



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

*Sent via Electronic Mail*

May 25, 2023

**NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING**

**SUBJECT: MEETINGS WITH LABOR ON THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION RULE SERIES 002 DEFINITIONS, 005 MEETINGS AND HEARING OF THE COMMISSION, 010 EXAMINATION ANNOUNCEMENTS AND APPLICANTS, 011 EXAMINATIONS, 011A POSITION-BASED TESTING, 012 ELIGIBLE LISTS, AND 013 CERTIFICATION OF ELIGIBLES, VOLUMES I-IV.**

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **June 5, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.**

This item will appear under the Human Resources Director's Report. Please refer to the attached notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is recommended. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources  
Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources  
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources  
Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources  
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources  
Mawuli Tugbenyoh, Department of Human Resources  
David Huebner, Department of Human Resources  
Anne Marie Monroe, Department of Human Resources  
Nate Frank, Department of Human Resources  
Dylan Johnke, Department of Human Resources  
Urszula Kakar, Department of Human Resources  
Daniel Kaplan, Department of Human Resources  
Angel Li, Department of Human Resources  
Ardis Graham, Department of Human Resources  
Claire McCaleb, Department of Human Resources  
Kimberly Ackerman, SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
William (Bill) Miles II, SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
Shana Dines, SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
David Garcia, SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
Commission File  
Commissioners' Binder  
Chron

## **NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

### **A. Commission Office**

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) and the web address is [www.sfgov.org/civilservice/](http://www.sfgov.org/civilservice/). Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

### **B. Policy Requiring Written Reports**

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

### **C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants**

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4<sup>th</sup>) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

### **D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission**

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

### **E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement**

**A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.**

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

### **F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order**

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

### **G. Procedure for Commission Hearings**

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

**H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings**

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at [www.sfgov.org/civilservice/](http://www.sfgov.org/civilservice/).

**I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission**

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the “Requests to Speak” portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended.

**J. Public Comment and Due Process**

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

**K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings**

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Information on Disability Access**

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City’s efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

**Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government’s duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people’s business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people’s review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: [soff@sfgov.org](mailto:soff@sfgov.org), or on the City’s website at [www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine](http://www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine).

**San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance**


Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.



# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of  
Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: \_\_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_\_ -
  2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: June 5, 2023
  3. Check One:           Ratification Agenda  
                              Consent Agenda  
                              Regular Agenda  
                              **Human Resources Director's Report     ✓**
  4. Subject: **Meetings with Labor on the Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rule Series 002 Definitions, 005 Meetings and Hearing of the Commission, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations: 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles, Volumes I-IV**
  5. Recommendation:
  6. Report prepared by: Carol Isen, Director Telephone number: (415) 557-4815
  7. Notifications:           **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV. Commission Report Format -A).**
  8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:  
  
Human Resources Director: 
- Date: **May 16, 2023**
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer  
Civil Service Commission  
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

<p><b><u>CSC RECEIPT</u></b> <b><u>STAMP</u></b></p>
--

## Notifications

Carol Isen  
Human Resources Director  
Department of Human Resources  
carol.isen@sfgov.org

Kate Howard  
Managing Deputy Director  
Department of Human Resources  
kate.howard@sfgov.org

Anna Biasbas  
Director of Employment Services  
Department of Human Resources  
anna.biasbas@sfgov.org

Shawn Sherburne  
Assistant Director, Employment  
Services  
Department of Human Resources  
shawn.sherburne@sfgov.org

Dave Johnson  
Assistant Director, Employment  
Services  
Department of Human Resources  
dave.johnson@sfgov.org

Mawuli Tugbenyoh  
Director of Policy and External  
Affairs  
Department of Human Resources  
mawuli.tugbenyoh@sfgov.org

David Huebner  
Director, HR Modernization Program  
Department of Human Resources  
david.huebner@sfgov.org

Anne Marie Monroe  
Manager, HR Modernization  
Program  
Department of Human Resources  
annemarie.monroe@sfgov.org

Nate Frank  
Manager, Digital HR  
Department of Human Resources  
nate.frank@sfgov.org

Dylan Johnke  
Lead Engineer, HR Modernization Program  
Department of Human Resources  
Dylan.johnke@sfgov.org

Urszula Kakar  
Manager, Assessment and People Analytics  
Department of Human Resources  
urszula.m.kakar@sfgov.org

Daniel Kaplan  
Hiring Process Reform Project Manager  
Department of Human Resources  
dan.kaplan@sfgov.org

Angel Li  
Full-Stack Engineer, People Systems  
Department of Human Resources  
angel.p.li@sfgov.org

Ardis Graham  
Director of Employee Relations  
Department of Human Resources  
ardis.graham@sfgov.org

Claire McCaleb  
Senior Employee Relations Representative  
Department of Human Resources  
claire.mccaleb@sfgov.org

Kimberly Ackerman  
SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
kimberly.ackerman@sfmta.com

William (Bill) Miles, II  
SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
william.MilesII@sfmta.com

Shana Dines  
SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
shana.dines@sfmta.com

David Garcia  
SF Municipal Transportation Agency  
david.garcia@sfmta.com



## **MEMORANDUM**

**DATE:** May 17, 2023  
**TO:** Civil Service Commission  
**THROUGH:** Carol Isen, Human Resources Director  
**FROM:** Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
**SUBJECT:** Meetings with Labor on the Proposed Amendments to Civil Service Commission Rule Series 002 Definitions, 005 Meetings and Hearing of the Commission, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations: 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles, Volumes I-IV

---

### **Summary of Meetings with Labor**

The Employee Relations Division (ERD) concluded discussions with Labor on the proposed amendments to Civil Service Commission (CSC or Commission) Rule Series 002 Definitions, 005 Meetings and Hearings of the Commission, 010 Examination Announcements and Applicants, 011 Examinations: 011A Position-Based Testing, 012 Eligible Lists, and 013 Certification of Eligibles Volumes I-IV posted by the Commission on November 7, 2022, and February 17, 2023.

ERD noticed Labor of the proposed amendments on February 24, 2023, and ERD sent follow-up notices on March 6, 2023. Ten (10) Unions expressed interest in meeting. The Department of Human Resources (DHR) and CSC hosted nine (9) informational meetings with Labor attended by Firefighters Local 798, Police Officers' Association, Municipal Executives' Association, SEIU Local 1021, IFPTE Local 21, San Francisco City Workers United, IBEW Local 6, Machinists Union Local 1414, and Sheriff's Managers & Supervisors Association. The San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) co-hosted six (6) of the meetings. During the meetings DHR, CSC, and MTA presented each of the proposed rule amendments and answered Labor's questions. Labor did not raise any adverse impacts on their members. Therefore, ERD considers these discussions closed.

### **Conclusion**

The City and County of San Francisco has met its obligations under the Meyers-Milias-Brown Act.

### **Attachments**

- A) 2023.03.13 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes IAFF Local 798
- B) 2023.03.13 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes POA
- C) 2023.03.21 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes MEA

- D) 2023.03.27 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes Volumes I and IV
- E) 2023.04.03 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes IBEW Local 6
- F) 2023.04.06 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes Local 21
- G) 2023.04.10 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes SEIU
- H) 2023.04.18 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes IAM Local 1414
- I) 2023.04.24 Post Meeting Memo Proposed CSC Rule Changes MSA

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

DATE: March 13, 2023

TO: Floyd Rollins, IAFF Local 798  
 Adam Wood, IAFF Local 798

FROM: Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

CC: Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, CSC  
 Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume III**

---

On Thursday, March 9, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the San Francisco Fire Fighters Union, Local 798 (Local 798 or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volume III which were posted by the commission on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

The CSC and the Department of Human Resources presented and explained the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire.

The Union stated that it is considering the proposed rule changes, and will respond to the City with any questions and identifiable impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits next week. If we do not hear from you by close of business on Friday, March 17, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.



**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

DATE: March 13, 2023

TO: Tracy McCray, President, SF Police Officers' Association

FROM: Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

CC: Rocky Lucia, Rains Lucia Sterns  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, CSC  
 Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume II**

---

On Thursday March 9, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the San Francisco Police Officers' Association (POA or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volume II which were posted by the commission on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

The CSC and the Department of Human Resources presented and explained the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire.

The Union did not express any concerns with the proposed changes and did not identify impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits. If we do not hear from you by close of business on Friday, March 17, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

**DATE:** March 21, 2023

**TO:** Criss Romero, Executive Director, Municipal Executives' Association  
 Christina Fong, Deputy Director, Municipal Executives' Association

**FROM:** Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

**CC:** Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Director, CSC  
 Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, CSC  
 William Miles II, Talent Acquisition Manager, MTA  
 Shana Dines, Sr. Employee & Labor Relations Manager, MTA

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I through IV**

---

On Friday, March 17, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the San Francisco Municipal Executives' Association (MEA or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volumes I through IV which were posted by the commission on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

The CSC, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Department of Human Resources presented and explained the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire.

The Union did not express any concerns with the proposed changes and did not identify impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits. If we do not hear from you by close of business on Friday, March 24, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
 www.sfdhr.org

**Via Email**

**DATE:** March 27, 2023

**TO:** Oumar Fall, Field Director, SEIU Local 1021  
 Katherine General, Field Director, IFPTE Local 21  
 Osha Ashworth, Senior Business Representative, IBEW Local 6  
 Ellen Mendelson, Union Counsel, San Francisco City Workers United

**FROM:** Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

**CC:** Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative, DHR  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, CSC  
 Lavena Homes, Deputy Director, CSC  
 Kimberly Ackerman, Human Resources Director, MTA  
 William Miles II, Talent Acquisition Manager, MTA  
 Shana Dines, Sr. Employee & Labor Relations Manager, MTA

**RE:** **Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I and IV Post Meeting Memo**

---

On Friday, March 17, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the IFPTE Local 21 (Local 21), SEIU Local 1021 (SEIU), IBEW Local 6 (Local 6), and San Francisco City Workers United (SFCWU) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Service Commission's (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volumes I and IV posted by CSC on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

CSC, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Department of Human Resources provided a presentation explaining the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring processes and reduce the time to hire. The Unions raised several questions and concerns regarding the proposed rule changes. Below are the City's responses to the Union's questions. The specific rules are cited for Volume I, but the same rules apply in Volume IV.

Employment Opportunity Website (Civil Service Rules 102.4, 102.25)

Question: Does this language change eliminate the requirement for hard copy postings of recruitments?

Response: The change does not eliminate hard copy postings. In cases where there is an existing agreement

between Unions and City to post hard copies, those agreements would still be valid. Rule 102.25 is defining the term “posting”. All recruitments will continue to be posted on the Employment Opportunity Website.

Minimum Posting Periods (Civil Service Rule 110.3)

Questions: Why is there not a maximum posting period?

Response: Some recruitments require a longer posting period as they are difficult to recruit. There are also continuous class-based tests (CCTs) that are open at all times.

Question: It seems like the main thrust is to reduce the applicant pool.

Response: Reducing announcement posting periods would be implemented based on the considerations written in the rule such as for classifications that have a high level of applicants and low turnover, low labor market availability, etc.

Question: How will the reduction of minimum posting periods impact nursing?

Response: Since nursing uses continuous testing where the recruitment is always open, this change would not impact the current process for posting recruitments for nursing. Reducing the Notice of Inquiry (NOI) would make interviewing faster for nurse hiring. The Department of Human Resources, Department of Public Health, and SEIU will meet separately to discuss RN hiring.

Promotional Applicants (Civil Service Rule 110.11)

Concern: The Unions raised concern regarding allowing exempt employees to qualify for promotional points in Class Based Tests (CBTs).

Response: The proposed change would align promotional points for CBTs with Position Based Tests (PBTs). Exempt candidates currently qualify for these points when they apply to a PBT. This proposed rule change would bring CBTs in line with PBTs, which would simplify the recruitment process for applicants and human resources. Additionally, the proposed language change would fully eliminate the process of verifying satisfactory service for each employee who is eligible for promotional points. This would expedite the exam process, as personnel files are not electronically stored citywide. Under the current system, this is manually carried out by human resources.

Question: Would all employees get the same number of promotional points?

Response: Yes, they will get the same number of promotional points.

Review of Ratings Period (Civil Service Rules 111A.22, 111.13, 111.15, 111.30, 112.7, 112.7.1, 112.7.3, 112.7.3)

Question: Please clarify on the change of language from “inspect” to “review”.

Response: This language change was clean up for consistency across all volumes. It is also to help minimize confusion between the Civil Services' auditing function (known as an inspection service).

Extension of Eligibility (Civil Service Rule 112.3)

Concern: The lists take a long time to make, so there are persons who have not performed the work in a long

time.

Response: The frequency to which someone has performed the work is something that should be addressed through a change in the minimum qualifications for the position in that the individual should have a certain number of years of experience within the past several years.

It is highly unlikely that the City will have a list duration of 48 months. This option is being added to account for emergencies such as COVID, where testing was delayed and eligible lists were expiring.

Exhaustion of the List (Civil Service Rule 113.6)

Question: What happens when a list is exhausted?

Response: The proposed rule change allows for a list to be declared exhausted when there are more vacancies than eligibles. This allows Departments to start a new recruitment process earlier.

Notice of Inquiry (Civil Service Rules 113.10.2, 113.10.3)

Question: Is the proposed change from a max of five days to a minimum of three days with no maximum?

Response: The proposed change would provide the option to reduce the NOI from five business days to three business days. The NOI can be longer based on the considerations written in the rule. As an example, reducing the NOI to three business days would expedite hiring for positions that have very few eligibles on the list.

Question: Concern regarding the reduction of some of the periods, such as the NOI in that some demographics will be left behind, people are working 10-hour days, and over reliance on the internet will hurt some people. Want to make sure it does not hurt some classifications, such as janitors.

Response: Within the proposed changes for the rules relating to time periods, there are considerations that need to be made when determining whether to reduce the time period. For example, the considerations listed in the rule for the NOI states:

“In establishing the minimum period, the Human Resources Director shall consider, among other factors, availability of technology to respond, number of eligibles, stability and reliability of the messaging platform in sending and receiving notifications, extent of access by eligibles to the means for receiving timely notification, and complexity of the selection procedures.”

And, for the Minimum Posting Periods for Examination Announcements the proposed change adds:

“In establishing the minimum period, the Human Resources Director shall consider, among other factors, number of vacancies, turnover in the classification, labor market availability, stability and reliability of the messaging platform in sending and receiving notifications, extent of access by the labor market to the means for receiving timely notification, and equal employment opportunity and racial equity goals.”

Appeal Language (Civil Service Rules 105.12.1, 105.12.2, 105.12.4)

No questions or concerns were expressed regarding the changes to these rules.

Certification Results (Civil Service Rule 113.11)

No questions or concerns were expressed regarding the changes to these rules.

The Civil Service Commission is responsible for the establishment of standards, procedures and qualifications of employment, recruitment, application, examination, selection, certification and appointment. If you wish to meet and confer on potential identifiable impacts of these proposed changes, please contact Caitlin Kirke at [Caitlin.Kirke@sfgov.org](mailto:Caitlin.Kirke@sfgov.org). If we do not hear from you by close of business on Tuesday, April 4, 2023, we will consider this matter closed.

Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

DATE: April 3, 2023

TO: Osha Ashworth, Assistant Business Manager, IBEW Local 6

FROM: Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

CC: Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Director, CSC  
 Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, CSC  
 William Miles II, Talent Acquisition Manager, MTA  
 Shana Dines, Sr. Employee & Labor Relations Manager, MTA

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I and IV**

---

On Monday, March 27, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the IBEW Local 6 (Local 6 or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volumes I and IV, posted by the CSC on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

CSC, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Department of Human Resources answered questions regarding the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire.

The Union did not identify impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits. If we do not hear from Local 6 by close of business on Monday, April 10, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

**DATE:** April 6, 2023

**TO:** Debra Grabelle, Executive Director, IFPTE, Local 21  
 Kat General, Field Director, IFPTE, Local 21

**FROM:** Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

**CC:** Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Director, CSC  
 Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, CSC  
 William Miles II, Talent Acquisition Manager, MTA  
 Shana Dines, Sr. Employee & Labor Relations Manager, MTA

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I through IV**

---

On Tuesday, April 4, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with IFPTE, Local 21 (Local 21 or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volumes I through IV which were posted by the commission on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

The CSC, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Department of Human Resources answered questions regarding the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire.

The Union did not identify impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits. If we do not hear from you by close of business on Friday, April 14, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.



**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

DATE: April 10, 2023

TO: Oumar Fall, Field Director, SEIU, Local 1021

FROM: Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

CC: Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Director, CSC  
 Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, CSC  
 Kimberly Ackerman, Director of Human Resources, MTA  
 William Miles II, Talent Acquisition Manager, MTA  
 Shana Dines, Sr. Employee & Labor Relations Manager, MTA

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I and IV**

On Wednesday, April 5, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with SEIU, Local 1021 (Local 1021 or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volumes I and IV which were posted by the commission on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

The CSC, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Department of Human Resources answered questions regarding the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire. The Union asked questions regarding the application of the amended rules for the minimum posting period and the notice of inquiry. The City responded to the Union's questions and concerns.

The Union did not identify impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits. If we do not hear from you by close of business on Monday, April 17, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact Employee Relations with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

**DATE:** April 17, 2023

**TO:** Pedro Mendez, Area Director, IAM Local 1414  
 Donte Vickers, Business Representative, IAM Local 1414

**FROM:** Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

**CC:** Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director  
 Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Director, CSC  
 Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, CSC  
 William Miles II, Talent Acquisition Manager, MTA  
 Shana Dines, Sr. Employee & Labor Relations Manager, MTA

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I and IV**

---

On Friday April 14, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the IAM Local 1414 (Local 1414 or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Services Commission's (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volumes I and IV, posted by the CSC on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

CSC, the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, and the Department of Human Resources answered questions regarding the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire.

The Union did not identify impacts on working conditions, pay, or benefits. If we do not hear from Local 1414 by close of business on Monday, April 24, 2023, we will consider this matter closed. Please feel free to contact the Employee Relations Division with any questions or concerns.

Thank you for your continued partnership.

**City and County of San Francisco**  
 Carol Isen  
 Human Resources Director



**Department of Human Resources**  
*Connecting People with Purpose*  
[www.sfdhr.org](http://www.sfdhr.org)

**Via Email**

DATE: April 24, 2023

TO: Lisette Adams, President, MSA  
 Claire McCaleb, Senior Employee Relations Representative

FROM: Ardis Graham, Employee Relations Director

CC: Jonathan T. Wright, Employee Relations Manager  
 Caitlin Kirke, Employee Relations Representative  
 Anna Biasbas, Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Shawn Sherburne, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Dave Johnson, Assistant Director of Employment Services, DHR  
 Sandra Eng, Executive Director, CSC  
 Lavena Holmes, Deputy Director, CSC

**RE: Proposed Civil Service Commission Rule Changes, Volume I**

---

On Wednesday, April 5, 2023, the City and County of San Francisco (City) met with the Sheriffs' Managers and Supervisors Association (MSA or Union) via Zoom to discuss the Civil Service Commission's (CSC) proposed amendments to Civil Service Rules Volume I, posted by CSC on November 7, 2022 and February 17, 2023.

During the meeting, CSC and the Department of Human Resources (DHR) answered questions regarding the proposed rule amendments which are intended to modernize hiring and recruitment processes and reduce the time to hire. The Union identified concerns with the changes to Rule 110.3 Minimum Posting Period and Rule 112.3 Extension of Eligibility.

The Civil Service Rule changes apply Citywide including to Volumes 2, 3, and 4 applicable to Police sworn ranks, Fire sworn ranks, and MTA Service critical positions, respectively. In the rule changes allowing for a reduction in the time period, including Rule 110.3 Minimum Posting Period, there are criteria in the specific rules for when the period could be shortened. The classifications represented by MSA do not meet the criteria for reducing the posting period, and in fact a reduced period would likely be counterproductive. The City often extends the posting for these classifications to allow more time for your members to apply. DHR oversees the exam process, and only a strong argument based on operational need would convince DHR to consider a reduced posting period. In addition, departments are required to include the length of the posting on the job announcement, so MSA would know if a recruitment is posted for less than ten (10) business days. Further, if the Union raises a concern regarding the posting period to DHR, DHR will work with the Union to resolve the concern.

Regarding the Union's concern with the change to Civil Service Rule 112.3 Extension of Eligibility, this change is in response to the extraordinary measures taken in the City's effort to sustain its workforce during the pandemic-related shutdown of services including creation of eligible lists. This change would give the Human

Resources Director the authority to extend lists in extraordinary circumstance without requiring Mayoral or CSC action. This change also aligns Volume 1 with Police and Fire rules wherein a 48-month list duration has always been an option.

DHR recognizes the impediments to career advancement that an extended list duration places on members who “just missed” the eligibility cutoff. DHR also recognizes the frustration of eligibles who are “next up” for promotion when a list is about to expire., and the delicate balancing of those opposing interests. DHR prefers, absent extraordinary circumstances, a consistent process wherein members know well in advance the requirements and specifics regarding promotional opportunities. Finally, DHR reviewed the length of the eligible lists for MSA classifications and none of the lists in the past five (5) years went beyond two (2) years duration.

Please contact Employee Relations Representative Caitlin Kirke at [Caitlin.kirke@sfgov.org](mailto:Caitlin.kirke@sfgov.org) with any further questions or concerns. If we do not hear from MSA by close of business on Monday, May 1, 2023, we will consider this matter closed.

Thank you for your continued partnership.