

COMMITTEE ON CITY WORKFORCE ALIGNMENT

Draft Minutes of The

April 24, 2023

Meeting of the Committee on City Workforce Alignment (CCWACCWA)
War Memorial Veterans Building, Green Room, 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

**CCWA
Voting
Members
Present**

Shamann Walton, Board of Supervisors
Kate Sofis, OEWD
Sheryl Davis, HRC
Trent Rhorer, HSA
Maria Su, DCYF
Ben Poole, PUC
Luenna Kim, DPH
Carol Isen, DHR

Shireen McSpadden, DSHS
Taras Madison, APD
Anni Chung, Self Help for the Elderly
Dion-Jay Brookter, Young Community
Developers
Vince Courtney Jr., Northern California
District Council of Laborers
Tiffany Jackson, Hospitality House

**CCWA
Additional
Members
Present**

Percy Burch, BOS
Brittini Chicuata, HRC
Tony Lugo, SFHSA
Aumijo Gomes, DCYF

Julia Ma, DHR
Kate Howard, DHR
Richa Dhanju, DPH

**CCWA Staff
Present**

Joshua Arce, OEWD, Chair
Chad Houston, OEWD
Jen Hand, OEWD
Kayla Gordon, Secretary

**CCWA
Members
Absent**

Carla Short, DPW (Darlene Frohm, DPW
appeared on Zoom)

Ruth Barajas, Bay Area Community
Resources
Bart Pantoja, San Francisco Building and
Construction Trades Council Secretary

Swearing In

Joshua Arce, Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) Workforce Director and Committee on City Workforce Alignment (CCWA) Chair, informed the public that CCWA would conduct a swearing-in. Mayor's Liaison to Boards and Commissions Tyra Fennell swore in the Committee on City Workforce Alignment (CCWA) Mayor appointments Anni Chung, Dion-Jay Brookter, and Vince Courtney, Jr.

**Ohlone Land
Acknowledgm
ent,
Announce-
ments &
Housekeeping
(Discussion
Item)**

Chair Arce called the meeting to order at 9:14 am. Secretary Kayla Gordon (OEWD) opened the meeting by reciting the Ohlone Land Acknowledgement and reviewing housekeeping rules.

Roll Call <i>(Discussion Item)</i>	Chair Arce requested that Secretary Gordon conduct roll call. Secretary Gordon conducted roll call and announced that a quorum was present.
Chair's Welcome <i>(Discussion Item)</i>	<p>Chair Arce thanked CCWA members and acknowledged the many stakeholders across the City departments, labor organizations, community organizations, and the general public for attending the CCWA meeting at the War Memorial Green Room and remotely on Zoom. Chair Arce invited Supervisor Walton, who sponsored the legislation reauthorizing the committee, to provide welcoming remarks.</p> <p>Supervisor Walton provided context about the creation of the legislation and provided a brief history of workforce development in San Francisco, including the initial Alignment legislation passed in 2014, the legislative intent to develop skills for individuals in San Francisco to enter careers, and the need for departments to work with OEWD to end poverty through skills building and career development</p>
Adoption of the Agenda <i>(Action Item)</i>	Chair Arce directed CCWA members to review the agenda. Next, Chair Arce solicited comments from CCWA members. Seeing none, Chair Arce requested a motion to adopt the meeting agenda. Member Rhorer made the motion, which was seconded by Member Courtney and passed unanimously.
Adoption of the Bylaws <i>(Action Item)</i>	Chair Arce directed CCWA Directors to review the CCWA Bylaws and noted that they may be amended in the future. Next, Chair Arce solicited comments from CCWA Members. Seeing none, Chair Arce requested a motion to approve the CCWA Bylaws. Member Courtney made the motion which was seconded by Member Brookter and passed unanimously.
Committee Member Goals and Objectives <i>(Discussion Item)</i>	<p>Chair Arce introduced the <i>Committee Member Goals and Objectives</i>, by outlining the legislative requirement to create a unified definition of workforce development, evaluate City-funded workforce programs to determine their effectiveness, and draft a shared City Workforce Development Plan by March 2024 with biennial updates. Director Arce discusses recommendations from the Economic Recovery Task Force, the formation and goals of the original workforce alignment legislation, FY 2021 Workforce Inventory Summary results, and the revised workforce alignment legislation from Supervisor Walton in 2022, focusing on establishing a unified definition of workforce development.</p> <p>Chair Arce encouraged Members to provide an update on agency goals, objectives, and visions for the committee's best use.</p> <p>Chair Arce elicited input from CCWA Members in turn:</p> <p>Human Rights Commission (HRC), as represented by Executive Director Davis, provided remarks on the necessity of partnership with DHR and with OEWD to promote internal and external City workforce Development strategies. Director Davis spoke to the work of HRC and the Office of Racial Equity in meeting with departments to advance the City's racial equity goals, and the City's priorities of recruitment, retention, and promotion. HRC priorities include intentionality in the work and aligning programs across departments for equal access and equal opportunity to take advantage of opportunities in the City. Director Davis spoke to the department's intentionality around building pipelines in City employment and developing</p>

transferrable skills which allow people to move to other places. Director Davis noted that the Workforce Inventory results are reviewed annually and could be better integrated into ongoing work. Director Davis provided remarks that the City needs to make sure it is supporting all individuals who need services, especially individuals who are immigrants or disconnected from school or work.

OEWD, as represented by Executive Director Sofis, provided remarks on how workforce development is a mission of all departments and requires working deeply across community with the public and private sector. Director Sofis underscored the need to use a human-centered perspective to tailor services to the needs of priority populations from youth to individuals with disabilities to displaced workers to empower workers and encourage participation in society. Director Sofis provided remarks on focusing on the City's economic future and harnessing the power of the City's workforce for economic recovery and to right historic wrongs which have impacted workers in specific industries or workers from historically marginalized backgrounds. Director Sofis spoke to the extraordinary people power of the San Francisco area, and encouraged partners to think about how departments can work together to stand up new training programs and access City opportunities.

San Francisco Human Services Agency (SFHSA), as represented by Executive Director Rhorer, provided remarks on aligning the City Workforce Development Plan with SFHSA's five-year plan, including the goal where everyone in San Francisco has a stable source of income and opportunity to increase well-being, with a special focus on individuals who have been historically ineligible for benefits, access to benefits for families, expanding public benefits, and developing and scaling strategies. Director Rhorer also shared remarks on developing a seamless array of customized workforce services across City departments, creating a pathway from economic poverty to self-sufficiency, and expanding the data infrastructure for tracking, warm handoffs, and telling the story of workforce services and best practices.

Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (DCYF), as represented by Executive Director Su, provided remarks on developing seamless systems; ensuring children and youth are supported by nurturing families and communities; and ensuring youth are physically and emotionally healthy, able to succeed in school, and are prepared for college and work. Director Su made remarks that DCYF has issued the first draft of the Services Allocation Plan which is used to develop the upcoming five-year request for proposals, and new outcomes and partnerships are necessary to support young people in transitioning to a productive adulthood.

Public Utilities Commission (PUC), as represented by Director Poole, provided remarks that PUC is a water, power, and sewer agency, and it—as an employer—relies on the workforce development expertise of the partners in the room to craft successful training programs for jobs and careers on capital projects. Director Poole shares that PUC's guiding principles include that the workforce diversity needs to reflect the diversity of people who drink the water delivered into homes by the PUC, and ensuring career pathways for upward mobility. PUC's vision for the committee includes finding an opportunity to have a centralized database to track workers through their journey in the construction trades and making informed decisions for how to impact and improve the worker journey out of poverty and into a career.

Department of Public Health (DPH), as represented by Director Kim, provided remarks that the agency's goal is to protect the health and well-being of all San Franciscans so that background and ethnicity do not impact health outcomes. Director Kim underscored that the healthcare workforce is exhausted, and there has been a reduction in the number of available candidates. DPH is being intentional about supporting candidates of color and promoting career pathways for upward mobility in partnership with DHR, Civil Service Commission, labor partners, and other partners in the room. Director Kim provided remarks that DPH would benefit from outside perspectives in the recruitment, retention, and selection of staff.

Department of Human Resources (DHR), as represented by Human Resources Director Isen, provided remarks about DHR's goals to be in community more, amending regulations to improve hiring and recruitment, and planning around recruitment and retention of City workers, with a specific focus on supporting employees of color. Director Isen spoke to DHR's role as the employer of record for the City, which leans heavily on regulation and compliance framework. Director Isen spoke to the high vacancy rate and the long hiring timeline, which are both shrinking slightly. DHR also has the ability to support recruitment and retention for City departments, and DHR continues to aggressively recruit workers at large job fairs. Director Isen shared that DHR is reexamining entry-level requirements so that people who want to work for the City can enter into employment, and that DHR has conducted an internal analysis of professionals which has identified gaps in support for Black and Brown employees.

Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH), as represented by Executive Director McSpadden, provided remarks on alignment of HSH's Home by the Bay five-year strategic plan with the work of the CCWA. Director McSpadden remarks on the necessity of racial equity in housing justice, and HSH's goals for equity, justice, and innovation. Director McSpadden noted that HSH intends to partner with OEWD for culturally competent strategies, including developing broader workforce strategies to train individuals experiencing homelessness to access jobs, expanding public-private partnerships, addressing staffing needs including employment for individuals who have experienced homelessness, identifying opportunities to expand integration of services, and engaging with the committee to connect people who are homeless to services.

Adult Probation Department (APD), as represented by Director Madison, provided remarks that APD intends to support its clients in building lives that make sure that clients do not reenter the criminal justice system and are able to secure jobs. APD supports with providing transitional housing, behavioral health, and other supportive services, including referrals to jobs training. APD intends to uplift the needs of its population at the table, and ensure that the population is not forgotten. Director Madison also noted that APD is working on its strategic plan, and it intends to continue to fund community-based organizations that are doing the work and partnering with City agencies that support justice-involved clients.

Department of Public Works (DPW), as represented by Director Frohm who appeared on Zoom, provided remarks that DPW launched a new apprenticeship program which is in its first cohort and the second cohort is planned. Additionally, DPW is working on its training schedules for upcoming months.

Mayoral Nonprofit Representative Appointment President Chung provided remarks on the needs of the Asian American and Pacific Islander communities, as well as those of aging adults. As the President and CEO of Self-Help for the Elderly, President Chung provided remarks about the utility of OEWD Job Centers in providing wraparound services, vocational training, and job placement. OEWD Job Centers supported clients through the pandemic, and the community continued to innovate to support special populations impacted by COVID-19 such as immigrants and create new skills training programs for quality jobs. President Chung spoke to the utility of iterating programs, starting small, evaluating for success, and expanding cohort size and with additional partners as necessary.

Mayoral Nonprofit Representative Appointment Director Brookter provided remarks on Young Community Developers, a fifty-year old organization that serves Black youth with workforce development services, housing, and education. Director Brookter provided background on Young Community Developers' shift to providing services from cradle to career and beyond in San Francisco, and urges the committee to use this framework in developing programs and services for youth and families. Director Brookter underscored the importance of working with multiple City agencies and with labor in the development of programs. Director Brookter underscored priorities to invest in and support young people, as well as the necessity of moving discussion from intention to impact.

Mayoral Labor Representative Special Assistant Courtney, on behalf of the Northern California District of Laborers, provided remarks on the intent of labor in moving workforce alignment forward, as well as labor partnerships with community organizations and the City to support good jobs and careers. Special Assistant Courtney provided remarks on the existing successful programs which each department has hosted, as well as the necessity of the public witnessing and being engaged in the planning work for good governance. Special Assistant Courtney expressed interest in the committee clearly defining workforce development programs and strategies, especially with regards to differences in approaches to workforce development and career pathing in contracting and expanding economies.

Board of Supervisor Nonprofit Representative Manager Jackson, on behalf of Central City Hospitality House and the Homeless Workforce Collaborative, provided remarks on equity and economic justice to address the underlying causes of homelessness and create a more just and equitable society for all, including transition age youth, families, and undocumented workers. Manager Jackson expressed community workforce priorities for identifying skills and knowledge gaps, paid training where people earn-and-learn, mentoring and coaching, connecting people to people instead of organizations so everyone may better navigate systems, better evaluate the effectiveness of workforce organizations, provide recommendations to City leadership for changes in organizational structure, communicating with City departments and community-based organizations to build trust with jobseekers, and using the neighborhood job center model as a hub where every door is the right door.

Chair Arce noted that two additional Board of Supervisors representatives Ruth Barajas and Bart Pantoja will join future meetings and elicited additional questions and comments from CCWA Directors.

Director Davis introduced HRC Director Chicuata to provide additional thoughts. Director Chicuata provided remarks on focusing on human potential and human capital, and the necessity of providing economic pathways to parity to new opportunities to mid-career transitions and co-designing solutions with community and with individuals who would benefit from the solutions.

**Opportunities
for
Partnership &
Collaboration**
*(Discussion
Item)*

Chair Arce introduced the next agenda item and noted that Members could share upcoming planning, project, and policy priorities, such as new and innovative pilot programs, policies or rules that impact workforce service coordination, and community events. Chair Arce summarized the outcomes from the discussion, including a focus on racial equity, intentionality, recruitment, retention, promotion, and pathways out of poverty.

Director Chicuata noted that the HRC asked for labor market data to be analyzed by race and other categories such as immigration and disability, because there are disparities in unemployment data. Understanding intersectional issues by race, the HRC is intentional with strategies in addressing those gaps when they are identified. Additionally, the HRC will focus on designing a workforce initiative for San Franciscans to build job opportunities and increase salary opportunities.

Chair Arce noted the availability of labor market information. The monthly employment data that OEWD receives from the Employment Development Department cannot provide real-time analysis concerning race, gender, age, or zip code; however, it does give data representing individuals actively looking for work but not working. The American Community Survey does provide annual data on race, gender, age, and zip code, in addition to unemployment data on individuals who have looked for work within the last twelve months, but who aren't currently working. Since the pandemic, OEWD has seen a reduction in the gap between unemployment rates for Black San Franciscans and the City average unemployment rate. Ideally, that shift is because the Dream Keeper Initiative and OEWD will provide an update at the next CCWA meeting.

Director Rhorer inquired about the change percentage in unemployment rates and how many job seekers that represented by numbers.

Chair Arce noted labor market Info data represents about 6,000 job seekers based on 2 and 3 percent comparisons.

Member Courtney made remarks about the success of the Citywide Joint Apprenticeship Training Committee, and encouraged members of the Alignment Committee to join the large annual meeting in October.

Chair Arce underscored that the committee and its members are not advocating for resourcing programs and funding, but the body is meant to bring concepts and thoughts for how to improve programs.

Member Jackson added that Hospitality House is hosting a job fair at the public library with 20 to 25 employers and invited members to join and/or collaborate.

**Public
Comment on
Non-Agenda
Items**
*(Discussion
Item)*

Chair Arce opened the meeting for public comment on non-agenda items.

Joe Wilson, Director of Hospitality House, emphasized the importance of focusing on often left out of the state and federal employment figures. Mr. Wilson also mentioned that the City needs to move towards supporting individuals who have experienced homelessness and unemployment during the pandemic. Mr. Wilson also underscores that individuals overrepresented in the problem must be overrepresented in the solution.

Donicia Carlos, a self-identified Black resident of San Francisco, would like to know how the public and departments will collaborate to keep them on task and honest about what is being discussed at the CCWA meetings. She also wants to know when and if San Francisco will lift the mandatory vaccination requirement to be employed by the city, given the walk back by the federal government.

Kari Gray left a comment in chat: "Coordination on this scale makes me optimistic about creating creative solutions to some shared challenges and opportunities."

Angie Lipschuetz left a comment in chat: "SF State looks forward to continuing to be an educational partner to support workforce development. Currently, in response to recent mass layoffs, the university is offering one class for free and one class at 50% off for dislocated workers <https://cpage.sfsu.edu/careers>."

Adjournment
(Action Item)

Seeing no more comments, Chair Arce requested a motion to adjourn the meeting. Director Chicuata made a motion, and Secretary Courtney seconded. The motion to adjourn was unanimous. The meeting ended at 11:01 a.m.