



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

**MINUTES  
Regular Meeting  
April 3, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2594 190 9960. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN**

**USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: #2594 190 9960 | followed by password # 27230  
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference  
Dial \*3 when you are ready to queue**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**DOUGLAS CHAN**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code #2594 190 9960 followed by password #27230.

(1) **CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Excused Absence
Commissioner Douglas S. Chan	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salveson	present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided the meeting.

(2) **REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA**

(3) **APPROVAL OF MINUTES** - Action Item

Regular Meeting of March 20, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 4 to 0)

(4) **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

None.

(5) **HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director reported on three (3) items: 1) E2P campaign – examination and appointment process, with appointments and referrals now at approximately 470, adopted 151 eligible lists with over 1100 candidates. Approaching 50% mark of the candidates being offered permanent appointments, many of them sitting on temporary exempt positions. Thank the Commission for its support and all participating departments. 2) Working with SEIU 1021 and IFPTE Local 21 on the entire administrative analyst series (1820, 1822, 1823, 1824, and 1825), have reached an agreement with SEIU to update the qualifications for the 1820 and 1822 classifications, especially pleased with the changes we are posting today. In the 1820 class, one (1) year experience was required to qualify to participate in the examination selection process for this classification, it has been the goal of DHR to make City employment much more welcoming to recent college graduates or those who have relative work experience. In the 1820 class DHR is removing the one (1) year experience required and removing specific coursework required, an applicant will need to have a

bachelor's degree. This is the last step before DHR can begin using continuous class-based testing for Rule of the List. As for promotive positions in class 1823 and 1824 DHR is still in discussion with Local 21 about these classifications. 3) Civil Service rule changes – meet and confer process is underway, holding a series of information meetings to explain the rule changes, based on those meetings only four (4) unions have expressed an interest in continuing to have discussion with the meet and confer team. Held five (5) informational meetings to date, all the unions are satisfied with the changes with the exception of SEIU, Local 21, Local 1414 (Machinists) and the Managing Sheriff’s Association. Still in the informational stage, if talks end up in bargaining, in order to update the Commission will need to request closed session. Will have more information after another round with unions who have expressed continuing interest.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)**

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer reported on the hurdles the Civil Service Commission (CSC) is experiencing with the budget for FY2023-24 We received some feedback from the Mayor’s Budget Office (MBO) Due to the large citywide budget shortfall and because the CSC was not able to meet the budget reduction targets MBO was unable to approve the substitution of the 1426 to 1244. Initially we just requested the 1244, the MBO did not approve that request. We offered a substitution of the vacant 1426 position and that too was rejected. The MBO suggested we delete the 1426 position, however our 1426 incumbent is on leave to a temporary exempt 1241 position. Therefore, we were asked to keep the 1426 vacant for salary savings and the \$70K increase in work order from PUC and MTA was reverted because the 1244 requested was not approved. We did not want the workorders removed because the requested work is still being performed by our office even though the additional position was not approved, CSC is still expected to support expedited hiring practices, racial equity and departments in litigations, unfair labor practices, while continuing to meet with the unions on issues within departments that involve CSC Rules.

**0058-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)**

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
43155 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$350,000	Contractor will work closely with Animal Care & Control (ACC) staff to provide as-needed veterinary dental treatments to animals that are in ACC’s care. The dental care services are for dogs and cats only. Nearly 85% of dogs and cats over two years of age have some degree of dental disease. Many of the dogs and cats that are impounded at the shelter have moderate to severe dental disease that impacts the animal’s quality of life and their likelihood of adoption or ability to be transferred to a partner agency. Veterinary dental care must be performed by a specialized registered veterinary technician at ACC when there is a veterinarian on-site to supervise the care. Care will be provided during regular business hours, Sunday through Friday, from 8am to 5pm.	Regular	7/15/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
46270 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$250,000	The proposed work of the vendor will be to take requests for American Sign Language (ASL) interpreter services, provide interpreters upon request, match the skills of interpreters with the specific requests, track and bill for requests. American Sign Language (ASL) is a complete, natural language that has the same linguistic properties as spoken languages, with grammar that differs from English. ASL is expressed by movements of the hands and face. It is the primary language of many North Americans who are deaf and hard of hearing and is used by some hearing people as well. ASL interpreters provide specialized language services to the ASL users. Services will be as needed.	Regular	3/2/2028
43631 - 22/23	Public Works	\$6,500,000	This request is for design-build services for the design and construction of a tiny home housing community on 1979 Mission Street. Public Works is managing this work on behalf of our client, the Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing under the emergency order.	Regular	3/6/2025
46763 - 22/23	Economic and Workforce Development	\$5,000,000	As required by a State grant, these services are in furtherance of Bay Area regional economic and workforce development planning in response to changing economic conditions from the COVID-19 pandemic. OEWD requires third-party support for stakeholder engagement of Bay Area regional economic and workforce development partners and community members in compliance with the California Community Economic Resilience Fund program goals and outcomes. Third-party support will be required for convening and facilitating regional Bay Area economic and workforce development stakeholders and sub-regional stakeholders within each Bay Area county; coordinating regional economic and workforce stakeholders and project goals across the Bay Area and sub-regions; and economic and workforce program development services, including but not limited to technical assistance, research and evaluation, and system design services.	Regular	12/31/2026
49091-22/23	Public Health	\$800,000	Contractor qualified will provide the San Francisco Department of Public Health (DPH) with 24 hour technical support, proprietary software support and upgrades and onsite support for the existing security system to ensure that the System, as defined below, remains continuously operating in good condition for which it was designed, improved, constructed, altered, or repaired, at various sites within DPH. Maintenance Definition: Routine, recurring, and usual work for the preservation, protection and keeping of any publicly owned facility for its intended purposes in a safe and continually usable condition for which it was designed, improved, constructed, altered or repaired. As part of "usual work for preservation" of the System, Maintenance shall include comprehensive Systems assessments, including System documentation, System growth needs, System deficiencies if any, and System, gap analysis at periodic times requested by City and agreed to by Contractor. In General, the System includes:1. Headend servers located at Zuckerberg San Francisco General Hospital (ZSFGH); 2. Security Operations Center at ZSFGH, which monitors and responds to device and closed circuit television (CCTV) alarms; and 3. A badging station at ZSFG. The complete System is comprised of an access/alarm system and a video management system which integrate with each other. The system is currently comprised of eight active sites with a roadmap to add additional sites over the duration of this contract with at least six additional sites currently identified. Maintenance services will be provided for the eight current sites. Additional sites will be quoted by the vendor as they come online. The Contractor will maintain those sites as required at an additional cost to the City.	Regular	12/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
49399-22/23	Public Health	\$500,000	The Department of Justice (DOJ) of the State of California, has awarded a contract for prescription data collection services for the Controlled Substance Utilization Review System (CURES). Specifically, the contractor will provide their Prescription Drug Monitoring Clearinghouse solution gateway (PMP Gateway) and analytical reporting service (Narxcare) to The Department. This solution allows integration of DOJ's CURES system with our hospital's Electronic Health Records System, which will provide real time Prescription Drug Monitoring Program (PDMP) Data at the Point-of-Care, provide automated PDMP searches, one location queries for individual patients, multi-state PDMP data, and full transparency into prescription transactions. As the DOJ awarded contractor, supports these processes effectively through its proprietary solution, and helps our Department comply with the California Health & Safety Code section 11165(d).	Regular	2/28/2026
45026-22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$600,000	After-hour roving security to make rounds in the town of Sunol between the Sunol Yard, the Storage Yard, and the San Antonio Pump Station – all locations within several miles of each other. The Storage Yard and San Antonio Pump Station will require a thorough drive through to look for vandalism, perimeter fencing, gates and door intrusion into the facility and loitering. The Sunol Yard will require perimeter fence and gate inspections for intrusion, walking the perimeter of the buildings and scanning a badge at a few exterior doors while looking for any intrusion and vandalism. This service is expected to last until the security apparatus in the Yard is fully upgraded, including exterior lighting and camera systems. It is anticipated that this will occur by the middle of 2024; although it may take up to an additional year to complete installation.	Regular	4/30/2026
46193-22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$300,000	The purpose of this contract is to provide annual maintenance, inspection, calibration and as-needed repair services for the electrical equipment and instrumentation and control system at the Wastewater Enterprise (WWE) Oceanside Water Pollution Control Plant (OSP) Recycled Water Treatment Facility for the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC). Work under this contract includes maintenance of the motor control centers (MCC), variable frequency drives (VFD), reduced voltage soft starters (RVSS), control panels, programmable logic controllers (PLC), remote telemetry units (RTU), flowmeters, transmitters and analyzers.	Regular	9/3/2027
47313-22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$8,000,000	Emergency Firefighting Water System (EFWS), historically referred to as the Auxiliary Water Supply System (AWSS), is an independent high pressure water supply system dedicated to fire protection. It was installed in 1913 in response to the Great Earthquake and Fire of 1906 and consists of a 135-mile-long pipeline network, a high elevation reservoir with two large capacity tanks, two pumping stations, three fireboats and underground water storage tanks (cisterns). The selected Consultant will work under the direction of the SFPUC to provide planning and engineering design services for the EFWS and City's Water Distribution System pipelines. Some assignments may require SFPUC engineering staff to be integrated into the consultant project team. The Consultant's work objective will be to perform planning and engineering design services applying all applicable codes and SFPUC Procedures and regulatory requirements/guidelines administered by the State Water Resources Control Board, Division of Drinking Water. Projects are expected to pertain to pipelines, pump stations and fireboat manifold systems.	Regular	9/1/2031

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
38576-22/23	City Administrator	Current Approved Amount \$67,500 Increase Amount Requested \$532,500 New Total Amount Requested \$600,000	This is a request for as-needed, intermittent, after-hours, weekend and holiday emergency veterinary services. Services are needed between 5:30 pm and 8:30 am, which are the hours when Animal Care & Control (ACC) veterinary staff is off-duty. In addition, services may be needed on holidays between 8:30 am and 5:30 pm when City veterinary staff may not be on duty. The vendor may also accept custody animals from San Francisco Police Department responding to incidents involving animals where the owner/guardian is unavailable (e.g., in the hospital) or when the animal requires impound for safety purposes (stray, nuisance). The vendor will maintain medical records to ACC on each animal and transmit them electronically.	Modification	7/15/2028
36452-19/20	Economic and Workforce Development	Current Approved Amount \$200,000 Increase Amount Requested \$50,000 New Total Amount Requested \$250,000	The Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) received a training cost reimbursement grant from the California Employment Training Panel (ETP). In order for OEWD to be reimbursed for these costs, training information and data must be reported on a monthly basis to the ETP. A contract was secured to submit this data on behalf of OEWD through ETP's online system in prior years and successfully secured reimbursement for the Department. This service is essential to ensure that OEWD can continue to receive reimbursement for the training services.	Modification	6/30/2025
46332-20/21	Public Library	Current Approved Amount \$95,000 Increase Amount Requested \$200,000 New Total Amount Requested \$295,000	Library seeks a qualified vendor to provide an 18-credit, career-based online high school diploma program for students to earn an accredited high school diploma plus a career certificate. The scope of services includes online assessment to identify potential students; customized program implementation training for library staff facilitators working directly with the students; student coaching (online and by phone); student recruiting and marketing support, curriculum including 18 credits (14 academic and 4 career); coursework in language arts, social studies, mathematics, and science, plus career electives offering eight career tracks, evaluate student transcripts and give course credit where appropriate, provide high school diplomas for graduates, and provide transcripts for students and graduates upon request. The Contractor shall be required to enroll and educate as follows: • up to 25 students during the first year, • up to 25 students during the second year (50 total students) • up to 25 students during the third year (75 total students). <b>Scope Change:</b> The City is looking for a vendor who can provide an online high school education program (the Program), fully accessible via website on a computer or mobile device, through which enrolled students can earn a high school diploma accredited by one or more of the following recognized organizations (the Agencies): Cognia; Middle States Association; New England Association; Western Association. Contractor must maintain its accreditation by one of the Agencies, without any lapses, for the length of the contract. Contractor must offer a diploma fully accredited by one of the Agencies to all students who successfully complete the requirements under the Program. Contractor shall provide student registration services; orientation information for students; online and telephone academic support and coaching for enrolled students; technical support to access the Program for enrolled students and library staff; and curriculum and graduation materials to students, including certified transcripts and a copy of their high school diploma, if applicable. Within the three-year term of this Agreement, Contractor shall be required to enroll and educate up to 120 San Francisco Public Library students for the term of the contract. Upon expiration of this Agreement or for any reason it should terminate before the Agreement's expiration date, Contractor shall allow any already-enrolled students up to their full enrollment time period to complete the program and be awarded diplomas.	Modification	1/31/2032

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
4045 – 11/12	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$846,500 Increase Amount Requested \$240,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,086,500	The contractor will provide helicopters and certified pilots to provide as needed services including: Aerial surveying and patrol services to support the maintenance of the power transmission system; transportation services for emergency repairs of infrastructure to areas not accessible all year; transportation to San Francisco Public Utilities Commission(SFPUC) and Hetch Hetchy Water and Power facilities in the event of unforeseen disasters or emergencies; and, priority shuttle service between the SFPUC facilities in the Sierra Nevada and the Bay Area.	Modification	9/30/2025
49868-17/18	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$9,700,000 Increase Amount Requested \$7,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$16,700,000	The primary scope of work is to design conveyance infrastructure to alleviate flooding for a susceptible portion of the City. Work will consist of engineering design and construction support for San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC's) Folsom Area Stormwater Improvement Project. This includes up to 4,000 linear feet of approximately 12' inside diameter tunnel from Alameda and Treat Streets to approximately 7th and Berry Streets, launching and receiving shafts, and all related site investigation work (e.g., geotechnical and hazardous material).	Modification	2/1/2028

**Speakers:** Jenny Collins and Jennifer Hand from the Economic and Workforce Development spoke on PSC #46763-22/23.  
 David Woodland from the Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #49094-22/23.  
 Ramon Garcia from the Public Utilities Commission spoke on PSC #47313-22/23.  
 Marcus Lange and Alice Chan from the SF Public Library spoke on PSC #46332-20/21.

- Action:**
- 1) Approved PSC #46763-22/23 from the Economic and Workforce Development. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 2) Approved PSC #49091-22/23 from the Department of Public Health with the condition to report back in three (3) years. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 3) Approved PSC #47313-22/23 from the Public Utilities Commission with the condition to report back in four (4) years. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 4) Approved PSC #46332-20/21 from the SF Public Library with the condition to report progress in four (4) years. (Vote of 4 to 0)
  - 5) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**0059-23-1 Status of 2320 Registered Nurse Hiring at San Francisco Department of Public Health. (Item No. 8)**

**Speakers:** Luenna Kim, Department of Public Health  
 Christina Bloom, Department of Public Health  
 Scott DeWolfe, Department of Public Health  
 Kim Walden, Department of Public Health  
 Dr. Richa Dhanju, Department of Public Health

**Public Comment:** Dana Pullman  
 Lilly Gong  
 Aaron Cramer

**Action:** Adopted the report. The Department of Public Health will report back to the Civil Service Commission in six (6) months. (Vote of 4 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 9)**

President Jacqueline P. Minor in view of the proposed budget, I would like to make a request that we convene something for our Commission similar to government operations work that is being done citywide to specifically look at processes and procedures by the Commission to ensure that not only do we have efficiencies and that we've updated our own internal procedures, but also that we take into consideration that it is likely for the next couple of years our staff will be quite diminished because of the inability to create a new 1244 position and the vacancy in the 1426 position. This whole idea of looking for efficiencies can be so inefficient; how do you go about doing that? President Minor has noted a couple of things that she continues to wonder about and will tick off a couple of things to get us started. It is possible for us to agendaize these items so that each commissioner will have a chance to contribute.

A couple of things to note –

- 1) Policy of asking departments if a contract is more than five (5) years to do an interim report, that requires tracking by our staff, follow-up by the departments, requires departments to come back and generate a report, etc. Request to consider whether or not we actually need a check-in after four (4) years. There may be good a reason for it historically and otherwise.
- 2) Another recurring question is “standing”, who has standing to file complaints with the commission? Very few quasi-judicial bodies operate without some understanding that the person who is complaining has to be personally aggrieved; let us to take a look at that. We have not closed out on Professor Gould's recommendation that our commission consider using hearing officers and so we probably need to make a final decision to remove that off of our plate.
- 3) One further thing from a prior meeting to the extent we have a backlog of restrictions that will come forward we should look at the rules to be certain we have rules in place to deal with restrictions that for some reason got caught up in a pipeline, didn't come to us in a timely fashion. Two meetings ago we heard a case where the restriction was



imposed seven (7) years ago. The department created the report to explain to the Commission why it was important to impose the restrictions seven years ago but frankly was irrelevant currently. The employee's case was reconsidered due to current employer's appraisals. Those are a couple. I have more, I won't go through my list completely. My point is we need to look at our practices and procedures and ways we've historically done things to take into account that we have a smaller budget, smaller staff and are we being as efficient as we possibly can be.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 10)**

4:10 p.m.