursue City College certificate programs. The outreach plan should be approved by the Director of Workforce Development and implemented by April 2022.	Office of Economic and Workforce Development [August 29, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	OEWD should not create an outreach team to enroll students in a system, CCSF, that is not a part of our WIOA funding outcomes or requirements. We are committed to serving San Franciscans in our workforce system through participation in our programs and the placement in employment opportunities. As appropriate, OEWD-funded providers refer participants to CCSF to upskill for careers if they demonstrate interest in specific CCSF coursework. Action to Address Finding-- We will discuss with CCSF the possibility of having a point of contact to assist OEWD participants in navigating the CCSF system. This would be inclusive of admission, financial aid, and enrollment processes, and bolster enrollment for our participants.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R7 [for F7]	OEWD should work with stakeholders who coordinate the Eligible Provider Training List to develop an outreach program that encourages clientele to pursue City College certificate programs. The outreach plan should be approved by the Director of Workforce Development and implemented by April 2022.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. OEWD should not create an outreach program to enroll students in a system, CCSF that is not a part of its WIOA funding outcomes or requirements. CCSF is committed to serving San Franciscans through participation in our programs and partners with OEWD and its funded providers on placement in employment opportunities. As appropriate, OEWD-funded providers refer participants to CCSF to upskill for careers if they demonstrate interest in specific CCSF coursework.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R7 [for F7]	OEWD should work with stakeholders who coordinate the Eligible Provider Training List to develop an outreach program that encourages clientele to pursue City College certificate programs. The outreach plan should be approved by the Director of Workforce Development and implemented by April 2022.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Disagree. OEWD should not create an outreach program to enroll students in a system, CCSF that is not a part of its WIOA funding outcomes or requirements. CCSF is committed to serving San Franciscans through participation in our programs and partners with OEWD and its funded providers on placement in employment opportunities. As appropriate, OEWD-funded providers refer participants to CCSF to upskill for careers if they demonstrate interest in specific CCSF coursework.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R7 [for F7]	OEWD should work with stakeholders who coordinate the Eligible Provider Training List to develop an outreach program that encourages clientele to pursue City College certificate programs. The outreach plan should be approved by the Director of Workforce Development and implemented by April 2022.	Board of Supervisors [September 28, 2021]	Will not be implemented because it is not warranted or is not reasonable	While San Franciscans would benefit from encouraging OEWD clientele to enroll in City College of San Francisco, the proposed outreach plan is not aligned with current OEWD funding outcomes. However, OEWD and City College of San Francisco should continue to collaborate and coordinate outreach to the greatest extent feasible.

2020-21 CIVIL GRAND JURY FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND RESPONSES TO FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Report Title [Publication Date]	R# [for F#]	Recommendation	Respondent Assigned by CGJ [Response Due Date]	Recommendation Response (Implementation)	Recommendation Response Text
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R8 [for F8]	Contract Education and Instructional Services at City College should establish formal outreach guidelines for collaborating with local businesses to develop customized training programs. The outreach guidelines should be submitted for review to City College’s Vice Chancellor for Academic and Institutional Affairs by February 2022. The outreach guidelines should be implemented by March 2022.	City College of San Francisco [August 29, 2021]		Agree. The College plans to develop an overview of the ways in which local businesses and CBOs can partner in offering training to their employees/clients (includes Contract Education, Continuing Education, Instructional Service Agreements, Apprenticeship Programs, etc.). The College already collaborates with many local employers, including the City and County of San Francisco, to develop customized training programs. The College recommends expanding our partnership with the City to provide preference points to Civil Service job applicants who completed a degree or certificate at City College.
Strategic Alignment: Breaking Through to a Living Wage [June 30, 2021]	R8 [for F8]	Contract Education and Instructional Services at City College should establish formal outreach guidelines for collaborating with local businesses to develop customized training programs. The outreach guidelines should be submitted for review to City College’s Vice Chancellor for Academic and Institutional Affairs by February 2022. The outreach guidelines should be implemented by March 2022.	City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees [August 29, 2021]		Agree. The College plans to develop an overview of the ways in which local businesses and CBOs can partner in offering training to their employees/clients (includes Contract Education, Continuing Education, Instructional Service Agreements, Apprenticeship Programs, etc.). The College already collaborates with many local employers, including the City and County of San Francisco, to develop customized training programs. The College recommends expanding our partnership with the City to provide preference points to Civil Service job applicants who completed a degree or certificate at City College.