



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
September 18, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2660 264 6713. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2660 264 6713
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

F.X. CROWLEY

VITUS LEUNG

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2660 264 6713.

CALL TO ORDER

2:05 p.m.

AND ROLL CALL

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Vitus Leung	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salveson	Excused Absence

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY’S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

Steve Zeltzer, United Front Committee for a Labor Party, expressed concerns about the stabbing of a social worker last week in the Tenderloin and what the City is doing to protect their workers. Also, expressed concerns on the City outsourcing.

Partick Monette-Shaw, Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director read a letter submitted by Partick Monette-Shaw that was forwarded to the Civil Service Commissioners.

Patrick Monette-Shaw, expressed that his letter was not intended to be read as public comment but forwarded to the Commissioners for review.

Patrick Monette-Shaw, As I previously testified, the Civil Service Commission doesn’t have a system in place to oversee whether contracts eventually awarded by City Departments end up exceeding approved authorization amounts under a PSC number approved by the Civil Service Commission.

Take the Department of Public Health. The Civil Service Commission previously approved PSC #49607–15/16 for SFDPH, approving an authorized amount of \$17 million. SFDPH issued at least four contracts citing PSC #49607–15/16 in contract language as the authority. The four contracts issued total \$22.83 million, **exceeding** the \$17 million PSC authorized **by at least \$5.8 million**. Separately, I’ve asked Executive Officer Sandra Eng to forward to each Commissioner my letter documenting this discrepancy.

The Civil Service Commission should work with the City Controller’s Office to develop and implement an automated tracking system to identify situations in which City Departments issue contracts valued in excess of their authorized PSC maximum amounts.

Cheryl Thornton expressed concerns about the stabbing in the Tenderloin and being harassed by management for giving a comment as a private citizen to the Standard Newspaper. Questioned to what happened to the 8/21/23 CSC Minutes. Concerns about DPH Managers and not permitting her attendance to the Labor Management Conferences.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of August 21, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the revised Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

Public Comment: Patrick Monette-Shaw, thanked the Commission for amending the Minutes of 8/21/23 to include the 150 word comment and stated that he would withdraw his complaint from the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer announced that item #23 Request for a Hearing by Tyree Robinson, former Senior Clerk Typist (1426) on their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco requested a postponement to a future meeting.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)

Carol Isen congratulated and welcomed Commissioner Leung and looks forward to working together. Reported that on August 24th a citywide memo providing implementation guidelines on the first set of rule changes that this commission adopted on the seventh of August. Also, at the end of August our Employment Services Division hosted a citywide virtual forum to ensure consistency in rule application. DHR working towards consistency of implementation and will continue to work with our constituent departments and to monitor and report back to the commission. The Department of Human Resources has two additional rule changes that they would like the commission to consider at its next meeting, this will be continuing series of amendments, DHR is focusing on rules they believe are outdated in relation to recent changes and investment in technology. Two issues DHR will be bringing to this commission and placing on calendar for the next meeting, the first is the definition of seniority. Presently seniority is tied to these certification date, which means that batches of people have the same seniority date. It's based on when the department submits a requisition and it becomes certified to an eligible list, this presents some significant challenges for current technology. DHR is going to be proposing that the seniority date change from certification date to appointment date for all new hires going forward. The proposed rule change would change prospectively. It would not affect city wide seniority date for any current employees. The proposed change would align DHR practices with the changes in technology and would allow DHR to create system efficiencies, which will be explained in the report that submitted to you in advance of your meeting on October 2nd, the second rule change that DHR would like CSC to consider is to make the rule of the list, the default certification rule for all continuous testing DHR will be proposing this for continuous class based testing examinations to be rule the list. The proposed rule changes allow DHR to modernize testing processes similar to what was accomplished with administrative analysts and will create system efficiencies, reduce the time to hire and it will allow for continued hiring in classifications with high vacancy rates and high turnover. DHR will also be

bringing this proposal at the meeting of October 2nd. This change will allow DHR to keep candidate pools refreshed, and DHR will be able to consider applicants as they apply. DHR is looking forward to presenting staff reports to on these two items and for CSC to take up these issues.

Public Jesse Stanton, Shop Steward. SEIU 1021
Comment: Naj Daniels, SEIU 1021
 Steve Zeltzer, United Front Committee for a Labor Party

EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT

0181-23-1 Response to the Commission’s Request on Selected Pending Appeals. (Item No. 6)

Speaker: Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

Action: Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0187-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
48217 - 22/23	Department of Early Childhood	\$10,000,000	Services are for the design, access, and support of information system solutions for the Department of Early Childhood (DEC). Information technology management system solutions are defined as technology-based systems that assist DEC staff and clients by providing childcare web-based waitlist; Program Evaluation and Assessment systems; Website Creation and Content Development Applications; contract management; and other ancillary services including training, technical support, installations, and upgrades of DEC’s information technology.	Regular	6/30/2028
45369 - 23/24	Department of Emergency Management	\$3,000,000	Department of Emergency Management (DEM) needs to upgrade its NICE Logger system because the current system was sunsetted in December 2022. DEM wishes to procure a total upgraded INFORM V10 system consisting of all existing four hundred seventy-six (476) primary telephony channels and provide Inform software access to SFDEM’s redundant 120-channel IP radio loggers from Contractor Motorola Solutions Inc.	Regular	12/31/2033
40707 - 22/23	Mayor	\$2,000,000	To provide state legislative representation, to advocate on behalf of the City and Departments on legislative and regulatory matters, to assist with the implementation of the City’s State Legislative Agenda, and to keep the Mayor’s Office up-to-date with relevant information about State government activities. As a City and County, San Francisco is affected by a broad range of issues across many disciplines and departments. The City’s state legislative representatives should possess the experience and knowledge to work in a broad array of policy topics included, but not limited to economic development, health care, public safety, human services, housing, environment, transportation, education and community development.	Regular	10/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41564 - 23/24	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$410,000	The consultant will provide required training to the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) police service dogs (K-9 unit) and their handlers on explosives detection in accordance with Transportation Security Administration (TSA) standards. The canines and police officers will then be qualified and TSA-certified to work when explosives detection is required within the SFMTA transit system.	Regular	9/4/2028
41489 - 23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$155,000	Annual maintenance and service of 3 generators PUC Power maintains on Treasure Island and Yerba Buena Island plus any spot repairs as needed. Service includes: Cooling system/Coolant; Air Intake system; Exhaust system; Electrical system; Fuel checks; Diesel Engine check; Engine Running check and Battery and Charge check.	Regular	9/1/2028
49028 - 23/24	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,000,000	The purpose of this contract is to provide maintenance, calibration and repair services, and certification of the truck and hopper scales throughout the Wastewater Enterprise (WWE) for the City and County of San Francisco, Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC). Work under this contract may include maintenance and repair to the load cells, load stands, indicators, microcells, junction boxes, ticket printers and troubleshooting truck and hopper scale software programs. Work will also include load scale testing and calibration using contractor's certified test weights, test trailer and test truck.	Regular	1/31/2029
48886 - 23/24	Public Works	\$500,000	Public Works is implementing a construction project management system software solution to integrate various systems related to project delivery processes and enhance financial management capabilities. The selected vendor will be responsible for the implementation and ongoing support of the System, ensuring its successful integration with existing systems while providing functional and technical assistance as needed. These services will be used to assist the Departments with system enhancements, modifications and additional systems support.	Regular	8/28/2028
43644 - 22/23	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$250,000 Increase Amount Requested \$750,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,000,000	The Permit Center seeks professional services to implement a streamlined and digital workflow solution, including data collecting and sharing. The professional services will configure and implement an inspection scheduler and workflow tool to digitize, streamline, and automate the inspection processes involving multiple inspecting departments. The tool will allow customers to schedule on-site inspections and collect data from the applicant prior to arrival. The workflow tool also allows multiple departments to access and view the data, make updates to the data prior to inspection, and allows departments to collect and record new data during the mobile inspection process. The services will provide a technology solution that provides an integrated and complete digital workflow. The solution will also be scalable to other use cases across multiple permitting and inspection services across the Permit Center.	Regular	4/30/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40949 – 16/17	Ethics Commission	Current Approved Amount \$1,374,750 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$1,374,750	The Ethics Commission currently contracts with a private vendor to provide an electronic filing system to file ethics forms and maintain its filing records databases. The forms include Fair Political Practices Commission (FPPC) and local campaign finance forms, Statement of Economic Interests, lobbyist reports and campaign consultant reports. The Secretary of State’s approval is required for filing systems that submit electronic FPPC campaign finance forms and the Ethics Commission can only contract with vendors on the Secretary of State’s certified vendor list. The FPPC’s approval is required for filing systems that submit electronic Statement of Economic Interest filings. The Ethics Commission requires a service that includes web-based filing software for filers, a back-office administration system, a database, and a search engine for online public disclosure. This system must be hosted by the vendor’s server infrastructure. This personal services contract will include developing additional components for the Ethics Commission’s existing electronic filing system, technical support, and system maintenance. The new components include new reporting requirements for Expenditure Lobbyists as required by Measure C (adopted by San Francisco voters in the November 3, 2015 election), new electronic forms required by the Committee on Information Technology (COIT)-funded Efiling Conversion Project, and new lobbyist registration requirements included in Measure T (adopted by San Francisco voters in the November 8, 2016 election). On January 20, 2017, the Mayor signed into law an ordinance requiring the electronic filing of behested payment reports by City boards and commissions, which becomes operative on January 1, 2018. The new contract will also provide flexibility to add additional forms and functionality to the system when new legislation is passed during the contract term.	Regular	6/30/2026
49252 -21/22	Human Services	Current Approved Amount \$1,026,131 Increase Amount Requested \$1,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,026,131	The scope of work shall include technical assistance and best practices in the implementation and evaluation of FFPSA prevention programs and services in the following areas: prevention program development and implementation that leverages a public and private partner network; determining funding sources for services; developing provider and San Francisco Human Services Agency capacity and processes to capture services costs in alignment with Family First Prevention Place Services Act requirements and California Department of Social Services instructions for claiming; continuous quality improvement utilizing programmatic and data evaluation and findings; and related coaching, supervision, and capacity building. The expected outcome is development and implementation of an integrated citywide plan that increases economic stability, reduces child maltreatment, and improves child welfare permanency outcomes through coordinated prevention programs provided to children, youth and families of the City and County of San Francisco.	Regular	10/31/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
31207 - 18/19	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$134,000 Increase Amount Requested \$166,000 New Total Amount Requested \$300,000	Contractor will provide rental and maintenance of ten 55-gallon, 4-foot aquaria located inside Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH) and one 8-foot aquarium located on the esplanade of the hospital. Maintenance will include regular feeding of fish and related aquaria animals using automated feeders, at least biweekly evaluation of all aquaria for cleaning and/or repair, and provision of those services as indicated. Results of the evaluation/quality assurance to be shared weekly with Director of Therapeutic Activities and Wellness Department, or their designee. Contractor will supply all aquaria with appropriate or agreed upon number of fish and any other related animals, and to replace all fish that may die during the course of the contract. Contractor will also provide 24-hour, on-call service for any problems that may occur, such as dead fish, equipment malfunction, or dirty tank conditions, and resolve those problems within 24 hours of the call. Contractor will maintain liaison with the Therapeutic Activities and Wellness Department regarding the operation and condition of the aquaria.	Regular	10/31/2028
31236 – 20/21	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$99,000 Increase Amount Requested \$135,000 New Total Amount Requested \$234,000	The contractor(s) will provide as-needed repairs and intermittent equipment maintenance for the Department's floor maintenance equipment, which at present is primarily at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital. Equipment requiring these services includes floor cleaning machines, floor buffers, floor burnishers, floor ride-on machines, and other similar equipment. At present, ZSFG must maintain 150-200 equipment items in order to maintain full maintenance capacity. (Note: These are longtime continuing services which previously had not been included as needing PSC approval.)	Modification	8/31/2025

Speakers: Ingrid Mezquita, Department of Early Childhood spoke on PSC #48217-22/23.
 Juan Soto, Department of Emergency Management spoke on PSC #45369-23/24.
 David Carter, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #41489-23/24.

Action:

- 1) Approved PSC #48127-22/23 from the Department of Early Childhood. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 2) Approved PSC #45369-23/24 from the Department of Emergency Management with the condition to provide a progress report back to the Commission in five (5) years. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 3) Approved PSC 41489-23/24 from the Public Utilities Commission with the condition to resubmit personal service contract form to the Executive Officer with clarification of funding source as general operations fund. (Vote of 4 to 0)
- 4) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0182-23-1 Report on MTA Service-Critical Appointments Exempt from Civil Service under Charter Sections 10.104-16 through 10.104-18. (Item No. 8)

Speaker: William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0183-23-1 SFMTA Provisional Appointment Report. (Item No. 9)

Speaker: None.

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0184-23-1 SFMTA Position-Based Testing Report for FY 2023. (Item No. 10)

Speaker: William Miles II, Municipal Transportation Agency

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0185-23-1 Annual Report on the City and County of San Francisco Pre-Employment Conviction History Program for Fiscal Year July 1, 2022, to June 30, 2023. (Item No. 11)

Speaker: Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0188-23-8 Status Report on Airport Personal Service Contract Number 41953-18/19. (Item No. 12)

Speaker: None.

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0189-23-1 Status Report on Airport Personal Service Contract Number 48165-18/19. (Item No. 13)

Speaker: None.

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0139-23-6 Appeal by Whitney Barca of the Human Resources Director's determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant's complaint of harassment and retaliation. (Item No. 14)

Action: Postponed to the meeting of October 16, 2023, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0167-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract No. 44539-22/23. (Item No. 15)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
44539 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$250,000,000	This Personal Services Contract (“PSC”) is being requested for as-needed information technology (“IT”) services of a finite term procured within the prequalified Citywide Technology Procurement Pool (“CTPP”), including but not limited to software/system customization, configuration and implementation, design, development, and testing; system design, development, implementation, and integration; cybersecurity monitoring, including vulnerability assessments, and penetration testing; network configuration and implementation; website development; training; and other services of similar nature. City departments’ technology needs vary greatly, from software or systems involved to specific specialized skills and expertise needed to perform mission-critical tasks. To address this need, the Office of Contract Administration (“OCA”) is establishing a CTPP in accordance with Section 21.4 of the San Francisco Administrative Code (“Admin Code 21.4”), which sets forth the requirements for establishing prequalified pools of suppliers from which to select on an as-needed basis. OCA anticipates that CTPP will consist of numerous pre-qualified suppliers.	Regular	8/30/2030

August 21, 2023: Postponed to the meeting of September 18, 2023, at the request of the Office of the City Administrator.

Speakers: Daniel Sanchez, Office of Contract Administration
 Jonathan Wright, Department of Human Resources
 Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
 Kate Kimberlin, Deputy City Attorney

Action: The Civil Service Commission adopted the report and approved the following:

- Amendment to the amount of \$180,000,000 in lieu of \$250,000,000.
- Amendment of the duration for five (5) years rather than seven (7) years.
- Approved the request for the proposed personal services contract with the proviso that the Civil Service Commission will be the third-party adjudicator as described in the letter of agreement between the employee organization, IFPTE Local 21, and the Office of Contract Administration.
 - The Commission will approve whether the scope of services is specific and meets the scope of work that was initially approved.
 - The item will be placed as a separate agenda item not included in the ratification agenda.

Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0192-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract Number 41012-23/24 from the Department of Public Health – Omit Posting. (Item No. 16)

Speakers: Jacquie Hale, Department of Public Health
Jonathan Lyens, Department of Public Health

Action: Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

Public Comment: Patrick Monette-Shaw, The Civil Service Commission should reject SFDPH’s PSC #41012-23/24 request for \$6 million for Temporary Registry staffing for Respiratory Therapy Technicians at Laguna Honda Hospital for a two-year and 25-week period. First of all, the PSC Summary Form #1 document states in response to question 3-B that typically, Civil Service Job Classifications 2320 Registered Nurses, and P103 Special Nurses can normally perform this work. SFDPH already has awarded *actual* contracts to Registry Staffing companies to the tune of millions of dollars to hire as-needed Nursing staff who can perform the Respiratory Therapy services. Second, an accompanying letter from SFDPH’s Kelly Hiramoto dated September 5 states that a recent survey inspection “*Plan of Correction*” had identified in the Summer of 2023 the need to hire Respiratory Therapists. A July 20, 2023 “*Root Cause Analysis*” report identified *compliance* problems with Laguna Honda’s tracheostomy and laryngectomy policies and procedures, **not** insufficient staffing levels.

0186-23-1 Status of 8238 Public Safety Communications Dispatcher Hiring at San Francisco Department of Emergency Management. (Item No. 17)

Speakers: Sandy Chan, Department of Emergency Management
Robert Smuts, Department of Emergency Management
Yvonne Rodriguez, Department of Emergency Management

Action: Adopted the report of the Department of Emergency Management. (Vote of 4 to 0)

Public Comment: Burt Wilson, City Employee
Naj Daniels, SEIU 1021

0039-20-6 Appeal by Craig Martin of the Human Resources Director’s determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant’s complaint of retaliation. (Item No. 18)

Speakers: Stephanie Medina, Department of Human Resources
Jennifer Burke, Department of Human Resources
Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
Kate Kimberlin, Deputy City Attorney
Craig Martin, Appellant

Action: The Civil Service Commission continued this item to a future meeting and moved to agendize the matter as a closed session for consideration by the Commission at a date to be determined after the appellant has been given the opportunity to review their EEO file at the Department of Human Resources. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0067-23-6 Appeal by Pornthipa Rojanadechakul of the Director of Transportation’s determination to administratively close Appellant’s complaint of retaliation. (Item No. 19)

Speaker: None.

Action: The Civil Service Commission continued this item to a future meeting and moved to agendize the matter as a closed session for consideration by the Commission at a date to be determined after the appellant has been given the opportunity to review their EEO file at the Department of Human Resources. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0140-23-6 Appeal by Eduardo Guerrero Ortiz of the Human Resources Director’s determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant’s complaint of harassment and discrimination. (Item No. 20)

Speaker: None.

Action: The Civil Service Commission continued this item to a future meeting and moved to agendize the matter as a closed session for consideration by the Commission at a date to be determined after the appellant has been given the opportunity to review their EEO file at the Department of Human Resources. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0075-19-7 Request for a Hearing by Jared Harris, former Senior Human Resources Analyst (1244) on their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 21)

Speaker: Katrina Williams, Human Services Agency

Action: The Civil Service Commission adopted the report and denied the appeal by Jared Harris. Future employment is subject to review and approval of the Human Resources Director after satisfactory completion of 10 years of verifiable work experience outside of CCSF service and proof of completing a rehabilitation program. Jared Harris failed to appear. (Vote of 4 to 0)

180-20-7 Request for a Hearing by Sandra Zuniga, former Manager IV (0932) on their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 22)

Speaker: Sandra Zuniga, Appellant
Karen Hill, Department of Public Works
Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources

Action: The Civil Service Commission approved the request to postpone to a future meeting at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 4 to 0)

0046-21-7 Request for a Hearing by Tyree Robinson, former Senior Clerk Typist (1426) on their Future Employment Restriction with the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 23)

Speaker: None.

Action: The Civil Service Commission approved the request to postpone this item to a future meeting at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 4 to 0)

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 24)

Commissioner Kate Favetti complimented staff on the new CSC logo.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 25)

6:01 p.m.