



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
July 17, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2661 849 7476. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2661 849 7476  
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2661 849 7476.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Excused absence
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of July 3, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopt the Minutes. (Vote of 3 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

None.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Kate Howard, DHR, reported on the E2P Program - 462 permanent appointments made, 151 eligible lists, 69 active referrals in progress, 56 other permanent appointments made through other CBT or PBT processes, 587 transitioned from CAT 18 to PCS status; the Administrative Analyst on-line on demand completed, 1820 class – 12 departments are participating in the post-referral process and 126 applicants are scheduled for interviews which are ongoing, the candidates who perform the best during the interview process will be referred to departments for final consideration, for the 1822 recruitment there are 667 candidates and interviews are scheduled in the following weeks, expect to complete 60 hires withing the next month; HR Analysts series – 892 test takers, there are 359 applicants and 250+ of those had been scheduled for the test; for the Community Police Services Aide, the recruitment will be conducted as a discrete class based test, it will be on the previously approved rule of five certification, the exam will be online and expected to be open in August; for the 8238 Dispatcher, the department is continuing to recruit.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

**0096-23-1 Processing and Scheduling of Appeals Before the Civil Service Commission – Possible Action Item**

**May 1, 2023:** Continued to the meeting of June 5, 2023.

**June 5, 2023:** Postpone to the meeting of July 17, 2023.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postpone to the meeting of August 7, 2023.

**0142-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
46560 - 22/23	Airport	\$1,500,000,000	Design-Build (DB)/Project Management Support Services (PMSS) teams with demolition, parking garage, AirTrain, airport cargo facilities, airport ground service equipment maintenance facilities, office tower, and underground utility management expertise are required to manage the design, construction, activation, and commissioning of the new infrastructure as part of the West Field Area Projects ("Projects"). The Projects may include the construction a new 1,100 stall parking garage, upgrades to the West Field Road AirTrain station, construction of two new airport cargo facilities, construction of a new airport ground service maintenance facility, construction of a new 11-story office building, demolition of Airport Buildings 660, 676 , 624, and 730 (including hazmat abatement), and upgrades and/or replacement of all major utilities on West Field Road. Contractor may also provide partnering, stakeholder engagement, and project coordination to support the Projects. The total \$1,500,000,000 PSC Amount includes the full construction budget for the DB contract for the Projects, of which design and PMSS will be approximately \$200,000,000.	Regular	8/31/2028
41550 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$4,600,000	Contractors shall provide towing, roadside assistance services, and storage for City-owned vehicles including light duty (Type I), medium duty (Type II), and heavy duty (Type V) for the City and County of San Francisco (the City), on behalf of Central Shops. These services shall be provided as-needed, 24/7, 365 days/year.	Regular	6/4/2028
41669 - 22/23	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing	\$3,000,000	The awarded contractor/s will provide transportation services for unhoused adults and families using emergency shelter services with the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH) Homelessness Response System (HRS). Transportation services include shuttle services to and from shelter sites and other HRS support services sites. Transportation services are available to clients intermittently available during non-business hours.	Regular	6/30/2028
47575 - 22/23	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing	\$300,000	Contractor will provide maintenance and repair services for recreational vehicles (RV) and trailers at an HSH emergency shelter site. These trailers were provided by the state of California to the City as temporary shelter for the City’s most vulnerable populations at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic. The Contractor will provide maintenance and repairs to electrical and lights, heater and air conditioning, doors/locks, appliances, leaks, etc. The current shelter site is expected to close in December 2023 as HSH winds down it’s COVID-19 response, however HSH needs the trailers temporarily beyond the close date until clients are permanently rehoused.	Regular	6/30/2024

43586 - 22/23	Juvenile Probation	\$200,000	The Juvenile Probation Department (JPD) wishes to procure consulting services from qualified individuals to support the implementation of Phase II of its Racial Equity Action Plan (attached for reference). Consulting services shall include Training, Coaching, Facilitation, Technical Services, and Organizational Equity Development. Phase II of the Racial Equity Action Plan will provide a more granular review of the intersection of department-specific employment decisions and race as well as gender, namely for hiring, promotions, professional development, terminations, exit interviews, and compensation decisions for department employees. The contracted consultant will provide assistance in operationalizing these goals, as well as provide JPD with tools to help foster inclusion and racial equity across the department. The contracted consultant will also provide coaching and support actions plans that address barriers to hiring, develop supplemental questionnaires, and review minimum qualifications for positions at the department. All staff will benefit from these services - with some services focused deliberately on leadership staff. Services will be provided in-person and virtually, with hybrid options.	Regular	10/31/2024
<b>PSC</b>	<b>Department</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Type of Service</b>	<b>Type of Approval</b>	<b>Duration</b>
43002 - 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$250,000	To provide federally mandated urine analysis for safety-sensitive employees with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency.	Regular	1/31/2029
45886 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$4,985,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC), a department of the City and County of San Francisco (“City”), seeks to retain the services of a qualified Proposer to provide construction management (CM) staff augmentation services for the Harrison and Treat Box Sewer Project (“Project”). As part of the SFPUC’s Sewer System Improvement Program (SSIP), and more specifically as a part of the Folsom Area Stormwater Improvements, the Project’s primary goal is to mitigate flooding in the 17th Street and Folsom Street neighborhood area in San Francisco. The Project work focuses on improvements to over 12,000 linear feet of the area’s existing sewer system, including deepening an existing reinforced concrete and brick box sewer, installing new reinforced concrete box sewers, upsizing existing pipe sewers, and installing new auxiliary pipe sewers and junction structures. The CM staff augmentation services required for the Project include, but are not limited to, construction administration, construction inspection, construct contracts management, and project controls (construction scheduling and cost estimation). The SFPUC will manage the staff augmentation team during construction for the Project for approximately 3 years and 4 months.	Regular	8/31/2027

41495 - 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$500,000	<p>Contractor to provide budget support, financial reconciliation, and procedure documentation consulting services to the SFMTA's Finance &amp; Information Technology Division's Budget, Financial Projections, and Analysis Section (BFPA). The Contractor shall support BFPA during the budget season, assist in clearing the backlog of financial analysis, and document existing roles, policies, and procedures.</p> <p>Budget Support: The Contractor shall conduct an analysis of the SFMTA's FY18-19 and FY21-22 operating budget sources and uses them to propose zero-base budgeting for each Division. The Contractor will provide each of the following Deliverables to the SFMTA for review and approval to achieve the Budget Support objectives. Each final Deliverable will be presented in the form of a report and presentation given at a meeting with SFMTA staff.</p> <p>Financial Reconciliation: The Contractor shall conduct the following financial reconciliation analysis services for the SFMTA. The Contractor will provide each of the following Deliverables to the SFMTA for review and approval to achieve the Financial Reconciliation objectives. Each final Deliverable will be presented in the form of a report and presentation given at a meeting with SFMTA staff.</p> <p>Policy and Procedure Documentation: The Contractor shall assist BFPA in developing, documenting, and refining BFPA-related policies and procedures. The Contractor will provide each of the following Deliverables to the SFMTA for review and approval to achieve the Policy and Procedure Documentation objectives. Each final Deliverable will be presented in the form of a report and presentation given at a meeting or training session with SFMTA staff.</p>	Regular	10/1/2025
---------------	---------------------------------	-----------	--	---------	-----------

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
46785 – 16/17	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$34,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$12,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$46,000,000	The San Francisco International Airport ('Airport') is seeking to replace the existing Common Use Self Service ('CUSS') Passenger Processing system that was originally installed in 2000 and later upgraded in 2007 and 2015. CUSS Passenger Processing systems are specialized systems used solely by airports to allow airlines to share common airport resources used for passenger processing, such as passenger check-in, baggage processing, passenger boarding. The system consists of four tightly integrated core vendor-developed components: 1) virtualized Common Use application, 2) Self Service Kiosk application, 3) Resource Management application, and 4) Airport Operational Data Base. The services will also include supporting the Information Display Systems (IDS), which are used to display flight and baggage information. The Contractors will be responsible for designing, implementing and supporting the system. The total cost for the systems is \$13,000,000. Of that cost, \$6,000,000 is for the professional services maintenance and support of end user equipment, such as computers, printers, scanners and readers. The remainder of the money is anticipated for the purchasing of equipment.	Modification	12/31/2031

41183 – 19/20	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$85,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$107,500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$192,500,000	Contractor will provide check writing services for the Department's Behavioral Health Services (BHS) to enable the Department to provide the following services: Residential Care Facility services ('mom-and-pop' board and care homes); reimbursement to out-of-county mental health service providers when children and adolescents are placed outside of San Francisco; intermittent and as-needed reimbursements of providers who are members of the San Francisco Mental Health Plan's Private Provider Network (PPN); provision of wraparound services (occasional food, tutoring, and other services) for children and adolescents served in San Francisco; assistance with client stabilization in emergency housing, as needed; support of the Parent Institute's trainings, and other as-needed services such as one-time or limited consultation related to the needs of clients with mental health issues and/or substance use disorder diagnoses, as well as as-needed treatment related to eating disorders at Psychiatric Emergency.	Modification	6/30/2028
44553 – 16/17	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$121,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$121,000,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) intends to award up to three (3) contracts ranging from \$15 million to \$35 million each to provide professional construction management (CM) services on an as-needed basis to support SFPUC staff on various Sewer System Improvement Program (SSIP) projects. These additional CM services will support existing staff on various SSIP projects including construction of the new headworks and biosolids digester facilities at the Southeast Water Pollution Control Plant (SEP) as well as major improvements and upgrades at other various wastewater treatment facilities. Additionally, as-needed CM staff may be required to support the SFPUC's Construction Management Bureau's organizational effort and may, for example, include adding on a short-term basis, Construction Engineer(s), Inspector(s), Safety Manager(s), and Cost Estimator(s).	Modification	6/30/2028

**Speakers:** Cynthia Avakian and Enrique Guadamos, Airport spoke on PSC 46785-16/17.  
 Bree Mawhorter, Municipal Transportation Agency spoke on PSC 41495-22/23

- Action:**
- 1) Approved PSC #41495-22/23 from the Municipal Transportation Agency subject to the three (3) modifications made by MTA. (Vote of 3 to 0)
  - 2) Approved PSC #46785-16/17 from the Airport. (Vote of 3 to 0)
  - 3) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 3 to 0)

**0188-20-6 Appeal by Craig Banks of Human Resources Director’s finding of untimely allegations of harassment, administratively close one allegation of retaliation, and insufficient evidence to substantiate three allegations of retaliation. (Item No. 8)**

**February 6, 2023:** Postponed to the meeting of April 17, 2023, at the request of the appellant.

**April 17, 2023:** Postpone to the meeting of July 17, 2023, at the request of the appellant.

**Speakers:** Jennifer Burke, Department of Human Resources  
 Craig Banks, Appellant  
 Rachel Gardunio, Public Utilities Commission

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission granted the appeal by Craig Banks. The Commission finds harassment based on verbal comments by Gee from April 2013 to March 2014 (with departure of Respondent Gee as supervisor). Also, the Commission finds that the significant change in Appellant's pump station duties was both harassing and retaliatory, based on Appellant's stated intent to both Respondents Gee and Yee to file EEO claims in December 2013. Furthermore, the Commission finds denial of approximately two (2) hours of overtime pay was both harassing and retaliatory. Also, the Commission finds that the failure to return his normal vehicle to Appellant after it returned from fire duties was harassing, and the failure to return it after Respondents' awareness of intent to file EEO claim in December 2013 was retaliatory. The Commission directs DHR to determine an appropriate remedy, and to communicate the remedy, and the reasons therefore, to Mr. Banks within sixty (60) days, unless the City and Mr. Banks should reach a mutually agreeable settlement of Mr. Banks' claims within that time frame. The remedy so determined by DHR may be appealed by Mr. Banks to the Commission. (Vote of 3 to 0)

**0004-23-6 Appeal by Velma Gay of the Human Resources Director's determination that investigative findings did not establish Appellant's complaint of harassment and discrimination. (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission postponed this item to a future meeting in October at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 3 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 10)**

President Minor requested a tentative date for the EEO update from Deputy Director Howard. Commissioner Crowley requested the Executive Officer look into an issue of grants given for services, employees being given debit cards for services rendered cleaning streets in San Francisco, it is an appalling work around and a serious violation of rules governing employment in the City and County of San Francisco. Commissioner Crowley also requested the Executive Officer look into electrical inspections at the PUC and the Port of San Francisco abating the Rules of the electrical inspection department (DBI) by using their own personnel package, request we seek remedy through inspection service.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 11)**

The Commission adjourned the meeting in memory of Larry Griffin. Mr. Griffin was a great friend of Commissioner Crowley their father's served on the San Francisco Labor Council together. He was a dear friend of Commissioner Crowley for 30 – 40 years. Mr. Griffin was with District Attorney's Office and spent many years as a very diligent union person with IFPTE, Local 21. He also worked with the Office of Labor Standards. Deputy Director Holmes recalled time spent at the IFPTE, Local 21 bargaining table with Larry Griffin who led the talks on behalf of the Local 21 contracts team. He is remembered as an affable man who left an indelible impression. Meeting adjourned at 3:49 p.m.