



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
July 3, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2598 127 8373. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2598 127 8373 |
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

F.X. CROWLEY

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2598 127 8373.

CALL TO ORDER

2:00 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Excused Absence
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

Vice President Kate Favetti presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021, spoke about the lack of attention by the city to the staffing issues at the Department of Emergency 911 Dispatcher vacancies, it is an important service to the City, these vacancies call for a study, to hold a hearing, there is a 36% vacancy rate, it is an urgent matter.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Special Meeting of June 5, 2023 – 1:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 3 to 0)

Regular Meeting of June 5, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 3 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director announced that only 3 commissioners are present therefore a unanimous vote needed for an item to pass.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT (Item No. 5)

Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources reported on items: 1) As of last Friday DHR has made 453 permanent appointments through the 153 eligible lists from the E2P program, there are 77 active referrals and another 56 individuals have transitioned through other PCS processes to permanent positions, based on those numbers there are 586 transitions from Permanent Exempt to Permanent Civil Service; 2) On-line on demand and continuous class base-testing – there is a high vacancy rate for the entry-level administrative analyst 1820 and 1822 classes, DHR is leading a city-wide post-referral process for the series to coordinate so the applicants have a better candidate experience and move quicker through the eligible lists, working with 12 departments and there are 1100 applicants on the lists currently, 1822 candidates scores issued 6/29/23; 667 eligibles. Interviews starting for 1820s (Jr. Admin Analysts) next week. DHR pursuing a similar process for 1241 and 1244 personnel series classifications both opened for application filing on 6/5/23, 1500 applications received for 1241 and 324 applications received for the 1244; Stationary Engineer recruitment – DHR appreciates the collaboration with Local 39 working together with them on rule of the list certification and continuous testing for this class because recruitment is very challenging, as soon as the list are adopted they are essentially exhausted due to the high demand. Expect to open recruitment for this classification in late summer; 4) Police Department Dispatcher - DHR collaborating with the SFPD on 9209 Public Service Aide testing online hopefully to set the stage for continuous testing is this class as well. This recruitment is slated to open early in the fiscal year; and lastly, 5) received the Civil Grand Jury report on June 21, 2023, regarding challenges in the City’s hiring processes. Working on responding to the findings and recommendations in the report, many of the recommendations are aligned with work already underway through the Commission and its staff and through DHR. Clearly there is much interest in how City can speed up time to hire while remaining true to merit principles and DHR will be working with Commission and its staff to improve these processes.

EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)

**0137-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts.
(Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
41761 - 22/23	Airport	\$6,000,000	Contractor will provide architectural and engineering support services for various capital and facilities improvement projects at San Francisco International Airport (Airport). The firms will assist with architectural scope development, feasibility and systems studies, design services and drawings, construction and technical specifications, project schedules, bid and construction administration services.	Regular	12/31/2028
42246 - 22/23	Airport	\$15,000,000	Contractor will provide exterior envelope and waterproofing consulting services for San Francisco International Airport (Airport) capital projects, including inspecting roof leaks and water intrusion in buildings across the Airport campus, evaluating the causes, determining the extent of water damage, proposing design solutions and reviewing details of remediation of exterior building envelopes. Contractor will also advise on future assessments of new and proposed building projects.	Regular	7/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47120 - 22/23	Airport	\$7,000,000	Contractor will provide as-needed electrical engineering and support services for the San Francisco International Airport's (Airport) electrical systems, telecommunication, and support with ongoing projects on the landside of the Airport. Airport expertise in these systems is needed to ensure proper and timely development and implementation of tasks. Some of these tasks include but are not limited to: designing electrical infrastructure including low and medium voltage systems, controls, life safety systems, telecommunications, access controls vehicle parking systems, electrical and energy storage solutions, programming, evaluations, value engineering, quality assurance/quality controls, studies, systems modifications, coordination, and construction support on related tasks, including support to comply with other requirements, in accordance with current local, state, and federal standards.	Regular	12/31/2028
49527 - 22/23	Airport	\$4,000,000	The San Francisco International Airport (Airport) requires assistance to achieve sustainability goals related to reducing energy usage and carbon emissions, solid waste diversion, resource-efficient buildings that focus on human well-being, and water conservation. The services are expected to include specialized expertise for each of the goals with work including: 1) assisting with strategic planning to provide frameworks, roadmaps, and benchmarks for sustainability related projects with carbon emissions, fleet and building electrification implementation, operational standards, and resource recovery; 2) provide recommendation for policy development including guidelines for Airport operational and project standards that conforms to applicable regulations and/or legislation; 3) producing technical reports, metrics, and feasibility studies; 4) developing project schedules, cost estimates, and other cost models; 5) providing clean technology assessment and case studies; 6) environmental compliance; and 7) producing media campaigns and content for the public, airport workers, and airlines to promote sustainability.	Regular	7/31/2028
48513 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$800,000	The City and County of San Francisco City Administrator's Office – Real Estate Division (RED) has approximately 38 emergency generators located at its critical facilities. Repair, maintenance, and testing of emergency generators is an integral part of maintaining optimal operational readiness in the event of an emergency. When these generators are inoperable due to mechanical issues or need repairs and basic maintenance, the City's mission to provide Emergency Operations Centers and continue supplying City services is compromised by any failure of this equipment.	Regular	6/30/2028
41737 - 22/23	Human Services	\$2,000,000	Vendors provide reliable 19-hour, 7 days a week high-risk client transportation services to Department of Aging and Disability (DAS) and clients from Office of the Public Conservator (PC) clients needing transportation between facilities which provide various levels of care and/or legal proceedings. Clients include high risk clients needing specialized transportation skills. Clients may be mentally ill, substance abusers, the developmentally delayed, history of violence, physically disabled. Hours of operation are 7 am to 12 AM (midnight). Although DAS will attempt to contact vendors with at least 24 hours lead time, vendors shall provide transportation with less than 24 hours notice. Last call to vendor will be 11 PM. Vendor will notify DAS staff within 24 hours of the requested transportation service date and time if the requested service cannot be completed as scheduled.	Regular	6/30/2028
44956 - 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$3,000,000	Establish a California Multiple Award Schedule (CMAS) to provide purchase and warranty of software, software maintenance as a product, and Information Technology (IT) consulting services. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Intelligent Transportation Systems Project Support – 2. IT Network Infrastructure Support 3. Data and Analytics Infrastructure Support 4. SharePoint Administration and Migration Support 5. Java / Middleware Engineer Support 6. Salesforce Development and Administration Support 	Regular	7/31/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42981 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$2,500,000	This contract entails the removal of water treatment sludge or residuals from SFPUC's two water treatment plants Harry Tracy and Sunol Valley water treatment plants (HTWTP and SVWTP). The contract provides for removal, hauling, and disposal and/or recycling of alum and ferric sludge (residuals) from the two plants. Approximately 2,000 tons of sludge is anticipated from SVWTP annually and approximately 250 tons of sludge is anticipated from HTWTP annually. Sludge removal from SVWTP is expected to be done twice a year from the plant's lagoons. Harry Tracy uses a dewatering process at the treatment plant and the dewatered ferric chloride sludge removal will be done throughout the year, with an estimated average of one load every two weeks. Removal may be required on holidays and weekends based on the amount of residuals generated in the peak winter season, which may result in a removal of two to three loads per week.	Regular	12/14/2030
44299 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$9,000,000	The work will require architectural, civil, structural, electrical, mechanical, process and other specialized engineering services in the planning, design, and engineering support during construction, for new conveyance and groundwater treatment facilities. The purpose of the project is to improve the performance and reliability of wells and facilities constructed under the Regional Groundwater Storage and Recovery Project in order to optimize the use of the groundwater supply in the South Westside Basin during dry years. The project will identify, design, and construct long-term improvements which may include a combination of retrofits or additions to the existing decentralized well pumping and treatment facilities and/or the construction of new centralized treatment and distribution facilities. An optional task is included to provide engineering support for projects related to the other Westside Groundwater Basin facilities, including South Sunset Well, West Sunset Well, and Golden Gate Central Well.	Regular	4/30/2032
46339 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$975,000	Consultant will provide expert advice, analysis, and assistance on planning for electric utility customer growth and expansion of owned electrical assets. Work products may include, but are not limited to the following: peer review of staff analyses, providing briefings and/or presentations, creating an actionable transition and growth implementation plan, and developing an organizational structure redesign plan.	Regular	12/31/2028
47742 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,100,000	Take before and after sample of fuel from bottom of each tank before and after each filtering process and provide both samples from each location to customer within 5 business days. Removal and filtration of fuel through no less than 5 micron or less filters to filter out water, sludge, microbial and fungal growth from the fuel and return it back to the tank it was removed from. Before and after physical samples of the fuel are taken and sent to a laboratory for analysis with a resulting report sent back to indicate the physical properties and condition of the fuel after all of the processes have been completed. Remove, manifest, haul and dispose of all contaminated water, filters and hazardous waste in a legal manner per federal, state, county and city laws and ordinances.	Regular	1/1/2031
45014 - 22/23	Public Works	\$185,000	The consultant shall provide consulting, training and coaching services for organizational development and change management to San Francisco Public Works staff, with the main purpose to be in alignment with the Malcom Baldrige Excellence Framework. Services may include the following areas: (a) development and deployment of strategic plan(s); (b) development and implementation of a training plan for a process improvement program based on the Lean Six Sigma methodology and the Baldrige Framework; (c) consulting, coaching, and training to staff to design, assess, and improve processes and metrics of Public Works services; (d) training and coaching on the Baldrige Framework and best practices; and (e) development of a department's assessment with the goal of improving our organizational development and performance management.	Regular	12/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42792 – 22/23	Sheriff	\$510,000	<p>The Sheriff's Office is proposing to enter into a 3-year agreement with Contractor to continue maintenance and annual subscription to their policy and training management solution. Contract ID 1000008809 was awarded to Contractor following a formal solicitation (Sourcing Event #000000322) issued on October 31, 2017. The awarded Contractor analyzed the Sheriff's Office policies, procedures, practices, culture, and training manuals for the three respective divisions of the SFSO; Administration and Programs, Field Operations, and Custody Operation. The Contractor worked collaboratively with SFSO to update policies and procedures consistent with emerging best practices and changes in case law, new legislation and statutes. The Contractor then implemented a comprehensive policy management and training system that allows electronic modifications to policy manuals via Contractor's Knowledge Management System (KMS) for streamlining the approval and acknowledgement of updated policies and procedures. The policies are consolidated onto the KMS Platform accessible from multiple electronic locations/devices, easily searchable by keyword, with consistent structure, terminology and formatting across policies.</p> <p>The annual maintenance and subscription will provide continuous updates. The Contractor's California legal and content development team will continuously monitor for new legislative bills, statues and case laws on the state and federal levels that directly impact SFSO policy content. The KMS send update notifications to SFSO users via the KMS online platform and mobile app. Their update management services include editing and formatting content to match the policy manual's structure and deconflicting policies and updates with other content in the SFSO manuals. The KMS tracks SFSO staff acknowledgement of training and produce reports by deputy, Daily Training Bulletin and/or topics.</p>	Regular	7/31/2026
46371 – 22/23	Police	\$630,000	<p>The contractor will provide maintenance and support of the San Francisco Police Department's (SFPD) Body Worn Camera (BWC) System, a law enforcement video data infrastructure with 2200 deployed units. Contracting staff will maintain and support the BWC eco-system of cameras, charging stations, fiber ring network, Azure cloud for evidence, evidence management through the portal and user/device management, desktop and mobile applications for uploading/tagging of metadata, and integrations with Computer Aided Dispatch for Records Management System.</p>	Regular	5/30/2024
4115 – 09/10	Municipal Transportation Agency	<p>Current Approved Amount \$42,294,319 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$42,294,319</p>	<p>The Phase 2, Central Subway Project consultant will provide engineering services for all of the project system components and construction services as follows: Contract design management; Verify/validate existing preliminary engineering design; Verify cost and schedule; Part A - Perform all engineering work required including the surface segment from the tunnel portal south to the interface with the T-Line at 4th and King St. including all system-wide elements in order to make CS operational. Part 8 - Perform all engineering work required for the Central Control and Communications upgrade program including the implementation of a primary and secondary Operations Control Center and upgrades to the existing legacy systems. Provide engineering support during construction; Provide as-needed engineering support during construction review and respond to technical submittals from contractors; Perform field visits and observations to verify design compliance and/or assist in resolving issues; Witness and approve factory testing of manufactured equipment and materials; Assemble operations and maintenance manuals; Prepare conformed plans and specifications upon contract completion; Implement the quality assurance/quality control program.</p>	Regular	7/1/2025

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
48177 – 14/15	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$12,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$12,000,000	The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) requires the services of a contractor to perform all duties pertaining to the SFMTA’s automated photo enforcement system. Duties include, but are not limited to the following: maintain the system (hardware and software); issue and process citations for red light and illegal turn violations; provide court evidence packages; provide expert witness testimony pertaining to the system; train SF Police Department employees on the system’s functions; provide regular reports on the system to the SFMTA; and provide a secure internet site for violators to obtain information on their violation.	Regular	11/6/2028
31866 – 20/21	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$2,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$600,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,600,000	Services are for on-site collection, consolidation, sorting and compacting of trash and recycling at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital (ZSFGH).	Regular	6/30/2026
40417 – 18/19	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$2,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$3,500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$6,000,000	Healthcare reform has led to the Department's need for specialized, limited-term projects. The contractor will provide intermittent, as-needed project management and technical services program support for specialized, limited-term projects and Department programs, focusing on new and existing information technology projects, facilities re-programming, and municipal bond/capital planning projects and initiatives.	Regular	6/30/2028
45316 – 21/22	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$198,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,198,000	The Contractor will augment the Department's search and recruitment of qualified candidates for executive level and senior management positions at the Department of Public Health, due to anticipated retirements, organizational changes, and vacancies.	Regular	12/31/2025
49607 – 15/16	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$25,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$50,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$75,000,000	Contractor(s) will be professional consultants who may provide services requiring broad and deep expertise in specialized areas, providing assistance to the Department as needed in areas such as assessment, evaluation, planning, grant writing, media development, and/or technical assistance services to support the planning, evaluation, promotion, and grant development needs of Department Primary Care and Prevention programs, including assistance in compliance with federal, State and local requirements. Contractor(s) will evaluate findings, assess and evaluate findings, provide technical reports, develop media promotion projects, develop grants, and provide expert technical assistance as required. Training services may include providing specialized courses or modules related to racial and cultural humility.	Modification	07/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49932 – 21/22	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$350,000 Increase Amount Requested \$650,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,000,000	The contractor will provide urgent kitchen equipment repair services within a 4-hour window 24/7/365 for the food production kitchen, 13 satellite kitchens at Laguna Honda Hospital (LHH), and Production Kitchen at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital (ZSFGH). Examples of kitchen equipment that may need repair services are not limited but include some of the following equipment: blast chiller, walk-in coolers, walk-in freezers, ice machine, warmers, air-curtain refrigerators, tray-line/service line, ovens, convection ovens, toasters, plate warmers, braziers, vertical choppers, mixers, stoves, griddles, grills, steamers, kettles, slicers, dishwashers, and steamtables. Appendix A and B lists the equipment for which the City and County of San Francisco wishes to purchase a urgent repair services contract. The contractor will be responsible for as-needed urgent repairs, per manufacturer recommendations, by performing necessary assessments, tests, and maintenance work that is typically not required of City employees, with appropriately certified staff. This includes responsibility for conducting an inspection of failed kitchen equipment; recording all findings in accordance with the format specified by the Department; and ordering any required replacement parts. The contractor shall provide all necessary labor, material, supplies, supervision that will maintain all covered equipment in prime operating condition, consistent with manufacturer’s recommendations. This includes repairing any failure of magnitude, using original equipment manufacturer (OEM) procedures and guidelines. OEM parts and OEM recommended oils, seal, gaskets, supplies, etc. Food and Nutrition Services and the ZSFGH and/or LHH Facilities staff will determine when urgent repairs are scheduled. Major repairs discovered during urgent repair services must be noted and relayed to the Food and Nutrition Services and Facilities to determine if repair or replacement is most appropriate. The Food and Nutrition Services and Facilities reserved the right to call meetings with contractor to discuss concerns regarding equipment repairs, reporting, and updates. Monthly written summary reports of all work must include equipment worked on, job preformed, completion dates, and anticipation dates of work in progress.	Modification	8/31/2028
43603 – 22/23	Public Works	Current Approved Amount \$150,000 Increase Amount Requested \$150,000 New Total Amount Requested \$300,000	Support the Operations division of SF Public Works in implementing the action items from the SF Public Works Racial Equity Action Plan, Phase One (2021) by 1) developing and supporting a racial equity working group of about 15 frontline staff from Operations; 2) supporting the Operations Racial Equity Working Group in developing policy, procedures and communications recommendations to further racial equity in Operations’ workplaces; leading racial equity trainings at Operations for the Working Group and other key staff. Scope Change: Public Works would like to hire a consultant to provide racial equity and organizational development trainings and facilitation to help its team members at 49 South Van Ness, which houses staff from three of its divisions (Building Design Construction, Infrastructure Design Construction and Finance/Administration) have essential conversations about racial equity and implement racial equity action items. (The previous scope of work only included staff from our Operations division.) Work will be based on the implementation of the department’s Racial Equity Action Plan, Phase One. The scope of work includes: 1) Offer a series of racial equity trainings that help participants integrate the new knowledge and skills. Topics to include, but are not limited to racial equity fundamentals, privilege, white supremacy culture, bias and microaggressions. 2) Support a mentoring for racial equity program through trainings that bring a racial equity lens to skill-building workshops in such topics as leadership development, facilitation, team-building, courageous conversations and microaggressions. 3) Facilitate pilot affinity groups based on racial identity.	Modification	4/1/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40456 – 18/19	Police	Current Approved Amount \$525,000 Increase Amount Requested \$515,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,040,000	The San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) requires a contractor to provide as-needed court reporting and transcription services for Police Commission disciplinary hearings. Work will be performed at: (1) Police Headquarters during the day (2) City Hall in the evening, and (3) in Oakland at the Office of Administrative Hearings during the day. Other duties will include, but will not be limited to, providing legal transcriptions from interviews performed by SFPD 's Internal Affairs Divisions and other SFPD Investigative Units.	Modification	6/30/2026

Speakers: Shawndrea Hale, Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC Nos. 42981-22/23, 44299-22/23, and 47742-22/23.
 Will Samson-Moser and Patrick Leung, SF Police Department spoke on PSC No. 46371-22/23
 Amy Nuque, Municipal Transportation Agency spoke on PSC No. 4115-09/10

Action:

- 1) Approved PSC #42981-22/23, 44299-22/23, and 47742-22/23 from the Public Utilities Commission with the condition to report back to the Commission in four (4) years. (Vote of 3 to 0)
- 2) Approved PSC #46371-22/23 from the Police Department for another year until June 30, 2024, and to send another letter to the Mayor and the Board of Supervisors in support of funding these positions in house. (Vote of 3 to 0)
- 3) Approved PSC #4115-09/10 from the Municipal Transportation Agency with the condition to correct the dates of the contract for the record (1/1/2025 – 7/1/2025). (Vote of 3 to 0)
- 4) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 3 to 0)

0085-23-4 Appeal by Jesus S. Olazaba of the 7328 Operating Engineer Examination. (Item No. 2)

Speakers: None.

Action: Denied the appeal and adopt the report of the Public Utilities Commission. Jesus S. Olazaba failed to appear. (Vote of 3 to 0)

COMMISSIONERS’ ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 9)

The Commissioners requested a report on the recruitment of 911 Dispatchers and the Grand Jury Report.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 10)

2:45 p.m.