



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
August 7, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2660 985 6816. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2660 985 6816  
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2660 985 6816.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

None.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES - (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of July 17, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer made two announcements, 1) PSC #43182-22/23 by the City Administrator had a typo on the amount. Amount should be \$4,000,000. 2) Item #14 Appeal by Eric Eliasson was postponed at the request of the Department of Human Resources due to pending grievance.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources reported on the following items: 1) provided a few updates on ongoing DHR activities in line with the CCT programs, continuous testing programs and others that are all in an effort to speed up hiring and infilling our cities high number of vacancies. 2) As of Friday, August 4<sup>th</sup> – 478 permanent appointments have been made off of our E2P eligible lists. In addition, there are currently 57 active referrals, 56 other appointments permanent appointments have been made to category 18 eligibles using the regular CBT and PBT processes. With these numbers we are looking at a combined total of 591 anticipated transitions from category 18 to permanent status. 3) Update on the 1820 and 1822 Administrative Analyst series. As we've reported the city wide post referral selection process for 1820 and 1822 has been a huge effort that seeks to fill approximately 65 vacancies across a

dozen departments. DHR has over a dozen staff supporting this recruitment along with one 115 subject matter experts also supporting application screenings and panel interviews throughout the city. I'm pleased to announce that the first offer was extended to fill one of our 1820 positions representing a total hiring timeline from publication of the CCT job ad to higher of 99 days. This is notably shorter than the median time to hire of 210 days for all 1820 PCS hires that were made in FY 22-23. Application screens and first round of the panel interviews were already completed for other 1820 recruitments, surveys were sent to semifinalists and hiring managers to do a job matching exercise and they've been completed. After we actually do the matching based on preferences of the hiring manager and the candidates, the final round of interviews, if, which is optional can begin next week. As for the 1822 application screenings of 667 eligibles have been completed and the first round of interviews are underway. 4) The 1241 and 1244 Human Resources Analyst series as of Monday, July 31<sup>st</sup> DHR adopted the initial continuous testing eligible list with 1042 eligibles. The initial referral for 12 approved vacant positions was issued on Friday, August 4<sup>th</sup>, the good news is that many of these vacant positions were recently filled through provisional recruitments. So, most departments don't even have to conduct a post-referral selection process to give their provisionals an opportunity to transition to permanent status in accordance with Civil Service Commission Rules, they simply just have to pick them up, this is rule of the list, so they are all reachable. As per the 1244 DHR has marketed the job postings on various social media and HR related sites. As of today, we received 407 applications DHR anticipates conducting a cut score analysis later this week and hopes to have an eligible list adopted by next week. 5) The 7334 Stationary Engineer, continuous testing rule of the list. The continuous testing job ad was published on Monday, July 31<sup>st</sup> as of today, 33 applications have been submitted and are in various stages of the exam process. DHR is collaborating with the Airport to track sources of applicants to further conduct recruitment efforts. 6) The 1840 series Management Assistant series, several meetings ago DHR announced that it was targeting June or July of 2023 to launch the CCT program. However, due to a recent change in minimum qualifications, removing the specific course work requirements for the degree to be more inclusive in an effort to gain more qualified candidates the launch of the CCT has been delayed until the end of this month. The good news is that we still have current active eligible list for the series, and we are encouraging departments to utilize them to build their vacancies prior to the launch of the CCTs. 7) Finally, I also wanted to provide the commission with a comment regarding the proposed rule changes under the regular agenda for today's meeting our action item, specifically action Items #11-13 pertaining to the proposed rule changes for Volume I - IV with the recommendation from the Executive Officer to incorporate proposed changes made by the Commission and adopt all changes. While we agreed to move forward with these changes, the Department of Human Resources would like to remind the Commissioners of its general concerns that some of the rule changes added by the Commission may weaken the effectiveness of DHR's initial intent to expedite hiring. We also previously mentioned that the 20 business day goal of resolving referrals may not be practical and may present a burden in reporting out, for example, any classifications that require backgrounding or medicals are very unlikely to resolve a referral in 20 business days. DHR will analyze the impact of the rule changes and come back to the commission if any are determined to be ineffective in expediting hiring.

**0096-23-1 EXECUTIVE OFFICER'S REPORT****Processing and Scheduling of Appeals Before the Civil Service Commission.  
(Item No. 6)****May 1, 2023:** Continued to the meeting of June 5, 2023.**June 5, 2023:** Postpone to the meeting of July 17, 2023.**Speaker:** Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

- Action:**
- Continue conducting in-person City-wide training on preparing and presenting staff reports responding to appeals to the Commission.
  - Extension requests due to grievance, arbitration, litigation, pending settlement agreements or similar will require departmental status updates from the department to Commission staff monthly until resolved and scheduling of the appeal within thirty (30) days of the resolution (17.6% of the appeals from FY2023 were due to these delays).
  - Provide up to one-month extension to departments for delayed appeal responses due to staffing issues. A second request for delay due to staffing issues will require a department representative appear before the Commission to provide justification for their extension request and to inform the Commission of the meeting date they will be prepared for the hearing.
  - Commission staff will send approximately 2-week reminders before the staff report due date.
  - Departments who do not meet the deadlines (e.g., monthly status updates, extension requests, staff report due dates) for reporting to the Commission will be scheduled to appear at the following Commission meeting to provide an explanation.
  - Electronic appeals database system - appellants e-file their appeal and the database captures and tracks all pending appeals through the appeals process generating auto email alerts and reminders to commission staff and to the affected departments when appeals are filed, and staff reports are due.
  - Potentially when the capability is available in SF.GOV – online appeal filing.
  - Fillable PDF staff reports

**0153-23-1 Response to the Civil Grand Jury Report. (Item No. 7)**

**Speakers:** Sandra Eng, Executive Officer  
 Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources  
 Mawuli Tugbenyoh, Department of Human Resources  
 Jon Givner, Deputy City Attorney

- Action:**
- The Commission directed the Executive officer to change:  
 F2 to say modify response “will be significantly reduced” to “aspires to significantly reduce”  
 F8 - reduce the phrase place a period and remove the last part

sentence “and should be automatically approved if funding is in place”

R2.1 edit to include “to establish aspirational and realistic goals” (Vote of 4 to 0)

- Delegate to Executive Officer the ability to work with Mayor’s Office and Department of Human Resources on Civil Grand Jury final response, Executive Officer to submit CSC response directly to the Civil Grand Jury if the Commissioners comments are not adequately reflected. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0155-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 8)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
43182 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$4,000,000	Clean interior and exterior windows, skylights, roof windows, greenhouses, plexiglass, mirrors, stained glass, etc., at City-owned facilities in San Francisco, San Mateo, and Alameda Counties. The contractor will perform window cleaning services on various buildings, ranging from historic landmark sites to Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED)-certified buildings, requiring a diverse and specialized knowledge of cleaning techniques, materials, and equipment.	Regular	9/29/2028
41951 - 22/23	Fire	\$150,000	Contractor will be responsible for the installation and setup of the EHR Software Integration and Implementation proprietary software, and the conversion of legacy information into the new system for the San Francisco Fire Department - including medical programs and organizational compliance programs. Software support and maintenance will include upgrades to new software versions of the proprietary EHR system, provide additional licenses, provide an interface to the existing systems used by the Fire Department, and other services necessary to maintain and support system functionality.	Regular	5/25/2028
43215 - 22/23	Police	\$122,348	The contractor will provide maintenance, service and parts to liquid handling platform used in DNA analysis process for the San Francisco Police Department's Crime Laboratory.	Regular	1/31/2027
46531 - 22/23	Port	\$2,700,000	The scope of the Pier 50 Earthquake Improvement Project will include the first phases of eventual seismic remediation at this site. The proposed scope will include engineering services consisting of data collection, surveys, geotechnical investigations and structural analysis to complete a seismic risk assessment of the site and the develop of overall retrofit strategies across the facility. It will then advance through the pre-design phase for selected priority retrofit projects to set a baseline scope, budget, and schedule for each. Final design and engineering, construction, and construction management will be completed by others.	Regular	7/1/2026

41901 - 22/23	Public Health	\$15,000,000	The contractor(s) will provide the Department of Public Health (DPH), a Picture Archiving and Communication System (PACS). The services shall include equipment, delivery, equipment configuration, equipment maintenance, implementing and maintaining the software, hosting (as applicable), and maintenance services to be provided by the Contractor(s). The PACS application will be integrated with the Epic Electronic Health Records System (EHR) and other clinical applications currently in use by the Department. The system is used to provide medical imaging storage across all hospital and clinics in the network. Any images including, but not limited to, X-Rays, computed tomography scans (CT), magnetic resonance imaging (MRI), dental images, and ultrasounds processed and stored through PACS. The professional services piece of this contract will be the start up implementation services, training, testing and maintenance portion, that are required to use PACS. The owner of the proprietary software is the only organization able to provide support and staff to implement, train, test and maintain the system with the hospital's existing Electronic Health Records System, Epic, and other clinical applications. In addition, during the term of this PSC approval the Department will be implementing PACS for Dental Images.	Regular	9/30/2028
---------------	---------------	--------------	---	---------	-----------

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
44438 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$19,000,000	The SFPUC is issuing this RFP totaling \$19,000,000 for two (2) separate \$9,500,000 contracts, for the purpose of selecting and entering into an agreement with a professional services Contractor to provide as needed intermittent services related to implementation of the agency's Racial Equity Action Plan, Racial Justice Resolution and other racial equity priorities, and to make sure that City staff performing this work can access specialized services and training as needed. The scope of work will include project management and change management, system and capacity development, improvements to internal workforce systems, improvements to agency services and assets, employee engagement, staff training and facilitation, manager and supervisor training and coaching, employee support, community engagement, and effective and transparent communication.	Regular	12/31/2028
44959 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$30,000,000	Work will consist of technical and project management services in all aspects required for expansion of an existing reservoir accomplished by raising a dam by over 50 feet. The increased reservoir storage will provide regional storage to benefit to 8 Bay Area and Central Valley water agencies. Activities include planning, permitting and design work related to construction of a surface water dam and an 8-mile conveyance pipeline that will enable delivery of water to California State Water Project infrastructure at the California Aqueduct. Operational and hydraulic modeling, regulatory permitting, facility design for Los Vaqueros dam and Transfer Bethany Pipeline, natural resources services, project management services, asset management services, land acquisition and management services, security and emergency response services, environmental and regulatory compliance services.	Regular	12/31/2025
49201 - 22/23	Public Works	\$22,000,000	Consultants will perform highly specialized professional land surveying work, such as, topographic, boundary and construction surveys, photogrammetric work, laser 3D scanner field and office assistance and training, AutoCAD Civil 3D drafting, help with special projects (monumentation, Geographical Information System (GIS) mapping, GPS network, etc.).	Regular	12/31/2029

4106 – 12/13	Economic and Workforce Development	Current Approved Amount \$2,485,000 Increase Amount Requested \$500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,985,000	The Workforce division of Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) manages a grant portfolio consisting of approximately 100 contract and grant agreements for 70 agencies annually across ten Federal, State and local fund sources. The process by which these agreements are negotiated, created, and tracked through their expiration is a very labor intensive process for both the City and the grantees/contractors involving repeated data entry into multiple spreadsheets, intensive paper-based-process steps, and lengthy reconciliation processes. After an extensive review of current business processes and identification of areas where efficiency and accuracy can be increased dramatically, OEWD has come to the conclusion that a technology solution is needed. The division is requesting approval to purchase a subscription to a customizable web portal and fully supported database to support the department's management of the grant negotiation, agreement creation, invoicing and financial reporting processes. The resource the division would like to acquire a subscription that has been successfully utilized by the Mayor's Office of Housing. <b>Scope Change:</b> OEWD will continue to work with the developer and the Financial Accounting and Information Management System(FAMIS)replacement team at the Controller's Office to identify areas in which the two systems can be synced and further reduce data entry burden on OEWD's finance staff. Currently the online portal is only managing grants for the workforce division of OEWD. OEWD is in the process of moving grantees from additional unit's portfolios -- more than doubling the size of the portfolio that will be managed through the online invoicing solution.	Modification	6/30/2025
--------------	------------------------------------	---	--	--------------	-----------

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42167 – 18/19	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing	Current Approved Amount \$2,145,000 Increase Amount Requested \$3,754,000 New Total Amount Requested \$5,899,000	On behalf of the City and County of San Francisco, the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH), in conjunction with the Local Homeless Coordinating Board (LHCB), must submit an annual comprehensive Notice of Funding Availability (NOFA) application to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) for Continuum of Care (CoC) Homeless Assistance Grant funds. The application requires grant-writing, strategic planning, program assessment, and evaluation assistance.	Modification	10/28/2028
45935 – 17/18	Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing	Current Approved Amount \$450,000 Increase Amount Requested \$180,000 New Total Amount Requested \$630,000	The City and County of San Francisco's Point-in-Time Homeless Count (Census), which is managed by the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH) and is held in 2019 and 2021, requires planning, coordination, and implementation assistance.	Modification	9/30/2024
49949 – 18/19	Human Services	Current Approved Amount \$750,000 Increase Amount Requested \$550,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,300,000	The purpose of the contract is to promote the safety and well-being of APS clients through the provision of emergency placement services and supportive personal care services available on a 24-hour basis. The Contractor shall provide a safe and secure placement for Adult Protective Services (APS) clients. The APS program will have access to placement and care to at least two clients, during any given month. For each referred client, provide a private bed within a licensed care facility. The placement will be consistent with licensing requirements set by California's Community Care Licensing Division and will include shelter, food, and assistance with personal care and Activities of Daily Living, as needed, for up to 60 days. Placement must be available on a short notice emergency, for a short-term, and to any APS client whether or not they are in need of medical care.	Modification	6/30/2025

41591 – 17/18	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$8,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$8,000,000	Contractor will provide a comprehensive patient billing statement solution (software). Services will include all necessary linkages to the Department's new Electronic Health Record (EHR) system, billing statement generation and distribution, ability for the City to manage and monitor all aspects of the service through an integrated application or service, and as-needed project management services during the implementation and post go-live period.	Modification	12/31/2029
42517 -18/19	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$1,750,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,100,000 New Total Amount Requested \$3,850,000	The contractor(s) will provide fully hosted, web-based software and its support to enable credentialing and privileging of medical services providers and employees for the Department of Public Health (DPH). Support will include project management, design, programming, testing, documentation, and system integration services. <b>Scope Change:</b> In addition to credential and privileging checks, the department is required to conduct health background check of all community care license applicants, community care licensees, adult residents, volunteers, and employees who have contract with clients in a health organization.	Modification	8/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47839 – 19/20	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$1,280,380 Increase Amount Requested \$2,319,620 New Total Amount Requested \$3,600,000	The work is calibrating and maintaining important water meters of the Hetch Hetchy regional water transmission system. The purpose of the work is to maintain accurate and reliable meter reads used for water accounting purposes. The work includes calibrating, inspecting, cleaning, and maintaining the system meters and related instruments used. The primary objective of all calibration activities is to ensure meter-signal accuracy and consistency carries through from the field located secondary metering equipment, through all remote transmitting units and field programmable logic controllers, through the SFPUC SCADA system, to the final remote operational display. The work often includes entering confined spaces to use special testing equipment to certify instrument accuracy. Work on each meter is documented and calibration certificates presented. Reporting includes site field notes, calibration notes and metering site instrument inventories. As needed, the work will involve diagnosing problems, identifying failed instruments, and performing parts replacement.	Modification	12/05/2027

**Speakers:**

Carlos Colon and Chris Horiuchi, Port spoke on PSC #46531-22/23. Shawndrea Hale and Chelsea Boilard, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #44438-22/23.

**Action:**

1. Approved PSC #46531-22/23 from the Port with the condition to amend the language on the scope of work and submit a copy to the Executive Officer. (Vote of 4 to 0)
2. Approved PSC #44438-16/17 from the Public Utilities Commission. (Vote of 4 to 0)



3. Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0154-23-3 Survey of Monthly Rates Paid to Police Officers and Fire Fighters in All Cities of 350,000 or More in the State of California (FY23-24). (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources  
Ted Wizinski, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** Adopted the Report; Transmit rates to the Retirement System in accordance with charter section A8.590.1 – A8.590.7; Provide report to The Board of Supervisors. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0156-23-8 Request to Grant the Health Service System Continuing Approval for Benefit Related Contracts for Personal Services Contracts. (File No. 10)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Approved the report. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0206-22-5 Proposed Rule Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rules Series 005 Meetings and Hearing of the Commission Article II: Hearings and Hearing Procedures Applicable to All Classifications. (Item No. 11)**

**November 7, 2022:** Accepted the Executive Officer's report, incorporate any changes made by the Commission, directed the Executive Officer to post the proposed amended Rule 005 Series for meet and discuss with the affected labor unions and interested stakeholders.

**Action:** Accepted the Executive Officer's staff report, incorporate any changes made by the Civil Service Commission; Adopted the proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Series 002 Definitions, 005 Meetings and Hearings of the Commission, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations, 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles in Volumes I – IV. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0255-22-5 Recommendation to Adopt Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rule Series 002 Definitions, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations, 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles in Volumes I-IV. (Item No. 12)**

**December 19, 2022:** Continued this item to the meeting of January 25, 2023.

**January 25, 2023:** Posted the proposed rules with the additions specified by the Commission (see “Sections” below), notify the Department of Human Resources of the results of certification within twenty (20) business days of the notice of certification, further; report to the Civil Service Commission on a regular basis, including a report on the departmental response time and the reason for delay and a report on the progress of advance notification of upcoming employment opportunities for the postings of five (5) days or less on the employment opportunity website. The additions specified in the Sections below for Volume I should be included in all rule volumes.

Sections:

- On title page of Rule Series 2 retitle Section 02.4.1 from “City Website” to “Employment Opportunity Website;” within Rule 02.4.1, change title to “Employment Opportunity Website”
- 110.3: To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by the labor market to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 111.13. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 111.15.1. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 111.30. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 111A.22.1. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 112.7.1. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 113.10.2. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access eligibles to the means for receiving timely notification.”

**Action:** Accepted the Executive Officer’s staff report, incorporate any changes made by the Civil Service Commission; Adopted the proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Series 002 Definitions, 005 Meetings and Hearings of the Commission, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations, 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles in Volumes I – IV. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0256-22-5 Recommendation to Adopt Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rule Series 402 Definitions, 410 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 411 Examinations, 411A Position-Based Testing, 412 Eligible Lists, and 413 Certification of**

**Eligibles in Volumes I -IV. (Item No. 13)**

**December 19, 2022:** Continued this item to the meeting of January 25, 2023.

**January 25, 2023:** Posted the proposed rules with the additions specified by the Commission (see “Sections” below), notify the Department of Human Resources of the results of certification within twenty (20) business days of the notice of certification, further; report to the Civil Service Commission on a regular basis, including a report on the departmental response time and the reason for delay and a report on the progress of advance notification of upcoming employment opportunities for the postings of five (5) days or less on the employment opportunity website. The additions specified in the Sections below for Volume I should be included in all rule volumes.

**Sections:**

- On title page of Rule 402 retitle Section 402.4.1 from “City Website” to “Employment Opportunity Website;” within Rule 402.4.1, change title to “Employment Opportunity Website”
- 410.3: To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by the labor market to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 411.13. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 411.15.1. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 411.29. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 411A.23.1. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 412.7.1. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access by candidates to the means for receiving timely notification.”
- 413.12.2. To the list of factors to be considered by the Human Resources Director, add the following factor: “extent of access eligibles to the means for receiving timely notification.”

**Action:** Accepted the Executive Officer’s staff report, incorporate any changes made by the Civil Service Commission; Adopted the proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Series 002 Definitions, 005 Meetings and Hearings of the Commission, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations, 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles in Volumes I – IV. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0238-22-6 Appeal by Eric Eliasson of Human Resources Director's determination that SFPUC did not violate the City's EEO Policy in denying Appellant's request for a religious accommodation that would exempt Appellant from the City's Vaccination Policy. (Item No. 14)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Approved the requested of postponement by the Department of Human Resources due to pending grievance. (Vote 4 to 0)

**0057-23-7 Request for a Hearing by Amro Elsakkar on their Future Employment Restriction with the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 15)**

**Speakers:** David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Amro Elsakkar, Appellant  
Paul Okunewitch, Municipal Transportation Agency

**Action:** Granted the appeal and removed the future employment restrictions for Amro Elsakkar. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0077-23-7 Request for a Hearing by Marlon McPherson on their Future Employment Restriction with the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 16)**

**Speakers:** David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Christine Cayabyab, Municipal Transportation Agency

**Action:** Adopted the report of the Municipal Transportation Agency. No future employment that requires a class B or BP Driver's License. Cancel any current examination and eligibility status that requires B or BP. Future employment is subject to the review and approval of the Department of Human Resources Director after satisfactory completion of two years of verifiable work experience outside of City and County of San Francisco service involving face to face customer service. Marlon McPherson failed to appear. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0077-23-7 Request for a Hearing by Sawanpreet Singh Dhaliwal on their Future Employment Restriction with the Municipal Transportation Agency. (Item No. 17)**

**Speakers:** David Garcia, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Sawanpreet Singh Dhaliwal, Appellant  
Brian Dusseault, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources  
Cynthia Hui, Municipal Transportation Agency

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission granted the appeal and removed the future employment restrictions for Sawanpreet Singh Dhaliwal.  
(Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 18)**

- Vice President Favetti requested the City Attorney's Office provide an interpretation to the recent PERB decision that might affect the responsibility of the Civil Service Commission and other departments.
- President Minor asked if we have any idea when the City Attorney's Office is going to provide the memo and presentation regarding the use of closed session for appeals.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 19)**

5:09 p.m.