



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

Amended

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
December 4, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2661 253 7263. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2661 253 7263
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

F.X. CROWLEY

VITUS LEUNG

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2661 253 7263.

CALL TO ORDER

2:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Excused Absence
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline Minor presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No.2)

Kimberly Cox – former city employee SFMTA was laid off during mandated vaccine policy. Request to reinstate former employees and benefits to all who were terminated.
Ellen Lee Zhou – former city employee who feels people were terminated during the mandated vaccine period who had religious exemptions. Directed a comment at Carol Isen (DHR) for wrongful terminating people and requesting a resolution.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of November 20, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No.4)

None.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No.5)

Carol Isen Human Resources Director reported on two items: 1. Medical examinations, proposed Personal Services Contract for supplemental services and for medical exams for pre-employment sworn employees and Department of Public Health. Fire Department does their exams in-house, it has been a long- standing practice. Police and Sheriff Departments use occupational health services at the Department of Public Health and service is sufficient. The Department of Public Health would consider 3rd party to

supplement existing service. Dr. Fiona Wilson also commented that the Sheriff Department is comfortable with the timelines of the services provided by Occupational Health Services. The Executive Officer will send the recording of this discussion to the Sheriff Department. 2. Nurses hiring - the Civil Service Commission heard from City nurses regarding staffing and nurse hiring. Department of Public Health has been working with SEIU regarding nurse staffing. The Department of Human Resources supports this work. Supplement staffing by using external and internal registries (P103s) many nurses have dual appointments as 2320 nurses' and P103 nurses' vacancy rate is down from 12% to under 9%. The time to hire is moving closer to 90-day/3-month range at a rate of about 22/month. Luenna Kim also reported about staffing updates, the time to hire has been reduced from 140 days to 90 days, 140 hires, vacancy rate now 9%. They have now a dedicated recruitment team. The Department of Public Health is partnering with SEIU and the Department of Human Resources to simplify the application process and is consolidating eligible lists. There are two eligible lists, one for new and one for experienced nurses. There is a training co-hort with urgent care as a pipeline to emergency department; the 173 steps in hiring process to be reduced to more efficient; help center for centralized support, transforming leadership program for promotional opportunities which SEIU is supplementing. Working on having processes occur concurrently rather than consecutively.

Public Comment: Ellen Zhou spoke about wrongfully terminating Registered Nurses
Tia Paneet spoke she was not aware about the RN hirings, it is not being communicated to nurses.

0239-23-1 Report on the Status of De-Identification for Classification-Based Testing Recruitment.

Speakers: Dave Johanson, Department of Human Resources
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources
Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission

Action: *Accept the report and consider possible modifications to the Rules on De-Identification at a future meeting.* (Vote of 4 to 0)

Public Comment: Jesse Stanton, Sr. Eligibility Worker at HSA, suggested to revisit the De-Identification Rule

Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021, suggested to revisit the De-Identification and consider a rule revision

EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT (Item No.6)

The Executive Officer will report later during the PSC policy portion of the meeting.

**0240-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.
(Item No.7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40046-23/24	Airport	\$2,000,000	Contractor will provide repair and re-upholstery services on an as-needed basis for furnishings located throughout the terminals and facilities at the San Francisco International Airport (Airport). Services will include providing fabrics and filler materials, replacing fabrics, performing minor repairs on upholstered furnishings, assisting Airport staff with assessing conditions and scope of needed repairs to furnishings, and providing/installing pre-fabricated covers and hand-sewn or similar components for existing furnishings.	Regular	12/31/2028
41802-23/24	Airport	\$1,000,000	The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency has classified perfluoroalkyl and polyfluoroalkyl substances (PFAS) as contaminants of emerging concern. PFAS can be found in various products including, but not limited to, firefighting foam, cleaning products, and non-stick cookware. The Airport requires Contractor with PFAS expertise to provide recommendations and support services for: 1) updates/changes to PFAS related laws and regulations, 2) policy development with PFAS treatment and destruction methods, and 3) guidance on remediation. The work also includes PFAS investigation, identify source boundary limits, and cleaning of fixed storage units and fire trucks to remove PFAS contamination.	Regular	12/31/2028
43930-23/24	Airport	\$9,000,000	Contractor will provide specialized acoustical engineering services for the San Francisco International Airport (SFO or Airport), including independent third-party verification of noise data, assistance with developing procedures for the Airport's Ground Based Augmentation System (GBAS), production of Federal and/or State required reports including quarterly noise reports, providing acoustical litigation support, assistance with preparation of specialized noise studies, and other specialized technical services in support of the Airport's projects designed to reduce the Airport's noise impact area.	Regular	12/31/2028
43805-23/24	City Administrator	\$95,800,000	The contractor will provide refuse collection and disposal services (recyclables, compostables, and trash) for City and County of San Francisco departments.	Regular	6/30/2031
40802- 23/24	Controller	\$3,000,000	Proposed work is to conduct solid waste rate-setting analysis and cost allocation, conducting solid waste infrastructure needs analysis in San Francisco. This work includes Zero Waste Assistance and Zero Waste Analysis. The contractor will recommend the implementation of programs, technologies, or other solutions to meet Zero Waste goals, such as reducing food waste or construction and demolition debris and other recoverable materials, prepare studies and reports for the refuse rates process, and complete other tasks needed to reduce material generation, increase recovery, or decrease disposal.	Regular	11/30/2028
45670 – 23/24	Controller	\$3,000,000	To provide special tax consultant services in connection with (i) City planning for new Community Facilities Districts (“CFDs”) including review of any specific plans, development agreements and financing plans, (ii) formation of CFDs including the development of a Rate and Method of Apportionment (“RMA”), (iii) the annexation of property from the future annexation area into CFDs, (iv) the issuance of Special Tax Bonds and (v) annual administration of CFDs including calculation and preparation of special tax levies and tracking the collection of special taxes on an annual basis.	Regular	11/30/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41409 – 23/24	Public Health	\$360,000	This contract will cover eyeglasses and as-needed optometric services for all DPH hospitals and clinics. The contractor(s) who are awarded this contract will be fitting eyeglasses for the patients of both hospitals (Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital and Laguna Honda Hospital) and providing optometric services on an as-needed basis for patients referred by ZSFGH.	Regular	11/30/2030
43595 – 23/24	Public Health	\$700,000	The proposed work will provide new services to members of San Francisco’s transgender, gender-diverse (TGD) community, through three types of programming described below. The target population are TGD clients aged 18 and above who are experiencing homelessness, at risk of homelessness, or transitioning into supportive housing and are considering and/or in the process of engaging in medical or social transitions. 1) Behavioral health services expansion 2) Navigation and Outreach for TGD seeking medical and social transition services, and specialized care for gender-affirming surgery. 3) Capacity building and training development of staff and community partners who work with TGD community	Regular	08/31/2026
48385 – 23/24	Public Health	\$6,000,000	The contractor will provide patient safety services, implementing a new security model designed to address racial disparities in patient safety and patient experience to support a welcoming and healing environment while maintaining safety for patients and staff. Client safety services are part of the Department’s delivery of patient-centered services. Staff providing the services will be specifically trained in providing patient safety services following this model, including client greeting, navigation, and de-escalation. Safety Service staff must have both lived experience and good training and support which are essential to successfully providing services to our patients (e.g., lived experience with substance use disorders, housing instability, mental illness, and/or incarceration), and come from the patients’ communities. In moving from a traditional security services to this new safety services model and to focus on providing effective patient safety services with minimal law enforcement personnel, DPH will work with the Sheriff’s Department to re-assign the current 5.2 FTE (inclusive of backfill) of Sheriff Deputies (job classification 8304) from their present assignments in DPH community clinics to work in the community off-site, with availability to respond to clinic needs when called by clinic staff, which will be based on clear protocols. The services provided by 5.2 FTE of Sheriff Deputy will be provided by 4.4 FTE of community safety officers who would be stationed at the following DPH community clinic sites: Tom Waddell Urgent Care (to become Maria X Martinez Health Service Center), Tom Waddell Urban Health Clinic, Mission Mental Health Clinic and Behavioral Health Services at 1380 Howard Street. DPH Director of Security Basil Price has been in ongoing communication with Sheriff Paul Miyamoto to plan for this transfer of service provision. Once RFP is awarded and a contract executed a transition plan will be developed with sufficient time to ensure continuity of service. Please see attached current Letter Of Agreement (LOA) between the Department of Public Health (DPH) and the Sheriff’s Department for additional detail.	Regular	6/30/2027
45214 – 23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$8,000,000	The Customer Care and Billing Transformation project will update the existing Customer Care & Billing System (CCB) to Oracle’s Customer Cloud Service (CCS) while analyzing, documenting, and updating the CSB’s business processes to find optimizations to reduce manual workload, errors in billing and revenue operations, and improve customer service operations through a better experience, ease of maintenance and leveraging new features and functionality made available through the cloud vendor. The SI will facilitate identifying business processes which can be modified to align with CCS base functionality and limit or minimize customizations of the CCS platform.	Regular	1/31/2029

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47993 – 23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$2,000,000	The Turlock Irrigation District (TID) and Modesto Irrigation District (MID) (Districts) perform maintenance on the respective canal flow gauging stations. These gauges are needed to perform natural flow calculations for the Tuolumne River. Under the Raker Act, the City is required to maintain gauging stations to perform this calculation. Hetch Hetchy Water and Power, MID and TID are the three water and power operators on the Tuolumne River basin; therefore, coordinated efforts for basin hydrology and meteorological conditions are vital and beneficial to all three parties. In addition, MID and TID are neighboring utility entities that can provide support services in periods of emergencies when one party's resources may be insufficient. The City and County of San Francisco is mandated by the 1913 Raker Act to make payment and "recognize the prior rights of Districts to the natural daily flow of the Tuolumne River...", which is an entity under the Secretary of the Interior. This Agreement will allow the City and County of San Francisco to meet our legal payment obligation.	Regular	12/30/2028
48878-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$500,000	During the course of preconstruction activities for the Alameda Creek Watershed Center, over 70 burials and features were discovered at the site, including over 14,000 artifacts. Several burials and features were also discovered during construction activities at the Sunol Yard. The SFPUC, worked closed with the local Tribe and an archaeology firm to remove the burials, features and artifacts. In addition, the interpretive exhibits were modified with the assistance of Tribal members to reflect the significance of the site to the tribe's ethnohistory. The proposed work will include the following: (1) consultation regarding the reinterment of Native American remains on SFPUC property including site planning and oversight of reinterment (2) monitoring oversight during construction activities (3) development and implementation of and input on education programming.	Regular	9/12/2032
46699 – 23/24	Technology	\$4,000,000	Training users on the citywide Enterprise Licensed Geographic Information System (GIS) software products, and Geographic Information System Project consulting, on an as-needed basis. Prior to 2022 CSC did not require departments to include the proprietary licensing and maintenance costs for on-premise and cloud based software products. The totality of this request is \$3.5M for proprietary software licensing and maintenance for both on-premises and cloud software products, as well as up to \$500k in training and consultative services on an as-needed basis. Not all departments actually utilize the 100 hours of technical training and up to 100 hours of learning and service credits. This amount also encompasses the vendors GIS training pass which includes up to 50 training days per year for client departments use to learn about new features on the software suite of products.	Regular	6/30/2027
2000 – 07/08	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$54,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$54,500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$109,000,000	Contractor(s) will provide fiscal and programmatic services for a variety of intermittent and as-needed community health, planning, support and service projects. Areas of service will include the promotion and support of childhood immunizations projects, environmental health, asthma prevention, lead exposure prevention, diabetes prevention, smoking cessation, dental health programs, primary care promotion, and specialized health related training and research projects. Contractor(s) will also assist individuals and small organizations with the needed organizational and financial management skills essential to the effective delivery of these projects. The proposed PSC amount includes the value of the community planning, support and service projects, which may be funded through grants, work orders, or (limited) general funds.	Modification	Continuous

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
46550-17/18	Treasurer/Tax Collector	Current Approved Amount \$2,350,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$2,350,000	Perform supplemental collection services on delinquent business and medical accounts referred by various city departments; also perform credit reporting, skip tracing, and negotiation of payment plans. Contractor shall receive a maximum of 25% of collected funds as a commission fee. The amount of commission fees for medical debt collections will not exceed 250K. The remaining 600K for delinquent business accounts would not be an expense to the City, but instead a commission fee based on the collected funds.	Modification	1/1/2028
44872 – 21/22	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$460,989 Increase Amount Requested \$499,011 New Total Amount Requested \$960,000	Determine the existing conditions of San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency subway stations by conducting on-site inspections and audits, examining maintenance documents and records, and consulting with San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency staff and other tasks as required. Investigate and make maintenance recommendations on subway station components. Recommend and prioritize corrective, maintenance, and rehabilitation measures, estimate the costs of the items, and provide comparisons and evaluations among ranges of possible actions. Recommend and prioritize upgrades and enhancements, estimate the costs of the items, and provide comparisons and evaluations among ranges of possible actions.	Modification	3/1/2029

Speakers: Reanna Albert and Rochelle Laxamana, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #41409-23/24
 Reanna Albert and Basil Price, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #48385-23/24
 Carla Schultheis, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #48878-23/24
 Reanna Albert and Daisy Aguayo, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #2000-07/08

- Action:**
- 1) Approved PSC #41409-23/24 from the Department of Public Health with condition to report back in four (4) years. (Vote of 4 to 0)
 - 2) Postpone PSC 48385-23/24 from the Department of Public Health to the meeting of January 30, 2024. (Vote of 4 to 0)
 - 3) Approved PSC #48878-23/24 from Public Utilities with the condition to report back in four (4) years. (Vote of 4 to 0)
 - 4) Approved PSC #2000-07/08 from the Department of Public Health with the condition to report back in six (6) months with the results of the audit of the scope of work, analyses of the classifications that perform the work and clarification of the time period requested for the additional \$55M included in the modification. (Vote of 4 to 0)
 - 5) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

Public Comment: Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021 spoke about PSC #48385-23/24

0241-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract Number 42533-22/23 from the Human Rights Commission. (Item No.8)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42533-22/23	Human Rights Commission	\$750,000	The Human Rights Commission seeks to engage professional community engagement partners and event planners to help in the coordination and logistics of multiple community engagement events and focus groups to be held throughout the funding cycle. These events will be a part of important department outreach initiatives to connect directly with San Francisco citizens and gain feedback from key stakeholders. These events will allow the department to confer directly with nonprofit organizations providing services in the city, community members as well as the recipients of community and/or city services.	Regular	6/30/2025

November 20, 2023: Continued PSC #42533-22/23 from the Human Rights Commission to the meeting of December 4, 2023.

Speakers: Terry Jones, Human Rights Commission
Amelia Martinez-Bankhead, Human Rights Commission

Action: Approved PSC #42533-22/23 from Human Rights Commission. (Vote 3 to 1; Commissioner F.X. Crowley dissented)

0229-23-1 Proposed Revised Policy of the Civil Service Commission on Personal Service Contracts. (Item No. 9)

November 6, 2023: Adopted the report; post the proposed revisions to the Civil Service Commission Policy and Procedures for Personal Services Contracts.

Speakers: Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission
Emily Wallace, IFPTE Local 21

Action: Accept the Executive Officer’s staff report and adopt the proposed amendments to the Policy of the Civil Service Commission on Personal Service Contracts. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0140-23-6 Appeal by Eduardo Guerrero Ortiz of the Human Resources Director’s determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant’s complaint of harassment and discrimination. (Item No. 10)

September 18, 2023: The Civil Service Commission continued this item to a future meeting and moved to agendaize the matter as a closed session for consideration by the Commission at a date to be determined after the appellant has been given the opportunity to review their EEO file at the Department of Human Resources.

Speakers: Sandra Eng, Civil Service Commission
Lizzette Henriquez, Civil Service Commission
Estevan Villareal, Department of Human Resources

Action: Adopt the report, uphold the decision of the Human Resources Director, and deny the appeal by Eduardo Guerrero Ortiz.
(Vote of 4 to 0)

0100-21-7 Request for a Hearing by Danny Hui, former Transit Supervisor (9139) Municipal Transportation Agency on Their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 11)

Speakers: David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency
Danny Hui, Appellant

Action: Adopt the findings, deny the appeal, and approve the future employability restrictions. (Vote of 4 to 0)

COMMISSIONERS’ ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 12)

None.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 13)

4:53 p.m.