

WORKFORCE INVESTMENT SAN FRANCISCO

Local Workforce Investment Board for the City and County of San Francisco

Minutes of The
August 18, 2023

Meeting of the

Workforce Investment San Francisco (WISF) Board Executive Committee
Office of Economic and Workforce Development

Meeting conducted in hybrid format on Zoom and in-person at
One South Van Ness, Fifth Floor, Room 5080
San Francisco, CA 94103

WISF Executive Committee Members Present (In person)	Jeanine Cotter, Luminalt Vikrum Aiyer, Heirloom Jorge Tapia, EDD
WISF Executive Committee Members Absent	Sam Rodriguez, Rodriguez Strategic Partners, LLC Tony Delorio, Local Union No. 665
Ohlone Land Acknowledgement, Announcements, & Housekeeping <i>(Discussion Item)</i>	Jeanine Cotter, Acting Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:07 A.M. Secretary Tai Seals-Jackson (OEWD) opened the meeting by reciting the Ohlone Land Acknowledgement and the meeting guidelines.
Roll Call <i>(Discussion Item)</i>	Acting Chair Cotter requested for Secretary Seals-Jackson to conduct roll call. Secretary Seals-Jackson took attendance, and quorum was achieved.
Chair's Welcome <i>(Discussion Item)</i>	Acting Chair Cotter welcomed the members and the general public who joined in person and on Zoom.
Adoption of Agenda <i>(Action Item)</i>	Acting Chair Cotter called the Adoption of the Agenda and requested comments from members. Seeing none, Chair Cotter called for a motion to adopt the agenda. Member Aiyer made the motion, and Member Tapia seconded. The motion passed unanimously.
Approval of Minutes from May 19, 2023 <i>(Action Item)</i>	Acting Chair Cotter called the Approval of the Minutes from May 19, 2023 and requested comments from members. Seeing none, Acting Chair Cotter called for a motion to approve the minutes. Member Tapia made the motion, and Member Aiyer seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

<p>Workforce Director's Report <i>(Discussion Item)</i></p>	<p>Acting Chair Cotter called the Workforce Director's Report and asked Joshua Arce, Director of Workforce at Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD), to introduce himself and his team. Director Arce introduced Director of Workforce Strategy Chad Houston; Jen Hand, Workforce Alignment Manager; Glenn Eagleson, Workforce Policy Manager; Secretary Tai Seals-Jackson; Armina Brown, Management Assistant; and Charlie Paisley, Sector Programs Manager.</p> <p>Director Arce summarized updated labor market data from the California EDD. Preliminary June 2023 data includes a 3.2% unemployment rate accounting for 18,600 unemployed in the San Francisco and San Mateo County Metropolitan District. Director Arce noted that the unemployment rate has increased slightly to levels last observed in late 2021, but has been relatively stable since then. Director Arce summarized the industry changes which include decreases in financial activities, private education and health services, and government. Director Arce introduced Jen Hand to provide additional background on the labor market information. Ms. Hand indicated that this is the first time in many years that there have been increases across all of OEWD's sector strategies, including all pilot sector training strategies, which belies the economic opportunity available to workforce participants enrolled in OEWD programming. Ms. Hand also noted that the Information and Professional and Business Services industries continue to see increases in employment, both month-over-month and year-over-year, which is different from media reports.</p> <p>Director Arce recognized colleagues who are joining on Zoom, including Adrian Owens, Alfredo Fajardo, Larry Chew, and Maddie Davenport.</p> <p>Director Arce showcased the HealthCare Academy graduation, which celebrated participants in a variety of healthcare occupations ranging from medical assistants to community health workers to certified nursing assistants. Director Arce introduced Charlie Paisley to note the providers who participated in the graduation, which included JVS, CityEMT, Mission Language and Vocational School, PRC, Homebridge, Homeless Prenatal Program, Homeless Children's Network, and Self-Help for the Elderly. Director Arce also noted that WISF Board Members Michon Coleman from the Hospital Council of Northern and Central California and Alex Wong from Kaiser Permanente joined the celebration.</p> <p>Director Arce made comments on the successful partnership with SFPD, SFOEWD, Supervisor Matt Dorsey, Mission Hiring Hall, Inner City Youth, and other community partners to fill police officer staffing shortages (appx. 500-800 current vacancies) through community recruitments. Director Arce noted that the police union negotiated a new contract which would put San Francisco police officers at a starting pay in the top level within the Bay Area.</p>
--	--

Director Arce shared the Dev/Mission TechSF graduation and showcased the strong outcomes and partnerships which have supported this program.

Lastly, Director Arce noted that the Employer Services unit and the Community Engagement unit have been recruiting for the new downtown IKEA location which is opening on 8/23. IKEA released a statement in the San Francisco Chronicle thanking OEWD and community partners for helping to fill vacant positions at the new location on market street.

Acting Chair Cotter opened the floor to questions.

Member Tapia requested information on what time the store is opening. Director Arce indicated he will find out the time and report back.

Acting Chair Cotter requested additional information on forecasts of unemployment and job growth. Through the Chair, Ms. Hand noted that labor market forecasting is dependent on past labor market performance, so as the labor market continues to grow and employment improves, the forecasts are very optimistic. Because of this, the team continues to monitor current conditions and look at variation on a monthly basis.

Acting Chair Cotter requested additional information on whether the sectors OEWD is currently investing in are demonstrating job growth. Director Houston noted that Glenn Eagleson is leading the Workforce Division's procurement process where OEWD is soliciting information from the community and from providers on investment preferences. Additionally, to support this process, the department is working internally and with a few consultants to conduct labor market information analysis and forecasting to assess sectors of interest for the upcoming procurement.

Acting Chair Cotter inquired whether the procurement process requires an assessment of the sector academies and outcomes. Director Houston confirms that is the case, and notes that the team will share WISF outcomes and a procurement update at the WISF December meeting.

Member Tapia noted that he intends to do additional inquiry in the labor market information data at EDD, because he wants to learn more about the decreases in government and private health and educational services.

Member Aiyer requested whether downtown recovery improvements have led to increases in retail hiring. Director Arce noted that the department has received anecdotal report that the hires are happening, but it is too early to have data in hand on any retail hiring increases. Director Arce noted that—during the meeting—the team received the most updated numbers from EDD's Labor Market Information Division. Director Arce shared that the unemployment rate held steady at 3.2% (preliminary data), with 18-19,000 individuals looking for work. At least 7,000 – 8,000 individuals are registered with OEWD looking for work on the Workforce Link job matching tool.

	<p>Seeing no further questions, Acting Chair Cotter closed the item.</p>
<p>Towards a Unified Definition of Workforce Development (Discussion Item)</p>	<p>Acting Chair Cotter called the item “Towards a Unified Definition of Workforce Development” and introduced Jen Hand, Workforce Alignment Manager, OEWD to present.</p> <p>Ms. Hand reviewed the Alignment legislation (Ordinance No. 209-22); the purpose of establishing a unified definition; explained the process for developing a definition which included stakeholder research with members, Inventory results from City agencies, legislation and policies governing the provision of workforce services, websites and procurements of Alignment member agencies; synthesized critical themes from member agencies; summarized all available workforce services funded by the City and County of San Francisco; demonstrated example definitions across Federal, State, and Local sources; outlined proposed definition components; and provided a draft definition for members to react to.</p> <p>The draft definition for discussion was as follows: “Workforce development” shall mean: publicly funded services including: workforce navigation, employment, training, supportive, and youth development services (defined in greater detail earlier in the presentation); in preparation for placement in post-secondary education or employment in high-growth sectors or in-demand occupations; which lead to family-sustaining wages, career pathways, quality jobs, and/or union membership; and prioritize participants who experience economic vulnerability.</p> <p>Acting Chair Cotter called for questions from the Board.</p> <p>Member Tapia requested an additional copy of the PowerPoint. Member Tapia noted that EDD would want to get more involved in the definition generation, because the unified definition will be of interest at the Federal and State level. Member Tapia noted that EDD would be interested in seeing priority of service for veterans incorporated, and expressed support for the inclusion of youth services.</p> <p>Member Aiyer asked what the delta between the current state and the definition’s adoption will be, especially with regards to grantmaking and the end user. Through the Chair, Ms. Hand acknowledged that the definition will allow the system to narrow the focus of the system and professionalize the system, including setting standards for City workforce programs. Through the Chair, Director Arce noted that all programs are funded through</p>

taxpayer dollars and City officials are accountable to the people of the City of San Francisco for being fiscally prudent in our investments. Chair Arce noted that this is only the first step in a multi-year roadmap to refine investments.

Acting Chair Cotter made a recommendation on adding retention data collection and outcomes to caveats and conditions section.

Acting Chair Cotter opened the floor to public comment.

Sola Adekanye from Workforce Solutions requested additional information on the procurement process and the kinds of services which are funded by OEWD, as well as whether there are preferred vendors. Mr. Adekanye noted that his organization serves over 135 small business, and he has reviewed the RFQs and has not observed any of the listed workforce development services. Through the Chair, Ms. Hand noted that the Workforce Division differentiates between an RFP and RFQ process, where the RFQ process solicits information for business facing services and the RFP process solicits vendors for the workforce development services which are outlined in the presentation. Through the Chair, Director Houston noted that there will be community meetings for the upcoming procurement for the workforce division, and the department expects to have at least 10 community meetings over the next two years for input. Mr. Adekanye inquired whether the meetings are posted on the website. Through the Chair, Director Houston noted that the meetings are posted on the website and OEWD also sends out notices via mailing lists. Mailing list sign up is here:

<https://signup.e2ma.net/signup/1989516/1958896/>

Director Arce noted that the list of OEWD workforce services and providers is available at www.oewd.org/jobcenters.

Member Callander asked whether City department are coordinating already and whether the City departments have developed alliances. Through the Chair, Ms. Hand noted that the Workforce Alignment scope has been in progress for six years. The partners started working together on trust building and strategy alignment over six years, and have moved to working more closely together on programs, initiatives, and continued high-level strategic planning since that time. Ms. Hand shared that this iteration of the Alignment Committee includes community and labor partners which allows these essential stakeholders to weigh in on an ongoing basis with the City departments. Director Houston noted that OEWD supports data coordination and program coordination for the State.

Member Aiyer asked whether the “family-sustaining wages, career pathways, quality jobs, and/or union membership” are characteristics the

	<p>WISF should consider in monitoring program efficacy, and how job data fits into program evaluation. Through the Chair, Ms. Hand responded that unemployment data is focused on the strength of the labor market instead of the strength of program design in the workforce development system. The outcomes listed reflect best practices in workforce program design and outcomes at the state and federal level. Director Houston noted that the unemployment information informs OEWD’s strategy for making investments. Ms. Hand confirmed that the outcomes listed are good components to keep in mind when the board is evaluating workforce programs.</p> <p>Member Tapia asked whether there is a lead or whether there will be a new department for coordinating agreements or projects. Through the Chair, Ms. Hand noted that the legislation tasked OEWD with staffing the committee which can include acting as a liaison for the system, but it is the Alignment Committee members’ responsibility to coordinate the entire system. OEWD does have strong relationships with existing workforce stakeholders and can support coordination as needed. Ms. Hand noted that the legislation is specific around not forming a new department to hold this function, but that the Alignment Committee may decide when it creates the Citywide Workforce Development Plan due in March about whether there should be specific communication channels or infrastructure created.</p> <p>Acting Chair Cotter closes this item.</p>
<p>Future Discussion Items <i>(Action Item)</i></p>	<p>Acting Chair Cotter calls for discussion from board members on topics of interest for future discussion.</p> <p>Member Tapia provides comments that the public perception of San Francisco in the downtown area seems very negative, especially with regards to individuals outside of San Francisco.</p> <p>Member Aiyer requests a presentation on the data components and calculations of family sustaining wages, which includes overlaying data on San Francisco workforce retention and residence.</p>
<p>Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items <i>(Discussion Item)</i></p>	<p>Acting Chair Cotter calls for public comment on non-agenda items. Secretary Seals-Jackson informs the public on how to provide public comment in the meeting and on Zoom. There is no public comment in the room or on Zoom. Ms. Hand notes that Director Arce shared the IKEA open hours from 11 a.m. - 7 p.m.</p>

<p>Adjournment <i>(Action Item)</i></p>	<p>Acting Chair Cotter expressed gratitude to all the attendees for their participation in the meeting and invited any member comments before proceeding with a vote to adjourn.</p> <p>Through the Chair, Director Chad Houston noted that the board will have board chair elections at the September 13th meeting.</p> <p>After receiving no further comments, Acting Chair Cotter called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Member Tapia made the motion, which was seconded by Member Aiyer and was unanimous. Members adjourned the meeting at 10:25 a.m.</p>
--	---

DRAFT