

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION



MERIT SYSTEM AUDIT PROGRAM

FISCAL YEAR
2022-2023

Prepared by:

Luz Morganti

Luz Morganti
Senior Human Resources Analyst
Civil Service Commission

INTRODUCTION

The role of the Civil Service Commission is to oversee and protect the civil service merit system for the City and County of San Francisco.

The Civil Service Commission is authorized by Charter (Article X Section 10.101. General Powers and Duties) to establish rules, policies, and procedures to carry out the merit system provisions of the Charter. The Commission provides oversight and hears appeals on examinations, eligible lists, minimum qualifications, classification, discrimination complaints, future employment restrictions with the City and other merit system matters.

In its effort to ensure compliance of the civil service merit system, the Commission delineates responsibilities and goals to the Civil Service Commission Department Staff for the purposes of coordinating/conducting open dialog and discussion on the merits of existing rules, policies and procedures; make recommendations for change; and, where departmental staff, employee organizations, employees, applicants and members of the public can obtain consistent, fair and concise information on the merit system, the jurisdiction of the Civil Service Commission, and the application of its Rules, policies and procedures.

COMPLIANCE REVIEW AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Charter Section 10.101 states, “The Commission shall have the power to inquire into the operation of the civil service merit system to ensure compliance with merit principles and rules established by the Commission.” The Civil Service Commission at its meeting on October 16, 2006, gave general directions for the Civil Service Commission staff to conduct audits to determine if City and County departments are adhering to Federal and California State Law as well as compliance with existing Civil Service Commission Rules, policies, and procedures.

Under its Charter Authority, the Civil Service Commission staff conducts an annual Audit Program. The purpose of the Audit Program is to ensure compliance with merit system Rules, policies and procedures established by the Civil Service Commission through the investigation of the conduct or actions of appointees in all positions.

MERIT SYSTEM AUDIT PROGRAM GOALS & OBJECTIVES

The Merit System Audit Program was designed to assess compliance of Civil Service Commission Rules, policies and procedures utilized by City and County departments. Commission audit reviews may include, but are not limited to auditing departmental records, determining compliance with departmental and merit system practices, and interviewing and applying relevant merit system Rules, policies, and procedures. When an audit/review is conducted and completed, Civil Service Commission staff prepares a written report outlining the subject matter of the audit, an analysis and summary of the findings, and if identified to be applicable, recommendations regarding areas requiring corrective action will be noted. The results and/or recommendation of an audit review could also include scheduling the matter for Civil Service Commission consideration and action if necessary or appropriate.

In summary:

- The audit is a mechanism utilized to assist departments in reviewing their internal procedures regarding the compliance of Civil Service Commission Rules, policies and/or procedures.
- The audit review provides an assessment as to whether there is compliance of required documentation and/or records and recommends changes that may be needed to meet compliance standards.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Appreciation is extended to the departments and their staff who graciously participated in the audit.

FISCAL YEAR 2022-23 AUDIT OBJECTIVES

All candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional and exempt appointments must meet the minimum qualifications for the jobs to which they are appointed. It is the City's policy that employment verifications for all applicants be completed by departmental Human Resources professionals prior to an offer of employment with the City and County of San Francisco. This means that prior to extending an employment offer, or processing a candidate's appointment, hiring departments are required to verify information provided by the applicant regarding their qualifying experience and education, licenses, certifications, etc. Throughout this fiscal year, the Commission received numerous complaints alleging that appointees did not meet the required qualifications for the position to which they were appointed.

On May 19, 2022, the Mayor issued the 48th Supplement to the Mayoral Emergency Declaration which authorized the Human Resources Director to temporarily modify Civil Service Commission Rules to establish a streamlined competitive examination process for employees who have served for at least one year in exempt status under Charter Section *10.104* (Category 18) for special projects and professional services. The Human Resources Director and the Mayor determined that immediate steps were needed to address COVID-19 related delays in the hiring process.

As required in the 48th Supplement, the Human Resources Director presented the temporary Rule Proposal 111.17 Examinations – Authorization for Exempt to Permanent Status Program (Rule 111.17) to the Civil Service Commission. According to the 48th Supplement, Rule 111.17 would be adopted five (5) days after the presentation to the Commission. With additional amendments made by the Commission, Rule 111.17 was approved at the meeting of June 6, 2022, and adopted on June 11, 2022.

Therefore, this fiscal year the Commission focused on reviewing the following selection and appointment practices for nine recruitments conducted by various City departments to assess the department's compliance with applicable Charter provisions, Commission Rules, and merit system policies and procedures. Specific to this review are appointments processed as a result of the 48th Supplement to the Mayoral Emergency Declaration.

The position recruitments for the following departments listed below were selected for the Fiscal Year 2022-23 Merit System Audit Program.

Department	Classification	Job Type
Board of Supervisors	Class 1053	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Board of Supervisors	Class 1822	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Emergency Management	Class 0942	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Emergency Management	Class 2533	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Technology	Class 1054	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Technology	Class 1070	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Public Utilities Commission	Class 4310	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Public Utilities Commission	Class 5322	PEX to Permanent Civil Service
Port of San Francisco	Class 9251	PEX to Permanent Civil Service

STANDARDS

QUALIFICATIONS OF APPLICANTS

Civil Service Commission Rule 110.9 Qualifications of Applicants states in part,

“Every applicant for an examination must possess and maintain the qualifications required by law and by the examination announcement for the examination. Experience gained in violation of Commission Rules shall not be recognized. City and County employees shall receive credit only for the duties of the class to which appointed or assigned unless sufficient and credible documentation is provided to verify performance of other duties. Employees may receive credit for duties not usually performed by incumbents in a class if their employee file contains contemporaneous documentation that the duties were assigned and performed. By way of example but not limitation, records that describe and verify the out-of-class assignment that may be accepted as documentation include a valid performance appraisal completed during the normal evaluation period, payroll records filed at the time of the assignment and Notice of Assignment. Credit for duties not usually performed by incumbents in a class based on non-contemporaneous documentation shall require the certification of the Appointing Officer and the approval of the Human Resources Director...”

Civil Service Commission Rule 111.17 Authorization for Exempt to Permanent Status Program states in part,

“Pursuant to the Forty-Eighth Supplement to the Mayoral Emergency Declaration, the Human Resources Director is authorized to establish programs giving exempt employees the opportunity to transition to permanent status. The exempt employee must have successfully served in an exempt status for a minimum of one (1) year. In establishing the program, the Human Resources Director shall consider, among other factors, active holdover rosters where qualified eligibles exist, availability of positions, budgetary restrictions, equal employment opportunity and Office of Racial Equity goals.

The specific procedures and qualifications established shall be listed in the examination announcement for the classifications involved. Eligibles processed in this manner will be placed on an eligible list. This rule shall only apply to Exempt Category 18: Special Projects and Professional Services. The certification rule for all eligible lists established under this program shall be Rule of the List.” Determination of the appropriate eligible list from which to make appointments if there is an active eligible list in the job classification is at the discretion of the Human Resources Director subject to criteria submitted to and approved by the Civil Service Commission.

Decisions by the Human Resources Director shall be subject to appeal to the Civil Service Commission whose decision shall be final. In view of the urgency and time limitations, an expedited report and hearing process utilizing special meetings of the Commission where a quorum is present may be considered.

The Human Resources Director shall submit monthly reports to the Civil Service Commission on the progress of the temporary program.

Inquiries and complaints on this program submitted to the Civil Service Commission office under its Charter authorizes Inspection Services and shall continue to be investigated and resolved.

Consistent with the provisions of the Forty-Eighth Supplement to the Mayoral Emergency Declaration, this Rule shall expire December 15, 2022, unless terminated earlier by the Mayor or the Board of Supervisors.

Department of Human Resources Memorandum No. 08-2010 – Verification of Employment History Information and Access to Employment Records in PeopleSoft

This memorandum outlines procedures and policies regarding obtaining employment history and reference checks for current and past City employees prior to making a job offer. It states in part, “It is the City’s policy that employment verifications for all applicants be completed by departmental Human Resources professionals prior to an offer of employment with the City and County of San Francisco. It is particularly important that departmental Human Resources professionals review and verify employment history information for current and past City employees who are under consideration for appointment to a City position (e.g., promotion, transfer, “Prop F” hire, etc.). To facilitate that review, departmental Human Resources professionals now have access to the PeopleSoft system for purposes of employment verification prior to employment.”

Department of Human Resources Policy on Verifying Possession of Minimum Qualifications (in-service conducted at HR Professional meeting on 8/19/2009)

“All candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional and exempt appointments must meet the minimum qualifications for the jobs to which they are appointed at the time of the deadline published on the announcement. ***Prior to extending an employment offer, hiring departments shall verify information provided by the applicant regarding their qualifying experience.***”

The policy provides specific instructions on “how” and “when” to verify an applicant’s qualifications:

- When an applicant’s qualifying experience was obtained through employment with the City and County of San Francisco the verification should be performed by the Department Personnel Officer or designee, who will check available PeopleSoft records. Credit for experience obtained outside of the employee’s class will only be allowed if it was recorded and placed in the personnel file at the time the assignment was made. Qualifying experience of City and County employees should be verified prior to the examination. City and County experience should be verified by the recruiting analyst at the time of application.

- To verify work experience earned outside of City and County of San Francisco employment, the hiring authority must contact the candidate's current and/or former employers to confirm dates of service, job titles(s) and duties performed. ***A record of this contact must be made.*** If this verification information cannot be obtained, the hiring authority shall keep a written record of the due diligence efforts that were made. The hiring authority must seek verification from a candidate's current and/or former employers prior to making an employment offer. Verification may be solicited at the time of reference checks.

SUMMARY ANALYSIS OF AUDIT FINDINGS

MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS

Minimum qualifications (MQs) as listed on the job/examination announcement are formal statements describing what is required for individuals to have to compete further in the employee selection process. They are descriptions of the education, training, work experience, licenses, certifications, etc., that one must have to possess the competencies needed to perform a job at entry. Applicants who do not meet the stated MQs are eliminated from the selection process. Screening applications based on MQs is considered a selection procedure that is covered by the Federal Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures. To withstand Title VII lawsuits that allege discrimination or other illegal hiring practices, any MQ that is used to screen applicants must be job-related and consistent with business necessity. Generally, the minimum qualifications for the tested position will remain the same as the minimum qualifications that are stated in the class specification.

Verification as Part of the Application Process

Applicants may be required to submit verification of qualifying education and experience, at any point in the application, examination, or departmental selection processes. All documents related to verification of minimum qualifications are required to be obtained prior to the appointment date of the candidate and are to be in the Official Employee Personnel File (OEPF) exhibiting compliance of procedures and policies. This refers to all candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional or exempt appointments. In general, there are several documents that can be requested and used to assess employment verification of experience:

- Transcripts, licenses, or certifications
- Standard letters (on letterhead) from employers
- Performance evaluations that describe duties performed
- DHR Employment Verification form
- PeopleSoft records or appointment processing form

The following provides limited information regarding experience and can be used when other verification is not obtainable:

- W2 form
- Income tax returns
- Paycheck stubs

FINDINGS

All the appointees reviewed for this audit were deemed by their respective department appointing officers or designees to have met the minimum qualifications for the position to which they were appointed. The Department of Human Resources (DHR) policy requires that all documents related to verification of minimum qualifications are to be obtained prior to the appointment date of the candidate and are to be in the OEPF exhibiting compliance of procedures

and policies. This applies to all candidates selected for permanent civil service, provisional or exempt appointments.

The DHR policy provides specific instructions on “how” and “when” to verify an applicant’s qualifications. To verify work experience earned outside of City and County of San Francisco employment, the hiring authority must contact the candidate’s current and/or former employers to confirm dates of service, job titles(s) and duties performed. ***A record of this contact must be made.***

In general, there are also several documents that can be requested and used to assess employment verification of experience:

- Transcripts, licenses, or certifications
- Standard letters (on letterhead) from employers
- Performance evaluations that describe duties performed
- DHR Employment Verification form
- PeopleSoft records or appointment processing form

To verify external qualifying work experience for one of the appointee’s reviewed as part of this audit, one department submitted an employer letter of verification dated March 2023. The employee’s employment began with the City for this department in a Temporary Exempt Class 1093 IT Operations Support Administrator III position effective April 3, 2017. According to the department’s Senior Human Resources Analyst, a phone verification was conducted prior to the time of hire with the employee’s external employer by using Equifax. However, the department did not produce the DHR Employment Verification form documenting the information which is why as a result of this audit inquiry, the employer letter of verification dated March 2023 was obtained by the employee years after the hire date for that position. The department did not comply with DHR policy by obtaining/documenting verification of employment prior to appointment of the employee in this instance. However, since as a result of this review the documentation submitted does verify the qualifications of the individual for the initial position of hire to TEX Class 1093 and subsequent hire to PEX Class 1053 Senior IS Business Analyst, which was the position of review.

The other four (4) departments that participated in this audit, complied with these procedures illustrating that each appointee is qualified for the position to which appointed. In summary, the nine (9) appointees that were reviewed are qualified for their appointments.

OVERALL SUMMARY

This year’s audit illustrates how the Merit System Audit Program is indeed a constructive mechanism utilized to assist departments in reviewing their internal procedures regarding the compliance of Civil Service Commission Rules, policies, and Department of Human Resources procedures.

AUDIT REVIEWS

BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

About the Board of Supervisors

The Board of Supervisors (BOS) is the legislative branch of the City and County of San Francisco. The Board consists of 11 members. Each member is elected on a non-partisan basis from a district where he or she lives. The Office of the Board of Supervisors manages the functions of the Supervisors.

Overview

The Clerk of the Board of the Board of Supervisors was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Clerk and the Senior Human Resources Analyst.

Class 1053 Senior IS Business Analyst – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On August 8, 2022, an examination announcement was posted for a Class 1053 Senior IS Business Analyst Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status position for the Board of Supervisors. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1053 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

These minimum qualifications establish the education, training, experience, special skills and/or license(s) which are required for employment in the classification. Please note, additional qualifications (i.e., special conditions) may apply to a particular position and will be stated on the exam/job announcement.

- An associate degree in computer science or a closely related field from an accredited college or university OR its equivalent in terms of total course credits/units [i.e., at least sixty (60) semester or ninety (90) quarter credits/units with a minimum of twenty (20) semester or thirty (30) quarter credits/units in computer science or a closely related field].
- Three (3) years in the information systems field, including system analysis, business process design, development and implementation of business application solutions or IT project management.

Substitution:

Additional experience as described above may be substituted for the required degree on a year-for-year basis (up to a maximum of two (2) years). One (1) year is equivalent to thirty (30) semester units/forty-five (45) quarter units with a minimum of ten (10) semester/fifteen (15) quarter units in computer science or a closely related field.

Desired Qualifications (as listed on the position description)

The stated desirable qualifications may be used to identify candidates advancing to the interview process and/or to identify job finalist(s) at the end of the selection process when referred for hiring.

- Bachelor's degree or higher in computer science or related field.
- Proficiency with .NET web development technologies, such as C#, ASP.NET, VB.NET, Web Services, NET Framework (1.1, 2.0, 3.0, and 3.5), and Visual Studio (versions 2003, 2005, 2008).
- Proficiency with HTML and CSS, web development, architecture, and design.
- Experience with configuration and maintenance of web servers.
- Experience with system monitoring tools.
- Experience with virtualization.
- Experience with statistical analysis and reporting.
- Intermediate to expert level of understanding and experience working with Windows Operating Systems, installing, and configuring hardware/software and troubleshooting various issues.

Selection Process

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records.

Certification Rule/Eligible List

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. The eligible list was adopted October 25, 2022. There were eleven (11) ranks with a total of thirty-three (33) eligibles.

Post-Referral Selection Process

On December 22, 2022, a Notice of Inquiry (NOI) with a position description for the BOS Class 1053 position was sent to all thirty-three (33) eligibles on the score report/eligible list. Only four (4) eligibles responded with interest. On January 11, 2023, a Referral Questionnaire which included questions to assess whether eligibles met the desired qualifications was sent to the four (4) interested eligibles/candidates. Only one (1) eligible, Navnit Madhwan, responded. The Clerk of the Board of Supervisors reviewed the candidate's employment application, Referral

Questionnaire and selected the Navnit Madhwan for appointment to the PCS Class 1053 status effective January 21, 2023 (rank #4).

Qualifications of Appointee/Navnit Madhwan to PCS Class 1053

Navnit Madhwan possesses a Bachelor of Science degree in Computer Science; and has over twenty (20) applicable years of external related work experience with various IT companies.

Review of Documents/Findings

The Department of Human Resources Policy on Verifying Possession of Minimum Qualifications states “***Prior to extending an employment offer, hiring departments shall verify information provided by the applicant regarding their qualifying experience.***”

The policy provides specific instructions on “how” and “when” to verify an applicant’s qualifications. To verify work experience earned outside of City and County of San Francisco employment, the hiring authority must contact the candidate’s current and/or former employers to confirm dates of service, job titles(s) and duties performed. ***A record of this contact must be made.***

In general, there are also several documents that can be requested and used to assess employment verification of experience:

- Transcripts, licenses, or certifications
- Standard letters (on letterhead) from employers
- *Performance evaluations that describe duties performed*

To verify external qualifying work experience for the appointee, Navnit Madhwan to Class 1053, BOS submitted a performance evaluation from an external employer for this review. However, the performance appraisal did not indicate any dates of employment and was not signed by the employee and the employee’s manager. The department was then contacted to provide adequate documentation of qualifying experience for the Class 1053 appointment and for the employee’s previous position with BOS since that appointment was the commencement of employment with the City. A performance evaluation with signatures was ultimately provided for this audit which the department used for verification of applicable external work experience for Class 1053.

Regarding the verification of external qualifying work experience for the previous position in Class 1093 IT Operations Support Administrator III, the department’s Senior Human Resources Analyst states that a phone verification was conducted prior to the time of hire with the employee’s external employer by using Equifax. However, the department did not produce the DHR Employment Verification form documenting the information, and as a result of this audit inquiry, the employer letter of verification dated March 2023 was obtained by the employee years after the hire date for that position and produced to the department. The department did not comply with DHR policy by obtaining/documenting verification of employment prior to appointment of the employee in this instance. However, since as a result of this review the late documentation submitted does verify the qualifications of the individual for the initial position of

hire to TEX Class 1093 and subsequent hire to PEX Class 1053 Senior IS Business Analyst. The appointee is qualified for the Class 1053 appointment.

Class 1822 Administrative Analyst – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On July 25, 2022, an examination announcement was posted for a Class 1822 Administrative Analyst Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status position for the BOS. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1822 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

- Possession of a graduate degree (Master's degree or higher) from an accredited college or university; and one (1) year full-time equivalent experience performing professional-level analytical work, as described in Note A; OR
- Possession of a graduate degree (Master's degree or higher) from an accredited college or university with major coursework as described in Note B; OR
- Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university, and two (2) years full-time equivalent experience performing professional-level analytical work as described in Note A; OR
- Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework as described in Note B and one (1) year full-time equivalent experience performing professional-level analytical work as described in Note A;

Substitution:

Applicants may substitute up to 2 years of the required education with additional qualifying experience in budget analysis, financial analysis and reporting, legislative/policy analysis, or contract/grant administration. One year (2000 hours) of additional qualifying experience will be considered equivalent to 30 semester units/45 quarter units.

Notes on Qualifying Experience and Education:

A. Qualifying professional-level analytical experience must be in one or more of the following functional areas: complex budget analysis, development and administration; complex financial/fiscal analysis and reporting; development of complex contracting systems and administration of competitive bid processes and complex contractual agreements; development and evaluation of complex management/administrative policy; complex grant administration and monitoring; complex program evaluation and planning; complex legislative analysis; complex economic analysis; or other functional areas related to the duties of positions in Class 1822, where the primary focus of the job is complex professional-level analysis for evaluation,

recommendation, development and implementation of major programs and functions of department/organization. Analytical experience equivalent to the duties of Class 1820 is considered qualifying.

B. Coursework applicable to a baccalaureate or higher degree in specialized subject matter areas such as public or business administration, management, business law, contract law, public policy, urban studies, economics, statistical analysis, finance, accounting, or other fields of study closely related to the essential functions of positions in Class 1822.

Selection Process

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records.

Certification Rule/Eligible List

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. The eligible list was adopted December 6, 2022. There were nine (9) ranks with a total of forty-two (42) eligibles.

Post-Referral Selection Process

On December 22, 2022, a Notice of Inquiry (NOI) with a position description for the BOS Class 1822 position was sent to all forty-two (42) eligibles on the score report/eligible list. Only three (3) eligibles responded with interest. On January 11, 2023, a Referral Questionnaire was sent to the three (3) eligible candidates to assess whether they met the desired qualifications and to filter out the most qualified eligible candidate. The Deputy Director of Administration and Finance reviewed the de-identified response and selected Jacqueline Hickey as the most qualified candidate to move forward in the selection process. The hiring manager, the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors reviewed Jacqueline Hickey's application and referral response and selected her for appointment to Class 1822 PCS status effective January 21, 2023 (rank #8).

Qualifications of Appointee/Jacqueline Hickey to PCS Class 1822

Jacqueline Hickey possesses a Bachelor of Arts degree in Arts and Sciences from an accredited college/university; and two (2) years' experience in an acting assignment as a Compliance Specialist for the Office of the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for the position/appointment and verification of qualifications was conducted.

DEPARTMENT OF EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT

About the Department of Emergency Management (DEM)

The Department of Emergency Management manages San Francisco's every day and not-so-everyday emergencies. DEM also helps everyone in San Francisco know how to prepare for emergencies, and what to do to be safe during one.

Overview

The Human Resources Manager for the department was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Manager.

Class 0942 Manager VII – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

In October 2022, an examination announcement was posted with a continuous application filing date through November 7, 2022, for a Class 0942 Manager VII Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status position for the Department of Emergency Management. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 0942 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

- Four (4) to six (6) years of managerial experience of which all must include supervisory.
- Possession of a baccalaureate degree from an accredited college or university.

Substitution:

May substitute up to two (2) years of education for baccalaureate degree with additional years of experience (consistent with citywide practice on MQs for professional classifications).

Exception: May fully substitute education with additional years of experience in fields in which incumbents in the feeder classifications typically do not have baccalaureate degrees (e.g., Public Safety, Trades, and IT). Advanced degrees should only be required when mandated by law; may substitute for one year of experience.

Selection Process

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records.

Certification Rule/Eligible List

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. The eligible list was adopted November 16, 2022. There were three (3) ranks with a total of three (3) eligibles.

Post-Referral Selection Process

A Referral Questionnaire was sent to the three (3) eligibles. Only one (1) candidate responded which was Michelle Geddes (rank #1). The hiring manager selected Michelle Geddes for appointment to Class 0942 PCS status effective February 4, 2023.

Qualifications of Appointee/Michelle Geddes to PCS Class 0942

Michelle Geddes possesses a Master of Science in Architecture & Engineering and was in the following classifications at DEM. PEX Class 0942 Manager VII from October 6, 2018 to February 3, 2023; PEX Class 0933 from July 1, 2014 to October 5, 2018; and PCS Class 0931 Manager III from February 9, 2009 to August 18, 2013.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for the position/appointment and verification of qualifications was conducted.

Class 2533 Emergency Medical Services Agency Specialist – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

In October 2022, an examination announcement was posted with a continuous application filing date through November 7, 2022 for a Class 2533 Medical Services Agency Specialist Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status position for the Department of Emergency Management. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 2533 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

- Three (3) years of field or clinical experience as an Emergency Medical Technician-Paramedic (EMT-P) or Registered Nurse.
- Possession of a current, valid license as a Registered Nurse in the State of California or possession of a current valid license as an Emergency Medical Technician-Paramedic (EMT-P) in the State of California.

Selection Process

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records.

Certification Rule/Eligible List

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. The eligible list was adopted November 16, 2022. There was one (1) rank with one (1) eligible on the list.

Post-Referral Selection Process

Only one (1) candidate was on the eligible list. The hiring manager selected Ronald Pike for appointment to Class 2533 PCS status effective January 21, 2023.

Qualifications of Appointee/Ronald Pike to PCS Class 2533

Ronald Pike possesses a current license as an Emergency Medical Technician-Paramedic (EMT-P) in the State of California; and has more than eight (8) years of external work experience as a Paramedic.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for the position/appointment and verification of qualifications was conducted.

DEPARTMENT OF TECHNOLOGY

About the Department of Technology

The Department of Technology provides technology services to City departments and agencies throughout the City and County of San Francisco.

Overview

The Recruitment and Operations Division Director of Human Resources for the General Services Agency/Department of Technology was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Director.

Class 1054 Principal IS Business Analyst - Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On September 30, 2022, an examination announcement was posted for a Class 1054 Principal IS Business Analyst Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status position for the Department of Technology. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a Category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1054 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

- An associate degree in computer science or a closely related field from an accredited college or university OR its equivalent in terms of total course credits/units [i.e., at least sixty (60) semester or ninety (90) quarter credits/units with a minimum of twenty (20) semester or thirty (30) quarter credits/units in computer science or a closely related field].
- Five (5) years of experience in the information systems field, including system analysis, business process design, development and implementation of business application solutions or IT project management.

Special Conditions:

- Twelve (12) months of verifiable Graphic Design experience.
- Thirty-six (36) months of verifiable Web Design, Development and Deployment experience.

Substitution:

Additional experience as described above may be substituted for the required degree on a year-for-year basis (up to a maximum of two (2) years). One (1) year is equivalent to thirty (30)

semester units/forty-five (45) quarter units with a minimum of ten (10) semester/fifteen (15) quarter units in computer science or a closely related field.

Selection Process

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records.

Certification Rule/Eligible List

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. The eligible list was adopted October 13, 2022. There were seven (7) ranks with a total of twenty-one (21) eligibles.

Post-Referral Selection Process

The hiring manager reviewed all of the de-identified applications of the candidates on the eligible list. Adam Cross was selected because he was the only candidate who met the special conditions of twelve (12) months of verifiable Graphic Design experience and thirty-six (36) months of verifiable Web Design, Development and Deployment experience.

Qualifications of Appointee/Adam Cross to PCS Class 1054

Adam Cross was hired with the City in the Department of Technology effective December 4, 2017 to May 3, 2020 in a Temporary Exempt Category 18 Class 1052 IS Business Analyst position. Effective May 4, 2020, to October 30, 2022 he was appointed to Temporary Exempt Category 18 Class 1054 Principal IS Business Analyst. He qualified for the Permanent Civil Service status appointment to Class 1054 effective October 31, 2022 because he met the requirement of the minimum of one year as a Category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1054. His external work experience verified that he also met the qualifications required for his appointments to Class 1052 and 1054. He was ranked #3 on the eligible list and met the special conditions required.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for the position/appointment and verification of qualifications was conducted.

Class 1070 IS Project Director - Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On August 25, 2022, a Citywide examination announcement was posted for a Class 1070 IS Project Director Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status. The Department of Technology had one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1070 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

- An associate degree in computer science or a closely related field from an accredited college or university OR its equivalent in terms of total course credits/units [i.e., at least sixty (60) semester or ninety (90) quarter credits/units with a minimum of twenty (20) semester or thirty (30) quarter credits/units in computer science or a closely related field].
- Seven (7) years of experience in system administration, information systems development, maintenance and support, or information technology project management, including two (2) years of supervisory experience.

Special Conditions:

- Sixty (60) months of verifiable Criminal Justice Technical Application Development experience.
- Sixty (60) months of verifiable Oracle Based Enterprise Project Management experience.

Substitution:

Additional experience as described above may be substituted for the required degree on a year-for-year basis (up to a maximum of two (2) years). One (1) year is equivalent to thirty (30) semester units/forty-five (45) quarter units with a minimum of ten (10) semester/fifteen (15) quarter units in computer science or a closely related field.

Selection Process

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of Category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records.

Certification Rule/Eligible List

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. The eligible list was adopted September 23, 2022. There were seven (7) ranks with a total of thirteen (13) eligibles.

Post-Referral Selection Process

The department's Human Resources Analyst sent referral questionnaires to all thirteen (13) eligibles/candidates. Four (4) candidates submitted their referral questionnaire responses. The hiring manager was provided de-identified applications and the referral questionnaire response for the four (4) candidates to review. Kevin Ling was selected because he was the only candidate who met the special conditions of sixty (60) months of verifiable Criminal Justice Technical Application Development experience and sixty (60) months of verifiable Oracle Based Enterprise Project Management experience.

Qualifications of Appointee/Kevin Ling to PCS Class 1070

Kevin Ling was hired with the City effective June 25, 2012 to May 17, 2020 in a Permanent Exempt Category 18 Class 1064 Principal IS Programmer Analyst position. Effective May 18, 2020, to October 30, 2022 he was appointed to Permanent Exempt Category 18 Class 1070 IS Project Director. He qualified for the Permanent Civil Service status appointment to Class 1070 effective October 31, 2022 because he met the requirement of the minimum of one year as a Category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1070; the required special conditions; and his work experience as a Class 1064 for approximately seven (7) years and eleven (11) months which met the minimum qualifications required for the classification. He was a reachable eligible and ranked #4 on the eligible list.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee is qualified for the Class 1070 and the department verified his qualifications.

SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

About the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC) provides retail drinking water and wastewater services to the City of San Francisco, wholesale water to three Bay Area counties, and green hydroelectric and solar power to our municipal departments.

Overview

The Chief People Officer of Human Resource Services for PUC was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Talent Acquisition Manager.

Class 4310 Commercial Division Assistant Supervisor - Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On September 27, 2022, a job/examination announcement was posted for a Class 4310 Commercial Division Assistant Supervisor- Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service status position for PUC. The closing date for applications was October 12, 2022. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 4310 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

These minimum qualifications establish the education, training, experience, special skills and/or license(s) which are required for employment in the classification. Please note, additional qualifications (i.e., special conditions) may apply to a particular position and will be stated on the exam/job announcement.

- Possession of a bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university with major coursework in Business Administration, Accounting, Finance, Information Systems, Mathematics, or related field; AND
- Three (3) years senior-level work experience in complex billing and collection processing functions.

Substitution: Additional qualifying experience may substitute for the required degree on a year-for-year basis.

OR:

- Three (3) years senior-level clerical experience in customer service or billing and collection in a large utility, public works, government agency, bank, department store, insurance company, credit card company or collections agency. At least one (1) year of this experience must have been in a supervisory capacity. Experience must include the use of data processing methods which analyze customer accounts for either the billing and collection activities or in providing, establishing, and maintaining customer services. Substitution: One (1) year of college or university coursework majoring in business or accounting (i.e., a minimum of thirty (30) semester or equivalent units with at least twelve (12) units in major subject area) may be substituted for one (1) year of senior-level, non-supervisory clerical experience.

Selection Procedures

Six (6) applications were submitted. Only one (1) application was deemed qualified. The five (5) applicants were deemed not qualified because they did not meet the minimum qualifications of a minimum of one year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 4310 by December 15, 2022.

Certification Rule

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. There was only one (1) eligible candidate on the list which was adopted November 16, 2022.

Post-Referral Selection Process

The hiring manager decided to hire the sole candidate on the eligible list – Lakisha Austin because the employee has “journey” level experience working with PUC in the Class 4310 and the department had already utilized their resources to train and integrate the employee into the department.

Qualifications of Appointee/Lakisha Austin to PCS Class 4310

Lakisha Austin has approximately twenty-two (22) years of qualifying experience which includes approximately ten (10) years of external work experience; ten (10) years in Class 1478 Utility Services Representative with PUC; one (1) year and four (4) months in Class 1480 Utility Services Representative Supervisor and two (2) years in Class 4310 PEX category 18.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for this class and work experience was verified.

Class 5322 Graphic Artist - Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On September 27, 2022 an examination announcement was posted for a Class 5322 Graphic Artist Permanent Exempt (category 18) to Permanent Civil Service Civil Service status position for PUC. The closing date for applications was October 11, 2022. There was one (1) approved vacancy.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 5322 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

These minimum qualifications establish the education, training, experience, special skills and/or license(s) which are required for employment in the classification.

- Possession of an Associate in Arts degree (two-year degree) from an accredited college or university with coursework in graphic art or design.
- General Specialty: One (1) year of professional experience in graphic art or web design.
OR
- Forensic Specialty: One (1) year of professional experience as an artist specializing in human portraits of a diverse population.

Selection Procedures

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of Category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records. A total of eighteen (18) applications were submitted. Only one (1) applicant met the minimum qualifications required.

Certification Rule

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. There was only one (1) eligible candidate on the list which was adopted November 16, 2022.

Post-Referral Selection Process

The hiring manager decided to hire the sole candidate on the eligible list – Anthony Cauilan. The department had also already utilized their resources to train and integrate the employee into the department.

Qualifications of Appointee/Anthony Cauilan to PCS Class 5322

Anthony Cauilan possesses a Bachelor degree in Art/Design Studies and has over four (4) years of qualifying work experience.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for this class and work experience was verified.

PORT OF SAN FRANCISCO

About the Port of San Francisco

The Port of San Francisco manages 7.5 miles of waterfront that is home to popular destinations and attractions, historic districts, small businesses, and robust maritime opportunities. The Port works to advance environmentally and financially sustainable maritime, recreational, and economic opportunities for the City, Bay Area, and California.

Overview

The Human Resources Manager for the PORT was contacted for participation in the Merit System Audit Program. The audit review was conducted with the assistance of the Human Resources Manager.

Class 9251 Public Relations Manager – Permanent Civil Service (PCS) Status

Job/Examination Announcement

On November 1, 2022, a job/examination announcement was posted for a Class 9251 Public Relations Manager - Permanent Exempt to Permanent Civil Service status position (category 18) for the Port of San Francisco. The filing deadline was November 15, 2022. The announcement was re-published on December 7, 2022, to allow an employee from a City department to apply.

Minimum Qualifications for this Recruitment

- A minimum of one (1) year as a category 18 exempt appointee in Class 1070 by December 15, 2022. Must be a current exempt employee with the City and County of San Francisco with no break in service.

Underlying Minimum Qualifications

These minimum qualifications establish the education, training, experience, special skills and/or license(s) which are required for employment in the classification.

- Possession of a Bachelor of Arts or Science degree in Journalism, Public Relations, Communications, Public Administration, Political Science, Sociology, or a field related to a department's business from an accredited college or university;
AND
- Five (5) years of experience in public affairs, public/media relations, community relations, international relations, or a related field;
And
- Possession of a valid Class C California driver's license.
- For positions at the PORT, employees must be insurable under the PORT's automobile liability insurance. Insurability must be maintained throughout employment.

Substitution:

Additional qualifying work experience may be substituted for the required education on a year-for-year basis.

Selection Procedures

Qualified applicants were ranked on the eligible list according to length of Category 18 exempt City service and any other qualifying points such as promotive or Veteran's preference in accordance with Civil Service Commission rules. Work history was verified through City records. Two (2) applications were submitted.

Certification Rule

The certification rule used for the eligible list/score report resulting from the examination/selection process was Rule of The List. There was only two (2) eligible candidates on the list who were rank #1.

Post-Referral Selection Process

The hiring manager decided to hire Kirsten Southey (rank #1) without conducting interviews due to her work experience with the PORT in PEX Class 9251 since July 27, 2019. Her appointment to PCS status in Class 9251 was effective January 21, 2023.

Qualifications of Appointee/Kirsten Southey to PCS Class 9251

Kirsten Southey possesses a Bachelor of Arts degree in Psychology and has applicable work experience as a PEX Class 1314 Public Relations Officer with the PORT from October 8, 2016 to July 26, 2019; and PEX Class 0887 Mayoral Staff VII from July 23, 2012 to October 7, 2016.

Review of Documents/Findings

The appointee meets the qualifications for this class and work experience was verified.