

Refuse Rates Administrator's (RRA) response to Recology's initial refuse rate change request (submitted March 7th, 2023)Weekly update dated 06/02/2023

This document is an update to the RRA's prior response letters and includes only the request items which have been shared with Recology to-date in the shared Questions And Requests workbook. As discussed in previous meetings, the RRA will accept submissions not broken out by the Audited Financial cost centers, and ratepayer class will be based on fee schedule breakout. The RRA's initial and subsequent reviews of the Recology March 7th submission identified 23 missing or incomplete schedules and 8 simplified schedules out of 42 total. This update identifies current missing or incomplete schedules as well as additional exhibits which will be necessary for the RRA to conduct analyses which lead to recommendation on future rates. This update also details any additional submissions or clarifications provided by Recology. Recology has also been submitting the requested exhibits. Incomplete or missing items should have an expected date of completion. The RRA has requested that Recology inform them as to when the complete submission can be expected, as the timing by which it is submitted will impact the timeline of the rate review and the RRA's ability to produce a recommendation based on the information available.

This document contains the following tables:

- Table 1. Status of Rate Change Request Schedules
- Table 2. Supporting Exhibits
- Table 3. Line Item Questions
- Table 4. Environment Department Exhibits Request
- Table 5. Environment Department Deliverables Request
- Table 6. Environment Department Reports
- Table 7. Commission Questions
- Table 8. Abbreviations or Acronyms

Item	Request date	Schedule	Status	RRA Notes	Response Date	Recology Timing Response
1.01	3/24/2023	A.2 Total Sources and Uses	In Review	Breakdown of Total Uses needed. Missing Residential Multi-Family, 5 units or less.	4/2/2023	Provided 4/2/2023 response: "As discussed with the Refuse Rate Administrator during the development of the Refuse Rate Change Request forms, the allocation of costs and other information between residential, apartment and commercial customers is being deferred. We agreed that allocation is not possible at this time due to the integrated nature of operations, the need to update Recology's underlying data collection and the need to develop agreed upon allocation methodologies and models. Apart from billed revenue, which is organized by customer class due to differing rate structures, all other rate activity, including all costs, is presented in aggregate, without separation by customer class."
1.02	3/21/2023	C.1 Ratepayer Revenue	In Review	Reconcile commercial revenue with rate reports (i.e. debris box?)	4/11/2023	Provided response and reconciliation on 4/11/2023, provided updated C.1 with revised RY25 on 5/3/2023.
1.03	3/15/2023	C.2 Waste Collection Revenue Detail	Missing	Recology has said they will be able to provide this schedule	4/11/2023	Will provide April 24
1.04	3/21/2023	C.3 Other Ratepayer Revenue	Missing	Include line-item for Contamination Fees	4/11/2023	Will provide April 24
1.05	3/15/2023	D.2 Revenue Offsets	Missing		4/11/2023	Revenue offsets will be covered as an exhibit moving forward, see 2.13 for additional details
1.06	3/24/2023	D.3 Recycling Revenue	In Review	Revenue by Customer Type missing, i.e., rows 34-78. Actuals would have to exist in order to have done accurate billings.	4/2/2023	Provided 4/2/2023 response: "As discussed with the Refuse Rate Administrator during the development of the Refuse Rate Change Request forms, the allocation of costs and other information between residential, apartment and commercial customers is being deferred. We agreed that allocation is not possible at this time due to the integrated nature of operations, the need to update Recology's underlying data collection and the need to develop agreed upon allocation methodologies and models. Apart from billed revenue, which is organized by customer class due to differing rate structures, all other rate activity, including all costs, is presented in aggregate, without separation by customer class."
1.07	3/24/2023	D.4 Disposal Revenue	In Review	All but 2 rows missing from rows 13-129	4/2/2023	Provided 4/2/2023 response: "As discussed with the Refuse Rate Administrator during the development of the Refuse Rate Change Request forms, the allocation of costs and other information between residential, apartment and commercial customers is being deferred. We agreed that allocation is not possible at this time due to the integrated nature of operations, the need to update Recology's underlying data collection and the need to develop agreed upon allocation methodologies and models. Apart from billed revenue, which is organized by customer class due to differing rate structures, all other rate activity, including all costs, is presented in aggregate, without separation by customer class."
1.08	3/24/2023	D.5 Processing Tonnage	In Review	Rows 46-48 Missing, and important for policymaker and public sightline, to know the impact on the Landfill Disposal Agreement's time-to-cap exceedance.	4/5/2023	Provided 4/5/2023
1.09	3/15/2023	D.6 Toxics Collection	In Review	RY23-RY25 projections not included. Recology has said they will be able to provide projections.	3/16/2023	Recology provided RY23-25 HHHW tonnage and collections
1.1	3/15/2023	E.1 Operating Expense Summary	Missing		4/11/2023	Will provide April 24
1.11	3/15/2023	F.1 Service Apportionment	Missing	Recology has said they are working on a cost allocation methodology and will provide	4/11/2023	Will provide April 24
1.12	3/15/2023	G.1 Refuse Collection Detail	Greater Detail Requested	identification of Fixed/Variable cost, and Combined and Eliminations columns are missing.	5/11/2023	See fixed/variable report.
1.13	3/15/2023	J.3 Depreciation Expenses	In Review	Actuals are missing	3/28/2023	Recology provided actuals
1.14	3/15/2023	K.1 Insurance Expenses	In Review	Recology submitted cost of coverage actuals on 4/3. RRA has requested written response for type of coverage, incurred vs. claims made, and value of coverage. Recology verbally conveyed all insurance is claims-made, that D&O insurance from 2020-2021 is not included as a cost for rate payers. Recology will adjust the value column to say "limit of coverage" and complete.	4/3/2023	Initial provided 4/3/2023
1.15	3/15/2023	L.2 Intercompany Processing	In Review	Some categories of recyclables are missing	4/2/2023	Provided 4/2/2023
1.16	3/15/2023	O.1 Professional Services Expenses	In Review	FTE and performing and requesting companies are missing	4/11/2023	Provided 4/11/2023: "Professional Services are third party service costs. Therefore, FTE, performing and requesting companies are not relevant for this section."
1.17	3/15/2023	O.2 Corporate Services Expenses	In Review	FTEs for RY20 and RY21, as well as all years for performing and requesting companies are missing	4/5/2023	Provided 4/5/2023

Item	Request Date	Exhibits	Notes	Response Date	Recology Timing Response
2.01	3/7/2023	Outreach	What are current services and costs associated with outreach. What changes to outreach are being made, and what are the associated cost changes?	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
2.02	3/15/2023 amended 3/15/23	Abandoned Materials Collection	What is the current level of service for abandoned materials collection and what are the associated costs? What changes to abandoned materials collections are being made and what are the associated costs? How were decisions made to propose enhanced service?	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023 slides 15-18
2.03	3/15/2023 amended 3/15/23	Increased "City car" service	What is the current level of service for "City car" service and what are the associated costs? What are the current routes and schedules for "City car" service and how will this change? What are the associated cost changes? How were decisions made to propose enhanced service?	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
2.04	3/15/2023	Changes to FTE count	Please specify when the additional FTE will support	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
2.05	3/15/2023	List of Fees and Charges	Please specify list of all fees and charges. Please specify any fees not included in one of the 6 rate schedules	4/13/2023	Provided on 4/13/2023
2.06	3/15/2023	Penalty Costs	For the 2 year rate period, please explain what the annual cost is assumed for the self-funded portion of the pension contribution, and what is by month for each of the 24 month periods.	4/13/2023	Provided on 4/13/2023
2.07	3/21/2023	Contamination Fees	Please provide current charges and procedures as well as proposed charges and procedures outlining changes, identify impacted operations and impact to customer waste collection costs.	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
2.08	3/15/2023	Rebalancing Account	Please provide a justification for the proposed 100% adjustment for the difference between actual net profits or losses.	4/13/2023	Provided on 4/13/2023
2.09	3/15/2023	Sustainable Crumbing at Per 94	Please describe the service provided at Per 94. What are the associated costs with this closure? What are the impacts to revenues and costs related to this closure? What are the impacts to labor needs and other material needs related to this closure?	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
2.10	3/15/2023	Programs Included in proposed rate Programs 4.20 - Narrative Summary	Please provide current and proposed labor and costs associated with these programs.	4/13/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
2.11	4/4/2023	Cost Accrual Basis	Please provide a summary of which costs have been and are proposed to be: 1) Full Accrual Basis, 2) Cash Basis, or 3) Other Basis, e.g. Modified Accrual Basis (along with the exception period, if modified accrual (i.e., 30-days following the RV end, 60 days, etc.))	4/13/2023	Revised to Q&A Questions
2.12	4/4/2023	Profit on Equipment Purchasing vs. Leasing	Please explain why certain assets are being depreciated (Full Accrual Basis Cost) vs. others like equipment are Leased-to-Own (Cash Basis). What is Recology's policy to lease or to own? For lease-to-own, is Recology leasing service a profit on the asset, and is Recology/SGG also earning a Profit Margin on the cash-basis lease cost charged to them by Recology Financing or other Recology entities? What is the difference in cost for leasing equipment from Recology entities plus profit margin on lease profit for Recology entities compared with Recology/SGG directly purchasing equipment and then depreciated over the useful life of 10 years?	5/12/2023	See file provided on 5/12/2023
2.13	4/4/2023	Basis for Revenue Offsets	What is the basis for assumed revenue offsets? Please detail which market analyses and pricing sources are being used and assumed by Recology for revenues associated with Disinfectants, Respirators, etc. to ensure SF Ratepayers are benefitting from and having some costs of service covered by those parts of the waste stream? How do Recology revenue offset prices for these products compare with competition in California?	5/12/2023	See file provided on 5/12/2023
2.14	4/6/2023	Recruitment Agent/Spot Procedures (RASP)	How longy expected Wednesday April 19, then expected Friday April 20?	5/8/2023	Provided on 5/8/2023
2.15	4/12/2023	Headcount per route	Please provide RV33 and projected RV24/SG headcount per S/GG route.	5/12/2023	Please refer to 3.149
2.16	4/12/2023	Abandoned Materials Efforts	Please detail all abandoned material efforts completed for the past 3 years and how the level of staffing and equipment compares with your proposed rates for RV24 and RV25. Please include date and hours of operation, number and type of equipment used, estimated truckloads or tonnage per week, location of new proposed zone, and whether cost is entirely ratepayer funded. If service records have only increased 2.80% who has response time ended 3.8% over the past year? Proposed enhancement includes 2 FTE and 2 vehicles but does not include fuel costs or other related costs.	5/12/2023	See spreadsheet provided. Red section highlights detail of all abandoned material efforts completed for the past 3 years. Blue section includes date and hours of operations. Green section notes the number and type of equipment used. Yellow has estimated truckloads or tonnage per week. Purple is location of the new proposed zone. Response times in 2022 began to erode as traffic impacts began to increase after significant pandemic lows in 2020 and 2021. This increase in traffic coupled with an increase in calls resulted in an eroded response time. See FTE report provided to show the fully loaded costs.
2.17	4/12/2023	Cost Drivers for Residential Rates	What does Recology identify as the cost drivers that are causing changes to the residential rates? How do these cost drivers relate to the equation in the CSA calculation from the 2021 rate order?	4/20/2023	Provided explanation on 4/20/2023
2.18	4/12/2023	Cost Drivers for Tipping Fee	What does Recology identify as the cost drivers that are causing changes to the tipping fee? How do these cost drivers relate to the equation for the current change to the tipping fee?	4/19/2023	Provided on 4/19/2023
2.19	5/7/2023	Penalty Cost Model	What would penalty costs look like for RV24 and RV25 if fully funded in 3 years, 5 years, and 10 years?	5/18/2023	See response and pdf attached
2.20	5/2/2023	How has tonnage changed over time for abandoned material pickup?	Include spreadsheet years	5/12/2023	Included in RBA Hearing presentation on 5/12/2023
2.21	5/2/2023	During the presentation, Recology stated that this program included proactive service pickup in the Bayview. CPW has stated that this is a 4 day a week pickup at 70 Hot Spots. Please provide a schedule and map of this.	5/12/2023	Included in RBA Hearing presentation on 5/12/2023	
2.22	5/2/2023	Abandoned Material Pick Up	What are the current routes and schedules of public receptacle pick up?	5/12/2023	Included in RBA Hearing presentation on 5/12/2023
2.23	5/2/2023	Public Receptacles	How would the barriers with rolling lockers impact and sensors impact service levels, cost of service, or the need for net routes? Please describe or increase in FTE/Trucks, Personnel, etc.	5/12/2023	Second pass collection of public care items between 10:00 AM - 7 PM, depending on location. The greatest volume of 811 calls are between 3 AM and 4 AM and 6 PM and 8 PM.
2.24	5/2/2023	What were historic tonnages or levels of service for weekend hours?	5/12/2023	Included in RBA Hearing presentation on 5/12/2023	
2.25	5/2/2023	How does this compare on a cost per ton basis to current bulky item pickup program?	5/12/2023	Included in RBA Hearing presentation on 5/12/2023	
2.26	5/2/2023	How much diversion has Recology seen that accounts that received targeted outreach compared to controls that have not?	5/18/2023	See email sent on 5/18/2023	
2.28	5/2/2023	What is the expected reduction in contamination for the implementation of the onboard cameras and the 1 FTE?	5/17/2023	Recology agrees that additional study is warranted before we make an estimate of future contamination fees. Advancing answering the contamination process to costs flow through here for ratepayers.	
2.29	5/2/2023	How did Recology estimate \$5 million in annual revenues from fees?	5/17/2023	Recology agrees that additional study is warranted before we make an estimate of future contamination fees. Advancing answering the contamination process to costs flow through here for ratepayers.	
2.30	5/2/2023	Who would this impact the most? (By ratepayer type, number of accounts, etc.)	5/12/2023	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The table below shows how contamination fees are distributed by customer type. We anticipate this allocation to remain consistent between the different customer categories. Commercial customers represent over 70% of our charges. These customers can include restaurants, office buildings, large residential buildings and other business. Residential customers represent less than 1% of our contamination revenue. This will increase slightly with the addition of cameras but will remain below 1%. 	
2.31	5/2/2023	What were the incidents that led to this proposal and where were they located? Please provide any related Policy reports, and historical incidents dating back to RV2020	5/12/2023	Breakdown by Customer Category % Commercial 71.69% Apartment 24.31% Companion 3.79% Residential 0.01% Total 100.00%	
2.32	5/2/2023	Safe Service	What were the incidents that led to this proposal and where were they located? Please provide any related Policy reports, and historical incidents dating back to RV2020	5/12/2023	See incidents and police reports provided
2.33	5/2/2023	What operations has Recology suspended, and what positions can be reallocated? (e.g. Per 94, reduced downtown public receptacle service, etc.)	5/12/2023	Since Per 94 is in the process of winding down, the manager from Sustainable Crumbing has been temporarily assigned to backfill the position during the recruitment process for the operations supervisor on transportation manager roles. It is expected that this individual will successfully qualify for one of these positions, reducing the actual headcount requirement to one position. Additionally recent collector bargaining efforts have complicated the dispatch process and Recology believes that a supervisory position must be present at all times when we are operating trucks over the road.	
2.34	5/2/2023	Please provide justification for all new FTE requests. What is the ending work plan for the unit? What would be the change to the work plan for the new FTE? (for example, 2 rate analysts are being requested. How many analysts are currently supporting analysis and what new analyses will the 2 new rate analysts be supporting? Request for Transportation Operations Manager and Operators Supervisor, what is the current unit supporting, and what is supporting this need if "tonnage is down"? How does this enhancement benefit ratepayers?)	5/10/2023	See FTE excel provided on 5/8/2023 for details and included in RBA hearing presentation on 5/8/2023 for additional details	
2.35	5/2/2023	What level of overtime is being billed to support the existing work?	5/16/2023	Please refer to 3.118 and 3.124	
2.36	5/2/2023	For vacancies (open headcount), how long have these positions been open?	5/10/2023	See FTE excel provided on 5/8/2023 for details.	
2.37	5/2/2023	What level of overtime is being billed to support these vacant positions?	5/16/2023	Please refer to 3.118 and 3.124	
2.37	5/2/2023	During the RBA hearing, Recology stated that they have a survey of 29 jurisdictions and comparable cities. Can Recology share the results of this survey?	5/18/2023	See response and pdf attached	
2.38	5/13/2023	Rebalancing Account	Please provide the balancing account spending and totals current and available for RV24 onwards as currently broken.	5/18/2023	See response and excel spreadsheets attached
2.39	5/13/2023	RBA Hearing 1 Recology Program Enhancements	Please review "RBA Hearing 1 Recology Program Enhancements.xlsx" initially delivered on 5/8/23 that responses are broken down by the item and specific line items are updated.	5/16/2023	Revised spreadsheet provided on 5/16/2023
2.40	5/13/2023	Programs Included in proposed rate Programs 4.20 - Narrative Summary	Please provide a status quo program detail - what are the specific programs that were delivered under the prior rate order, on which anything additional would be considered a "program enhancement". Please provide the RV24 and RV25 Adjusted Net Revenue Requirement (calculated by the 10% allocation of 201 adjusted under the "status quo". Question 3.005 G.1 Expense is a related item so these fees should align.	5/17/2023 and 5/21/2023	As discussed, Recology generally operates an integrated cost system. Therefore costs are not allocated between the 20 programs. We have allocated costs to certain programs based on an overhead factor per the suggestion of the Controller's office. One of the future rate-making activities will be development and adoption of allocation models that will address allocation of costs on the program level. See file provided as support. See updated file submitted on 5/21/2023.

Item	Descrição	Quantidade	Valor Unitário	Valor Total
1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100

ID	Date	Description
001	2023-01-01	Initial setup and configuration of the system.
002	2023-01-15	First major update to the system.
003	2023-02-01	Bug fixes and performance improvements.
004	2023-02-15	New feature implementation for user management.
005	2023-03-01	Integration with external services.
006	2023-03-15	Security audit and patches.
007	2023-04-01	Performance optimization of the database.
008	2023-04-15	New reporting module development.
009	2023-05-01	User training and documentation updates.
010	2023-05-15	Final testing and deployment preparation.
011	2023-06-01	System launch and initial user adoption.
012	2023-06-15	Monitoring and early feedback collection.
013	2023-07-01	Minor updates and bug fixes.
014	2023-07-15	Evaluation of system performance.
015	2023-08-01	Planning for the next phase of development.
016	2023-08-15	Review of project progress and milestones.
017	2023-09-01	Final reporting and project closure.
018	2023-09-15	Post-project analysis and lessons learned.

Request Date	Number	Exhibits	Notes	Response Date	Recology Timing Response
3/22/2023	1	Detail on proposed new composting contamination removal processing at the West Wing, including equipment specs, layout, any additional labor, projected material type and tons of contamination removed and impact on net recovery of compostables.		4/11/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
3/22/2023	2	Contamination Charge & Removal of Recovery/Diversion Discount Protocol, including details on the streamlined process to automate the quality assurance review and communication processes referenced in the Summary of Assumptions. What assumptions are associated with the \$5 million revenue?	See support provided. Please refer to RRA request 3.092 for assumptions and calculation on contamination revenue.	5/3/2023	Provided support
3/22/2023	3	Detail on Commercial Bulky Item collection service offered and assumed for rate calculation including frequency by generator type and level of recovery. SFE understands from Waste Zero staff that this service is currently available to SF businesses.			
3/22/2023	4	Organizational chart for RSS, RSF, and RGG, including Waste Zero staff.		4/14/2023	Provided on 4/14/2023
3/22/2023	5	Explain assumptions and justification in tonnage and recovery projections and reason for changes, such as lower residential composting received and lower % diverted, that is shown in Schedule D.5. The % diverted for recycling needs to be corrected as it currently shows % disposed not diverted.			
3/22/2023	6	Abandoned Materials Collection assumptions on tonnage and additional services referenced in the Narrative.	This will be covered by request #2.16, see #2.16 for additional details.	4/17/2023	Provided on 4/17/2023
3/22/2023	7	Event rate schedule and clarification that no events receive free service.		4/18/2023	Provided response
3/22/2023	8	Trash processing test net costs with avoided Hay Road disposal cost offset and state goal after test to develop plan with SFE for scaling trash processing in subsequent rate process.		4/11/2023	Provided as part of Rate Hearing Presentation on 4/13/2023
4/28/2023	9	Clarify the tons, frequency and locations of proposed compost giveaways.			
4/28/2023	10	What is General Recycling in Schedule H.1 and what programs does it relate to in the Narrative Summary, BIR or District Clean Ups?			
4/28/2023	11	Where in the schedules are the costs for District Clean Up Events?			
4/28/2023	12	Where in the schedules are the costs of BIR?			
4/28/2023	13	Contamination: how many accounts are expected to migrate as part of contamination charge process and how will this affect recovery?			
4/28/2023	14	Contamination: what portion of facility costs are associated with contamination removal?			
4/28/2023	15	Contamination: how will Recology ensure equity in administering contamination charges if cameras will only be on 38 trucks?			
4/28/2023	16	Contamination: what thresholds are considered a "clean inspection" as referenced in 4/13/2023 presentation as well as sufficient to merit a tag? The current thresholds are 25% by volume in landfill, 10% and 5% in recycling and composting, respectively. Will the customer need to request the inspection? Will it happen through the automated system just as the fees are proposed to be assessed?			
4/28/2023	17	Contamination: is Recology also considering Removal of Diversion Discount as a portion of the \$5 million additional revenue?			
4/28/2023	18	Contamination: will Recology be focused on contamination in the recycling and composting? How will they minimize the potential for accounts to continue contaminating the landfill and increasing landfill collection service?			
4/28/2023	19	Contamination: what timeline for escalation from 50% to 100% contamination charge does Recology plan?			
4/28/2023	20	Contamination: what amount of time will be considered between the first and second instances of contamination? For example, if the first instance occurs followed by a tag and a letter, could the second instance be within a week? a year?			
4/28/2023	21	Contamination: what education efforts will the additional FTE managing the contamination process ("FTE to evaluate photos, conduct trainings, manage customer account data, contamination warnings, and process") undertake after the first instance to be sure that accounts are aware of the issue and all the tools to remedy? How will the staff person be sure to get ahold of the correct person at the location? How will the Recology staff person ensure that accounts understand the process to remove the contamination charge/removal of diversion discount?			
4/28/2023	22	Contamination: is there a period of time that the account must maintain a contamination charge before initiating its removal? In the past this has been two months.			
4/28/2023	23	Contamination: how is Recology prepared to handle and respond to likely appeals to the contamination charges? How many do they anticipate addressing given past experience and that this would represent a significant increase in scale?			
4/28/2023	24	Organics Pre-processing: Provide copy of Stanislaus County notification that Recology has until December 2023 to clean up organic feedstock from San Francisco. Provide proposed pre-processing equipment specifications including throughput, electrical energy use and % increase of electrical use at transfer station. Provide examples comparable use of similar pre-processing used for organics with results achieve. Compare proposed pre-processing to the current processing of organics at BVON.			
5/3/2023	25	Compost giveaways: Recology has stated in both the initial submissions March 7th and every subsequent public hearing that it intends to do compost giveaways. Compost giveaways were featured a number of times, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Page 11, number 29 of the March 7th submission March 16th hearing, minute 57 What product will be distributed? How will Recology identify locations and volumes of distribution? How will Recology promote the giveaways? Who is the intended audience? How and with what frequency will Recology report to the City the SB 1383-qualified compost distributed on our behalf for the purposes of fulfilling our state-mandated procurement goal.			

Category	New activity as of October 2023	Task Oct 2023 Sept 2025	Sector	Exhibit associated	Recology Response
Collection	No	Deliver kitchen pails for all residential and apartment building service starts upon request.	All Residential		This is in the costs. New ask would be to send to all residential & apartment starts. Our estimate is this would be an additional 8,100 pails and \$10K additional expense for all new starts. Correct. This is new, and we agreed to ship a gravity bin for compost.
Collection	Yes	Maintain inventory of gravity bins and locked bins so that any commercial, residential or event customers may request 96 gallon landfill and/or 64 gallon compost and/or recycle service in gravity bin with no more than a two week delay. Experience shows that unlocked bins contribute to contamination and contamination charges have been overturned in an appeal due to lack of locked bins.	All		
Collection	Yes	Plan, promote, staff and execute District Clean-Up Events annually in each supervisor district. Include services to maximize recovery and reuse including all three streams (recycle, landfill, compost), household hazardous waste (light bulbs, batteries, appliances, sharps, lamps, etc.) and a reuse component such as partnering with Goodwill to refurbish working computer monitors.	All Residential		Cleared
Collection	Yes	Bulky item recycling (RecycleMyJunk). Single family (1.5 units) receives 2 free pick-ups per year, apartment and commercial rate apartment residents receive 1 free pick up per year, property managers receive 1 free pick up per year.	Residential	Need exhibit	Cleared
Contamination	Yes	Publish a clear and concise summary of the contamination charges and methods to avoid/remove them translated into Spanish, Filipino and Traditional Chinese. Distribution avenues will include website, newsletter, direct mail and provided upon request through customer service.	All		Previously agreed to update website with contamination charge removal instructions. Part of direct mail is new. Previously agreed to send by mail upon request only.
Contamination	Yes	Implement consistent contamination charges throughout SF apartment and commercial rate customers per a mutually agreed upon protocol and phased-in approach with SFE. Begin the first year with commercial and apartment rate accounts w/o compactors and between 2 cy and 40 cy.	Apartment & Commercial		Same as what we agreed to
Contamination	No	Conduct required ISO audits of affected large refuse generators as mutually agreed with SFE.	Apartment & Commercial		Its accounted for in the actual costs.
Contamination	Yes - See column F for specifics	Improve route monitoring by drivers with full utilization of test camera technology to monitor every container that is unloaded.	All	Need exhibit	We agreed to adding cameras to a percentage of our routes (not every container that is unloaded). 38 units that will target compost contamination- accounted for in RA.
Contamination	No	Perform waste evaluations per the container contamination minimization requirements of SB 1383 Section 18984.5(c) twice annually and report outcomes to the City as mutually agreed	All		its accounted for in our actual costs.
Contamination	No	Contact every Commercial and Apartment account with contamination charge or removal of diversion discount at least once a year. First attempt to contact by email or phone, then send letter to the account if not able to reach anyone. Escalate charges as mutually agreed upon.	Apartment & Commercial		its accounted for in the actual costs.
Hazardous Waste	Yes	Fully integrate electronic manifesting for all shipments to off-site disposal facilities for Hazardous Waste.	All		Cleared
Hazardous Waste	Yes	Provide outreach to property managers, associations, and buildings on battery collection safety issues and identification of "high hazard" batteries. [In conjunction with removal of existing orange battery collection containers?]	Apartment		Cleared
Hazardous Waste	Yes	Provide outreach to MFO residents on identification of "high hazard" batteries and battery recycling options. [In conjunction with removal of existing orange battery collection containers?]	Apartment		Cleared
Hazardous Waste	Yes	Fully integrate electronic manifesting for all shipments to off-site disposal facilities.	All		Cleared
Hazardous Waste	Yes	Add Spanish and Chinese language options to Household Hazardous Waste worksheet (330-1465).	All Residential		Cleared
Outreach	Yes - See column F for specifics	Outreach to all new accounts, prioritizing customers whose service reflects 50% or less recovery rate.	All		Combined this goal with #9, #17 and 25#.
Outreach	Yes - See Column F for specifics	Provide printing & distribution every year for residential zero waste outreach mailer promoting what goes where, bulky item pickup program, household hazardous waste collection, and generation reduction strategies. Alternating between apartment residents (E+ units) and single family (1.5 units). SFE will lead on the design of the outreach by working with SFE's contractors and Recology will pay for printing and mailing of outreach materials.	All Residential		In the rate application
Outreach	No	Provide regular virtual and in person trainings to property management companies, associations, and buildings. Offer on a monthly basis, customized per audience with a virtual option as well as upon request by customers.	All		its accounted for in our actual costs.
Outreach	No	Engage the waste zero champions with quarterly events	All		Agreed this is not applicable
Outreach	Yes - See column F for specifics	Revise bills to show clearly rate structure and incentive calculation. Publish a website an updated rate calculator for both residential and small, FEL commercial customers outlining the services available	All		We agreed to work with SFE in partnership on this. Cleared
Outreach	Yes	Develop in collaboration with SFE and print/publish a consolidated commercial service brochure and accompanying web/app content, including Rate calculator for small, FEL commercial customer. Cardboard options. Updated what best resource for commercial customer materials. Detailed set-out guidelines. Additional services such as loading and indoor services. Methods to discourage illegal dumping/cleaning (including gravity bin options). Contamination charges and how to avoid/remove them. VSOG program and other options for hazardous waste removal. Options for bulky item disposal	Commercial		We accounted for the associated costs of this in the Rate Application. Cleared
Outreach	Yes - See column F for specifics	Contact all new Apartment and Commercial accounts at least once that subscribe to 2 cubic yards or more weekly refuse service and whose recovery rate (AKA diversion discount) is 50% or less to offer service that reflects at least 67% recovery	Apartment & Commercial		We combined this goal with #9, #17, #25 and accounted for it in the 2024 RA by specifying a number of accounts to commit to reaching out to each year. A few things were agreed with here.
Outreach	Yes	Provide SB 1383-qualified compost, transportation and staffing to all distribute compost at four events annually for a total of at least 80 cubic yards annually, distributed at the direction of SFE.	All		Concluded this is not applicable
Outreach	No	Provide at least 1,250 Commercial and 600 apartment building accounts (defined by SIC code) with one or more assists annually (e.g., site visit, presentation, phone exchange, email or letter offering outreach, outreach materials sent, self-assessment forms completed, waste zero champion sign-up, service level recovery improvement), captures data on tip code and language served for assists, and submits a list of Commercial and Apartment accounts assisted quarterly.	Apartment & Commercial		This is in our actual costs.
Outreach	Yes - See column F for specifics	Communicate the source separation requirements to all new accounts. Contact all new Apartment and Commercial accounts at least once that subscribe to 2 cubic yards or more weekly refuse service and whose recovery rate (AKA diversion discount) is 50% or less to offer service that reflects at least 67% diversion.	All		We already send welcome letters with source separation requirements to all new accounts. Combined contact goal with #9, #17 and #25.
Processing	Yes	Recology will deliver 1200 tons of SF representative trash to Waste Management (WM) organics material recovery facility (OMRF) in San Leandro, CA for trash processing test. WM will provide a San Francisco material only test in both the OMRF and the Organics Material Composting Facility (OMCF). WM will also provide analysis of the recoverable material and composting quality of end product. This analysis will provide data in determining whether to utilize this facility for full scale SF trash in subsequent rate. Projected cost \$14,233.08	All	Yes	Cleared
Reporting		Reporting as outlined in separate communications to controller.	All		Cleared

#	Title	Criteria	Purpose	Template (Y/N)	Frequency	Current rate report connection	SFE Lead(s)	Recology Response
1	Annual HHW Report	Form 303 data (weights and disposition by type by program), Retail Site weights by type and site, zip code summary for Facility Drop-off and Home Collection Service	Required by CalRecycle to report collection numbers by program and waste type	Y	Quarterly	Table 5	Maggie Johnson, Hilary Near, Jen Jackson, Huy Le	Cleared
2	Table 3	All information in the template	Used to reconcile disposal for CalRecycle Electronic Annual Report (EAR) and generation studies	Y	Annually	N	Jack Macy, Hilary Near	Cleared
3	Apartment & Commercial rate customer information	AR and Altar accounts	Used to update our CRM service information and provide direct technical assistance for compliance with source separation and adequate service. All account information from AR and ALTAR services in one row.	Y	Monthly	Table 4	Hilary Near, Michael Bybee	Yes, we send monthly (from Accounting)
4	Commercial & Apartment customer outreach for source separation	Commercial and apartment building accounts (defined by SIC code) with one or more assists (e.g., site visit, presentation, phone exchange, email or letter offering outreach, outreach materials sent, self-assessment forms completed, waste zero champion sign-up, service level recovery improvement). Include relevant account details including address, zip code and language served for assists	Tracking progress toward shared action plan goals	N	Quarterly	Table 4	Hilary Near, Jessica Narvios, Freddy Coronado	Yes, WasteZero sends quarterly
5	Contamination charges and recovery discount removals	Accounts with contamination charges and/or discount removals	Used for direct technical assistance and other monitoring needs	Y	Quarterly	N	Alexa Kielty, Hilary Near	Yes, we send quarterly (From Waste Zero)
6	Customer communication tracking	Number of communications by type and sector, including call wait time. Quarterly in-language support to all customers through call center, email, online requests forms, direct technical assistance, and in-person/virtual trainings. Capture geographic information and language(s) delivered as frequently as possible by reporting zip code.	Monitor major customer service issues. Establish customer service equity baseline of monolingual or limited-English-proficient resident and business account holders.	N	Biannually	N	Alexa Kielty, Maggie Johnson, Hilary Near	Part of this is a new request. We can provide the data from Language Line.
7	Monthly route collection reports ("Fan 3 Reports") & Table 3	Recycling, composting and trash graphs, summary, monthly Table 3 and disposal	Used for technical assistance, overall communication, and reporting to the Office of the Controller.	Y	Monthly	Table 3	Soko Made, Jack Macy	Cleared
8	Noncompliant accounts	All commercial accounts and residential accounts 5 units or more without collection service for any refuse stream (and if noted SFE compliant), should tie to quarterly rate report Table 4	Used for direct technical assistance and reporting to the state regarding AB 341/1826 required recycling & composting compliance	Y	Quarterly	Table 4	Hilary Near	Yes, we send quarterly (from Accounting)
9	Quarterly HHW Report	Narrative Report, Form 303 data, Battery Bucket Collection Report	Supports the annual HHW report and required by HHW Facility Operating Agreement contract	Y	Quarterly	N	Maggie Johnson, Hilary Near, Jen Jackson, Huy Le	Cleared
10	Refuse Separation Compliance Ordinance	Large refuse generator (LRG) accounts (compactor or 40 cy/week total refuse collection volume)	Used to communicate to new LRGs and identify audit needs	Y	Quarterly	N	Hilary Near	Yes we send Quarterly
11	Weight scale records	Weight scale records to match the annual Table 3	Evaluating recovery rates for purposes of the Zero Waste Incentive	N	Annually	N		

Item	Meeting Date	Commission	Question	Response Date	Response
	3/20/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	How is the city receiving public comment and conducting outreach?	3/20/2023	Listserve, social media, OEWD, small business commission. Hearings, workshops. Collecting public comment and presenting to RRB.
	3/20/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	Advice - do roadmap so anyone can understand how rates were set. Outreach is important, so do the outreach, 3-4 times.	3/20/2023	Noted.
	3/20/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	There is a difference in overflow fees for residential vs commercial, small businesses are taking trash home or public dumping.		
	3/20/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	There's less trash being tipped, so it makes sense that the rate per ton would go up, but shouldn't it balance out? If price up but volume down?		
	3/20/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	How does "mosquito fleet" impact costs?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	For regular monopoly is there a regular % that's considered reasonable and fair?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	What is recology's incentive to manage costs?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	What controls are in place to ensure landfill tonnage and ZWI reporting of numbers are accurate?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	Will inflation projections be updated again during this process?	3/28/2023	Yes, likely using the Controller's 9-month report data
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	What resources are available to learn more about the rate setting process and other related details?	3/28/2023	There are more resources on the Refuse Rate Administration website.
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	How are ZWI tier 3-4 funds available to recology? How often are proposals being approved if the ZWI tier is not achieved?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	What is CoE and ENV's role in setting goals for this rate cycle?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	Who decides how to allocate funds from ENV's portion of the impound budget? What is the relationship between the impound budget and rate setting process?	3/28/2023	ENV and CoE determine their budget
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	Does CoE/ENV recommend to CDN to assume \$14.7M/year, or does ENV negotiate with them?	3/28/2023	Prop F June 2022 allows CoE to give input
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	One of the commissioners said they strongly support the change in ZWI metrics from tonnage to % recovery.	3/28/2023	Noted.
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment	The second to last slide in Recology's presentation showed rates increase for recycle and compost bins more than for trash. That sends the wrong signal to residents. CoE wants them to recycle and compost, not rely on black bins. Can the rates put more of any increase on black bins and less on blue and green to reward residents who've done a good job of sorting? Is there a way to use the fee to incentivize more sorting?		
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment			
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment			
	3/28/2023	Commission on the Environment			
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	What is the actual increase in abandoned materials in Bayview over the past 5 years? What were the tonnages, number of required pickups, and 311 complaints for each year?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	Can you show any statistics which demonstrate that public outreach and engagement reduces abandoned materials? What about changes to staffing?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	Can you show any statistics which demonstrate that public outreach and engagement reduces contamination? What about changes to staffing?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	How does Recology share data on contamination with DPW and SFE?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	Doesn't employee ownership (ESOP) impact Recology's calculation of profit or how profit should be considered? How are taxes different with ESOP vs. a traditional for-profit or publicly-traded company?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	Under Recology's proposal, what is the incentive to manage costs? Do Recology's profits increase relative to their costs without limit? What is the justification for a balancing account that covers 100% of profits or loss if there are a lack of cost controls?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	The Board has requested more jurisdiction comparisons for rates as well as operating ratios and/or profit margins. This item may be better suited as an exhibit.		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	What are the average diversion discounts across customer classes annually?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	How are diversion discounts calculated and what evidence does Recology have to show that they are effective in increasing diversion?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	Public comment: If certain street bins require a second pickup during the day, would it be possible to install a second bin nearby to reduce second pass?		
	4/13/2023	Refuse Rate Board	What data does Recology have to demonstrate that neighborhood commercial zones are requiring more frequent service of street bins than in the past?		
	5/15/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	Recology is an ESOP, and there are different ways to compare an ESOP with a conventional corporation. Were ESOPs compared with other types of competitors in evaluating service and rates? How is this factored into the analysis?		
	5/15/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	I saw a lot of the word "projected" in the rate setting process. Is there a true-up in the process?		
	5/15/2023	Sanitation and Streets Commission	Congratulations on setting up whole new process and thank you. The public outreach has been robust and distillation of information into understandable slides.		

Abbreviation or Acronym	Title
AB	Assembly Bill
AUP	Agreed Upon Procedures
CRM	Customer Relationship Management
EAR	Electronic Annual Report
FTE	Full Time-Equivalent (for employee count)
FY	Fiscal Year
HHW	Household Hazardous Waste
iMRF	Integrated Material Recovery Facility
LRG	Large Refuse Generator
MFD	Multi Family Dwelling
OMRF	Organics Material Recovery Facility
RGG	Recology Golden Gate
RRA	Refuse Rates Administrator
RSF	Recology San Francisco
RSS	Recology Sunset Scavenger
RY or RYE	Rate Year Ending
SB	Senate Bill
SFE or ENV	San Francisco Environment Department
SS/GG	Recology Sunset Scavenger and Golden Gate
WM	Waste Management inc.