



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
April 17, 2023**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id # 2590 676 4348. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN

**USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: # 2590 676 4348 | followed by password # 27230
Press # twice in order to listen to the meeting via audio conference
Dial *3 when you are ready to queue**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

DOUGLAS CHAN

F.X. CROWLEY

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code # 2590 676 4348 followed by password #27230.

CALL TO ORDER

2:02 p.m.

ROLL CALL

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner Douglas S. Chan	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline P. Minor presided.

REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA (Item No. 2)

Kevin Jackson – spoke about item #13 on the agenda of December 19, 2022, meeting was in violation of Robert's Rules of Order, it is moot and should be removed dismissed or rescinded entirely. Agenda item #14 was misrepresented. The actions of items #13 and #14 at the 12/19/22 meeting should be corrected.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of April 3, 2023 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

Item #11 postponed to a future meeting at the request of the Health Service System department.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT (Item No. 5)

Carol Isen, Human Resources Director report included: 1) The E2P eligible lists – broke 500 mark for appointments and referrals from eligible lists close to halfway mark (originally 1100); 2) Reached agreement with SEIU on clarifying and changing minimum qualifications (MQs) in the administrative analyst series, changed and adopted changes to the MQs, generally lowered the number of years required for class 1820 accessible to any graduate of a 4 year college or AA degree with experience allowing for substitution; agreement with Local 21 to change MQs for the entire personnel analyst series to allow new college graduates to enter the field without any experience and learn as they go; 3) The desire to use online on demand continuous class-based testing requires use of rule of the list, if reached agreement with SEIU and Local 21 for 1820, 1822 series 1840, 1842, 1844 series and 1241 and 1244 series; 4) Rule changes – coordinated meetings with labor concluded discussions with all but one union hoping to resolve without the need for closed session; 5) Saturday’s job fair at Civic Center Plaza 4 hour event in which the Mayor attended and 30 departments represented thousands of attendees. Great success! Generating interest in the next generation of City employees.

0073-23-1 Civil Service Commission Mid-Year Report for Fiscal Year 2022-23. (Item No. 6)

Action: Accepted the report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0074-23-1 Civil Service Commission Third Quarter Report for Fiscal Year 2022-23. (Item No. 7)

Action: Accepted the report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0075-23-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 8)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
10915 - 22/23	Arts Commission	\$100,000,000	Fine art services and consulting for artworks in the collection and care of the City and County of San Francisco. Scope of work may include the handling, transportation, conservation, restoration, cleaning, packing, sorting, storing, framing, photography, installation, and de-installation of artworks including those of monumental scale. Services also include the design and fabrication of integral hardware, pedestals, cases, and plaques. Additionally, there are specialized consulting services to evaluate the condition of existing and proposed artworks.	Regular	<i>Continuous</i>
40489 - 22/23	Children; Youth & Their Families	\$3,800,000	At the request of its Oversight and Advisory Committee, the Department of Children, Youth and Their Families seeks to engage a professional event planner to help in the coordination and logistics of multiple community engagement events and focus groups to be held throughout the funding cycle. These events will be an important department outreach initiative to connect directly with San Francisco citizens and gain feedback from key stakeholders. They will allow the department to confer directly with the nonprofit organizations providing youth services in the city, as well as the direct recipients of these services.	Regular	6/30/2029

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
44698 - 22/23	Children; Youth & Their Families	\$5,300,000	The Department of Children, Youth and Their Families seeks a fiscal intermediary to provide fiscal and human resources support the Youth Empowerment Allocation's youth-led initiatives and projects. The Youth Empowerment Allocation is a funding stream established in San Francisco City Charter Section 16.108 (i)(2)(A)(vi), which states the department's annual Children and Youth Fund support must "include funding for youth-initiated projects totaling at least 3 percent of the total proposed expenditures from the Fund for the cycle." These funds are referred to as the Youth Empowerment Allocation. The department seeks a contract with a fiscal intermediary that can provide fiscal management to youth-initiated projects, manage annual events, and hire and support youth interns to act in an advisory capacity to the implementation of the Youth Empowerment Allocation.	Regular	6/30/2029
49568 - 22/23	Children; Youth & Their Families	\$25,500,000	This request is for professional technical assistance and capacity building for department grant-funded nonprofit programs providing direct services to children, youth and their families. Capacity building may also be made available as continuing education to department staff whose roles involve support of funded programs. Technical assistance and capacity building will be provided broadly to address issues of program quality and administrative capability.	Regular	6/30/2029
42038 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$18,000,000	Contractor(s) shall provide the City and County of San Francisco (the City) with unrestricted access to the following non-exhaustive list of types of technology research services: proprietary research and analysis about technology related trends; data and analytics; development and delivery; infrastructure and operations; sourcing and vendor management; strategy; change management; mission-critical solutions; security and risk; and enterprise architecture. These services are provided through access to online content in the form of research, technology-related data, best practice tools, training materials, and advisory.	Regular	6/29/2028
43644 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$250,000	The Permit Center seeks professional services to implement a streamlined and digital workflow solution, including data collecting and sharing. The professional services will configure and implement an inspection scheduler and workflow tool to digitize, streamline, and automate the inspection processes involving multiple inspecting departments. The tool will allow customers to schedule on-site inspections and collect data from the applicant prior to arrival. The workflow tool also allows multiple departments to access and view the data, make updates to the data prior to inspection, and allows departments to collect and record new data during the mobile inspection process. The services will provide a technology solution that provides an integrated and complete digital workflow. The solution will also be scalable to other use cases across multiple permitting and inspection services across the Permit Center.	Regular	4/30/2025
44191 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$300,000	Currently, the City and County of San Francisco has a number of electric vehicle charging dispensers, or electric vehicle supply equipment ("EVSE"), which are proprietary devices. The EVSE is integrated with a patented software interface. The contracted services will cover maintenance of proprietary software, wireless network upkeep and monitoring, customized programming, quarterly energy use reporting, security patches, remote monitoring, onsite troubleshooting and repairs, notification services for outages and other issues identified remotely, visual inspection of charging units, unit cables and the load management controller oversight, and onsite hardware and software maintenance.	Regular	5/31/2028

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45619 - 22/23	City Administrator	\$4,600,000	Contractor(s) to provide crane services to hoist materials, equipment, tools, and supplies from one location to another or to and from a roof. Services shall cover various scopes and complexity of the projects. The weight and type of the materials to be craned and the height and reach of the crane will need to be evaluated for each project. Contractors will provide cranes with certified operators that possess the required certifications based on the types of cranes and levels of expertise. The lifting capacities of cranes can range from 30 tons to 500 tons and heights from 25 feet to over 197 feet. Contract(s) will be available for all City departments where (1) departments do not have cranes and/or operators or (2) departments have a crane but do not have the right crane or certified operator or at times when the crane is out of service.	Regular	4/16/2028
48607 - 22/23	Human Services	\$800,000	Provide web-based time study to HSA-DAS (Human Services Agency/Department of Aging and Disability Services) and HSH(San Francisco Department of Supportive Housing and Homelessness) service providers and internal HSA employees of over 1300 staff and fiscal administrators.	Regular	6/30/2027
46341 – 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$300,000	To provide an off-site facility to collect pre-employment, post-accident, return-to-duty, and reasonable suspicion breath and urine samples during normal working hours and/or after hours for San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) employees and contractors. Also, to provide a mobile on-site facility to collect random, follow-up, reasonable suspicion, and post-accident breath and urine samples in compliance with DOT/FTA Drug and Alcohol Testing Regulations.	Regular	8/31/2028
47645 – 22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$120,000	The consultant will provide the services of a Medical Review Officer (MRO) for the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA). This is a mandatory service under the Department of Transportation/Federal Transit Administration (DOT/FTA), Title 49: Transportation, Code of Federal Regulations, Part 40 – Procedures for Transportation Workplace Drug and Alcohol Testing Programs (49 CFR Part 40).	Regular	8/31/2028
40782 – 22/23	Public Health	\$5,000,000	The selected contractor will administer and provide services in a "test to treat" program in support of the ongoing COVID-19 response and possibly other communicable diseases. Under a test to treat program, individuals can get tested and—if they are positive and treatments are appropriate for them—receive a prescription from a health care provider and have their prescription filled, all in one location.	Regular	12/31/2027
49192 – 22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$450,000	The scope of proposed work is to have California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) performed technical review of the Project Study Report-Project Report (PSR-PR) in order to obtain Caltrans' approval for Lower Alemany Area Stormwater Improvements Project (LAASIP) as several project elements (including the tunnel shaft and portions of tunnel) will be within Caltrans' jurisdiction. LAASIP is one of the regulatory compliance projects to improve collection system capacity during wet weather months within the area between Ellsworth Street and Barneveld Avenue in the Lower Alemany Area of San Francisco.	Regular	3/31/2026
46787 – 22/23	Public Works	\$3,000,000	Provide specialized services in waterproofing consultation to support Public Works design staff on an as-needed basis. The Consultants will provide expert waterproofing consultation services to ensure that our projects are designed and constructed to the best quality standards of waterproofing. Periodically, provide independent third-party evaluation of design prepared by City staff from waterproofing perspective.	Regular	12/31/2029
40890 -14/15	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$70,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$40,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$110,000,000	The Program Management Support Services Consultant (Consultant) will provide overall management expertise and oversight of the Capital Improvement Project (CIP) at the San Francisco International Airport (Airport). The scope of work will include project scoping and programming, design and construction management services, project controls for overall CIP, contract administration, cost estimating services, field inspection, document control, and other services in support of the CIP.	Modification	12/31/2029

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47246 - 18/19	Airport	Current Approved Amount \$60,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$20,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$80,000,000	Contractor shall be responsible for the maintenance, repair, inspection, testing, repair and/or replacement of parts and components, and emergency call-back work for approximately 240 elevators, 138 escalators, and 43 electric walks at the Airport including the terminals, boarding areas, parking garages, and other field buildings.	Modification	6/30/2024
36583 - 15/16	Economic and Workforce Development	Current Approved Amount \$1,768,000 Increase Amount Requested \$630,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,398,000	The consultant will assist the Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) with designing, implementing, and transitioning the existing online Workforce Central (WFC) client tracking and performance management platform to integrate new federal Workforce Innovation and Opportunities Act (WIOA) provisions. Scope Change: In response to new reporting requirements and client tracking needs, this modification will support a database for Small Business as well as Workforce programming.	Modification	6/30/2025
42573 - 19/20	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,000,000	Contractor will provide cloud-based software for management of Department policies and procedures, including licensing and maintenance. The Department of Public Health (DPH) currently manages the multiplicity of its policies and procedures with a rudimentary system using MS Office applications (Word, Excel) which can be unwieldy and difficult to coordinate and manage. Reviewing and keeping policies and procedures current is required by federal regulators, the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS). DPH intends to purchase proprietary software (licensing and maintenance) to modernize and enable its policies and procedures tracking system to be more responsive to operational and regularly needs, and to ensure review of and alignment with evolving laws, guidelines, regulations, standards, and best practices. .	Modification	12/31/2030
48034 - 21/22	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$7,408,988 Increase Amount Requested \$1,591,012 New Total Amount Requested \$9,000,000	The contractor(s) will provide encoder software for use in the San Francisco Department of Public Health Epic electronic health record and standalone use. The contractor will perform Health Information Management (HIM) coding of inpatient and outpatient procedural coding including, Medicare Severity-Diagnosis Related Groups (MS-DRG) and All Patients Refined-Diagnosis Related Groups (APR -DRG) reimbursement formulary, Ambulatory Payment Classification (APC) core grouping calculations and other payer formulary calculations, and clinical documentation integrity (CDI). The software also supports standard and customer user defined reporting. The value of this request covers estimated costs for licensing, maintenance, and related professional services such as training and consultation.	Modification	12/31/2030
48890 - 18/19	Public Health	Current Approved Amount \$899,000 Increase Amount Requested \$650,000 New Total Amount Requested \$1,549,000	The contractor(s) will provide a complete system for the management of incident and grievance responses which will assist in managing safety and quality of services within the San Francisco Health Network (SFHN). The system will include flexible event reports that encourage analysis and will be used to meet for regulatory requirements. In addition to a fully functional hosted application, the contractor will also provide project management, design, programming, testing, documentation, and system integration services in support of the application.	Modification	12/31/2030

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45085 – 19/20	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$5,700,000 Increase Amount Requested \$3,600,000 New Total Amount Requested \$9,300,000	The contractor works with ranchers and farmers to use biosolids as a fertilizer. The contractor secures all necessary permitting required for the use of biosolids as a fertilizer. Annual fees for permitting are paid by the contractor. The contractor manages the agronomic application of biosolids so that nitrogen added to fields does not exceed crop uptake needs. When sufficient biosolids have been added to a field to meet its nitrogen needs, the contractor moves the application operation to a new field. When moving to a new field, the contractor is responsible for coordinating with the trucking contractor for the transportation of biosolids to the new location. The contractor is responsible for ensuring the all county ordinances are followed during the course of operations at each field. This includes the posting of signs, flagging of buffer areas where biosolids are not to be applied, setting up a mobile weather station, a portable toilet and a washdown station for trucks. The contractor is responsible for the spreading and discing (incorporation) of the biosolids on each field. Co-ordination with the ranchers, farmers, and county is the responsibility of the contractor.	Modification	04/14/2027
47657 – 21/22	Public Utilities Commission	Current Approved Amount \$350,000 Increase Amount Requested \$280,000 New Total Amount Requested \$630,000	An independent review of revenue requirements, costs of service, and rates for the utilities under the jurisdiction of the San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC).	Modification	06/30/2024
4083 – 12/13	Treasurer/Tax Collector	Current Approved Amount \$8,200,000 Increase Amount Requested \$10,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$18,200,000	The Gross Receipts Tax and Business Registration Fees Ordinance (2012 Proposition E) was approved by San Francisco voters on November 6, 2012. It mandates that the City implement changes to local business taxes and registration fees by January 1, 2014 with a phased implementation through 2018. The Treasurer & Tax Collector has previously procured proprietary software that requires data migration and business process development to meet the requirements of the Ordinance.	Modification	05/31/2033

Speakers: Allison Cummings and Kevin Quan, Arts Commission spoke on PSC #10915-22/23
 Kate Kimberlin, Office of the City Attorney spoke on PSC #10915-22/23 from the Arts Commission
 Kimmie Wu and Alanna Olague, Treasurer/Tax Collector spoke on PSC #4083-12/13

- Action:**
- 1) Continued PSC #10915-22/23 from the Arts Commission to the meeting of May 1, 2023. (Vote of 5 to 0)
 - 2) Approved PSC #4083-12/13 from the Treasurer Tax Collector with the condition to update the description and scope of work for the next ten (10) years and report back in five (5) years. (Vote of 5 to 0)
 - 3) Adopted the report. Approved the requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0258-22-6 Appeal by Jarmee Thieu of the Human Resources Director’s determination to administratively close Appellant’s complaint of age discrimination and retaliation. (Item No. 9)

Speakers: None.

Action: Postponed to the meeting of June 5, 2023, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0188-20-6 Appeal by Craig Banks of Human Resources Director’s finding of untimely allegations of harassment, administratively close one allegation of retaliation, and insufficient evidence to substantiate three allegations of retaliation. (Item No. 10)

February 6, 2023: Postponed to the meeting of April 17, 2023, at the request of the appellant.

Speakers: None.

Action: Postponed to the meeting of July 17, 2023, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0076-23-8 Appeal by SEIU Local 1021 of the Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contract Numbers 42725-22/23 and 47934-22/23. (Item No. 11)

PSC	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
42725 – 22/23	Health Service System	\$1,383,200	Temporary as-needed on-site professional telephonic call-center support for Active and Retired Members of the San Francisco Health Service System.	Regular	12/31/2024
47934 – 22/23	Health Service System	\$615,600	Request for Proposal (RFP) for As-needed Off-site Call-Center Support for the San Francisco Health Service System Member Services Unit.	Regular	12/31/2024

Speakers: None.

Action: Postponed to a future meeting at the request of Health Service System. (Vote of 5 to 0)

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 12)

Commissioner Salveson requested a recommendation from staff about our procedures for obtaining departmental staff reports on appeals. There may be certain amount of discretion to allow for continuance or extension for submittal of staff reports, but at some point, they may have to come before the commission, or the commission should receive a report on what extensions have been granted to departments. The commission should look at what are legitimate reasons for extensions. In situations where departments are not responding it is not fair to appellants to have their hearings dragged out for no real reason. Critically important to take a look at this and report back to the commission with a recommendation.

Also, Commissioner Salveson noted that the quarterly reports are very helpful, particularly, the reports collecting data of the aftermath of the emergency declarations impact on Civil Service Rules. When emergencies happen there is not a lot of information or guidelines available on handling emergencies, but now we have information about what happens when you suspend civil service rules. It is important that we keep this information collected and available in a handy spot and possibly consider even doing a report including guidelines to consider in the future for anyone considering suspension of civil service rules.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 13)

3:37 p.m.