



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
November 6, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2661 400 2029. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2661 400 2029
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

F.X. CROWLEY

VITUS LEUNG

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2661 400 2029.

CALL TO ORDER

2:02 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

None.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of October 16, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopt the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

None.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)

None.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT

0228-23-1 2024 Calendar of CSC Meeting Dates including deadlines for reports. (Item No. 6)

Action Adopted the calendar. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0230-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.
(Item No.7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42055-23/24	Children; Youth & their Families	\$5,000,000	The Contract Management System (CMS) is an online application that serves as the primary contract monitoring and invoicing mechanism between grantees and the Department of Children, Youth and Their Families. This contract will provide CMS maintenance and support services related to daily application and data backup, application hosting and connectivity, project management, user support, security, implementation and monitoring, data integration, software bug fixes, minor additions to data collection, browser compatibility testing, general code optimization, and ongoing customizations.	Regular	6/30/2029
45002-23/24	Children; Youth & their Families	\$6,000,000	The Our415 Coordinated Communications Initiative of the Department of Children, Youth and Their Families is a multifaceted program designed to connect families with available programs, resources, and supports. The project includes the creation of a resource website for families, development of an online service inventory database, public event production, and brand marketing services for the department and its community initiatives. The intention is to create a network of tools and community engagement activities to link youth and families with the resources they need to thrive in the City	Regular	6/30/2029
43627-23/24	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$14,000,000	Professional Services that include: 1. software development of a commercial off the shelf software application for planning, developing, managing transit services. The application integrates to other systems for transit real time predictions and for transmitting timekeeping transactions for up to 3,000 transit employees. 2. Training on the use of this commercial off the shelf software application. 3. Technical expertise on this commercial off the shelf application the best use of the software and for planning future enhancements. Licensing for the use of the commercial off the shelf application for: 1. Developing transit schedules for SFMTA's public transit services, 2. Conducting online shift bids, managing employee work assignments, generating timekeeping transactions based on the schedule, bid, and shift worked, and 3. Interfacing the data from Transit Scheduling: a. to real time computer aided dispatching b. Transit passenger time predictions c. Peoplesoft People and Pay	Regular	9/30/2033
41202-23/24	Port	\$250,000	The Port is a utility operator for various utility types within this geography. California State law requires utility operators such as the Port to locate and mark their subsurface utilities prior to certain construction activities within their immediate vicinity. Through this solicitation, the Port seeks to contract with a consultant to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coordinate a portion of the Port's obligation with USA North; • Triage USA North ticket requests for subsurface utility location services; • Locate and mark Port-owned subsurface installations in the field; and • Coordinating with Port staff to ensure Port GIS base maps are maintained and updated 	Regular	9/30/2027

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49173-23/24	Public Health	\$5,000,000	Contractor(s) will work with Department staff to create engaging media and outreach campaigns and/or conduct community assessments and surveys for a variety of public health topics. The initial project will be a campaign to educate the public in the area of substance use in San Francisco and the availability and effectiveness of treatment for opioid addiction and educating the public about naloxone and how it can save a life. Contractor(s) will also provide: Recommendations on how to reach target audience using market analysis; Design multilingual and multimedia campaigns; Purchase ad space in a variety of forums; and provide engagement and reach metrics of the media campaigns.	Regular	12/31/2027
40354-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,540,000	Third Party Interrupter Testing: The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) Power Enterprise seeks International Electrical Testing Association (NETA) Level 3 or Level 4 certified technician to field test interrupters per PG&E's Interconnection handbook, Appendix R "Protective Relay Requirements and Approvals" found at the following link: https://www.pge.com/includes/docs/pdfs/shared/rates/tariff-book/ferc/tih/... SFPUC Power Enterprise Distribution Engineering will provide approved settings and SFPUC Power Enterprise Utility Field Services will program the interrupter to the approved settings. The approved settings will be provided to the NETA Level 3 or Level 4 certified technician by SFPUC in advance of the test date. No equipment or materials will be supplied by SFPUC. Contractor shall provide the probes/connectors to connect to interrupters. The interrupter testing equipment must follow the standards listed by SFPUC in the Scope of Work. Once testing is complete, SFPUC will install the equipment. If Contractor's performance of any tests discovers any deficiencies, Contractor shall notify and advise SFPUC of any corrective action that must occur prior to any further testing.	Regular	1/31/2031
43035-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$45,000,000	The scope includes work in three cooperative programs: 1. Source Water Protection - Watershed controls to preserve the San Francisco Regional Watersheds within Yosemite National Park (YNP) as high-quality drinking water sources and to maintain the filtration avoidance status of the Hetch Hetchy Supply. This includes watershed management for source water protection and implementation of the Raker Act water quality provisions, along with other source water protection initiatives. 2. Environmental Stewardship (ES) Program - Collaborative efforts to improve environmental stewardship of the Upper Tuolumne River ecosystem which affects, or is affected by, SFPUC facilities and operations within YNP. These efforts incorporate policies described in the SFPUC Water Enterprise Environmental Stewardship Policy and will also assist in carrying out stipulations entered into by the SFPUC within the Department of the Interior under provisions of the Raker Act. 3. Security Program - Providing security for facilities essential to SFPUC operations within the YNP.	Regular	6/30/2028
45219-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$15,000,000	The scope of work includes obtain services to augment and assist SFPUC staff with specialized program/ project scheduling, Critical Path Method (CPM) scheduling, forecasting, change control, cost controls, and cost estimating for capital improvement projects and programs, review construction change orders and evaluate cost and schedule impacts, database modifications, upload/download of data from other software systems to the Primavera suite of tools used in Program Controls Group (PCG), and other specialized services such as providing technical training to staff.	Regular	12/31/2033

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
48658-22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$8,000,000	4 Contracts at \$2,000,000 each. The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), Power Enterprise, seeks a professional services consultant to assist with power operations support on an as-needed basis. Tasks will include assisting in the development of an Integrated Resources Plan (IRP) and the design and implementation of ongoing IRP review. The consultant will also provide support in risk management, settlements, power scheduling, and trading. The SFPUC would also like to utilize the consultant's expertise in business and strategic planning for both the publicly-owned utility (POU) functions and community choice aggregation (CCA) processes.	Regular	9/30/2028
42458-23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,800,000	Fish screen cleaning and DSOD valve exercising at raw water supplies including: San Antonio Reservoir, Calaveras Reservoir, Crystal Springs Reservoir, and San Andreas Reservoir. Perform required treated water tanks and reservoir inspections and cleanings as required. Tanks and reservoirs to be inspected and cleaned are: Castlewood Reservoir, Tesla Treatment Facility domestic water tanks, Sunol Town Tanks, SVWTP Chlorine Contact Tank, SVWTP Treated Water Reservoir, The Balancing Reservoir, HTWTP Chlorine Contact Chamber, and HTWTP Treated Water Reservoir. **Inspection and cleaning including the removal of sediments and debris as well as necessary underwater repairs from pump sumps, tunnels and terminus's from and leading to SF Bay at and from: AWSS Pump Station # 1, 698 2nd. St, SF, CA. AWSS Pump Station # 2, 3455 Van Ness Ave. SF, CA. ** Limited Underwater Emergency inspections and underwater repairs for CDD potable water assets	Regular	12/1/2028
45441-23/24	Public Works	\$4,000,000	Provide specialized services in Specifications Writing and Hardware Design to support Public Works design staff on an as-needed basis. The Consultants will provide expert advice and services to ensure that the most up to date products are utilized in our specifications.	Regular	12/31/2030
48750-23/24	Public Works	\$3,000,000	Selected Consultants will provide specialized Inspector of Record (IOR) Inspection services for hospital projects on an as-needed basis. As required by the Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development (OSHPD) – a State Agency, Inspectors of Record for hospital projects must be certified by OSHPD. The role of the IOR is to provide competent and continuous inspection of all phases of hospital construction, allow OSHPD to efficiently monitor the construction process, and assure that the work is being performed in accordance with OSHPD-approved plans and applicable codes. An IOR must record all construction activities that occur on site and is responsible for verifying such items as seismic anchorage and equipment; the bracing of all mechanical, plumbing, and electrical piping; and conduit installation in accordance with the approved documents and installation procedures. The IOR also oversees all inspections and witnesses work performed by outside inspectors. As part of the inspection team and as the liaison between the Owner (City), the Architect of Record, and OSHPD, the IOR observes and reports the results of each inspection to all responsible parties.	Regular	9/30/2030
47587-22/23	Airport	\$750,000	Veterinary care services for approximately 18 working canines of the San Francisco Police Department Airport Bureau (SFPD-AB) Canine Unit at San Francisco International Airport (Airport). Work shall include providing standard care including examinations, disease prevention programs, diet and weight management services, medications, and treatments as necessary to various conditions and illnesses. Contractor shall also provide 24/7 emergency and specialty care include oncology treatment, cardiology, ophthalmology, and neurology services, on an as-needed basis.	Regular	12/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47345-23/24	Assessor/Recorder	\$564,250	The Office of the Assessor-Recorder’s (ASR) property assessment system is one of the most important IT resources in the City and County of San Francisco, as it tracks all valuations and modifications for taxable property in the City and is responsible for generating property tax revenues of over \$3.0 billion annually. ASR’s current property tax system is a proprietary system that was designed and installed over 20 years ago and is highly customized for ASR. ASR is in the process of replacing our property tax assessment system with a new modernized system known as the System for Managing Assessments, Records, and Transactions (SMART) which will more fully support ASR’s property assessment functions. Given that SMART will require an additional year to fully implement and deploy, it is essential that ASR be able to maintain and update the current system until the new system goes live and the old system can be fully decommissioned. Therefore, ASR is undertaking a new contract in the amount of \$564,250 for a software maintenance services agreement; the initial contract term is one (1) year with two (2) one-year options to extend for one year each	Regular	12/31/2026
48439-23/24	Human Resources	\$900,000	City candidates and employees need timely access to medical clearance and monitoring examinations, which are required for certain job classes under state and federal regulation. The scope of work includes all of the screening and monitoring services required for select City job classes to begin and continue work. Medical Examinations administered by a physician or physician extender: pre-placement physical exam, respirator clearance physical exam, physician consultation, hazardous worker exam, asbestos exposure physical exam, silica physical exam, Department of Motor Vehicles/Department of Transportation physical exam. Medical examinations administered by an ancillary provider or technician: Audiogram, screening electrocardiogram, resting, Cardiac stress test with treadmill, Chest X-Ray, 1 view, Chest X-Ray, 2 views, Chest X-Ray, 4 views, frontal and lateral with oblique projections, B Reader Chest X-ray, respirator medical clearance/OSHA, respirator fit test, qualitative, review of OSHA Respirator Questionnaire, spirometry. Laboratory work administered by an ancillary provider or technician: PPD, placement and reading, QuantiFERON, CBC with automated differential, Chem Comprehensive Panel, Blood lead, Cholinesterase, RBC, Cholinesterase, Plasma/Serum, Fecal Immunochemical Test, Laboratory or nonphysician review of tests/brief screen – no physical exam, venipuncture. Pre-Employment Titer and Vaccinations administered by an ancillary provider or technician: Titer: Mumps Antibody Screen, Titer: Rubella Antibody Screen (German Measles), Titer: Rubeola Antibody Screen (Measles), Titer: Varicella (Varicella or Chickenpox) Antibody Screen, Titer: Hepatitis B Surface Antibody (HBsAb), Titer: Hepatitis A IgG Antibody (HAAB). Pre-Employment Titer and Vaccinations administered by a Registered Nurse: Vaccine: Measles Mumps Rubella (MMR), Vaccine: Varivax (Varicella or Chickenpox), Vaccine: Tdap, Vaccine: Td, Vaccine: Influenza, Vaccine: Hepatitis B, Vaccine: Hepatitis A, Vaccine: Twinrix (Hep B and Hep A combo), Vaccine: COVID-19 Booster	Regular	6/30/2027
45665-18/19	Mayor	Current Approved Amount \$4,260,000 Increase Amount Requested \$471,000 New Total Amount Requested \$4,942,000	Contractor shall conduct and coordinate federal lobbying services for the City, including identifying and advocating for or against legislation and regulatory matters that impact the City. The scope includes identifying potential legislation or regulation, representing the City’s agenda to federal legislators, as well as advocating for the City’s position with proposed legislation and budget appropriations with federal legislators. This requires maintaining good relationships with the staff of federal legislators.	Modification	9/30/2024

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
3070-12/13	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$262,000 Increase Amount Requested \$420,000 New Total Amount Requested \$682,000	Contractor will provide specially training medical clowns to provide comfort and support to patients, their families and / or their caregivers. Medical clown services are a specialized form of patient support services that some studies have shown to be an effective part of the overall treatment plan for a patient. Medical clowns may utilize music, humor, magic tricks, and other techniques to entertain and relax patients.	Modification	12/31/2027

Speakers:

Rosa Esquivel, Municipal Transportation Agency spoke on PSC #43627-23/24.
 Kelly Hiramoto and Emily Raganold, Department of Public Health and Naj Daniels, Service Employees International Union Local 1021 spoke on PSC # 49173-23/24.
 Shawndrea Hale, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #40354-23/24.
 Shawndrea Hale and Helen Yang, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC# 45219-23/24.
 Don Sy, Public Works spoke on PSC 45441-23/24.
 David Heubner, Fiona Wilson, Carol Isen and Paul Cheng, Human Resources spoke on PSC # 48439-23/24.

Action:

1. Approved PSC # 43627-23/24 from Municipal Transportation Agency with the condition to report back in five (5) years. (Vote of 5 to 0)
2. Approved PSC# 49173-23/24 from the Department of Public Health with the proviso that a study is conducted for the creation of a new class or an existing class that can perform the work. (Vote of 5 to 0)
3. Approved PSC # 40354-23/24 from the Public Utilities Commission with the condition to report back in four (4) years. (Vote of 5 to 0)
4. Approved PSC# 45219-23/24 from Public Utilities Commission (PUC) with the condition of report back in five (5) years with an eight (8) years term and also to look at the feasibility of a study to determine if work can be done in-house by classifications in PUC. (Vote of 5 to 0)
5. Approved PSC# 45441-23/24 from Public Works. (Vote of 5-0)
6. Approved PSC# 48439-23/24 from Human Resources. (Vote of 5 to 0)
7. Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0229-23-1 Proposed Revised Policy of the Civil Service Commission on Personal Service Contracts. (Item No. 8)

Speakers: Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
Kate Kimberlin, Deputy City Attorney
Gus Guibert, Deputy City Attorney
Taraneh Moayed, Office of Contract Administration
Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

Public Donte Vickers, International Association of Machinists, Local 1414

Comment: Naj Daniels, Service Employees International Union Local 1021

Action: Adopted the report; post the proposed revisions to the Civil Service Commission Policy and Procedures for Personal Services Contracts. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0169-23-4 Appeal by Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez of the Rejection of the 9139 (CBT-9139-T00076) Transit Supervisor Examination. (Item No. 9)

Speakers: Shivani Nath, Municipal Transportation Agency
William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency
Alfonso Ramirez, Appellant

Action: Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0171-23-4 Appeal of Rejection of Application by John Reimonenq for 9139 Transit Supervisor (CBT-9139-T00076). ((Item No.10)

Speakers: None.

Action: Adopted the report and denied the appeal by John Reimonenq. Appellant failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0201-23-5 Appeal by Craig Martin of the Human Resources Director’s determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant’s complaint of retaliation. (Item No. 11)

September 18, 2023: The Civil Service Commission continued this item to a future meeting and moved to agendaize the matter as a closed session for consideration by the Commission at a date to be determined after the appellant has been given the opportunity to review their EEO file at the Department of Human Resources.

Speakers: Rachel Gardunio, Public Utilities Commission
Stephanie Medina, Department of Human Resources
Craig Martin, Appellant

Action: Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Human Resources Director, and denied the appeal by Craig Martin. (Vote 5 to 0)

0194-21-7 Request for a Hearing by Jose Santiago, former 3417 Gardener with the San Francisco Department of Public Works. (Item No. 12)

Speakers: Karen Hill, Department of Public Works

Action: Upheld the Department of Public Works’s decision to restrict the future employment of Jose Santiago with the City & County of San Francisco and denied the appeal. Appellant failed to appear. (Vote 5 to 0)

0180-20-7 Request for a Hearing by Sandra Zuniga, former Manager IV (0932) on their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 13)

September 18, 2023: The Civil Service Commission approved the request to postpone to a future meeting at the request of the appellant.

Speakers: Karen Hill, Department of Public Works
Sharee Nisha, Department of Public Works
Camille Framroze, Attorney for Appellant

Action: Commissioner Vitus Leung recused himself. (Vote of 4 to 0)

Upheld the Department of Public Works’s decision to permanently restrict Sandra Zuniga’s future employment with the City & County of San Francisco and denied the appeal. (Vote 4 to 0)

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 14)

Commissioner Kate Favetti requested the following: 1) A report back from the Department of Public Health on the hiring of Registered Nurses; and 2) A report back from the Department of Human Resources if the personal service contract regarding medical examinations will also assist the hiring in the Police Department, Fire Department, Department of Public Health, and the Sheriff's Department.

Commissioner Minor announced that she and the Executive Officer had anticipated on November 2, 2023, to respond to the Board of Supervisors Government Audit Oversight Committee regarding the Civil Grand Jury Report when it was postponed during the meeting due to Supervisor Preston being unavailable that day. This item is scheduled for the next GAO meeting scheduled for December 7, 2023.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 15)

6:12pm