



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
May 1, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2591 344 9620. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN**

**USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2591 344 9620 | followed by password # 27230  
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**DOUGLAS CHAN**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2591 344 9620 followed by password #27230.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:10 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner Douglas S. Chan	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

**REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)**

Sophie Huston, RN – clinical RN in the community since 1999; filed complaints with DPH EEO and the Labor Team and waiting for any response or results; suffered severe bullying, harassment, and retaliation in urgent care and the clinics; loss of income related to reduced scheduling and bullying; over the last 5 years, 6 nurses, who have suffered bullying and harassment, filed complaints with supervisors and went through the EEO process.

Tia Paneet, RN – 5 years as a nurse with DPH in the community and ambulatory care; suffered bullying, harassment, and adverse employment action; filed EEO complaint and continued to experience retaliation as the City failed to reinforce its' own policy; still waiting for EEO to follow-up on her complaint.

Ninfa Alvarez Pleites, Retired RN – employed at DPH from 1984 – 2021; reported patient and staff abuse to the supervisor and took these issues further to human resources, but the concerns were bounced back to the administrative team; witnessed staff of color being treated dismissively and disrespectfully from administration; had to retire because administration and human resources made no changes except for conducting trainings; human resources and administration did not follow their own policies, especially management;

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of April 17, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer announced that Item No. 9 PSC #42725-22/23 by HSS has been withdrawn.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT (Item No. 5)**

Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources (DHR), reported on the E2P program – they have recently made 332 permanent appointments from 152 eligible lists; there are 158 active referrals, 56 permanent appointments of Category 18 employees through other processes, and 546 Category 18 transitions; Classes 1820 and 1822 CBT online/on-demand testing program was launched last Thursday. This is the first in a series of continuous class-based tests. 1820 Junior Administrative Analyst has a vacancy rate of 40%. As a result, DHR is opening up the recruitment process for college graduates within 6 months or graduates with an associate degree with experience to compete and participate in the selection process contingent upon degree confirmed. 1820 and 1822 prior applicants are in the outreach group to participate in this new process. Using recruitment aggregators for outreach and partnering with Controllers Office and other City departments websites.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT**

**0096-23-1 Processing and Scheduling of Appeals Before the Civil Service Commission. (Item No. 6)**

**Action:** Continued to the meeting of June 5, 2023. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0087-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
43590 - 22/23	Board of Supervisors	\$540,000	The Office of the Clerk of the Board (COB) seeks a vendor to enhance or replace the current aging and costly Legislative Management System (LMS) with a state-of-the-art solution to effectively address mandated requirements, streamline legislative workflow, and meet stakeholder expectations. The COB will adopt a legislative system that will streamline the process of 1) drafting, submitting, and accessing status of legislation, 2) developing and managing public meeting agendas and minutes, 3) ensuring the integrity and retention of legislative records, 4) providing a legislative drafting tool for city departments, and 5) providing a public portal accessible to the public for tracking legislation. The LMS would not only support the core business of the Board of Supervisors, but all City Departments and agencies that submit and recommend legislation and/or amendments. The technology solution will be developed, implemented, and supported through a software development and support agreement with the Contractor and internal COB IT staff.	Regular	8/31/2028
42173 - 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$500,000	San Francisco Chained Activity Modeling Process (SF-CHAMP) is the official transportation modeling tool for San Francisco and is certified as compliant with the Regional Transportation Plan by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC). San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) seeks the services of a consultant for the care, maintenance, and updates of SF-CHAMP, the San Francisco travel forecasting software program, in order to implement new relevant features, reporting tools, and up-to-date assumptions about travel behavior. Consultant will analyze the SFMTA transportation impacts on potential land use, employment, housing, transit service, and transportation infrastructure changes and provide as-needed travel demand monitoring.	Regular	3/31/2028
42708 - 22/23	Police	\$360,000	The contractor will provide factory certified technicians to manage print services for 632 Hewlett Packard (HP) and Canon printers and 4 plotters for the San Francisco Police Department (SFPD) at 32 City locations. The contractor will provide timely service, parts, toner, toner cartridge recycling and printer utilization reports for 65 different HP models.	Regular	3/30/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49799 - 22/23	Public Health	\$1,000,000	Contractor will compile and generate reports that meet Provider and County reporting and reconciliation requirements to manage capitated and fee-for-service managed care plans for Inpatient and Outpatient specialty mental health and substance use disorder Programs' service claims, adjustments, and corrections; and, for data needed to prepare Fiscal Year Cost Reports, to benchmark performance, monitor budgets, and for other, various, reporting purposes.	Regular	6/30/2027
41953 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$300,000	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) is seeking an auditor to provide post-enrollment verification (PEV) program design, auditing, and communication with and support for low-income and historically marginalized communities navigating audit processes. The primary role of the auditor will be to design the PEV programs for the SFPUC Customer Assistance Program (CAP) and SuperGreen Saver; conduct outreach, customer support, and document review for annual PEV for Water/Wastewater and Hetch Hetchy Power CAP and SuperGreen Saver; and train SFPUC staff to conduct PEVs in the future. The auditor will work under the direction of SFPUC Business Services and the Audit Bureau.	Regular	6/30/2026
43899 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$1,000,000	Wastewater Enterprise will be purchasing two trailers for an approximate cost of \$1,000,000. The service amount from the total purchase amount is estimated at \$150,000, which is attributed to the installation of these trailers by the trailer manufacturer. The work includes delivery of the trailer; block and leveling; install foundation tiedowns, custom ramp and wood skirting.	Regular	12/15/2024
45463 - 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$300,000	The purpose of this contract is to provide technical support and data analysis for system performance evaluation, operational protocol recommendations, equipment performance assessment, membrane cleaning training and assistance, instrumentation calibration and maintenance services and operator training of the Biwater Reverse Osmosis equipment at the Wastewater Enterprise (WWE) Oceanside Water Pollution Control Plant (OSP) Recycled Water Treatment Facility for the City and County of San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC).	Regular	9/1/2026
43603 - 22/23	Public Works	\$150,000	Support the Operations division of SF Public Works in implementing the action items from the SF Public Works Racial Equity Action Plan, Phase One (2021) by 1) developing and supporting a racial equity working group of about 15 frontline staff from Operations; 2) supporting the Operations Racial Equity Working Group in developing policy, procedures and communications recommendations to further racial equity in Operations' workplaces; leading racial equity trainings at Operations for the Working Group and other key staff.	Regular	4/1/2026
49077 - 22/23	Public Works	\$3,500,000	Public Works is seeking a qualified Architectural and Engineering (A/E) team led by an executive architect to provide design and engineering services in assisting the City with the San Francisco Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH) Shelter project located at 1001 Polk Street, San Francisco, CA. This project will seismically retrofit an existing congregate shelter and convert it into a renovated family shelter with 40 family rooms, and a congregate space for an additional 40 individuals. The Consultant Team is to be integrated with the City Team to deliver specialty design and engineering consultant services for the project.	Regular	5/26/2032
45005 - 22/23	Department of Technology	\$55,000,000	The current Citywide Microsoft Enterprise License Agreement (ELA) will expire on August 31, 2023. The Department of Technology intends to conduct a new solicitation to procure licenses for the continued use of Microsoft products. The Microsoft products consist of software, software maintenance, hardware and software-as-a-service (SaaS). There will be no professional services or labor of any kind in the solicitation or final contract. This request is being submitted solely at the direction of the Civil Service Commission and OCA as it pertains to software maintenance, hardware maintenance and software-as-a-service.	Regular	8/31/2026

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
43103 - 18/19	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$200,000 New Total Amount Requested \$700,000	The Transportation Security Administration (TSA) under federal regulation Part 1542 and the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) under federal regulation Part 139 requires the Airport to provide security and safety trainings to airlines, tenants, vendors, constructors and government employees in order to receive an airport security badge and operate in the Airport environment. The Contractor will update and develop computer-based training (CBT) course content for security and safety training modules in Security Identification Display Area (SIDA), Security Awareness, Authorized Signatory, Non-Movement Driving in Air Operations Area, Movement Driving in Air Operations Area, Fueling, Escort Privileges, and Passenger Boarding/Jet Bridge courses. The Contractor will also provide maintenance to the operating software/system of the CBT known as iLS (Instructional Learning System), update course content and develop additional program as required by regulatory changes.	Modification	6/30/2028
47501 - 16/17	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$350,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$50,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$400,000,000	Project Management Support Services (PMSS) and Design-Build (DB) service teams with airport design and management expertise are required to manage the design and construction of the Terminal 2 (T2) to Terminal 3 (T3) Secure Connector Project (Project). Services to be provided include project controls, scheduling, document control, design management, contracts management, architectural and engineering design services, and construction of the project. The scope of work of this Project includes, 1) the design and construction of a new, elevated, secure connector for passengers to efficiently and securely connect between T2 and T3, and 2) an associated building addition that will provide additional square footage for passenger amenities, lounge areas, and airline or other tenant office space. To accommodate the new building addition, the Project will relocate the Airport's Emergency Operations Center and Communication Center. Both are critical to safe and secure airport operations and neither can be out of service for any period of time. Relocation of these facilities includes complex infrastructure modifications and specialized handling of equipment. Additionally, work related to airport security systems, airfield geometry and aircraft systems will be required for the new build out and this Project will facilitate systems connections and the future installation of new baggage handling system transfer line between the terminals. Sustainable growth and continuing the San Francisco International Airport (Airport) leadership in the Green House Gas (GHG) reduction and achieving a minimum for a Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) Gold Certification will be requirements. Sustainable building practices for The Project will consist of being Net Zero ready including but not limited to energy, carbon and waste. The PMSS portion will be approximately \$20,000,000. The DB portion will be approximately \$260,000,000 which includes approximately \$20,000,000 for design and \$240,000,000 for construction.	Modification	1/31/2027
48369 - 17/18	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$2,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$0 New Total Amount Requested \$2,000,000	The proposed work is an overnight bus service to and from the San Francisco International Airport (SFO) between Millbrae BART and Caltrain stations, and all local bus stops on Route 292 between downtown San Francisco and south to Palo Alto. This is a late night bus service that operates 7 days per week between the hours of 12:45 a.m. and 6:00 a.m. Additionally, SamTrans will provide emergency replacement bus service when Airtrain is shut down due to unforeseen circumstances.	Modification	6/30/2028

**0087-23-8 Continued**

**Speakers:** Belle Macaranas and Sherry Katz spoke on PSC #49077-22/23  
 Jolie Gines and Wilfred Dere spoke on PSC 45005-22/23

**Action:**

- 1) Approved PSC #49077-22/23 from the Department of Public Works with the condition to report back to the Commission in five (5) years. (Vote of 5 to 0)
- 2) Approved PSC #45005-22/23 from the Department of Technology. (Vote of 5 to 0)
- 3) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0092-23-3 Salary Survey for Registered Nurse Classifications. (Item No. 8)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report; Certify to the Board of Supervisors for the Acute Care Nursing Classifications the highest prevailing salary schedules in the six Bay Area counties (Public & Private) in effect on April 15, 2023. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0076-23-8 Appeal by SEIU Local 1021 of the Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract Numbers 42725-22/23 and 47934-22/23 . (File No.) – (Item No. 9)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42725 – 22/23	Health Service System	\$1,383,200	Temporary as-needed on-site professional telephonic call-center support for Active and Retired Members of the San Francisco Health Service System.	Regular	12/31/2024
47934 – 22/23	Health Service System	\$615,600	Request for Proposal (RFP) for As-needed Off-site Call-Center Support for the San Francisco Health Service System Member Services Unit.	Regular	12/31/2024

**April 17, 2023:** Postponed to a future meeting at the request of Health Service System.

**Speakers:** Abbie Yant, Health Services System  
 Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021

**Public Comment:** Geraldine Cerda  
 Ruby Diaz

**Action:** The Civil Service Commission adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract #47934-22/23 with the condition to report back to the Commission in one (1) year; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 1; Commissioner F.X. Crowley dissented.) PSC # 42725-22/23 was withdrawn by the Health Service System.

**0088-23-8 Review of Personal Services Contract Number 10915-22/23 from the Arts Commission. (Item No. 10)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
10915 - 22/23	Arts Commission	\$100,000,000	Fine art services and consulting for artworks in the collection and care of the City and County of San Francisco. Scope of work may include the handling, transportation, conservation, restoration, cleaning, packing, sorting, storing, framing, photography, installation, and de-installation of artworks including those of monumental scale. Services also include the design and fabrication of integral hardware, pedestals, cases, and plaques. Additionally, there are specialized consulting services to evaluate the condition of existing and proposed artworks.	Continuing	<i>Continuous</i>

**April 17, 2023:** Continued PSC #10915-22/23 from the Arts Commission to the meeting of May 1, 2023.

**Speakers:** Kevin Quan, Arts Commission

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0089-23-8 Status Report on Airport Personal Service Contract Number 48319-18/19. (Item No. 11)**

**Speakers:** Cynthia Avakian, Airport

**Action:** Accepted the report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0090-23-8 Review of Personal Services Contract Number 48916-17/18 from the Public Utilities Commission– Omit Posting. (Item No. 12)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
48916-17/18	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$289,160 Increased Amount Requested \$400,000 New Total Amount Requested \$689,160	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission ("SFPUC") is headquartered at 525 Golden Gate Avenue in San Francisco, California. The building's Lutron Quantum Lighting Control and Energy Management System ("Lutron Lighting System") installed by Webcor on or about 2012 at a cost of approximately \$3,325,000, is manufactured by Lutron Electric Inc. ("Lutron Electric"). The Lutron Lighting System is a highly technical and proprietary system that provides total light management by bringing together the most complete line of lighting controls, digital ballasts, LED drivers, and sensors together under one software umbrella. Since its installation in 2012, SFPUC has not been able to secure a contract by which to maintain its Lutron Lighting System. At this time, we have negotiated a five year contract with Maltby Electric Supply Co. Inc. ("Maltby"), the only entity authorized by the system's manufacturer, to provide the system maintenance services required for the system to continue operating properly. The services will consist of: Software Upgrade Services, Annual System Support Service and As-Needed Technical Support. Please see attached documents for details regarding scope of each type of service. This purchase has been authorized by the Office of Contract Administration under Section 21.30 of the San Francisco Administrative Code.	Modification	5/31/28

**0090-23-8 Continued**

**Speakers:** Chris Anderson, Public Utilities Commission

**Action:** Adopted the report. Approved the request for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0091-23-4 Response to Vice President Favetti inquiry on the status of 2908 Senior Eligibility Worker Hiring at San Francisco Department of Public Health. (Item No. 13)**

**Speakers:** Jennifer Magnusson, Department of Public Health

**Action:** Adopted the report of the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0010-23-4 Appeal by Vincent Chu of the Rejection of Application for 7371 Electrical Transit System Mechanic (CBT-7371-T00040). (Item No. 14)**

**Speakers:** Shivani Nath, Municipal Transportation Agency  
Vincent Chu, Appellant  
William Miles, Municipal Transportation Agency

**Action:** Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Vincent Chu. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 15)**

Commissioner Jacqueline Minor requested the following: 1) the status of the Equal Employment Opportunity Complaints/Whistleblower Complaints made by the nurses who submitted public comment; 2) as the Commission is conducting a post-pandemic review of operations to look at efficiencies and opportunities for streamlining particularly employment and retention challenges, calendar an agenda item for a hearing to get direct input from stakeholders including departments, unions, and employees on what rules are impeding the hiring process and what rules could expedite the hiring process; and 3) Calendar on the agenda a hearing to get direct input from stakeholders on how can we streamline the Civil Service Commission's personal service contract approval process so we can be more efficient and productive. Commission Minor requested that these items be scheduled as quickly as possible and to provide adequate notice.

Commissioner Kate Favetti requested a timeline of selection from eligible list from the post-referral process to appointment including the background and medical examination process and how to streamline that process.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 16)**

5:01 p.m.