



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
August 21, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2663 147 4793. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2663 147 4793  
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2663 147 4793.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA**

**Steven Seltzer**, United Front Committee for a Labor Party, expressed concerns on the City outsourcing work and privatization in the City and County of San Francisco.

**Brenda Barros**, City employee, expressed concerns about the Department of Public Health's contracts over 200 million dollars; also expressed concerns about the number of employees who were released because of the COVID vaccine mandate and now that it is no longer required for the department to call them back to work.

**Cheryl Thornton**, requested transparency and accountability by posting the data on discrimination lawsuits settled by the City and County of San Francisco to prevent further incidents and improve existing policies on anti-discrimination.

**Patrick Monette-Shaw**, the Commission should **not** create an "automatic" approval process removing placing some PSC's on Commission agendas. It should **not** be modeled on the State's PSC system, providing for Commission hearings only when the Commission receives an objection to a particular PSC. The "*objection-based*" provisions in the State's PSC system is a flawed model. DHR shouldn't be granted additional unilateral authority to double the value of PSC contracts from \$100K to \$200K. DHR shouldn't be given "*objection-based*" power for all PSC's beyond Prop Q's value, to allow an increase from \$10,000 to \$25,000.

Don't remove from the policy the process of entering PSC's into the PSC database to allow DHR to more easily update those procedures separate from the policy. The process of entering data into the PSC database shouldn't be removed, handing DHR *carte blanche* authority to update its procedures separately from any governing Civil Service Commission "policy."

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of August 7, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Item #17 Request to approve PSC #44539-22/23 from the Office of the City Administrator, postpone to the meeting of September 18, 2023.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Carol Isen, reported on 3 items: 1. About items 10 through 16 on the consent agenda, 7 reports required by CSC will be presented today, the 8<sup>th</sup> report about promotive only examinations which has not been given any of this type in this fiscal year, specifically not promotive only examinations since 2016; 2. Civil Grand Jury Report – Let’s get to work, it examines the hiring practices of the city, focusing specifically on the length of time it takes to hire; 3. The Covid-19 Vaccine Policy in placed is being rescinded, employees who were separated can reapply, it will no longer be a requirement as a condition for employment, some employees in certain settings will still require vaccination.

**Public Comment:** **Steve Seltzer**, bring back employees terminated. Steve Zeltzer – no report about vacancies about tests that have or will be done push to privatize public service. COVID testing not happening for City employees.  
**Brenda Barros**, former employees should be notified of vaccine mandated being rescinded. Look at vacancies and bring terminated people back to fill vacancies.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT**

**0157-23-1 Civil Service Adviser No. 35 Minimum Qualification Verification. (Item No. 6)**

**Speakers:** Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director

**Action:** Divide this Adviser in 2 parts; Continued to the meeting of October 2, 2023

**Public Comment:** **Brenda Barros**, managers refuse to provide performance letters.  
**Cheryl Thornton**, no rules on acting assignments, no performance appraisals done, no accountability.  
**Steve Seltzer**, city workers doing same work as public workers and getting paid less.  
**Patrick Monette-Shaw**, former 1446 city employee, out of class work

**0158-23-1 Civil Service Commission FY 2022- 23 Year-End Report. (Item No. 7)**

**Speakers:** Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

- Action:**
1. Commissioner Favetti requested a report back to the Commission on the status of the following pending appeals: Register Nos. 85-23-4, 176-22-6, 18-19-6, 75-19-7, 10-21-7, 157-22-7, 136-16-7, 53-23-7, 36-17-7, 5-21-7, 46-21-7, 194-21-7, 125-21-7, and 180-20-7. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  2. Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0113-23-8 Discussion on Potential Updates to the Civil Service Commission’s Personal Services Contract Approval Process to be More Productive and Efficient. (Item No. 8)**

**June 5, 2023:** No action taken.

**Speakers:** Sandra Eng, Executive Officer  
 Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney  
 Taraneh Moayed, Office of Contract Administration  
 Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Continue to the meeting of October 2, 2023

**Public Comment:** Patrick Monette-Shaw, statement read by Lavena Holmes  
 Naj Daniels, SEIU L1021  
 Brenda Barros  
 Cheryl Thornton  
 Patrick Monette-Shaw  
 Kim Thompson, IFPTE L21  
 Claude Joseph, SEIU 1021  
 Patrick Monette-Shaw

**0159-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 9)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49169 - 22/23	Airport	\$21,000,000	Contractor will provide engineering support services for various facilities and capital improvement projects at San Francisco International Airport (SFO or Airport). Work may include planning, design, development of construction documents, special studies, investigations, and other technical services for work on Airport terminal and office building interiors, industrial waste and storm drains, sewage and potable water infrastructure, fire and police stations, power distribution, underground infrastructure, heating, ventilation, and air conditioning systems.	Regular	8/30/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40533 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$2,000,000	According to the Department of Disability and Aging Services (DAS), one in ten San Franciscans reports a disability (94,000 people). Almost half of people with disabilities are under age 65. Investing in this community is important for the future of the City. Digital accessibility refers to the inclusive practice of removing barriers that prevent interaction with, or access to websites, digital tools and technologies, by people with disabilities. • Implementation or Remediation: Functional and technical implementation services for applications, modules and enhancements that supplement or complement existing systems. • Audit: Covers the following public facing digital material, but not limited to: Assessing department websites, Word/PDF documents, multi-media content, mobile applications, and social media accounts. Includes both automatic or manual testing methodologies.	Regular	8/31/2028
40791 - 22/23	Elections	\$2,000,000	The selected contractor would assist REG in developing and implementing a series of as-needed, intermittent, multilingual outreach campaigns with the goals of increasing public understanding of registration and voting options as well as voter engagement. The selected contractor would also help conduct evaluative research, primarily in the form of surveys and polls.	Regular	11/30/2028
41849 - 22/23	Environment	\$450,000	Contractor will provide professional technical assistance for program development and implementation of projects and programs in the City's Toxics Reduction Program Contractor will provide technical assistance in any or all of the following issue areas, which may include but are not limited to: Integrated Pest Management; Environmentally Preferable Purchasing; Precautionary Principle Toxic Chemical Reduction; Hazardous Waste; Product Stewardship; Green Business; and Used Motor Oil Recycling. Contractor may perform technical research, conduct technical and/or laboratory analyses, and/or make recommendations regarding program development, strategy, legislation, and policy as well as assist with technical training for City staff and stakeholder engagement on topics related to toxics reduction, pollution prevention, and hazardous waste management.	Regular	8/31/2026
40468 - 22/23	Human Resources	\$250,000	Provide valid test materials. Contractor will score candidate responses to the test.	Regular	6/30/2029
44096 - 22/23	Human Resources	\$3,450,000	Contractor will provide maintenance and support services; data hosting services; electronic data interchange development services; training, consulting, and software system improvements to the Workers' Compensation Division's (WCD) web-based claims management system.	Regular	9/15/2029
41579 - 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$4,000,000	The request for proposals is being developed. Four-year with one-year optional extension contract with a consultant firm experienced in communications, marketing, and public outreach, with specialized bicycle training knowledge for children, young people, and adults. This supports SFMTA's healthy transportation options policy and safety on San Francisco streets.	Regular	4/10/2029
49500 - 22/23	Police	\$350,000	Coordinate, facilitate, and execute the Boundary analysis of existing SFPD District Stations against current quantitative and qualitative factors as well as input from Working Groups and community members.	Regular	12/31/2024
30699 - 22/23	Port	\$199,000	The contractor will develop and perform trainings on racial equity to Port staff groups of various sizes. Contractor will provide leadership coaching on an individual and group basis to specific groups of individuals. Contractor will provide an assessment and provide organizational development support in small group sessions. And contractor will issue a final report.	Regular	8/5/2025

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45877 -22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$14,250,000	The SFPUC Infrastructure Division Project Management Bureau seeks professional services to support project management in various capital improvement programs including Wastewater Enterprise Capital Improvement Program (WWEICIP), Water Enterprise Capital Improvement Program (WECIP), Hetchy Capital Improvement Program (HCIP), and Power Enterprise Transmission/Distribution projects. This PSC will be made up of three (3) agreements, each at a value of \$4.75 million. These services are required to support project management functions including project coordination support, project document control, project closeout support, and other services not specified but similar in nature to support project management functions.	Regular	12/17/2028
45762 -22/23	Public Works	\$3,500,000	Public Works is seeking a qualified Architectural and Engineering (A/E) team led by an executive architect to provide property assessment services in assisting the City with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) located at 1 South Van Ness Street, San Francisco, CA. This project will generate an assessment report on current property conditions of twenty selected garages operated by SFMTA and Park & Recreation. The Selected Consultant Team is to be integrated with the City Team to deliver a property assessment report which provide current condition of the facilities, a recommended repair list and their respective cost estimate.	Regular	9/10/2028
49322 – 21/22	Human Services	Current Approved Amount \$165,000 Increase Amount Requested \$250,000 New Total Amount Requested \$415,000	Services are for a software license subscription for data risk protection and response. This software allows the user to save data on their laptops that may contain client data and it stay protected. The Human Services Agency (HSA) would use these services to provide automated backup and recovery of user data on workstation computers. This system includes standard backup/recovery in case of device failure, and additionally it is used by HSA to ensure retention of data that may be subject to litigation hold. The service includes litigation hold functionality that prevents users or administrators from accidentally or routinely deleting data under hold, e.g. in the course of decommissioning accounts after separation from employment. <b>Scope Change:</b> No scope change, simply buying more licenses.	Modification	9/30/2025

**Speakers:** John Arntz, Department of Elections spoke on PSC #40791 – 22/23

- Action:**
- 1) Approved PSC No. 40791 – 22/23 from the Department of Elections. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 2) Adopted the report. Approved the requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0160-23-1 Report on Position-Based Testing. (Item No. 10)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0161-23-1 Report of Proportion of Appointments Exempt Under Charter Sections 10.104-1, 2, and 4 through 12. (Item No. 11)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0162-23-1 Annual Report on Certification of Eligibles – Entry and Promotion – Uniformed Ranks of Fire, Police, and Sheriff. (Item No. 12)**

**Speakers:** Jen Lo, Department of Human Resources  
Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0163-23-1 Report of Exempt Appointments and Position Requests under Charter Sections 10.104- 16 through 10.104-18 for the period of January 1, 2023 to June 30, 2023. (Item No. 13)**

**Speakers:** Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0164-23-1 Report of Future Employment Restrictions and Probationary Releases for the period of January 1, 2023 to June 30, 2023. (Item No. 14)**

**Speakers:** Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources  
Mirna Palma, Human Services Agency  
Katrina Williams, Human Services Agency

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**Public Comment:** Patrick Monette-Shaw  
Jesse Stanton

**0165-23-1 Report on Provisional Appointments. (Item No. 15)**

**Speakers:** Stephanie Mayorga-Tipton, Department of Human Resources  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0166-23-1 Report of Expired Exempt Appointments under Charter Sections 10.104-16 through 10.104-18 for the period of January 1, 2023 to June 30, 2023. (Item No. 16)**

**Speakers:** Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0167-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract No. 44539-22/23. (Item No. 17)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
44539 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$250,000,000	This Personal Services Contract (“PSC”) is being requested for as-needed information technology (“IT”) services of a finite term procured within the prequalified Citywide Technology Procurement Pool (“CTPP”), including but not limited to software/system customization, configuration and implementation, design, development, and testing; system design, development, implementation, and integration; cybersecurity monitoring, including vulnerability assessments, and penetration testing; network configuration and implementation; website development; training; and other services of similar nature. City departments’ technology needs vary greatly, from software or systems involved to specific specialized skills and expertise needed to perform mission-critical tasks. To address this need, the Office of Contract Administration (“OCA”) is establishing a CTPP in accordance with Section 21.4 of the San Francisco Administrative Code (“Admin Code 21.4”), which sets forth the requirements for establishing prequalified pools of suppliers from which to select on an as-needed basis. OCA anticipates that CTPP will consist of numerous pre-qualified suppliers.	Regular	8/30/2030

**August 7, 2023:** Postponed to the meeting of August 21, 2023, at the request of the Office of the City Administrator.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postponed to the meeting of September 18, 2023, at the request of the Office of the City Administrator. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0168-23-8 Status Report on Personal Service Contract No. 48282-18/19 from the Department of Public Health. (Item No. 18)**

**Speakers:** Kelly Hiramoto, Department of Public Health  
David Smith, Department of Public Health

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)



**0127-22-4 Appeal by Yves Augustin of Rejection of Their Application for 2018 Human Services Agency Social Worker (CBT-2918-904264) Standardized Examination as Bias. (Item No. 19)**

**June 5, 2023:** Postponed to a future meeting at the request of the appellant.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Yves Augustin. Yves Augustin failed to appear. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 20)**

Commissioner Kate Favetti requested the “report back to the Civil Service Commission on PSCs” reports that they’d be placed on the Consent Agenda instead of the Regular Agenda.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 21)**

5:49 p.m.