



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

*Sent via Electronic Mail*

October 26, 2023

**NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING**

Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez  
[REDACTED]

**SUBJECT: APPEAL BY ALFONSO JAMAAL RAMIREZ OF THE REJECTION OF THE 9139 (CBT-9139-T00076) TRANSIT SUPERVISOR EXAMINATION.**

Dear Alfonso Ramirez:

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **November 6, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.** You will receive a separate email invite from a Civil Service Commission staff member to join and participate in the meeting.

The agenda will be posted for your review on the Civil Service Commission's website at [www.sf.gov/CivilService](http://www.sf.gov/CivilService) under "Meetings" no later than end of day on Wednesday, November 1, 2023. Please refer to the attached Notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings. A copy of the department's staff report on your appeal is attached to this email.

In the event that you wish to submit any additional documents in support of your appeal, please submit **one hardcopy 3-hole punch, double-sided and numbered at the bottom of each page to the CSC Office at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 720 and email a PDF version to the Civil Service Commission's email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) by 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, October 31, 2023**, please be sure to redact your submission for any confidential or sensitive information that is not relevant to your appeal (e.g., home addresses, home or cellular phone numbers, social security numbers, dates of birth, etc.), as it will be considered a public document.

It is important that you or an authorized representative attend the hearing on your appeal. Should you or a representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and any testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance. As a reminder, you are to be honest and forthright during all testimony and in all documentation that you provide to the Civil Service Commission.

You may contact me at (628) 652-1100 or at [Sandra.Eng@sfgov.org](mailto:Sandra.Eng@sfgov.org) if you have any questions.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Jeffrey Tumlin, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Kimberly Ackerman, Municipal Transportation Agency  
William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Shivani Nath, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Commission File  
Commissioners' Binder  
Chron

## **NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

### **A. Commission Office**

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) and the web address is [www.sfgov.org/civilservice/](http://www.sfgov.org/civilservice/). Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

### **B. Policy Requiring Written Reports**

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

### **C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants**

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4<sup>th</sup>) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

### **D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission**

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

### **E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement**

**A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.**

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

### **F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order**

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

### **G. Procedure for Commission Hearings**

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

#### **H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings**

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at [www.sfgov.org/civilservice/](http://www.sfgov.org/civilservice/).

#### **I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission**

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take in-person public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the "Requests to Speak" portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended. People who have received an accommodation due to a disability (as described below) may provide their public comments remotely. The Commission will also allow public comment from members of the public who choose to participate remotely. It is possible that the Commission may experience technical challenges that interfere with the ability of members of the public to participate in the meeting remotely. If that happens, the Commission will attempt to correct the problem, but may continue the hearing so long as people attending in-person are able to observe and offer public comment.

#### **J. Public Comment and Due Process**

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

#### **K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings**

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

#### **Information on Disability Access**

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

#### **Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: [soft@sfgov.org](mailto:soft@sfgov.org), or on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine](http://www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine).

#### **San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.



# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22MTA) Applicable to Municipal Transportation Agency Service-Critical Classes

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of Written Reports MTA for Instructions on completing and processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: 0169 - 23 - 4
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: November 6, 2023
3. Check One:                 Ratification Agenda  
  Consent Agenda  
  Regular Agenda                                 X
4. Subject: **Appeal of Rejection of Application by Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez for 9139 Transit Supervisor (CBT-9139-T00076)**
5. Recommendation: Adopt the report and deny the appeal by Ramirez.
6. Report prepared by: Shivani Nath Telephone number: (415) 646-2120
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV. Commission Report Format -A**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:  
  
Municipal Transportation Agency Director: *Kimberly Decker*  
  
Date: October 25, 2023
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer  
Civil Service Commission  
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

<u>CSC RECEIPT STAMP</u>
--------------------------

Attachment

## NOTIFICATIONS

**Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez**



**Jeffrey Tumlin – Director of Transportation**

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor

San Francisco, CA 94103

Email: [Jeffrey.Tumlin@sfmta.com](mailto:Jeffrey.Tumlin@sfmta.com)

**Kimberly Ackerman – Chief People Officer, SFMTA Human Resources**

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor

San Francisco, CA 94103

Email: [Kimberly.Ackerman@sfmta.com](mailto:Kimberly.Ackerman@sfmta.com)

**William Miles II –Talent Acquisition Senior Manager, SFMTA**

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor

San Francisco, CA 94103

Email: [William.MilesII@sfmta.com](mailto:William.MilesII@sfmta.com)

**Shivani Nath, Examinations and Classification Manager, SFMTA**

1 South Van Ness Avenue, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor

San Francisco, CA 94103

Email: [Shivani.Nath@sfmta.com](mailto:Shivani.Nath@sfmta.com)



London Breed, Mayor

Amanda Eaken, Chair  
Gwyneth Borden, Vice Chair  
Stephanie Cajina, Director

Steve Heminger, Director  
Fiona Hinze, Director  
Manny Yekutieli, Director

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation

## MEMORANDUM

**DATE:** October 25, 2023

**TO:** Honorable Civil Service Commission

**THROUGH:** Kimberly Ackerman *kl*  
Chief People Officer, SFMTA Human Resources

**THROUGH:** William (Bill) Miles II *WEM*  
Talent Acquisition Senior Manager, SFMTA Human Resources

**FROM:** Shivani Nath <sup>SN</sup>  
Examinations and Classification Manager, SFMTA Human Resources

**SUBJECT:** **Appeal of Rejection of Application by Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez for 9139 Transit Supervisor (CBT-9139-T00076)**

---

### BACKGROUND

The job advertisement (job ad) for the Transit Supervisor (CBT-9139-T00076) recruitment opened on June 21, 2023, and closed on July 5, 2023, by the Municipal Transportation Agency, Human Resources Division, Exams and Classification (E&C) unit.

To qualify for this recruitment, applicants must have possessed the following minimum qualifications (MQs) by July 5, 2023 (closing date of the job ad).

- 1. Experience: Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA): 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, 9132 Transit Fare Inspector, 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisor/Investigator, 9136 Transit Training Specialist, or 9163 Transit Operator*

Clarifying notes were provided as part of the MQs, including a note specifying that experience driving school buses, tour buses and small vans is not considered qualification experience.

The E&C unit reviewed Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez's (Ramirez) application and rejected Ramirez for lacking six (6) months of required experience, that must have been at a large public transit system



performing duties equivalent to one or more of the classes listed above under the minimum qualifications.

After review of documents provided during the reconsideration period, a second not qualified notice was sent on 8/10/23, and Ramirez filed an appeal on 8/16/23. Ramirez contests that their time from their previous experience was not accurately calculated, and that they were not given enough time to submit verification from one (1) of their employers (which is not identified in the appeal).

### **ISSUE**

Does Ramirez meet the minimum qualifications to participate in the examination for class code 9139 for recruitment CBT-9139-T00076?

### **AUTHORITY/STANDARDS**

#### **Sec. 410.2 Examination Announcements**

The examination announcement shall be the official notice of an examination and shall provide the qualifications, dates, and other particulars regarding the selection procedure. Applicants must be guided solely by the terms of the examination announcement.

#### **Sec. 410.4 Appeals of Examination Announcements**

Appeals concerning the provisions of an examination announcement must be received by the MTA Director of Transportation/Designee within five (5) business days from the issuance date. The MTA Director of Transportation/Designee shall rule on all appeals and shall notify appellants in writing of the decision. This decision is subject to appeal to the Commission as provided elsewhere in these Rules.

#### **Sec. 410.9 Qualifications of Applicants**

Every applicant for an examination must possess and maintain the qualifications required by law and by the examination announcement for the examination. Experience gained in violation of Commission Rules shall not be recognized. City and County employees in Service Critical classes at the Municipal Transportation Agency shall receive credit only for the duties of the class to which appointed or assigned unless sufficient and credible documentation is provided to verify performance of other duties. Employees in Service-Critical classes at the Municipal Transportation Agency may receive credit for duties not usually performed by incumbents in a Service-Critical class if their employee file contains contemporaneous documentation that the duties were assigned and performed. By way of example but not limitation, records that describe and verify the out-of-class assignment that may be accepted as documentation include a valid performance appraisal completed during the normal evaluation period, payroll records filed at the time of the assignment and Notice of Assignment. Credit for duties in Service-Critical classes at the Municipal Transportation Agency



not usually performed by incumbents in a Service-Critical class based on non-contemporaneous documentation shall require the certification of the Municipal Transportation Agency Deputy Director, Labor Relations and Human Resources, and the approval of the Director of Transportation.

#### Sec 405.12.1 Examination Matters

An action by the MTA Director of Transportation/Designee, on examination matters, may be appealed to the Commission provided such appeal is received by the Executive Officer by close of business on the fifth (5th) working day (excluding Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays) following the postmarked mailing date of notification to the appellant. The appeal period shall be extended an additional five (5) working days (excluding Saturdays, Sundays, and holidays) where the notification to the appellant is sent exclusively by certified mail – return receipt requested. The Commission's action on the appeal shall be final and no reconsideration request shall be allowed.

### FINDINGS

1. Ramirez was appointed to the Transit Operator, class code 9163, on 1/14/19 in a permanent civil service appointment. **[Attachment A]**
2. The examination announcement for **CBT-9139-T00076** was posted on June 21, 2023, and closed July 5, 2023. **[Attachment B]**
3. No appeals were received related to the job advertisement.
4. Ramirez submitted a timely application, with one (1) attachment, their resume, to compete in the recruitment process on June 22, 2023. **[Attachment C]**
5. Based on the 1/14/19 appointment date, Ramirez possessed nearly 4 years, 6 months of experience in class 9163 Transit Operator as of the filing deadline.
6. The E&C unit determined that the application materials and supporting documents did not verify full possession of years of experience as required by the minimum qualifications. Ramirez received their first not-qualified notice on July 21, 2023. The first not-qualified notice required additional information to be submitted by July 28, 2023. **[Attachment D]** Ramirez responded to Suzanne Wong, Senior Human Resources Analyst (Wong) on the same day and asked if an extension to submit the information was a possibility. Wong responded on July 24, 2023 and asked Ramirez to do their best to meet the deadline but if they were unable to do so, to make contact on July 28, 2023. Rodriguez made contact on July 27, 2023, indicating that they were still waiting on their employer for a verification letter. Wong responded on this same day and stated, “if you haven’t received it on Monday, please let me know.” (July 31, 2023 would have been the date on that Monday.) **[Attachment E]**





7. Ramirez submitted two (2) paystubs for employer Blue Bus Tours, on July 28, 2023. No additional documents were submitted, and no other extension was requested. **[Attachment F]**
8. Upon review, The E&C unit did not find that the additional documents submitted verified full possession of the Minimum Qualifications. Ramirez received a second not-qualified notice on August 10, 2023, detailing the reasons for rejection of the application. **[Attachment G]**
9. Ramirez filed an appeal on the rejection of his application on August 16, 2023. **[Attachment H]**

### ANALYSIS

The 9139 Transit Supervisor is a first-line supervisor. The incumbent in the class is responsible to supervise, direct, review and evaluate the work of personnel engaged in a variety of transit service activities serving the public who utilize the Municipal Transportation Agency transportation systems. A large part of the work includes transit operator supervision, analyzing traffic passenger data, field monitoring, investigating service issues, transit schedule preparation and modification, divisional assignments, and initiating responses by personnel of transit services including dispatching police, medical and other support personnel. The work requires frequent interaction with the public, personnel and other stakeholders in many settings. **[Attachment I]**

Positions in this classification are assigned to the following working groups: Central Control, Dispatch, Metro Rail Operations, Scheduling, Station Operations and Street Operations.

Ramirez listed three (3) work experiences on their application. One (1) of the three (3) work experiences were considered qualifying. Ramirez was credited for four (4) years and six (6) months of qualifying experience as of the final filing date of July 5, 2023, for their experience as a Transit Operator, class code 9163, at the MTA, where they are still currently employed. The job classification is listed on the 9139 job ad as a recognized classification that provides relevant work experience towards minimally qualifying for the subject 9139 recruitment for Transit Supervisor.

Ramirez was not credited for their work experience as a Real Estate Agent for Keller Williams (where the application indicates still being held as of the filing deadline). This is because as a real estate agent, Ramirez presents purchase offers, represents buyers, follows up with prospective buyers, explains incentive on properties and registers new clients and cultivates long-lasting relationships. This work experience does not provide the relevant experience required to minimally qualify for the subject 9139 recruitment for Transit Supervisor.

Ramirez was also not credited for their work experience as a Tour Bus Operator for Blue Bus Tours. Tour Bus Operator experience is currently and has been historically considered not qualifying experience. This is consistent with job ads dating back to 2009. **[Attachment J]** Specifically, under



the notes section it states, “*Experience driving school buses, tour buses and small vans is not considered qualifying experience.*” According to analyst notes from the 2009 recruitment, this language was added in consultation with MTA’s Subject Matter Experts to transparently state how the determination of wording in the MQs associated with a “large public transit system” will be evaluated when reviewing applications.

While the experience gained as a Tour Bus Operator may appear relevant on face-value, it does not provide the full breadth of experience necessary. The classes for which one must possess 5 years of equivalent experience to minimally qualify all require a strong knowledge of metro operations, the provisions of providing transit services to the public, and strong communication skills when interacting with the public and personnel to relay critical operational information and resolve complicated issues such as reporting safety hazards, redirecting lines based on traffic, special events or street closures, and adjusting schedules as necessary related to such issues. Of the classes listed in the MQs, the 9163 Transit Operator is the only one which is a driving position.

Ramirez listed on their application that they accepted and processed fares, transported passengers along prescribed routes, inspected emergency equipment and verified safe working order of the bus. However, Ramirez’ tour bus experience is not equivalent to working as a 9163 Transit Operator with a large public transit system. Our SME states that Transit Operator experience is a time point based service, where operators are expected to stay on schedule to get to a public transit stop, maintain proper spacing between busses, and to get riders from one point to another timely to meet connecting modes of transportation. Transit Operators also need to maintain close contact with the Integrated Control Center (ICC). An ICC coordinates management of the entire Transportation network to enhance efficiency, safety and overall management of transportation systems. While a tour bus operator may relay to a form of an ICC, such as a dispatcher, it is not equivalent to a Transit Operator with a large public transit system, where coordination is key to maintaining on-time performance and overall success of services, making heightened awareness of surroundings, and effective communication skills in stressful situations a critical skill on day one on the job. This experience is deemed critical for success in the Transit Supervisor position at MTA.

Ramirez submitted two (2) pay stubs during the reconsideration period. The pay stubs showed earnings during the 12/3/17, and 12/2/18 pay periods that Ramirez collected while employed with Blue Bus Tours LLC. This was not new or additional information, and it did not change the original determination as no information was presented to indicate the experience was anything other than tour bus experience. As such, a second not qualified notice was sent.

The E&C unit received an appeal on the rejection of Ramirez’s application. In the appeal Ramirez contests that their time from their previous experience was not accurately calculated, and that they were not given enough time to submit verification from one (1) of their employers. The time possessed at SFMTA is based on the City’s internal Employee System and only shows 4 years, 6 months of experience as of the filing deadline.



There is evidence to demonstrate that Ramirez was afforded additional time to submit information. They received their first not-qualified notice on July 21, 2023 with a stated deadline that documents be submitted by July 28, 2023. It is standard for individuals to be provided 5 business days to provide such documentation to request for a reconsideration of their application. Ramirez responded to Suzanne Wong, Senior Human Resources Analyst (Wong) on the same day and asked if an extension to submit the information was a possibility. It is not typical to provide an extension unless the candidate were able to show effort having been taken to get the documentation by the stated deadline and difficulties expressed in doing so, such as the employer stating they would not be able to provide it until the following week. Since the request was made on the same date the notice was sent, there was no evidence of such attempts already having been made or statements of such. Wong responded on July 24, 2023, and asked Ramirez to do their best to meet the deadline but if they were unable to do so, to make contact on July 28, 2023. Ramirez made contact on July 27, 2023, indicating that they were still waiting on their employer for a verification letter. Wong responded on this same day and stated, “if you haven’t received it on Monday please let me know.” (July 31, 2023, would have been the date on that Monday.) Ramirez submitted two (2) pay stubs on Friday, July 28, 2023, and did not submit any additional documents by the extended date of Monday, July 31, 2023, nor did Ramirez ask for another extension. As such no further extensions were granted.

No other employers were listed on the application materials under than work as a Rail Estate Agent. SFMTA notes that Ramirez makes mention of MV Transportation in their appeal stating employment from 2016-2017. There is no mention of this employer on the application materials submitted. Per the job ad, all work experience substantiating possession of the minimum qualifications needed to be included on the application by the filing deadline.

Based on all the information received, all time was accurately calculated and appropriately credited.

### **CONCLUSION**

Ramirez contests that they should be qualified for the current 9139 examination. Based on the information received, Ramirez lacked six (6) months of the required minimum qualifications by the filing deadline that must have been at a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the classes listed under the minimum qualifications as discussed above.

### **RECOMMENDATION**

Adopt the report and deny the appeal by Ramirez.



**INDEX**

<b>Attachment</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Page</b>
A	Ramirez CCSF Job Appointment Summary	RAMIREZ-001
B	2023 Job Ad for Transit Supervisor, 9139 (CBT-9139-T00076)	RAMIREZ-002
C	Ramirez application with Resume	RAMIREZ-007
D	Ramirez First Not-Qualified (NQ) Notice	RAMIREZ-010
E	Ramirez & Wong Communications between July 21, 2023 – July 28, 2023, regarding additional information and extension to submit information.	RAMIREZ-012
F	Additional Documentation Submitted By Ramirez During Reconsideration Period	RAMIREZ-017
G	Second Not-Qualified (NQ) Notice	RAMIREZ-019
H	Ramirez Notice of Appeal	RAMIREZ-021
I	9139 Transit Supervisor Class Spec	RAMIREZ-027
J	9139 Job Ad from 2009	RAMIREZ-035



# ATTACHMENT A

Alfonso J Ramirez      Emp:      ID: [REDACTED]      Empl Record: 0

Personalize | Find | View All | [?]      First: 1 of 1      Last: [?]

EF Date	Appt Date	Action	Description	Payroll Status	Job Code	Union Code	Empl Class	Empt Cat	FullPart Time	Elig List #	Rank	POS #	Dept Sen Date	Dept Location	Cert Date	Cywl Srvy Date	Company Seniority Date	Vacation Anniversary Date	Sick Anniversary Date
01/14/2019	01/14/2019	HIR	New Hire	Active	9183	233	PCS	NA	F	M00214	154.00	#1009581	01/03/2019	MTA	MTA001	01/03/2019	01/14/2019	01/14/2019	01/14/2019

[Save](#)    [Return to Search](#)    [Notify](#)

# ATTACHMENT B

## Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139)

(Default)

- Multiple Locations, San Francisco, CA, United States
- Full-time

### Company Description

San Francisco is a vibrant and dynamic city, on the forefront of economic growth & innovation, urban development, arts & entertainment, as well as social issues & change. This rich tapestry of culture and ideas is sustained by our City's commitment to heighten the quality of life for San Franciscans and residents of the greater Bay Area. Our employees play an important role not only in making our City what it is today, but also in shaping the future of San Francisco.

**Application Opening:** June 21, 2023

**Application Deadline:** July 5, 2023

**Compensation Range:** \$98,878 - \$120,198 Yearly (This compensation range will change effective July 1, 2023.) 9139 Transit Supervisor | City and County of San Francisco (sf.gov)

**Recruitment ID:** CBT-9139-T00076 / REF4724E

### Job Description

Under general supervision, the Transit Supervisor, as the first-line supervisor, supervises, directs, reviews, plans and evaluates the work of subordinate personnel engaged in a variety of transit service activities at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA). This is a uniformed job classification.

#### Essential Functions:

According to Civil Service Commission Rule 409, the duties specified below are representative of the range of duties assigned to this job code/class and are not intended to be an inclusive list.

1. Supervises the activities of transit personnel; ensures that the department rules, policies and procedures are followed by subordinate personnel.
2. Maintains transit services by coordinating schedule adjustment and operator activities with TMC and other transit supervisors; investigates service problems on assigned lines and at MUNI metro stations; takes corrective actions; and ensures proper coverage at subway stations.
3. Prepares and/or modifies transit service schedules; analyzes traffic and passenger data to identify schedule problems and reports the information to appropriate personnel, and uses computer hardware and software in the performance of duties.
4. Instructs, advises and evaluates subordinate personnel in the field, classroom, or division on the safe, efficient operation of revenue and non-revenue equipment and operating rules, procedures and policies; identifies and recommends retraining needs.

5. Prepares different reports such as schedule adherence reports, accident/incident/violation reports and instructional plans using computer applications; reviews reports to ensure that the information is complete and accurate.
6. Coordinates and initiates responses by appropriate personnel and transit services; maintains communications among field staff, responds to silent alarms and emergencies; dispatches police, medical units and/or support personnel.
7. Interacts with members of the public and other agency representatives on various matters; listens to customer complaints and takes appropriate courses of action; and directs traffic as needed. Serves as Good-Will-Ambassador for the SFMTA.
8. Uses different computer applications to prepare correspondence, and reports; monitors service and researches information; utilizes specialized computer applications such as Trapeze, DriveCam, NEXTBUS, and TransitSafe, OrbCAD, MAESTRO, Microsoft Office Suite, as well as applicable electronic forms as assigned.
9. Performs related duties and responsibilities as assigned.

**Nature of Work:** requires incumbents to work rotating shifts, holidays, nights, and weekends; to work outdoors in all weather conditions; and to use computer applications; stand and/or sit for prolonged periods of time; and may require the performance of different physical activities such as lifting /transporting/operating work-related materials and equipment weighing up to 50 pounds; pulling poles, may be required to manually setting track switches on surface streets and cranking switches in the subway, resetting retrievers to return disabled transit vehicles to service and assisting in the movement of disabled vehicles when required.

## Qualifications

*The following are required to be possessed as of the filing deadline for applications:*

1. Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA): 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, 9132 Transit Fare Inspector, 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisor/Investigator, 9136 Transit Training Specialist, or 9163 Transit Operator.

*The following must be possessed as of the date that a position is certified to the eligible list and maintained through the date of appointment. These minimum qualifications ensure that hires will possess necessary standards of delivering safe and quality service.*

1. No accidents where applicant contributed to the cause (i.e., preventable) in the previous thirty-six (36) months; **AND**
2. No preventable non-collision safety incidents in the previous twelve (12) months; **AND**
3. No suspensions in the previous twelve (12) months; **AND**
4. No Performance Appraisals within the previous twelve (12) months with an overall determination of unsatisfactory performance; **AND**
5. Possession of a valid, unrestricted, CA Class C Driver License

*The following will be assessed during the probationary period:*

1. Ability to utilize software applications related to the work of the assigned unit

### **Notes:**

- A preventable non-collision safety incident refers to any event that involves unsafe operation of a vehicle.
- All candidates who possess the required education and experience by the filing deadline will be invited to compete in the examination process. When positions are certified to the eligible list, reachable candidates who score high enough in the selection process will be reviewed to ensure that they meet all listed minimum qualifications.
- Experience driving school buses, tour buses and small vans is not considered qualifying experience.
- Employees must maintain the licensure and certification requirements as a condition of employment.
- Some positions require obtaining and maintaining a valid Commercial Class B Driver License with appropriate endorsements as required by the DMV and no restrictions that prohibit operation of a SFMTA public transit vehicle within six (6) months of appointment and obtaining and maintaining Verification of Transit Training (VTT).



- Some positions may require possession of a valid DMV Medical Examiner's Certificate as a condition of assignment to such position(s).

One year of full-time employment is equivalent to 2000 hours. (2000 hours of qualifying work experience is based on a 40-hour work week.) Any overtime hours that you work above forty (40) hours per week are not included in the calculation to determine full-time employment.

*Applicants must meet the minimum qualification requirement by the final filing date unless otherwise noted.*

**Verification:** Applicants may be required to submit verification of qualifying education and experience at any point during the recruitment and selection process. More information can be found at: <https://sfdhr.org/information-about-hiring-process#verification>.

Prior to final selections being made, candidates in consideration for hire will have their employment records as well as state and internal driving records reviewed to ensure possession of the above minimum qualifications. Candidates who were not SFMTA employees for part of or all of the time periods being reviewed will be required to provide additional documentation verifying possession of the minimum qualifications.

**Note:** Falsifying one's education, training, or work experience or attempted deception on the application may result in disqualification for this and future job opportunities with the City and County of San Francisco.

All work experience, education, training and other information substantiating how you meet the minimum qualifications must be included on your application by the filing deadline. Information submitted after the filing deadline will not be considered in determining whether you meet the minimum qualifications.

Resumes will not be accepted in lieu of a completed City and County of San Francisco application.

Applications completed improperly may be cause for ineligibility, disqualification or may lead to lower scores.

**SELECTION PROCEDURE:** ([General Exam Process Information](#)) After application submission, candidates deemed qualified must complete all subsequent steps to advance in this selection process, which includes the following:

**Minimum Qualification Supplemental Questionnaire (Weight: Qualifying):** Candidates will be required to complete a MQSQ as part of the employment application. This MQSQ is designed to obtain specific information regarding an applicant's experience in relation to the Minimum Qualifications (MQ) for this position. The MQSQ will be used to evaluate if the applicant possesses the required minimum qualifications.

**Trades Supervisory Examination (TSE) (Weight: 50%):** Candidates will be administered a written multiple-choice examination that includes test items that relate to various supervisory practices and procedures (e.g., directing subordinates, delegating tasks to subordinates, providing customer service, demonstrating appropriate supervisory/leadership behavior, addressing and/or evaluating subordinate issues, behavior and performance, etc.) as well as reading comprehension items. This is a standardized examination, and therefore, test questions and test answers are not available for public inspection or review.

For your reference, a Multiple-Choice Test Preparation Manual is available on the DHR website: <http://www.sfdhr.org/modules/showdocument.aspx?documentid=18426>

The examination is administered via computer or in paper format. Qualified candidates will be notified of the particular format to be used in their test appointment notification. The score you achieve on this examination shall be valid and 'banked' for three years, starting from the date of the examination. This means that, during this three-year time period, you will not be required to take this test again should you apply and be found eligible for a future announcement for which this particular test is used. Please note this test is used for other supervisory classes therefore your test score may be applied to one or more of these classes if you choose to apply to future recruitments. If the test for this future announcement is held within one year of the date of this examination, your score will be automatically applied to that announcement. However, after one year, you have the option to either (a) apply your test score to the other announcement or (b) re-take the test. Re-testing is permitted no sooner than one year from the date of the examination and only in association with your eligibility for another announcement for which this test is used. Please note that, should you re-test, your re-test score would become your official score since it is the most recent. Only those applicants who pass the Trades Supervisory Exam will receive a score on the Written Multiple-Choice Examination.

**Written Multiple-Choice Examination (Weight: 50%):** Candidates will be tested to determine their relative knowledge, skill and ability levels in job-related areas which may include but not be limited to: knowledge of transit lines, schedules and equipment; knowledge of traffic patterns and their impact on transit corridors; interpersonal ability; analytical ability; and knowledge of emergency procedures.

This is a standardized examination and, therefore, test questions and test answers are not available for public inspection or review. A passing score will be established for each examination. Candidates must pass all examinations in order to be placed on the eligible list.

## Additional information

**Eligible List/Score Report:** A confidential eligible list/score report of applicant names that have passed the civil service examination process will be created and used for certification purposes only. An examination score report will be established, so applicants can view the ranks, final scores and number of eligible candidates. Applicant information, including names of applicants on the eligible list/score report, shall not be made public unless required by law. However, an eligible list/score report shall be made available for public inspection, upon request, once the eligible list/score report is exhausted or expired and referrals resolved. The eligible list/score report resulting from this civil service examination process is subject to change after adoption (e.g., as a result of appeals), as directed by the Director of Transportation or the Civil Service Commission.

The duration of the eligible list/score report resulting from this examination process will be 24 months and may be extended with the approval of the Director of Transportation.

### Certification Rule

The certification rule for this selection process will be **Rule of Three Scores**.

**Terms of Announcement:** Applicants must be guided solely by the provisions of this announcement, including requirements, time periods and other particulars, except when superseded by federal, state or local laws, rules or regulations. [Note: The correction of clerical errors in an announcement may be posted on the Department of Human Resources website at <https://careers.sf.gov>.] The terms of this announcement may be appealed under Civil Service Rule 410.4. Such appeals must be submitted in writing to the Department of Human Resources, 1 S Van Ness Avenue, 4th Floor, San Francisco, CA 94103 by close of business on the 5th business day following the issuance date of this examination announcement. Information concerning other Civil Service Commission Rules involving announcements, applications and examination policies, including applicant appeal rights, can be found on the Civil Service Commission website at <http://sfgov.org/civilservice/rules>.

**Medical Examination/Drug Testing:** Candidates who are being considered for appointment may be required to pass a medical examination. The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) has determined that Class 9139 Transit Supervisor is a "safety-sensitive" position, under regulations issued by the Federal Transit Administration (49 CFR Part 655). All applicants for Safety-Sensitive positions shall undergo urine drug testing prior to employment and within 90 days prior to performing Safety-Sensitive functions for the first time. For more information, click here: <https://www.sfmta.com/about-us/sfmta-career-center/how-join-our-team#Background>.

[Additional Information Regarding Employment with the City and County of San Francisco: Information About The Hiring Process / Conviction History / Employee Benefits Overview / Equal Employment Opportunity / Disaster Service Worker / ADA Accommodation / Veterans Preference / Seniority Credit in Promotional Exams / Right to Work / Copies of Application Documents / Diversity Statement](#)

**How To Apply:** Applications for City and County of San Francisco jobs are only accepted through an online process.

- Visit <https://careers.sf.gov/>
- Type "9139" into the "Search by class or keyword" field
- Click the link to open the job ad
- Select the "Apply Now" button and follow instructions on the screen

Applicants may be contacted by email about this recruitment and, therefore, it is their responsibility to ensure that their registered email address is accurate and kept up-to-date. Also, applicants must ensure that email from CCSF is not blocked on their computer by a spam filter. To prevent blocking, applicants should set up their email to accept CCSF mail from the following addresses (@sfgov.org,

@sfdpw.org, @sfport.com, @flysfo.com, @sfwater.org, @sfdph.org, @asianart.org, @sfmta.com, @sfpl.org, @dcyf.org, @first5sf.org, @famsf.org, @ccsf.edu, @smartaalerts.info, and @smartrecruiters.com).

Applicants will receive a confirmation email that their online application has been received in response to every announcement for which they file. Applicants should retain this confirmation email for their records. **Failure to receive this email means that the online application was not submitted or received.**

**Exam Analyst Information:** If you have any questions regarding the Exam Process, please contact the exam analyst, [suzanne.wong@sfmta.com](mailto:suzanne.wong@sfmta.com). *Please note: all your information will be kept confidential according to EEO guidelines.* SW | CBT-9139-T00076 | CPE

**CONDITION OF EMPLOYMENT:** All City and County of San Francisco employees are required to be fully vaccinated against COVID-19 as a condition of employment. Someone is fully vaccinated when 14 days have passed since they received the final dose of a two-shot vaccine or a dose of a one-shot vaccine. Any new hire must present proof of full vaccination status to be appointed. Any new hire who will be routinely assigned or occasionally enter High-Risk Settings, must provide proof of having received a COVID-19 booster vaccine by March 1, 2022, or once eligible.

The City and County of San Francisco encourages women, minorities and persons with disabilities to apply. Applicants will be considered regardless of their sex, race, age, religion, color, national origin, ancestry, physical disability, mental disability, medical condition (associated with cancer, a history of cancer, or genetic characteristics), HIV/AIDS status, genetic information, marital status, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity, gender expression, military and veteran status, or other protected category under the law.

# ATTACHMENT C

JAMAAL RAMIREZ - (REF4724E) - Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139)

OFFICIAL COPY

## Job Application

### JAMAAL RAMIREZ

<b>Submission:</b> 10:38:42 on 2023-June-22	<b>Email:</b> [REDACTED]
---	--------------------------

## Experience

### Real Estate Agent

2022-10 - Present

Keller Williams

Keller Williams - San Francisco, CA \* Presented purchase offers to sellers for consideration \* Represented buyers and sellers of developed and undeveloped properties \* Followed up with prospective buyers regarding incentives from builder and new developments in surrounding area \* Greeted and registered new clients to engage each in process and cultivate long-lasting relationships.

### Transit operator

2019-01 - Present

Muni

Muni - San Francisco, CA \* Coordinate and initiate responses by appropriate personnel and transit services \* Maintained communications among field staff and responded to emergencies. \* Interact with members of the public and other agency representatives on various matters \* Successfully operated shuttle s to transport passengers to various locations

### Tour Bus Operator

2017-02 - 2019-01

B/ueBus Tours

B/ueBus Tours \* Accepted and processed fares \* Operated bus and navigation equipment in alignment with company safety, DOT, and local traffic standards and regulations, \* Inspected emergency equipment and verified safe working order for student and driver use \* Transported passengers safely along prescribed routes according to tight schedules \* High school Diploma \* Downtown High school/ \* San Francisco

## Education

### High School Diploma

Secondary Education  
Complete

Downtown High School

# JAMAAL RAMIREZ

---

---

## Professional Summary

To seek and maintain full-time position that offers professional challenges utilizing interpersonal skills, excellent time management and problem-solving skills.

## Skills

- Recordkeeping Strengths
- Documentation Proficiency
- Patient Management
- Needs Assessment
- Case Management
- Written and Verbal communication
- Cultural Awareness
- Team Orientated
- Operation Equipment Knowledge

## Work History

**Real Estate Agent**, 10/2022 to Current

**Keller Williams** – San Francisco, CA

- Presented purchase offers to sellers for consideration
- Represented buyers and sellers of developed and undeveloped properties
- Followed up with prospective buyers regarding incentives from builder and new developments in surrounding area
- Greeted and registered new clients to engage each in process and cultivate long-lasting relationships.

**Transit operator**, 01/2019 to Current

**Muni** – San Francisco, CA

- Coordinate and initiate responses by appropriate personnel and transit services;
- Maintained communications among field staff and responded to emergencies.
- Interact with members of the public and other agency representatives on various matters
- Successfully operated shuttle s to transport passengers to various locations

**Tour Bus Operator**, 02/2017 to 01/2019

**B/ueBus Tours**

- Accepted and processed fares
- Operated bus and navigation equipment in alignment with company safety, DOT, and local traffic standards and regulations,
- Inspected emergency equipment and verified safe working order for student and driver use

- Transported passengers safely along prescribed routes according to tight schedules
- High school Diploma
- Downtown High school/
- San Francisco

## **Education**

**High School Diploma**

**Downtown High School - San Francisco, CA**

# ATTACHMENT D

**From:** Suzanne Wong from City and County of San Francisco <[notifications@careers.sf.gov](mailto:notifications@careers.sf.gov)>

**Sent:** Friday, July 21, 2023 1:27:17 PM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

Dear JAMAAL RAMIREZ:

Thank you for submitting your application for Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139). After a careful review of your application, it has been determined that your application does not clearly show that you possess the **Sufficient Experience** required as of the filing deadline of 07/05/2023. All applicants must meet all of the minimum qualifications by the announcement deadline and provide the necessary documents in order to progress in the examination.

According to the examination announcement, the minimum qualifications required for all applicants is the following:

**Experience:** Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA): 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, 9132 Transit Fare Inspector, 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisor/Investigator, 9136 Transit Training Specialist, or 9163 Transit Operator.

One year of full-time employment is equivalent to 2000 hours. (2000 hours of qualifying work experience is based on a 40-hour work week.) Any overtime hours that you work above forty (40) hours per week are not included in the calculation to determine full-time employment.

Exams staff is working remotely. If you wish to have your application reconsidered for this recruitment, please reply to this message and include verification as stipulated below by **Friday, July 28, 2023**. If we do not receive verification documents or an email specifying why verification is unable to be provided by **Friday, July 28, 2023**, your application will not proceed in this examination process.

Experience must be verified by submitting verification of qualifying work experience. Verification of work experience must be on the employer's letterhead; must show the name of the applicant; job title(s) and duties performed; dates of employment; types of employment (part-time/full-time); and must be signed by the employer. City employees will receive credit for the duties of the class to which they are appointed or assigned unless sufficient and credible documentation is provided to verify performance of other duties. Credit for experience obtained outside of the employee's class will be allowed only if recorded in accordance with the provisions of the Civil Service Commission Rules.

If self-employment is claimed as experience, evidence of earnings and duties comparable to those listed is required by submitting copies of income tax papers listing occupation and total earnings.

The verification documentation must be received no later than **close of business (5:00 p.m.) on Friday, July 28, 2023**, Civil Service Commission Rules for the City and County of San Francisco specify

announcement, application and examination policies and procedures, including applicant appeal rights. They can be found on the Civil Service Commission website at <http://sfgov.org/civilservice/rules>.

Best,

Suzanne Wong

SFMTA Examinations & Classification Unit  
Recruitment: CBT-9139-T00076



# ATTACHMENT E

**From:** [JAMAAL RAMIREZ](#) [REDACTED]  
**To:** [Wong, Suzanne](#)  
**Subject:** Re: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review  
**Date:** Friday, July 28, 2023 8:29:06 AM

---

EXT

Hi Suzanne,

I already submitted six and a half years' worth of experience. Four and a half years with SFMTA and an additional two years with Greyline. So, I'm not sure how I do not qualify based on experience? Is my time at SFMTA(MUND) not being counted? Thank you.

Respectfully,  
Mr. Jamaal Ramirez

---

**From:** Suzanne Wong from City and County of San Francisco <[notifications@careers.sf.gov](mailto:notifications@careers.sf.gov)>  
**Sent:** Friday, July 28, 2023 8:20:30 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

Mr. Jamaal Ramirez.

Thank you for your email. The SFMTA Exams Unit will review your application, along with the additional information. Another email will be sent to you at a later date.

Thank you for your patience.

Suzanne

---

**From:** JAMAAL RAMIREZ [REDACTED] <[notifications@smartrecruiters.com](mailto:notifications@smartrecruiters.com)>  
**Sent:** Friday, July 28, 2023 7:02 AM  
**To:** Wong, Suzanne <[Suzanne.Wong@sfmta.com](mailto:Suzanne.Wong@sfmta.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

EXT

Hi Suzanne,

I understand that this is not the letter needed however for what it's worth these are the final two paystubs from my previous employer. Quick question how much time am I short? Thank you.

Respectfully,  
Mr. Jamaal Ramirez

---

**From:** Suzanne Wong from City and County of San Francisco <[notifications@careers.sf.gov](mailto:notifications@careers.sf.gov)>

**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2023 2:43:19 PM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** RE: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

Hi Mr. Jamaal Ramirez,

Thank you for your email.

If you still haven't received it on Monday, please let me know.

Thank you,

Suzanne

---

**From:** JAMAAL RAMIREZ [REDACTED]

**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2023 2:41 PM

**To:** Wong, Suzanne <[Suzanne.Wong@sfmta.com](mailto:Suzanne.Wong@sfmta.com)>

**Subject:** Re: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

EXT

Hi Suzanne,

Just wanted to give you an update. I have been in contact with the HR department of my former employer to provide you with the verification letter to qualify me for the 9139 position. I still waiting on them to verify my employment it seems I may not have the letter tomorrow but will have very soon. I know you mention you would be willing to give me a little more which would be great as this position is one I am very interested in. Thank you for support.

Respectfully,

Mr. Jamaal Ramirez

---

**From:** Suzanne Wong from City and County of San Francisco <[notifications@careers.sf.gov](mailto:notifications@careers.sf.gov)>

**Sent:** Monday, July 24, 2023 4:28:25 PM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** RE: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

Hi Mr. Jamaal Ramirez,

Please try your best to gather the verification and submit by COB Friday, July 28, 2023.

If you are still unable to obtain the verification documents by Friday morning, please contact me.

RAMIREZ-013

Thank you,

Suzanne

---

**From:** JAMAAL RAMIREZ [REDACTED] <[notifications@smartrecruiters.com](mailto:notifications@smartrecruiters.com)>  
**Sent:** Friday, July 21, 2023 2:28 PM  
**To:** Wong, Suzanne <[Suzanne.Wong@sfmta.com](mailto:Suzanne.Wong@sfmta.com)>  
**Subject:** Re: Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

EXT

Hi Suzanne,

I just received your email. I'm a little confused I know I'm qualified for the position and have heard if operators with less experience given the opportunity to test. I'll do my best to gather the information to qualify for the position however it may take more than a week. Can I please get an extension? Thank you.

Respectfully,  
Mr. Jamaal Ramirez

---

**From:** Suzanne Wong from City and County of San Francisco <[notifications@careers.sf.gov](mailto:notifications@careers.sf.gov)>  
**Sent:** Friday, July 21, 2023 1:27:17 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139) Qualifications Review

Dear JAMAAL RAMIREZ:

Thank you for submitting your application for Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (9139). After a careful review of your application, it has been determined that your application does not clearly show that you possess the **Sufficient Experience** required as of the filing deadline of 07/05/2023. All applicants must meet all of the minimum qualifications by the announcement deadline and provide the necessary documents in order to progress in the examination.

According to the examination announcement, the minimum qualifications required for all applicants is the following:

**Experience:** Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA): 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic

RAMIREZ-014

Checker, 9131 Station Agent, 9132 Transit Fare Inspector, 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisor/Investigator, 9136 Transit Training Specialist, or 9163 Transit Operator.

One year of full-time employment is equivalent to 2000 hours. (2000 hours of qualifying work experience is based on a 40-hour work week.) Any overtime hours that you work above forty (40) hours per week are not included in the calculation to determine full-time employment.

Exams staff is working remotely. If you wish to have your application reconsidered for this recruitment, please reply to this message and include verification as stipulated below by **Friday, July 28, 2023**. If we do not receive verification documents or an email specifying why verification is unable to be provided by **Friday, July 28, 2023**, your application will not proceed in this examination process.

Experience must be verified by submitting verification of qualifying work experience. Verification of work experience must be on the employer's letterhead; must show the name of the applicant; job title(s) and duties performed; dates of employment; types of employment (part-time/full-time); and must be signed by the employer. City employees will receive credit for the duties of the class to which they are appointed or assigned unless sufficient and credible documentation is provided to verify performance of other duties. Credit for experience obtained outside of the employee's class will be allowed only if recorded in accordance with the provisions of the Civil Service Commission Rules.

If self-employment is claimed as experience, evidence of earnings and duties comparable to those listed is required by submitting copies of income tax papers listing occupation and total earnings.

The verification documentation must be received no later than **close of business (5:00 p.m.) on Friday, July 28, 2023**, Civil Service Commission Rules for the City and County of San Francisco specify announcement, application and examination policies and procedures, including applicant appeal rights. They can be found on the Civil Service Commission website at <http://sfgov.org/civilservice/rules>.

Best,

Suzanne Wong

SFMTA Examinations & Classification Unit  
Recruitment: CBT-9139-T00076

This message is from outside of the SFMTA email system. Please review the email carefully before responding, clicking links, or opening attachments.

This message is from outside of the SFMTA email system. Please review the email carefully before responding, clicking links, or opening attachments.

This message is from outside of the SFMTA email system. Please review the email carefully before responding, clicking links, or opening attachments.

This message is from outside of the SFMTA email system. Please review the email carefully before responding, clicking links, or opening attachments.

# ATTACHMENT F

ALFONSO J RAMIREZ  
[REDACTED]

NON-NEGOTIABLE

NON-NEGOTIABLE

PERSONAL AND CHECK INFORMATION			EARNINGS						
Alfonso J Ramirez			DESCRIPTION	HRS/UNITS	RATE	THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD HOURS	YTD (\$)	
[REDACTED]			Hourly	69.95	22.0000	1538.90	1744.06	37809.32	
Soc Sec #: [REDACTED] Employee ID: [REDACTED]			Retro Pay					479.65	
Clock ID: [REDACTED]			Overtime	20.27	33.0000	668.91	1031.34	33667.49	
Home Department: 100 Driver			DoubleTime	0.67	44.0000	29.48	99.61	4382.84	
Pay Period: 12/03/17 to 12/16/17			Holiday OT rate				31.88	1052.04	
Check Date: 12/22/17 Check #: 15180			Bonus					708.71	
NET PAY ALLOCATIONS			Commissions		22.0000	27.00		1566.30	
DESCRIPTION	THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD (\$)	Sick	8.00	22.0000	176.00	88.00	1936.00	
Check Amount	0.00	5016.48	Vacation				16.00	352.00	
Chkg 2385	1891.61	56047.85	<b>Total Hours</b>	98.89			3010.89		
<b>NET PAY</b>	<b>1891.61</b>	<b>61064.33</b>	<b>Gross Earnings</b>			2440.29		81954.35	
			<b>Total Hrs Worked</b>	90.89					
			WITHHOLDINGS		DESCRIPTION		FILING STATUS	THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD (\$)
			Social Security					151.30	5081.17
			Medicare					35.39	1188.34
			Fed Income Tax	M 0				280.27	7645.25
			CA Income Tax	MI1 1 0				59.76	3200.48
			CA Disability					21.96	737.60
			<b>TOTAL</b>					548.68	17852.84
			DEDUCTIONS		DESCRIPTION		THIS PERIOD (\$)		YTD (\$)
			Garnishment 1						3037.18
			<b>TOTAL</b>						3037.18
<b>NET PAY</b>						<b>THIS PERIOD (\$)</b>		<b>YTD (\$)</b>	
						<b>1891.61</b>		<b>61064.33</b>	

BLUE BUS TOURS LLC  
 220 RANKIN ST  
 SAN FRANCISCO CA 94124

ORG1:100 Driver  
 EE ID: DD

Payrolls by Paychex, Inc.

Payrolls by Paychex, Inc.

ALFONSO J RAMIREZ

NON-NEGOTIABLE

NON-NEGOTIABLE

PERSONAL AND CHECK INFORMATION			EARNINGS						
Alfonso J Ramirez			DESCRIPTION	HRS/UNITS	RATE	THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD HOURS	YTD (\$)	
Soc Sec #: [REDACTED] Employee ID: [REDACTED]			Hourly	45.32	24.0000	1087.68	1944.73	44878.70	
Clock ID: [REDACTED]			Overtime	12.13	36.0000	436.68	993.82	34639.91	
Home Department: 100 Driver			DoubleTime				86.76	4011.10	
Pay Period: 12/02/18 to 12/15/18			Holiday OT rate				11.10	366.30	
Check Date: 12/21/18 Check #: 2543			Bonus					1782.01	
NET PAY ALLOCATIONS			Commissions					1919.25	
DESCRIPTION	THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD (\$)	Sick				34.00	800.00	
Check Amount	0.00	51.08	Vacation				90.23	2133.52	
Chkg 2385	1310.22	69792.80	<b>Total Hours</b>	57.45			3160.64		
<b>NET PAY</b>	<b>1310.22</b>	<b>69843.88</b>	<b>Gross Earnings</b>			1524.36		90530.79	
			<b>Total Hrs Worked</b>	57.45					
			DESCRIPTION	FILING STATUS		THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD (\$)		
			Social Security			94.51	5612.91		
			Medicare			22.11	1312.70		
			Fed Income Tax	M 3		60.13	7993.55		
			CA Income Tax	MI1 1 0		22.15	3462.45		
			CA Disability			15.24	905.30		
			<b>TOTAL</b>			214.14	19286.91		
			DESCRIPTION			THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD (\$)		
			PXROTH 401 EE				1400.00		
			<b>TOTAL</b>				1400.00		
NET PAY						THIS PERIOD (\$)	YTD (\$)		
						1310.22	69843.88		

Payrolls by Paychex, Inc.

# ATTACHMENT G

**From:** Suzanne Wong from City and County of San Francisco <notifications@careers.sf.gov>

**Sent:** Thursday, August 10, 2023 3:38 PM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Response to Reconsideration Request: 9139 Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (CBT-9139-T00076)

EXT

Hi Jamaal Ramirez,

Thank you for submitting additional documents to support your reconsideration request for 9139 Transit Supervisor - SF Municipal Transportation Agency - (CBT-9139-T00076).

A second review of your application along with the additional information you submitted has been conducted.

According to the job ad, the minimum qualifications required for all applicants are the following:

Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA): 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, 9132 Transit Fare Inspector, 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisor/Investigator, 9136 Transit Training Specialist, or 9163 Transit Operator.

**Notes:** Experience driving school buses, tour buses and small vans is not considered qualifying experience.

**The additional information that we received from you are as follows:**

- Check Stub for pay period 12/03/17 to 12/16/17 from Blue Bus Tours LLC showing that you were a Driver.
- Check Stub for pay period 12/02/18 to 12/15/18 from Blue Bus Tours LLC showing that you were a Driver.

Below are details on your application, which determined that you do not meet the minimum required for experience as of filing deadline July 5, 2023.

**Analysis of information on your application, city and county records, and additional documents provided show the following:**

- Real Estate Agent, Keller Williams since October 2022 to present.
- 9163 Transit Operator – since 1/14/2019 to present, which is equivalent to **four (4) years and six (6) months of qualifying experience** as of filing deadline of July 5, 2023.



- Tour Bus Operator, Blue Bus Tours, LLC. Pursuant to the Notes section of the 9139 Transit Supervisor job announcement, this is not considered qualifying experience.

Unfortunately, the information provided does not indicate that you possess the experience required to qualify for this position. Per Civil Service Rules, every applicant for an examination must possess and maintain the qualifications required by law and by the examination announcement for the examination. Therefore, your application for this recruitment will not continue to the next step in the exam process.

Thank you for your time and interest in this recruitment. Civil Service Commission Rules for the City and County of San Francisco specify announcement, application and examination policies and procedures, including applicant appeal rights. They can be found on the Civil Service Commission website at <http://sfgov.org/civilservice/rules>. If you wish to challenge this decision, a protest must be submitted in writing to the Director of Transportation by close of business on the fifth working day following the transmittal date of this electronic communication.

We encourage you to continue to seek employment opportunities with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency. You may obtain employment information from our website at [www.sfmta.com/jobs](http://www.sfmta.com/jobs) or from the City and County of San Francisco website at Careers at City and County of San Francisco ([smartrecruiters.com](http://smartrecruiters.com)).

Thank you for your time and interest in this recruitment.

Respectfully,

Suzanne Wong

SFMTA Examinations & Classification Unit

RECRUITMENT: CBT-9139-T00076



# ATTACHMENT H

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR

### NOTICE OF RECEIPT OF APPEAL

DATE: August 18, 2023  
REGISTER NO.: 0145-23-4  
APPELLANT: ALFONSO JAMAAL RAMIREZ

Jeffrey Tumlin  
Director of Transportation  
Municipal Transportation Agency  
1 South Van Ness Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Jeffrey Tumlin:

The Civil Service Commission has received the attached letter from Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez appealing the disqualification of their application for Class 9139 Transit Supervisor Examination with the Municipal Transportation Agency. Your review and action are required.

If this matter is not timely or appropriate, please submit CSC Form 13 "Action Request on Pending Appeal/Request," with supporting information and documentation to my attention by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org). CSC Form 13 is available on the Civil Service Commission's website at [www.sf.gov.org/CivilService](http://www.sf.gov.org/CivilService) on the "File an action request for a Civil Service Commission hearing" page.

In the event that Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez's appeal is timely and appropriate, the department is required to submit a staff report in response to the appeal within sixty (60) days so that the matter may be resolved in a timely manner. Accordingly, **the staff report is due no later than 11 a.m. on October 25, 2023**, so that it may be heard by the Civil Service Commission at its meeting on November 6, 2023. If you will be unable to transmit the staff report by the October 25th deadline, or if required departmental representatives will not be available to attend the November 6th meeting, please notify me by use of CSC Form 13 as soon as possible, with information regarding the reason for the postponement and a proposed alternate submission and/or hearing date.

Appellant: Alfonso Jamaal Ramirez  
August 18, 2023  
Page 2

You may contact me at [Sandra.Eng@sfgov.org](mailto:Sandra.Eng@sfgov.org) or (628) 652-1100 if you have any questions. For more information regarding staff report requirements, meeting procedures or future meeting dates, please visit the Commission's website at [www.sf.gov.org/CivilService](http://www.sf.gov.org/CivilService).

Sincerely,

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Kimberly Ackerman, Municipal Transportation  
William Miles, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Shivani Nath, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Romika Williams, Municipal Transportation Agency



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**  
**City and County of San Francisco**

25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720  
San Francisco, California 94102-6033  
Executive Officer  
(628) 652-1100

CSC Register No.
<u>0169-23-4</u>
To: <u>X J. Tumlin</u>
CC: <u>K. Ackerman</u>
<u>W. Miles</u>
<u>S. Nath</u>

**APPEAL TO THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

**INSTRUCTIONS:**

Submit an original copy of this form to the Executive Officer of the Civil Service Commission at the address above **within the designated number of days** following the postmarked mailing date or email date (whichever is applicable) of the Department of Human Resources' or Municipal Transportation Agency's notification to the appellant. The appellant's/authorized representative's original signature is required. **(E-mail is not accepted.)** It is recommended that you include all relevant information and documentation in support of your appeal.

**TYPE OF APPEAL:** (Check One)

- Examination Matters (by close of business on 5<sup>th</sup> working day)
- Employee Compensation Matters (by close of business on 7<sup>th</sup> working day) - Limited application
- Personal Service Contracts (Posting Period)
- Other Matters (i.e., Human Resources Director/Executive Officer Action) (30 Calendar days)
- Future Employability Recommendations (See Notice to Employee)

"During the Shelter Order dated March 17, 2020, we are accepting appeals by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org)"  
Alfonso Jamal Ramirez 1 S Van Ness 6<sup>th</sup> Floor (415)701-5050

Full Name of Appellant	Work Address	Work Telephone		
9163 Transit Operator SFMTA				
Job Code	Title	Department		
Residence Address	City	State	Zip	Home Telephone
Full Name of Authorized Representative (if any)	Telephone Number of Representative (including Area Code)			

**NOTE:** If this is deemed to be a timely and appealable matter, the department will submit a staff report to the Civil Service Commission to request that it be scheduled for hearing. You will be notified approximately one week in advance of the hearing date, at which time you will be able to pick up a copy of the department's staff report at the Commission's offices. If you would instead prefer Commission staff to email you a copy of the meeting notice and staff report, please provide your email address below.

Email: [Redacted]

**COMPLETE THE BASIS OF THIS APPEAL ON THE REVERSE SIDE.** (Use additional page(s) if necessary)

Does the basis of this appeal include new information not previously presented in the appeal to the Human Resources Director? If so, please specify.	Check One: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
--	--

Alfonso Ramirez  
Original Signature of Appellant or Authorized Representative

8/15/2023  
Date

CSC-12 (5/2021)

Date Received by Civil Service Commission: \_\_\_\_\_

**State the basis of this appeal in detail.** For more information about appeal rights and deadlines, please review the Civil Service Rules located on the Civil Service Commission's website at [www.sfgov.org/CivilService](http://www.sfgov.org/CivilService).

The calculation of my time from my previous employers was accurately calculated nor was I given enough time to submit verification from one of my employers. This position requires 5 years of experience. With all my experience I would have 7 and a half years. With one employer I would have 5 and a half years as I worked from 2016-2017 with MV Transportation which was contracted through SamTrans. Please consider this appeal for reconsideration.

**Eng, Sandra (CSC)**

---

**From:** CivilService, Civil (CSC)  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 16, 2023 10:39 AM  
**To:** Eng, Sandra (CSC); Holmes, Lavena (CSC); Henriquez, Lizzette (CSC)  
**Cc:** Aldana, Elizabeth (CSC)  
**Subject:** Fw: Appeal for 9139 Position

FYI

Civil Service Commission Representative  
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Office (628) 652-1110  
Main (628) 652-1100  
Fax (628) 652-1109

---

**From:** Jamaal Ramirez [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 16, 2023 10:34 AM  
**To:** CivilService, Civil (CSC) <civilservice@sfgov.org>  
**Cc:** Ramirez, Alfonso (MTA) [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Re: Appeal for 9139 Position

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

Cont.

On my submitted form it should read "was not accurately calculated" not "was accurately calculated". Thank you.

Respectfully,  
Mr. Jamaal Ramirez

---

**From:** Jamaal Ramirez  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 16, 2023 6:50:30 AM  
**To:** civilservice@sfgov.org <civilservice@sfgov.org>  
**Cc:** Ramirez, Alfonso [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Appeal for 9139 Position

Good Morning,

Please find attached my signed appeal for the 9139 position. I was not given all my time from all my employers which would have qualified me for the exam of this position. Thank you.

Respectfully,  
Mr. Jamaal Ramirez





# ATTACHMENT I

## SF | Careers

SF.GOV

SF | DHR

# 9139-Transit Supervisor

SF | Careers > 9139-Transit Supervisor

---

## Know the class code?

Class codes are four characters long.

Search

## Search by keyword:

Use a keyword to search for a class.

Search within title  Search within job descriptions

Search

---

Compensation set id:



## Transit Supervisor

## Job classification

RAMIREZ-027



<b>Class</b>	<b><u>9139</u></b>
<b>Title</b>	Transit Supervisor
<b>Overtime eligibility</b>	Covered (Non-Z) - Nonexempt
<b>Labor agreement</b>	<u>TWU, Local 200</u>
<b>Effective date</b>	July 13, 2023

---

## Current compensation plan

**Effective:** Jul 01, 2023

See [Historic and future compensation information](#) for this class

<b>Step:</b>	<b>Step 1</b>	<b>Step 2</b>	<b>Step 3</b>	<b>Step 4</b>	<b>Step 5</b>
<b>Rate /hr:</b>	\$48.7250	\$51.1500	\$53.7375	\$56.4125	\$59.2375
<b>Rate /biweekly:</b>	\$3,898.00	\$4,092.00	\$4,299.00	\$4,513.00	\$4,739.00
<b>Rate /year:</b>	\$101,348	\$106,392	\$111,774	\$117,338	\$123,214

---

## Job description

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES

Title: Transit Supervisor

Job Code: 9139

### DEFINITION

Under general supervision, the Transit Supervisor, as the first-line supervisor, supervises, directs, reviews, plans and evaluates the work of subordinate personnel engaged in a variety of transit service activities at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA). This is a uniformed job classification.

### DISTINGUISHING FEATURES

Positions allocated to the Transit Supervisor job code function at the level of a first-line supervisor. Assignments in this broad job code include but are not limited to: transit operator supervision, training and field monitoring, adjustment and control of schedule adherence, schedule preparation and modification, and divisional assignments in

RAMIREZ-028

dispatching and communications. Positions in this job code are distinguished from the 9140 Transit Manager I in that the latter has responsibility for management functions and 9160 Transportation Operations Specialist in that the latter may provide direction and supervision in other service areas including train control, bus dispatching, central communications, traffic signal operations, public information, parking enforcement, and field operations; develops and administers training programs for Transit Management Center (TMC) and Field Operations staff.

#### SUPERVISION EXERCISED

Most positions in this job code supervise employees in Transit Operator and/or Station Agent job codes.

#### EXAMPLES OF IMPORTANT AND ESSENTIAL DUTIES

According to Civil Service Commission Rule 409, the duties specified below are representative of the range of duties assigned to this job code/class and are not intended to be an inclusive list.

1. Supervises the activities of transit personnel; ensures that the department rules, policies and procedures are followed by subordinate personnel.
2. Maintains transit services by coordinating schedule adjustment and operator activities with TMC and other transit supervisors; investigates service problems on assigned lines and at MUNI metro stations; takes corrective actions; and ensures proper coverage at subway stations.
3. Prepares and/or modifies transit service schedules; analyzes traffic and passenger data to identify schedule problems and reports the information to appropriate personnel, and uses computer hardware and software in the performance of duties.
4. Instructs, advises and evaluates subordinate personnel in the field, classroom, or division on the safe, efficient operation of revenue and non-revenue equipment and operating rules, procedures and policies; identifies and recommends retraining needs.
5. Prepares different reports such as schedule adherence reports, accident/incident/violation reports and instructional plans using

computer applications; reviews reports to ensure that the information is complete and accurate.

6. Coordinates and initiates responses by appropriate personnel and transit services; maintains communications among field staff, responds to silent alarms and emergencies; dispatches police, medical units and/or support personnel.

7. Interacts with members of the public and other agency representatives on various matters; listens to customer complaints and takes appropriate courses of action; and directs traffic as needed. Serves as Good-Will-Ambassador for the SFMTA.

8. Uses different computer applications to prepare correspondence, and reports; monitors service and researches information; utilizes specialized computer applications such as Trapeze, DriveCam, NEXTBUS, and TransitSafe, OrbCAD, MAESTRO, Microsoft Office Suite, as well as applicable electronic forms as assigned.

9. Performs related duties and responsibilities as assigned.

#### KNOWLEDGE, SKILLS, AND ABILITIES

Knowledge of: transit lines, line management techniques, schedules and equipment necessary to coordinate and maintain safe and effective transit operations; traffic patterns and their impact on transit corridors necessary to effectively reroute and reschedule transit equipment; emergency procedures necessary to quickly and safely assist passengers, the public and transit personnel in emergency situations; and radio communication terminology necessary to expediently and effectively handle emergency situations.

Ability or Skill to: effectively schedule, coordinate, monitor, evaluate and train subordinate personnel; provide leadership and issue orders; effectively interact with the public, peers, transit personnel and representatives of other agencies in a courteous and effective manner using discretion and sound judgment even in difficult and stressful situations; analyze quantitative and qualitative data and draw reasonable inferences as to the relative importance of the information; assess the relative impact of various solutions to a problem; break complex problems into components; communicate verbally in a clear, concise and effective manner with subordinates, peers, superiors and members of the public; provide instruction, information and direction

especially in emergency situations to members of the public and transit personnel; prepare reports and memoranda in a clear, understandable, and concise manner; prepare materials for instruction; comprehend written materials; use different computer programs/applications to prepare schedules, input data, dispatch personnel and/or vehicles, monitor transit activities, and prepare payroll; and lift /transport work-related materials and/or operate equipment weighing up to 50 pounds.

#### MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS

These minimum qualifications establish the education, training, experience, special skills and/or license(s) which are required for employment in the classification. Please note, additional qualifications (i.e., special conditions) may apply to a particular position and will be stated on the exam/job announcement.

Education:

Experience:

The following are required to be possessed as of the filing deadline for applications:

1. Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with the SFMTA: 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, 9132 Transit Fare Inspector, 8121 Transit Fare Inspector Supervisor/Investigator, 9136 Transit Training Specialist or 9163 Transit Operator.

The following must be possessed as of the date that a position is certified to the eligible list and maintained through the date of appointment. These minimum qualifications ensure that hires will possess necessary standards of delivering safe and quality service.

1. No accidents where applicant contributed to the cause (i.e., preventable) in the previous thirty-six (36) months; AND
2. No preventable non-collision safety incidents in the previous twelve (12) months; AND
3. No suspensions in the previous twelve (12) months; AND

4. No Performance Appraisals within the previous twelve (12) months with an overall determination of unsatisfactory performance; AND
5. Possession of a valid, unrestricted, CA Class C Driver License

The following will be assessed during the probationary period:

1. Ability to utilize software applications related to the work of the assigned unit (to be tested at the time of appointment and/or during the probationary period).

#### Notes

- A preventable non-collision safety incident refers to any event that involves the unsafe operation of a vehicle.
- All candidates who possess the required education and experience by the filing deadline will be invited to compete in the examination process. When positions are certified to the eligible list, reachable candidates who score high enough in the selection process will be reviewed to ensure that they meet all listed minimum qualifications.
- Experience driving school buses, tour buses and small vans is not considered qualifying experience.
- Employees must maintain the licensure and certification requirements for the position during the course of employment.
- Some positions require obtaining and maintaining a Commercial Class B Driver License with appropriate endorsements as required by the DMV and no restrictions that prohibit operation of a SFMTA public transit vehicle within six (6) months of appointment and obtaining and maintaining Verification of Transit Training (VTT).
- Some positions may require possession of a valid DMV Medical Examiner's Certificate as a condition of assignment to such position(s).

#### SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION

Nature of work: requires incumbents to work rotating shifts, holidays, nights, and weekends; to work outdoors in all weather conditions; and to use computer applications; stand and/or sit for prolonged periods of time; and may require the performance of different physical activities such as lifting /transporting/operating work-related materials and

equipment weighing up to 50 pounds; pulling poles, may be required to manually setting track switches on surface streets and cranking switches in the subway, resetting retrievers to return disabled transit vehicles to service and assisting in the movement of disabled vehicles when required.

PROMOTIVE LINES

To: Various Classes at SFMTA

From: 9163 Transit Operator and other classes indicated in the minimum qualifications

ORIGINATION DATE:

May 4, 1981

AMENDED DATE:

12/21/04; 05/25/16; 06/08/18; 09/26/19; 07/13/23

REASON FOR AMENDMENT:

To accurately reflect the current tasks, knowledge, skills & abilities, and minimum qualifications.

BUSINESS UNIT(S):

SFMTA

## Standard information

### Disaster service work

All City and County of San Francisco employees are designated Disaster Service Workers through state and local law (California Government Code Section 3100-3109). Employment with the City requires the affirmation of a loyalty oath to this effect. Employees are required to complete all Disaster Service Worker-related training as assigned, and to return to work as ordered in the event of an emergency.

## Historic and future compensation

**Effective (Sched)** **Step 1** **Step 2** **Step 3** **Step 4** **Step 5**

RAMIREZ-033



<b>Jul 01, 2023 (X)</b>	\$48.7250	\$51.1500	\$53.7375	\$56.4125	\$59.2375
<b>Jul 01, 2022 (W)</b>	\$47.5375	\$49.9000	\$52.4250	\$55.0375	\$57.7875
<b>Jan 08, 2022 (V)</b>	\$45.1625	\$47.4125	\$49.8125	\$52.2875	\$54.9000
<b>Jul 01, 2021 (U)</b>	\$44.9375	\$47.1750	\$49.5625	\$52.0250	\$54.6250



**Applicant resources**

Info center

Common issues

Request an accommodation

Career pathways

Contact us

**Human Resources**

DHR Homepage

Career Events

**About San Francisco**

SF.gov

London Breed, Mayor

SF.gov Privacy Policy

# ATTACHMENT J

## 9139 Transit Supervisor Recruitment #cbt-9139-055033

Department:	Municipal Transportation Agency
Date Opened:	3/20/2009 8:00:00 AM
Filing Deadline:	4/3/2009 5:00:00 PM
Salary:	\$33.56 - \$40.79/hour; \$69,810.00 - \$84,838.00/year
Job Type:	CBT Discrete
Employment Type:	Full-Time

[Go Back](#)

[View Benefit](#)

### INTRODUCTION

**SFMTA**

Municipal Transportation Agency



The following information describes the civil service classification for which applications are being solicited. Make sure you read the entire announcement before completing the application form.

### 9139 TRANSIT SUPERVISOR

Under general supervision, the Transit Supervisor performs first line supervisory duties in a variety of transit service activities at San Francisco Municipal Railway. The essential functions of the class may vary depending on assignment and include the following: supervise, direct, review, plan and evaluate the work of subordinate personnel engaged in a variety of transit service activities; schedule and monitor division work activities and line management; coordinate schedule adjustments and operator activities with central control; maintain, analyze, prepare, and update transit schedules; ensure proper coverage at the subway stations; use two-way radio systems; instruct operators in safe, efficient vehicle operation and passenger service, including identifying and recommending retraining needs; evaluate problems and recommend and/or take corrective action; prepare and analyze operating reports and records; interact with members of the public and other agency representatives. Incumbents may be required to perform other related duties in addition to the ones listed above. Incumbents must be able to perform the essential functions of the assigned duties. The current salary range is \$69,810 - \$84,838. Differential pay will be given for specific positions.



Nature of work: Some positions require incumbents to work rotating shifts, holidays and weekends; to work outdoors in all weather conditions; and to use computers. In addition, some positions may require standing and/or sitting for prolonged periods of time and may require the performance of different physical activities such as pulling poles, cranking switches in the subway, resetting retrievers to return disabled transit vehicles to service and assisting in the movement of disabled vehicles when possible.

**MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS:**

Five (5) years of full-time verifiable experience with a large public transit system performing duties equivalent to one or more of the following classifications with SFMTA: 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, or 9163 Transit Operator. Applicants with two (2) years of full-time experience equivalent to one of the above classes will be allowed to compete in the examination and, if successful, will be placed on the eligible list under waiver of appointment until the five (5) year experience requirement is met.

Applicants must also possess the ability to utilize software applications related to the work of the assigned unit (to be tested at the time of appointment and/or during the probationary period).

In addition to the above, applicants must possess a valid, unrestricted, Class C Driver License (to be presented at the time of the written/performance examination).

**NOTES:**

1. One year full-time employment is equivalent to 2000 hours.
2. Experience driving school buses, tour buses and small vans is not considered qualifying experience.
3. Eligibles under waiver of appointment will be responsible for notifying SFMTA Human Resources when they have fully fulfilled the minimum qualification of five (5) years in order for their waiver to be lifted.
4. Some positions may require obtaining an unrestricted Class B California Driver License with passenger endorsement and Verification of Transit Training (VTT).
5. Some positions may require the ability to transport work-related materials and equipment weighing up to 50 pounds.

**HOW TO APPLY:**

Job Announcements and applications will be distributed beginning Friday March 20, 2009 at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) - Merit and Comparability Section; 401 Van Ness Avenue, Rm. 304; San Francisco, CA. Job announcements and applications may also be obtained from our website at [www.sfmta.com/jobs](http://www.sfmta.com/jobs). All completed applications must be received no later than the final filing date of **Friday April 3, 2009 (postmark not accepted)**. Refer to the section titled verification for information on how to submit the required verification. Mail or submit in person completed applications and verification to: San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency - Class 9139; 401 Van Ness Avenue, Room 304; San Francisco, CA 94102. Applicants are encouraged to keep copies of their application materials submitted for their

own records. If you prefer to submit the application online, please refer to the section “**Applying Online**”.

**Applying Online:**

- \* Visit <http://www.jobaps.com/sf> to begin the application process
- \* Choose “9139 Transit Supervisor” from the list of job opportunities
- \* Click “Apply” located under the position salary information and acknowledge the information
- \* Click on “I am a New User” if you have not previously registered, or on “I have Registered Previously”
- \* Follow instructions given on the screen

Upon successful submittal of the application online, the applicant will receive a notification on the screen, as well as in the applicant’s e-mail inbox, acknowledging the receipt of the application by the SFMTA - Merit and Comparability Section. If you are having difficulty submitting your application online, please contact us at (415) 554-4124 or (415) 554-6899 between 8:30 AM and 4:30 PM.

**VERIFICATION**

**All applicants must submit verification of all work experience needed to qualify. This required verification must be submitted by April 10, 2009. (postmark not accepted).** Current SFMTA employees who are in job classifications 9122 Transit Information Clerk, 9124 Senior Transit Information Clerk, 9126 Transit Traffic Checker, 9128 Senior Transit Traffic Checker, 9131 Station Agent, and/or 9163 Transit Operator who meet all the qualifications based solely on employment with SFMTA do not need to provide verification of qualifying experience. Applicants with a combination of experience both with SFMTA and from outside must submit verification (proof) of qualifying experience gained outside of SFMTA. All other applicants must submit written verification of all qualifying experience.

Verification of work experience must be on the employer’s letterhead; must show the name of the applicant; job title(s) and duties performed; dates of employment; and must be signed by the employer. City employees will receive credit for the duties of the class to which they are appointed or assigned unless sufficient and credible documentation is provided to verify performance of other duties. Credit for experience obtained outside of the employee’s class will be allowed only if recorded in accordance with the provisions of the Civil Service Commission Rules. City employees who qualify based upon a combination of City and outside experience must also verify the outside qualifying experience. Applicants who cannot obtain the required verification of employment may request a waiver of the verification requirement. The applicant must submit a signed statement explaining the reason for the request, the name(s) of the employer(s) with whom qualifying experience was obtained, job title(s), duties performed, and the dates of employment. Verification may be waived if impossible to obtain. Waiver requests will be evaluated on a case-by-case basis. **Failure to submit the verification of work experience or a request for waiver of verification by April 10, 2009 (postmark not accepted) may result in disqualification of the application.**

**SELECTION PROCEDURE:**

<b>Written/Performance Examination:</b>	<b>WEIGHT</b>
---	---------------

<p><b>Standardized Multiple-choice Examination:</b> Candidates will be tested to determine their relative knowledge, skill and ability levels in job-related areas which may include but not be limited to: knowledge of transit lines, schedules and equipment; knowledge of traffic patterns and their impact on transit corridors; and knowledge of emergency procedures</p>	<p><b>35%</b></p>
<p><b>Performance Examination:</b> Candidates will be tested to determine their analytical and written communication abilities using job-related written exercise(s)</p>	<p><b>25%</b></p>

A passing score will be established for the standardized multiple-choice examination. The written exercise(s) of all the candidates who received a passing score in the standardized multiple-choice examination will be evaluated and scored. The scores from the standardized multiple-choice examination and the performance examination will be combined to arrive at the total score for the written/performance examination. **Approximately 200 of the top scoring candidates from the written/performance examination will be invited to participate in the oral examination.**

<b>Oral Examination:</b>	<b>WEIGHT</b>
<p>Candidates will be tested to determine their relative knowledge, skills and abilities in job-related areas which may include but not be limited to: supervisory ability, interpersonal ability, and oral communication ability</p>	<p><b>40%</b></p>

**TOTAL WEIGHT** **100%**

**CERTIFICATION RULE:**

The certification rule used for the eligible list resulting from this examination will be the Rule of Three Scores. The duration of the eligible list resulting from this examination will be three years.

**VETERAN'S PREFERENCE INFORMATION:**

Applicants who qualify as veterans or disabled veterans may be eligible for veteran's preference credit. Applicants who wish to claim veteran's preference must complete the veteran's preference application form and provide verification of eligibility. The application form is available online at <http://www.sfmta.com/cms/aopp/veterans.htm> or in person at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency – Recruitment Office. Please refer to the pamphlet entitled “Veteran's Preference Information” for details.

**NOTES:**

Qualified applicants will be notified by mail of the exact date, time and location of the

examination. If your address changes, it is your responsibility to inform the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency - Merit and Comparability Section of your new address by sending this information to the address listed below. Qualified applicants with disabilities requiring reasonable accommodation for this selection process must contact the examination analyst by phone at (415) 554-4124, or if hearing impaired, (415) 554-6898 (TDD) or in writing to SFMTA-Merit and Comparability Section, Class 9139; 401 Van Ness Avenue, Room 304; San Francisco, CA 94102 as soon as possible.

The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) has determined that Class 9139 Transit Supervisor is a "safety-sensitive" position, under regulations issued by the Federal Transit Administration (49 CFR Part 655). Federal law requires that all transit employees who perform safety-sensitive functions be subject to random, post-accident, reasonable suspicion, return-to-duty and follow-up drug and alcohol testing. All applicants for safety-sensitive positions must pass a pre-employment drug test prior to appointment.

In addition, each applicant who has worked for a Department of Transportation (DOT)-regulated employer(s) within the last two years will be required to sign a consent form, prior to appointment, authorizing SFMTA to obtain information from his/her prior employers concerning his/her drug and alcohol test history. Each applicant will also be required to provide SFMTA with information regarding whether, during the last two years, the applicant tested positive or refused to test on any pre-employment drug or alcohol test administered by an employer to which the applicant applied for, but did not obtain, safety-sensitive transportation work covered by DOT drug and alcohol testing rules. SFMTA will not hire any applicant for a safety-sensitive position who fails to provide this information or fails to provide written consent for the release of information from prior employers.

**General information concerning San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency employment policies and procedures is located at our "[Important Employment Information](#)" website. This information, including information regarding appeals of the terms of this announcement, is part of the terms of all announcements.**

**Minorities, Women, and Persons with Disabilities are Encouraged to Apply  
An Equal Opportunity Employer**

Issued: March 20, 2009  
COMBINED PROMOTIVE & ENTRANCE  
Nathaniel P. Ford, Sr., Executive Director/CEO  
SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
Announcement No. MTA 09-04  
Team: SFMTA/WM (415-554-4124)

#### **DISASTER SERVICE WORKERS**

All City and County of San Francisco employees are designated Disaster Service Workers through state and local law (California Government Code Section 3100-3109). Employment with the City requires the affirmation of a loyalty oath to this effect. Employees are required to complete all Disaster Service Worker-related training as assigned, and to return to work as ordered in the event of an emergency.

#### **BENEFITS**

All employees hired on or after January 10, 2009 will be required (pursuant to San Francisco Charter Section A8.432) to contribute 2% of pre-tax compensation to fund retiree healthcare. In addition, most employees are required to make a member contribution towards retirement, typically a 7.5% of compensation. For more information on these provisions, please contact your departmental personnel officer.

---