



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED  
MAYOR**

***Sent via Electronic Mail***

April 20, 2023

**NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING**

**SUBJECT: REVIEW OF PERSONAL SERVICES CONTRACT NUMBER 48916-17/18  
FROM THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION– OMIT POSTING.**

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **May 1, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.**

This item will appear on the Regular Agenda. Please refer to the attached notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is recommended. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG  
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Kyndra Cox, Public Utilities Commission  
Ivy Fine, Public Utilities Commission  
Shawndrea Hale, Public Utilities Commission  
Maria Mabutias, Public Utilities Commission  
Commission File  
Commissioners' Binder  
Chron

## **NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

### **A. Commission Office**

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) and the web address is [www.sfgov.org/civilservice/](http://www.sfgov.org/civilservice/). Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

### **B. Policy Requiring Written Reports**

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

### **C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants**

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4<sup>th</sup>) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

### **D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission**

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

### **E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement**

**A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.**

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

### **F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order**

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

### **G. Procedure for Commission Hearings**

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

#### **H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings**

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at [www.sfgov.org/civilservice/](http://www.sfgov.org/civilservice/).

#### **I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission**

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the "Requests to Speak" portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended.

#### **J. Public Comment and Due Process**

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

#### **K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings**

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

#### **Information on Disability Access**

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org) to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

#### **Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: [soff@sfgov.org](mailto:soff@sfgov.org), or on the City's website at [www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine](http://www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine).

#### **San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance**

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.



# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of  
Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: \_\_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_\_ - \_\_\_\_\_
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of: May 1, 2023
3. Check One:  
Ratification Agenda \_\_\_\_\_  
Consent Agenda \_\_\_\_\_  
Regular Agenda X  
Human Resources Director=s Report \_\_\_\_\_
4. Subject: Personal Service Contract No. 48916-17/18 Modification Request from the Public Utilities  
Commission-OMIT POSTING
5. Recommendation: Adopt the report. Approve the request for proposed Personal Service Contract; Notify  
the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration.
6. Report prepared by: Shawndrea Hale Telephone number: (415) 551-4540
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV.  
Commission Report Format -A).**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:  
  
Human Resources Director: \_\_\_\_\_  
  
Date: \_\_\_\_\_
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified  
(see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer  
Civil Service Commission  
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720  
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

CSC-22 (11/97)

<p><b><u>CSC RECEIPT STAMP</u></b></p>
--

**Notification List**

Hale, Shawndrea M. [SHale@swater.org](mailto:SHale@swater.org)

Cox, Kyndra [KCox@swater.org](mailto:KCox@swater.org)

Mabutas, Maria [mmabutas@swater.org](mailto:mmabutas@swater.org)

Fine, Ivy <[IFine@swater.org](mailto:IFine@swater.org)>



**MEMORANDUM**

DATE: April 13, 2023  
 TO: Civil Service Commission  
 THROUGH: Sandra Eng  
 FROM: San Francisco Public Utilities Commission  
 SUBJECT: Review of Request for Personal Service Contract No. 48916-17/18- OMIT POSTING

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) is requesting approval of PSC 48916-17/18. This contract will expire on May 31, 2023, and the PSC needs approval to execute an amendment to extend the contract duration and amount. There was a delay submitting the PSC because IT procurement staff working on the amendment to the contract had a family emergency and left the SFPUC with exceptionally short notice.

The Lutron Quantum Software interfaces with the hardware for status, diagnostics and trouble shooting. It also is needed to address the lighting ballasts and adjust schedules within the building. When replacing a bulb or ballast the device point number is entered into the system (point addressing) to link the device/fixture with the computer interface for mapping. The computer interface requires periodic software version updates and at times software programming/troubleshooting support from Lutron is needed. If the software/server fails SFPUC staff lose the ability to run diagnostic tests, troubleshooting aspects, mapping and scheduling adjustments of the lighting in the building. However, the lights would still operate and the schedules would stay intact.

If one of the hardware components fails for example; a EcoSystem (ESN/QSN) controller, Lutron will need to troubleshoot/replace/reprogram. While inoperative the section (zone) of the building would lose lighting control.

We would appreciate your consideration to expedite our PSC, to complete our contract process.

**London N. Breed**  
 Mayor

**Newsha K. Ajami**  
 President

**Sophie Maxwell**  
 Vice President

**Tim Paulson**  
 Commissioner

**Anthony Rivera**  
 Commissioner

**Kate H. Stacy**  
 Commissioner

**Dennis J. Herrera**  
 General Manager



PERSONAL SERVICES CONTRACT SUMMARY ("PSC FORM 1")

Department: PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Dept. Code: PUC

Type of Request:  Initial  Modification of an existing PSC (PSC # 48916 - 17/18)

Type of Approval:

Expedited  Regular  Annual  Continuing  (Omit Posting)

Type of Service:

System Maintenance Services for 525 Golden Gate Lutron Lighting System

Funding Source: Operating Funds

PSC Original Approved Amount: \$289,160 PSC Original Approved Duration: 06/01/18 - 05/31/23 (5 years)

PSC Mod#1 Amount: \$400,000 PSC Mod#1 Duration: 04/03/23-05/31/28 (5 years 2 days)

PSC Cumulative Amount Proposed: \$689,160 PSC Cumulative Duration Proposed: 10 years 2 days

**1. Description of Work**

A. Scope of Work/Services to be Contracted Out:

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (

B. Explain why this service is necessary and the consequence of denial:

The Lutron Lighting System is a highly technical and proprietary system. Since its installation in 2012, SFPUC has not been able to secure a contract by which to upgrade or maintain its Lutron Lighting System. Consequently, system issues are being resolved internally and inadequately, putting the system at constant risk of failure. In addition, and despite our attempt to resolve these issues internally, we are having significant software lighting failures on the 13th floor of our building, as well as other locations throughout the building. If SFPUC is not permitted to contract with Maltby to properly maintain the system in accordance with the system manufacturer's requirements, the system will ultimately fail. In so doing, SFPUC would be required to purchase and install a new lighting system – something that would cost the agency at least \$1.5-2 million dollars, disrupt building operations and require redirecting staffing resources – all while delivering zero added value over the current system.

C. Has this service been provided in the past? If so, how? If the service was provided under a previous PSC, attach copy of the most recently approved PSC.

Services have been provided in the past through earlier PSC request. See 48916 - 17/18

D. Will the contract(s) be renewed?

Yes. The Lutron Lighting System consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it. As per Lutron Electric guidelines, the 525 Golden Gate Lutron Lighting System must be maintained by its distributor Maltby Electric Supply Co. Inc, a current 12b City Supplier. Until such time we replace the entire lighting system for this building, we will require maintenance services similar to those proposed under this contract.

E. If this is a request for a new PSC in excess of five years, or if your request is to extend (modify) an existing PSC by another five years, please explain why:

The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission 'SFPUC' is headquartered at 525 Golden Gate Avenue in San Francisco, California. The building's Lutron Quantum Lighting Control and Energy Management System 'Lutron Lighting System' installed by Webcor on or about 2012 at a cost of approximately \$3,325,000, is manufactured by Lutron Electric Inc. 'Lutron Electric'. The Lutron Lighting System consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it. As per Lutron Electric guidelines, the 525 Golden Gate Lutron Lighting System must be maintained by its distributor



Maltby Electric Supply Co. Inc, a current 12b City Supplier. Until such time we replace the entire lighting system for this building, we will require maintenance services similar to those proposed under this contract.

**2. Reason(s) for the Request**

A. Display all that apply

Other (be specific and attach any relevant supporting documents):

**REASON FOR CHECKING OTHER:**

The Lutron Lighting System consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it. As per Lutron Electric guidelines, the 525 Golden Gate Lutron Lighting System must be maintained by its distributor Maltby Electric Supply Co. Inc, a current 12b City Supplier. Until such time we replace the entire lighting system for this building, we will require maintenance services similar to those proposed under this contract.

Explain the qualifying circumstances:

no response from department

B. Reason for the request for modification:

To continuing receiving The Lutron Lighting System support which is a highly technical and proprietary system that provides total light management by bringing together the most complete line of lighting controls, digital ballasts, LED drivers, and sensors together under one software umbrella.

**3. Description of Required Skills/Expertise**

A. Specify required skills and/or expertise: The Lutron Lighting System consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it.

B. Which, if any, civil service class(es) normally perform(s) this work? 1043, IS Engineer-Senior; 1044, IS Engineer-Principal; 5212, Engineer/Architect Principal; 5241, Engineer;

C. Will contractor provide facilities and/or equipment not currently possessed by the City? If so, explain:  
No.

**4. If applicable, what efforts has the department made to obtain these services through available resources within the City?**

Not Applicable

**5. Why Civil Service Employees Cannot Perform the Services to be Contracted Out**

A. Explain why civil service classes are not applicable.

The Lutron Lighting System consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it.

B. If there is no civil service class that could perform the work, would it be practical and/or feasible to adopt a new civil service class to perform this work? Explain: No. The Lutron Lighting System consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it.

**6. Additional Information**

A. Will the contractor directly supervise City and County employee? If so, please include an explanation.  
No.

- B. Will the contractor train City and County employees and/or is there a transfer of knowledge component that will be included in the contract? If so, please explain what that will entail; if not, explain why not. Contractor is providing system maintenance services for the Lutron Lighting System. This system consists of proprietary software and hardware components belonging to Lutron Electric. As such, only suppliers authorized by Lutron Electric may maintain the Lutron Lighting System and/or provide any upgrades to it. Therefore, there is no subject on which staff require training.
- C. Are there legal mandates requiring the use of contractual services?  
No.
- D. Are there federal or state grant requirements regarding the use of contractual services? If so, please explain and include an excerpt or copy of any such applicable requirement.  
No.
- E. Has a board or commission determined that contracting is the most effective way to provide this service? If so, please explain and include a copy of the board or commission action.  
No.
- F. Will the proposed work be completed by a contractor that has a current PSC contract with your department? If so, please explain.  
No.

**7. Union Notification:** On 04/12/23, the Department notified the following employee organizations of this PSC/RFP request:  
Professional & Tech Engrs, SFAPP; Professional & Tech Engrs, Local 21; Prof & Tech Eng, Local 21; Architect & Engineers, Local 21;

I CERTIFY ON BEHALF OF THE DEPARTMENT THAT THE INFORMATION CONTAINED IN AND ATTACHED TO THIS FORM IS COMPLETE AND ACCURATE:

Name: Shawndrea Hale Phone: (415) 551-4540 Email: shale@sfgwater.org

Address: 525 Golden Gate Avenue, 5th Floor, San Francisco, CA 94102

\*\*\*\*\*

**FOR DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES USE**

PSC# 48916 - 17/18

DHR Analysis/Recommendation:

Civil Service Commission Action:

**From:** [dhr-psccordinator@sfgov.org](mailto:dhr-psccordinator@sfgov.org) on behalf of [shale@sfgov.org](mailto:shale@sfgov.org)  
**To:** [Hale, Shawndrea M.](mailto:Hale,Shawndrea.M.); [junko.laxamana@sfgov.org](mailto:junko.laxamana@sfgov.org); [amakayan@ifpte21.org](mailto:amakayan@ifpte21.org); [ewallace@ifpte21.org](mailto:ewallace@ifpte21.org); [ecassidy@ifpte21.com](mailto:ecassidy@ifpte21.com); [WendyWong26@yahoo.com](mailto:WendyWong26@yahoo.com); [wendywong26@yahoo.com](mailto:wendywong26@yahoo.com); [tmathews@ifpte21.org](mailto:tmathews@ifpte21.org); [kschumacher@ifpte21.org](mailto:kschumacher@ifpte21.org); [kpage@ifpte21.org](mailto:kpage@ifpte21.org); [eerbach@ifpte21.org](mailto:eerbach@ifpte21.org); [L21PSCReview@ifpte21.org](mailto:L21PSCReview@ifpte21.org); [dhr-psccordinator@sfgov.org](mailto:dhr-psccordinator@sfgov.org)  
**Subject:** Receipt of Modification Request to PSC # 48916 - 17/18 - MODIFICATIONS  
**Date:** Wednesday, April 12, 2023 11:00:09 AM

---

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

This message is from outside the City email system. Do not open links or attachments from untrusted sources.

PSC RECEIPT of Modification notification sent to Unions and DHR

The PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION -- PUC has submitted a modification request for a Personal Services Contract (PSC) for \$400,000 for services for the period April 3, 2023 – May 31, 2028. For all Modification requests, there is a 7-Day noticed to the union(s) prior to DHR Review.

If SEIU is one of the unions that represents the classes you identified in the initial PSC and the cumulative amount of the request is over \$100,000, there is a 60 day review period for SEIU

After logging into the system please select link below:

<http://apps.sfgov.org/dhrdrupal/node/20148>

Email sent to the following addresses: [L21PSCReview@ifpte21.org](mailto:L21PSCReview@ifpte21.org)  
[eerbach@ifpte21.org](mailto:eerbach@ifpte21.org) [kpage@ifpte21.org](mailto:kpage@ifpte21.org) [kschumacher@ifpte21.org](mailto:kschumacher@ifpte21.org)  
[tmathews@ifpte21.org](mailto:tmathews@ifpte21.org) [wendywong26@yahoo.com](mailto:wendywong26@yahoo.com) [WendyWong26@yahoo.com](mailto:WendyWong26@yahoo.com)  
[ecassidy@ifpte21.com](mailto:ecassidy@ifpte21.com) [ewallace@ifpte21.org](mailto:ewallace@ifpte21.org) [amakayan@ifpte21.org](mailto:amakayan@ifpte21.org)  
[junko.laxamana@sfgov.org](mailto:junko.laxamana@sfgov.org)