



# CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

## CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Date: April 17, 2023

To: Civil Service Commission

From: Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

Subject: **Civil Service Commission Third Quarterly Report for Fiscal Year 2022-23**

---

The following is a summary report of the Civil Service Commission's (Commission) activities for the period between July 1, 2022 – March 31, 2023.

### Policy Bodies Return to In-Person Meetings

While the Civil Service Commission has been conducting hybrid meetings (in-person and virtually) for approximately two years, policy body members were officially required to attend meetings in person beginning in March 2023. Although policy bodies were not required to continue with hybrid meetings, the Commission agreed to continue in this manner because the Civil Service Commission meetings became much more accessible to employees and the public in hybrid format particularly with the ability to provide public comment by phone. Hybrid meetings require all Commission staff to work together to host the virtual meeting while conducting the in-person portion of the meeting. Our office receives much appreciative feedback from employees and union representatives regarding the time saved by not having to travel and wait to have their item heard by the Commission.

### Staffing

In addition to the vacant 1426 Senior Clerk Typist position there is one employee on a leave of absence effective April 1, 2023.

### Appeals and Hearings

The Commission received a total of seventy-six (76) new appeals and requests for hearings from July 1, 2022 – March 31, 2023, in addition to the forty-six (46) appeals that were carried over from the previous fiscal year. As of March 31, 2023, sixty-six (66) or 54% of the appeals were resolved as of March 31, 2023. Commission staff notes a pattern of delays attributed to postponement requests, staff changes, grievances, arbitration, litigation, and delays in producing staff reports associated with appeal hearings. The goal is to resolve 70% of the appeals by the end of the fiscal year. Commission staff has continued sending monthly reminders to departments and appellants to make every effort to have the appeals heard in a timely manner. The Executive Office conducted a training on appeals and Rules application with union representatives and has plans to conduct additional trainings on appeals and staff reports to assist departments in submitting timely reports.

### Rule, Policies and Administration

Commission staff continues to be subject matter experts in the meet and confer meetings hosted by the Department of Human Resources Employee Labor Relations Team on the proposed rule amendments by the Executive Officer and the Human Resources Director from the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2022-23.

### Inspection Service Requests

The Commission received fifty-five (55) inspection service requests from July 1, 2022 through March 31, 2023. As of March 31, 2023, thirty-two (32) or 58% of the inspection service requests received were completed within 60 days. Delays are due to the extended time needed by departments to respond to our inquiries and provide a summary and written explanation of the selection process conducted by the department. We are also noting that human resources divisions are understaffed. The goal is to resolve 80% of the inspection service requests received within sixty (60) days. Inspection Service Requests continue to come in regarding the unfairness of the hiring process through the Mayor's 48<sup>th</sup> Supplement and the lack of communication informing all employees of this new hiring process from human resources staff and union representatives.

### Training

The Executive Officer conducted two (2) Merit System Trainings, one (1) training on appeals and participated in a departmental town hall meeting. Due to the high number of new human resources staff in the departments and new union representatives, the plan is to continue training on the merit system, appeals process, and responding to inspection service requests.

### Merit System Audits

Due to the number of requests for clarification on how the 48<sup>th</sup> Supplement is applied in the Exempt to Permanent Status Program, the audit this fiscal year will be on appointments made through this specific hiring process. The audit is completed and will be presented to the Commission in the 4<sup>th</sup> quarter.

### Website

Commission staff worked closely with Digital Services and their consultant team on preparing the department's website to move to a new platform focusing on user-friendly information. Commission staff continues to devote a considerable number of hours adding and editing content to the website to have a consistent look and feel to the user. Part of the instructions and information provided was to ensure the site contained webpages that closely met the goal of maintaining a 5<sup>th</sup> grade reading level throughout the site and to significantly decrease the use of PDF documents to provide ease of use and disability access. Commission staff attended more fifty (50) cumulative hours of training in writing publishing, and public body meetings to develop web content and manage the website and continues to regularly update content. The full site launched the first week of November 2022 and the old site was also archived online. Because the Civil Service Commission has an enormous storage of historical documents in PDF on the old site, Digital Services has had to provide support when individuals were having problems accessing these documents. Commission staff is currently learning how to add reports to the new site and create space on the website for these reports. Digital Services has provided support whenever possible, but it has been a challenge because departments citywide are requesting assistance.

**Recommendation:** Accept the Report

### Attachments

- Attachment A - Appeals Log for Fiscal Year 2022-23
- Attachment B - Inspection Service Log for Fiscal Year 2022-23

# **ATTACHMENT A**

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0127-22-4	4	Appealing the 2918 Human Services Agency Social Worker (CBT-2918-904264) standardized examination as bias.	08/19/22	08/23/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton M. Tugbenyoh K. Williams M. Palma	11/07/22	10/27/22			11/4/22 HSA requested postponement to the meeting of 2/6/22;10/12/22 HSA requested postponement to a tentative meeting on 12/5/22
0161-22-6	6	Appealing the Director of Transportation's decision to administratively close without further investigation on her complaint, DHR EEO File No. 3985.	09/21/22	09/26/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman V. Harmon A. Martinez J. Buick C. Cueva Alegria	12/05/22	11/23/22			
0165-21-6	6	Appealing the HRD's determination on her EEO File No. 3427, to not further investigate and administratively close	09/24/21	10/01/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez R. DeWit J. Luong	12/20/21	12/09/21	07/06/22	5	7/6/22 appeal closed, appellant never responded;5/19/22 DHR informed CSC that appellant would be withdrawing appeal; 10/29/21 DHR re-opening appellant's first complaint EEO File No. 3411 dated 2/28/20, which relates to complaint EEO File No. 3427 dated 4/29/20, to conduct further investigation. Requesting to hold scheduling appeal until EEO investigation is completed.
0138-20-1	1	Appealing the Decision of the Executive Officer to Uphold the Action of the Human Resources Director/Designee to Administratively Resolve Appeal due to Untimeliness.	06/09/20	06/11/20	SE			10/12/22	4	10/12/22 Resolved Administratively-Settlement agreement with original department in 2021; approved by BOS in 2022
0187-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 2708 Custodian (CBT-2709-E00088) Cat. 18	10/24/22	10/31/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	02/06/23	01/26/23			
0188-20-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's decision to close his EEO Complaint File No. 1781 without further investigation.	09/29/20	09/29/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh L. Simon M. Valdez J. Hinderliter R. Nelson	12/07/20	11/25/20			2/6/23 - Appellant requested item postponed to the meeting of 4/17/23; 11/14/22 Informed department and requested status; 10/29/22 Appellant wants to move forward with his appeal; 10/12/22 CSC following up with appellant; 6/8/22 DHR issued appellant a revised determination letter regarding investigation. Appellant did not appeal the new determination.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0186-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 6319 Senior Construction Inspector Cat. 18.	10/24/22	10/25/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/05/22	1	12/5/22 Adopted the report and denied the appeal; recommended DHR to extend the CBT 6319 Eligible List for one year and notify the appellant when a CBT 6319 or an E2P Eligible List is utilized by a City Department.
0104-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of application for class 1823 Sr. Administrative Analyst (REF 13904U) examination.	07/27/22	07/29/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	10/17/22	10/06/22	08/02/22	4	8/1/22 - DHR resolved administratively. Appellant meets MQs.
0086-22-4	4	Appealing disqualification for 2908 Senior Eligibility Worker.	06/28/22	06/30/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard L. Kim S. Dewolfe	09/19/22	09/08/22	11/07/22	1	11/7/22 Resolved; 10/12/22 DPH tentatively scheduled for meeting of 11/7/22
0088-22-4	4	Appealing disqualification for 9163 Transit Operator	06/28/22	06/30/22	K. Ackerman W Miles	09/19/22	09/08/22	09/13/22	2	9/6/22 - MTA Appeal untimely.
0167-22-4	4	Appealing the 7226 Carpenter Supervisor Examination Announcement requiring one (1) year of Cat. 18 Temporary Exempt experience in this classification.	10/03/22	10/04/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson	12/19/22	12/08/22	10/07/22	4	10/6/22 - DHR resolved administratively .
0054-22-6	6	Appealing the Director of Transportation's determination regarding his complaint of discrimination, EEO File No. 3893.	04/15/22	04/19/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman V. Harmon A. Martinez	07/18/22	07/07/22	10/17/22	1	10/17/22- Adopt the report, uphold the decision of the Director of Transportation and deny the appeal. 8/15/22 - Appellant requested 2nd postponement to a future meeting (10/17/22); 7/12/22 - Appellant requested item be postponed to the meeting of 8/15/22.
0217-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for Class 1820 Junior Administrative Analyst Cat. 18.	11/16/22	11/18/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/09/22	5	12/8/22 - Appellant withdrew appeal.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0185-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 6319 Senior Construction Inspector Cat. 18.	10/24/22	10/25/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/05/22	1	12/5/22 - The Civil Service Commission adopted the report and denied the appeal and recommended to the Department of Human Resources to extend Eligible List 903687 for Class 6319 for one (1) year; Notify the appellant when the 6319 Exempt to Permanent Eligible List or Class Based Test Eligible List is utilized by any department. Appellant failed to appear.
0110-22-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's determination to administratively close his complaint of discrimination, EEO File No. 4431	08/02/22	08/04/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez A. Kwan P. Miyamoto J. Quanico	11/07/22	10/27/22	08/22/22	5	8/11/22 - Resolved Administratively; DHR will reopen an investigate EEO complaint, rendering appeal moot.
0236-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for class 2604 Food Service Worker Cat. 18.	12/01/22	12/02/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton	03/06/23	02/23/23	03/06/23	1	3/6/23 - The Civil Service Commission denied the appeal and adopted the staff report of the Department of Human Resources. The Commission determined that the appellant was misclassified as a 2604 Food Service Worker in a Temporary Exempt Category 16 position and should be appointed in an Exempt Category 19 position effective on the date of appointment to the Temporary Exempt Category 16 2604 Food Service Worker position. This is a very narrow application for this appellant based on the circumstances that were presented to the Commission; 12/19/22 - continued to the meeting of 1/25/23.
0267-19-3	3	Appealing the denial of assault pay as an 8214 Parking Control Officer with the Municipal Transportation Agency.	10/07/19	10/08/19	T. Maguire K. Ackerman D. Kim P. Boparai	12/16/19	12/05/19			10/13/22 Informed MTA denial of sick leave with pay for employees injured by battery is an appealable matter; MTA to prepare staff report; 10/9/22 - requested status update from MTA
0226-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of her application for class 1842 Management Assistant (E00041) Cat. 18.	11/22/22	11/28/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/07/22	5	12/6/22 - DHR informed the commission that appellant withdrew their appeal.
0190-21-2	2	Appealing the decision of the Human Resources Director/Designee's determination that she is not performing out-of-class work.	11/15/21	11/16/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Graham S. Ponder R. Gardunio	03/07/22	02/24/22	08/15/22	1	8/15/22 - Adopted the report and denied the appeal; 6/1/22- Appellant requested postponement to the meeting of 8/15/22; 4/11/22 Postpone to the meeting of 6/06/22; 3/11/22 - PUC will need additional time; 3/8/22 - PUC requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 4/4/22; 1/21/22 PUC requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 3/21/22.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0169-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification for the 2591 Health Coordinator II Temporary Exempt Cat. 18 examination.	10/06/22	10/07/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton L. Kim S. DeWolfe	12/19/22	12/08/22	11/07/22	1	11/7/22 Resolved
0010-23-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for 7371 Electrical Transit System Mechanic examination.	01/17/23	01/23/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath S. Lee	04/03/23	03/23/23			3/16/23 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 5/1/23.
0045-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of her application for the 1312 Public Information Officer.	03/25/22	03/31/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles II S. Nath S. Wong	07/18/22	07/07/22	06/17/22	2	6/17/22 - DHR closed this appeal due to untimeliness 4/12/22 - MTA advised CSC that this appeal falls under the jurisdiction of DHR.
0298-18-2	2	Appealing the exam announcement for 7501 Environmental Services Worker	09/07/18	09/10/18	Callahan Gard Biasbas Ponder Wong Isen	11/19/18	11/08/18			9/20/22 DHR ERD reviewing matter
0166-21-6	6	Appealing the HRD's determination on her EEO Complaint File No. 3157.	09/24/21	10/01/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez R. DeWit K. Williams	12/20/21	12/09/21			5/11/22- EEO, DHR informed CSC appellant has pending litigation; 3/22/22 Appellant requested postponement to 5/16/22; 11/10/21 DHR requesting item be heard on 2/7/22.
0041-23-6	6	Appealing the HRD's determination on their Complaint of Discrimination, EEO File 4428.	02/28/23	03/02/23	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez J. Burke	05/15/23	05/04/23			
0046-23-4	4	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	03/15/23	03/16/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman S. Dines D. Garcia	06/05/23	05/25/23			

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0073-21-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's Determination on her Claim of Discrimination and Retaliation, DHR EEO File No. 3443.	05/10/21	05/12/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh J. White M. Valdez R. DeWit J. Hinderliter R. Nelson	08/02/21	07/22/21			2/24/23 - DHR informed CSC Litigation Hold on file as of 1/1/21. DHR EEO and CSC do not proceed with appeals when there is a Lit Hold on the matter; 9/23/22 Pending litigation.
0243-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for class 7502 Asphalt Worker Cat. 18.	12/07/22	12/09/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton	03/06/23	02/23/23	12/21/22	4	12/20/22 - DHR informed the commission that appellant withdrew their appeal.
0032-23-4	4	Appealing the exam administration for 8208 Park Ranger.	02/24/23	02/27/23	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton D. Jou	05/15/23	05/04/23	03/30/23	3	3/24/23 - Rec & Park informed the CSC not an appealable matter.
0238-22-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's determination regarding their complaint of discrimination, EEO File No. 4061.	12/02/22	12/06/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez W. Macy R. Gardunio S. Tang	03/06/23	02/23/23			3/7/23 - PUC requesting item be postponed to a future meeting; 2/1/23 - PUC requesting item be postpone to 3/20/23 representative will not be available for 3/6/22 meeting.
0014-23-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for 7318 Electronic Maintenance Technician (CBT-7318-904470) examination.	01/19/23	01/23/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath L. Dominguez	04/03/23	03/23/23			3/16/23 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 5/1/23.



Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0219-19-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's decision to administratively close his discrimination complaint, EEO File No. 3105.	8/27/2019	8/29/2019	Callahan K. Howard L. Simon M. Valdes J. Buick H. Albert R. Simmons R. Weigelt	11/18/2019	11/7/2019	11/09/22	5	11/9/22 - Closed, Appellant never responded if he wished to continue with appeal by 10/31/22 deadline;10/20/22 waiting for appellant's response to CSC request for status; 3/21/22 - Continued to a future meeting. 2/7/22 - Postponed to a future meeting date at the request of the appellant. 11/15/21 - Postponed to 2/7/22 at the request of DPH. 11/18/19 - Postpone the appeal to February 2022. On November 18, 2019, appellant did not appear for the appeal & CSC postponed for 3 months.
0004-23-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's determination on their Complaint of Discrimination, EEO File No. 3463.	1/6/2023	2/28/2023	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez K. Williams	5/14/2023	5/4/2023			
0054-23-4	4	Appealing the 48th Supplement Emergency Declaration hiring process for class 2706 Housekeeper/ Food Service Cleaner (E00046).	3/22/2023	3/23/2023	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson M. Tugbenyoh K. Howard S. Mayorga- Tipton	6/5/2023	5/25/2023			
0013-23-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for 7318 Electronic Maintenance Technician (CBT-7318-904470) examination.	1/18/2023	1/23/2023	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath L. Dominguez	4/3/2023	3/23/2023			3/16/23 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 5/1/23.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0244-20-6	6	Appealing the HRD's decision on his EEO File No. 3267.	12/7/2020	12/9/2020	C. Isen J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh K. Howard L. Simon M. Valdez R. DeWit M. Brown R. Simmons H. Albert	3/1/2021	2/18/2020			3-18-22 attorney/appellant requested to move forward after receiving closing letter; 3-11-22 no response received from appellant/representative; Sent 2nd closing letter; 2-18-22 Requested appellant to provide letter from appellant's physician indicating that due to restrictions, appellant was unable to contact our office; 2-16-22 appellant request to move forward with appeal; appellant unable to respond due to health condition from 10-14-21 through 2-7-22; 2-14-22 Sent closing letter; 1-27-22 Informed appellant/attorney if CSC does not receive a response to move forward with the appeal by 2-7-22, the appeal will be closed; 1-13-21 Informed appellant/attorney item may be schedule in March/April 2022; 10-15-21 Informed appellant/attorney item can be scheduled for 11-15-21; 9-29-21 Attorney requested postponement; 7/20/21 - Appellant's attorney requesting postponement and checking 10/4/21 availability. 7/7/21 DHR requesting postponement to the meeting of 8/2/21; 5/25/21 - DHR requesting postponement to the meeting of 7/19/21; 3/23/21 - DHR investigator on leave requesting item be postponed until 6/7/21 or later; 2/19/21 - appellant informed CSC he wished to proceed with appeal; 2/18/21 - CSC sent email to appellant asking if he wished to proceed with appeal; 2/17/21 - DHR informed CSC that appellant had retired as of 1/12/21; 12/9/20 - DPH informed CSC that appellant has filed a complaint against the Department of Public Health
0138-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for the 1408 Principal Clerk (CBT-1408-REF14671A) examination.	8/29/2022	8/30/2022	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson M. Tugbenyoh S. Mayorga Tipton	11/21/2022	11/10/2022	10/17/22	1	10/17/22 - Adopted the report and denied the appeal. Appellant was a no show.
0212-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of her application for 1241 Human Resources Analyst Cat. 18.	11/10/2022	11/14/2022	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	2/6/2023	1/26/2023	12/05/22	1	12/5/22 Adopted the report and denied the appeal.
0192-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of her application for class 2708 Custodian (CBT-2708-E00088) Cat. 18.	10/28/2022	10/31/2022	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	2/6/2023	1/26/2023			

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0030-20-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's decision to Not Investigate and Administratively Close Discrimination Complaint, EEO File No. 3187.	01/29/20	02/03/20	Callahan L. Simon M. Valdez M. Tugbenyoh J. Buick M. Brown H. Albert R. Simmons	05/18/20	05/07/20	12/13/22	5	2/24/23 - DHR to check-in with DPH re appeal; 12/13/22 Appellant was given a deadline to respond by 10/28/22 to move forward with the appeal; no response received; 10/12/22 CSC following up with appellant; 4/5/21 - Postponed the appeal to a future meeting date at the request of the appellant.
0184-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 1842 Management Assistant Cat. 18.	10/24/22	10/25/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh	02/06/23	01/26/23	11/18/22	5	11/16/22 - DHR informed CSC that appellant withdrew his appeal.
0221-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 9772 Community Development Specialist (REF15357M) Cat. 18.	11/16/22	11/21/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton K. Williams M. Palma	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/09/22	4	12/9/22 - Administratively Resolved : appellant withdrew appeal directly to DHR
0220-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 9775 Senior Community Development Specialist II (REF15354R) Cat. 18.	11/16/22	11/21/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton K. Williams M. Palma	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/09/22	4	12/9/22 - Administratively Resolved : appellant withdrew appeal directly to DHR

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0008-23-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for 5211 Senior Landscape Architect.	01/12/23	01/13/23	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh	04/03/23	03/23/23	02/23/23	2	2/22/23 - DHR notified CSC appeal was untimely & did not meet MQs.
0196-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 2708 Custodian (CBT-2708-E00088) Cat. 18.	11/01/22	11/02/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/05/22	1	12/5/22 Adopted the report and denied the appeal.
0124-22-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's determination that there was insufficient evidence to establish that he was subjected to discrimination or harassment on his age, EEO File No. 3956.	08/15/22	08/18/22	Callahan J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez P. O'Riordan M. Nieve	11/07/22	10/27/22	02/06/23	1	2/6/23 - Adopted the report; upheld the decision of the HRD and denied the appeal; 12/7/22 DHR requested to postpone to the meeting of 2/6/23; 10/19/22 DHR postponed this item to the meeting of 12/19/22; 9/6/22 - transmitted additional information to department.
0041-20-4	4	Appealing the denial to file a late application for the Q50 Sergeant Examination after the closing of the official filling period with SFPD.	02/12/20	02/13/20	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson M. Tugbenyoh	05/04/20	04/23/20	09/16/22	4	9/14/22 - Resolved administratively back on April 10, 2020; exam was re-opened
0015-4	4	Appealing the rejection of their application for 7318 Electronic Maintenance Technician (CBT-7318-904470) examination.	01/19/23	01/23/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath L. Dominguez	04/03/23	03/23/23			3/16/23 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 5/1/23.
0060-20-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's decision to administratively close your discrimination complaint, EEO File No. 3229 without further investigation.	02/28/20	03/03/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh L. Simon M. Valdez	05/18/20	05/07/20	10/03/22	1	10/3/22 - Adopted the report and denied the appeal; 6/1/22 - Appellant requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 10/3/22; 4/13/22 - Appellant requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 6/6/22; 3/10/22 DHR to schedule for 4/18/22

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0189-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification of his application for class 1767 Media Program Specialist (CBT-1767-E00075) Cat. 18.	10/25/22	10/26/22	C. Isen K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh J. Buick A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/05/22	1	12/5/22 Adopted the report and denied the appeal; appellant failed to appear
0209-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 2803 Epidemiologist II Cat. 18.	11/02/22	11/04/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton M. Tugbenyoh	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/05/22	1	12/5/22 Granted the appeal given the specific testimony in this case; appellant demonstrated they served in a CAT 18 role.
0174-20-6	6	Appealing the HRD's decision to close her discrimination complaint EEO File No. 3349.	08/11/20	08/17/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh L. Simon M. Valdez C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg	11/02/20	10/22/20			2/24/23 - DHR informed CSC that ABK to draft closure request as this complaint was folded into pending investigation. 12/13/22 Requested status from DHR; 10/12/22 CSC follow up with EEO; 9/23/22 - Needs to be rescheduled
0234-22-4	4	Appealing the job announcement for 3434 Arborist Technician (E1001 10) Cat. 18.	11/30/22	12/01/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton	03/06/23	02/23/23	01/19/23	4	1/17/23 - DHR informed the CSC that the appeal has been administratively resolved due to the Commission's action taken on 12/19/22 denying the appeal. The MQs specified in the 3434 Arborist Technician E1001 10 job announcement aligns with the 3434 Class Specification rendering the appeal moot.
0109-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of application for the 7253 Electrical Transit Mechanic Supervisor I examination.	08/02/22	08/03/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath	10/17/22	10/06/22	10/20/22	4	10/19/22 - Administratively Resolved: Met the MQs; 9/29/22 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 11/7/22.
0105-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of application for the 7253 Electrical Transit Mechanic Supervisor I examination.	07/28/22	07/29/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath	10/17/22	10/06/22	11/07/22	1	11/7/22 Resolved; 9/29/22 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 11/7/22.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0039-20-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's decision that there was insufficient evidence to substantiate his retaliation claim, EEO File No. 2309.	02/10/20	02/13/20	Callahan L. Simon M. Tugbenyoh M. Valdez J. Buick J. Hinderliter	05/04/20	04/23/20			2/24/23 - DHR Informed CSC of Litigation Hold was on file from Aug 2018 until Jan 2021. However, DHR EEO was not informed of the release of the Lit Hold until January 2023. DHR EEO needs to assign to an investigator and schedule appeal; 1/20/23 - Additional information transmitted to DHR; 1/12/23 - Appellant submitted additional information; 11/01/22 partial closure; investigating remaining matters; requested further clarification from DHR
0215-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 7514 General Laborer (CBT-7514-E00060) Cat. 18 recruitment.	11/14/22	11/15/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton K. Hill S. Vaksberg S. Sexton	02/06/23	01/26/23	12/19/22	1	12/19/22 - Deny the appeal and adopt the report of the City Administrator - appellant didn't show up.
0154-22-4	4	Appealing the examination administration for the 0923 Shelters and Navigation Manager.	09/15/22	09/20/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson	12/05/22	11/23/22	11/30/22	3	11/17/22 - DHR informed appellant the matter is not appealable.
0089-22-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's determination to not further investigate and to administratively close his Complaint of Discrimination, EEO File No. 3529.	07/06/22	07/08/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez W. Macy R. Gardunio S. Tang	09/19/22	09/08/22	11/07/22	1	11/7/22 Resolved; 10/7/22 Appellant requested postponement to the meeting of 11/7/22; 8/26/22 - DHR EEO requesting item be postponed to the 10/17/22 meeting.
0146-22-4	4	Appealing disqualification for 7318 Electronic Maintenance Technician	09/08/22	09/08/22	K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath	11/21/22	11/10/22	09/12/22	4	9/12/22 Administratively Resolved : appellant withdrew appeal directly to MTA HR
0208-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of application for class 9212 Aviation Security Analyst.	11/01/22	11/04/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton M. Tugbenyoh A. Caporale E. Zadlo	02/06/23	01/26/23	01/30/23	4	1/27/23 - Administratively resolved DHR/AIR notified CSC appellant met the MQs.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0155-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification for the 1408 Principal Clerk Examination.	09/15/22	09/21/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson	12/05/22	11/23/22	09/29/22	4	9/22/22 - Administratively Resolved: met MQs.
0158-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification for 1822 Admin Analyst (Requires PEX status)*	09/23/22	09/23/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson	12/05/22	11/23/22	11/07/22	1	11/7/22 Resolved
0103-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of application for the 7380 Electrical Transit Mechanical Assistant Supervisor examination.	07/27/22	07/29/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath A. Kaminska	10/17/22	10/06/22	03/06/23	1	3/6/23 - Adopted the report and denied the appeal;1/25/23 - Appellant requested item be continued to a future meeting; 12/5/22 CSC approved reconsideration and the appeal is scheduled for 1/25/23; 11/21/22 Requested reconsideration because appellant claimed he never notice of meeting;11/7/22 Resolved; 9/29/22 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 11/7/22.
0107-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of application for the 7253 Electrical Transit Mechanic Supervisor I examination.	07/29/22	08/01/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles S. Nath	10/17/22	10/06/22	10/20/22	4	10/19/22 Administratively Resolved: Met MQs; 9/29/22 - MTA requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 11/7/22.
0176-22-6	6	Appealing the HRD's determination on her Complaint of Discrimination, EEO File No. 3706.	10/12/22	10/18/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez C. Short S. Vaksberg R. De Wit	03/06/23	02/23/23			
0018-19-6	6	Appealing the HR Director's decision to administratively close the harassment/discrimination complaint.	01/16/19	01/18/19	Callahan S. Gard L. Simon M. Valdez	04/01/19	03/21/19			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 2-24-23 - DHR to check-in with DPH re appeal; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 10/12/22 EEO following up with DPH 9/23/22 - Needs to be rescheduled
0262-22-4	4	Appealing the Disqualification from Pre-Employment Processing and the Removal from the Eligible List for Class 8302 Deputy Sherriff I.	12/08/22	12/23/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson J. Sanford	03/20/23	03/09/23			

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0179-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification for the 2593 Health Program Coordinator III (REF 16008F) examination.	10/17/22	10/19/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton M. Tugbenyoh	02/06/23	01/26/23	10/28/22	5	10/28/22 - Appellant withdrew their appeal;10/25/22 - DHR notified CSC that appellant will be withdrawing appeal.
0156-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification for the 1408 Principal Clerk (CBT-1408-REF14671A) Examination.	09/21/22	922/22	C. Isen J. Buick A. Biasbas K. Howard D. Johnson	12/05/22	11/23/22	11/30/22	4	9/22/22 - DHR informed the Commission appellant met the minimum qualifications.
0239-22-4	4	Appealing the 2908 Senior Hospital Eligibility Worker announcement Cat. 18.	12/05/22	12/07/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton	03/06/23	02/23/23	02/06/23	1	2/6/23 - Adopted the report and denied the appeal from DPH; 1/25/23 - Appellant requests item be postponed to the meeting of 2/6/23.
0016-23-4	4	Appealing the 2903 Eligibility Worker announcement Cat. 18.	12/05/22	01/20/23	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson	04/03/23	03/23/23	01/27/23	2	1/27/23 - DHR/DPH notified CSC appeal untimely.
0258-22-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's determination on their Complaint of Discrimination, EEO File No. 4197	12/20/22	12/20/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tubenyoh A. Martinez A. Kwon K. Williams	03/06/23	02/23/23			
0043-23-6	6	Appealing the Director of Transportation's determination regarding their complaint of discrimination, DHR EEO File No. 3362..	03/08/23	03/09/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman V. Harmon A. Martinez	06/05/23	05/25/23			



Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0002-23-4	4	Appealing the examination administration for the 0923 Housing Placement Manager .	12/30/22	01/06/23	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton	03/20/23	03/09/23			
0242-22-6	6	Appealing the HRD's determination on their Complaint of Discrimination, EEO File 4308.	12/07/22	12/09/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez W. Macy R. Gardunio S. Tang	03/06/23	02/23/23	03/06/23	1	3/6/23 - Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Human Resources Director, and denied the appeal.
0097-22-6	6	Appealing the HRD's determination to not further investigate and administratively close her complaint of discrimination, EEO File No 4035.	07/18/22	07/20/22	C. Isen K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Martinez J. Torres S. Jacques J. Nelly	10/03/22	09/22/22	03/06/23	5	3/29/23 Still no response from appellant to withdraw their appeal in writing; 3/17/23 Contacted appellant to confirm in writing their request to withdraw their appeal; 3/6/23 Appellant informed CSC by phone to withdraw appeal; waiting for request in writing; 11/21/22 DHR requested postponement; 11/16/22 Met with EEO
0295-19-6	6	Appealing the Human Resources Director's decision to administratively close his discrimination complaint, EEO File No. 3123 without further investigation.	11/7/2019	11/12/2019	Callahan J. Buick L. Simon M. Tugbenyoh M. Valdez M. Brown H. Albert R. Simmons	2/3/2020	1/23/2020	11/09/22	5	11/9/22 - Closed, Appellant never responded if he wished to continue with appeal by 10/31/22 deadline;10/20/22 Waiting for appellant's response to CSC request for status; 3/21/22 - Continued to a future meeting. 2/7/22 - Postponed to a future meeting date at the request of the appellant. 12/4/19 - DHR EEO requesting item be postponed to February 2020.
0145-22-4	4	Appealing disqualification for Class 1823	9/2/2022	9/8/2022	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard A. Biasbas	11/21/2022	11/10/2022	09/29/22	5	9/23/22 - Appellant withdrew appeal.
0188-22-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for class 2708 Custodian (CBT-2708-E00088) Cat. 18.	10/24/2022	10/31/2022	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga- Tipton	2/6/2023	1/26/2023			

SEPARATIONS - REQUESTS FOR HEARING

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0085-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on her future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	6/21/2022	6/28/2022	C. Isen K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Sherburne L. Taylor K. Ellis	9/19/2022	9/8/2022			9/9/22 - pending arbitration; 7/29/22 additional time needed to conclude investigation.
0031-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on her future employability with the Department of Public Works.	3/3/2022	3/10/2022	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg	5/2/2022	4/21/2022			3/11/2022 - pending grievance
0209-20-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 5310 Survey Assistant I with the City and County of San Francisco.	10/22/20	10/26/20	C. Isen J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg A. Degrafinried	01/04/21	12/24/20	06/27/22	4	9/26/22 - Resolved administratively; returned to work; 6/27/22 post arbitration decision. Future employment restriction was rescinded. 12/8/20 - GSA requesting this item be postponed to 3/1/21 CSC Mtg. due to scheduling issues.
0181-20-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 7502 Asphalt Worker with the City and County of San Francisco.	08/31/20	09/09/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg A. Degrafinried	12/07/20	11/25/20	07/18/22	1	7/18/22 - Adopted the report and denied the appeal. Future employment subject to the review and approval of the Human Resources Director after satisfactory performance and completion of two (2) years' work experience outside the City and County of San Francisco. Must submit satisfactory evidence of trustworthiness and attendance.
0078-21-7	7	Appealing his future employments restrictions with the City and County of San Francisco.	05/13/21	05/24/21	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman W. Miles JP Ziegler	08/02/21	07/22/21	12/19/22	1	12/19/22 - Adopt the findings, deny the appeal, and approve the future employment restrictions - appellant didn't show up; 10/20/22 Per MTA, tentatively scheduled for the meeting of 12/19/22; 9/23/22 MTA update - no longer proceeding to arbitration; Tentative meeting date in December 2022; 7/19/21 pending grievance process, might lead to arbitration.
0304-18-7	7	Appealing future employment restrictions	09/10/18	09/12/18	Callahan Gard Weigelt Simmons	12/03/18	11/21/18			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/21/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/14/22 Requested status update from DPH; 3/26/19 Still in litigation; 9/13/18 Pending litigation
0210-20-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 2312 Licensed Vocational Nurse with the City and County of San Francisco.	10/22/20	10/26/20	C. Isen J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh M. Brown R. Simmons	01/04/21	12/24/20			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/21/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/14/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/4/20 DPH requesting appeal to be held in abeyance pending the outcome of grievance process.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0010-15-7	7	Requesting a hearing on her future employment restrictions as a 2918 HSA Social Worker with the City and County of San Francisco	01/21/15	01/23/15	Callahan Gard Kim	03/16/15	03/05/15	03/06/23	1	3/6/23 - restrictions lifted; 2/9/23 HSA requested postponement to the meeting of 3/6/23; 1/10/23 - DHR requesting item be scheduled for the meeting of 2/6/23; 11/29/22 HSA tentatively schedules the hearing for the meeting of 1/25/23; 10/21/22 Appellant wishes to move forward with the appeal; 9/26/22 - CSC following up with appellant; 4/2/19 Contacted appellant if they wish to move forward with appeal; 3/28/19 HSA 7-19-16 Arbitration award: denied grievance and upheld termination; 8/17/15: Pending arbitration 7/24/15; 06/01/15 Pending Arbitration; 05/04/15 Pending arbitration; 04/02/15 Arbitration.
0057-23-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	03/27/23	03/29/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman S Dines D. Garcia	07/03/23	06/22/23			
0229-19-7	7	Requesting a hearing on future employment restriction with the City and County of San Francisco.	09/03/19	09/04/19	Callahan J. Buick R. Weigelt R. Simmons	11/18/19	11/07/19			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/21/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/14/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/10/19 DPH requesting appeal to be held in abeyance pending the outcome of the grievance process.
0075-19-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employment restriction with the City and County of San Francisco.	03/18/19	03/19/19	Callahan Gard Howard L. Kim	06/03/19	05/23/19			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/21/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/14/22 Requested status from DPH.
0100-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	06/24/21	06/25/21	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman R. Williams JP Ziegler	09/20/21	09/08/21			9/23/22 - MTA Update - case is scheduled for arbitration in Dec 2022. 7/8/21 MTA notified CSC of pending arbitration.
0136-16-7	7	Request for hearing on his future employability with the City & County of San Francisco	03/28/16	03/29/16	Callahan Gard Koehler	06/20/16	6/9/2016			9/14/22 - Requested status from DHR ERD 6/26/18 Contacted DHR for update on status; 04/01/17 Grievance Resolved; dept preparing staff report; 4/01/16 Pending grievance.
0157-22-7	7	attorney on behalf of appellant, appealing the department head 's decision to place permanent restrictions on their future employability as a peace officer with the department.	09/21/22	09/22/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard S. Sherburne Department Representa tives	12/05/22	11/23/2022			12/5/22 Department informed CSC appeal resolved administratively; waiting for follow-up documentation to officially close this appeal
0177-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	10/14/22	10/18/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman R. Williams S. Dines	02/06/23	1/26/2023	02/06/23	1	2/6/23 - Accepted the report; denied the appeal and approve the future employment restrictions. Appellant failed to appear.
0010-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability with the City and county of San Francisco.	01/26/21	01/27/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh S. Ervin D. Menezes	03/15/21	3/4/2021			10/25/22 Department scheduled hearing for 12/5/22; 10/14/22 Union did not move this item to arbitration; department determining next steps; 10/12/22 Requested status from SFUSD; 4/19/21 - Take the item off calendar until arbitration has been resolved.

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0053-23-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	03/21/23	03/22/23	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard S. Sherburne L. Kim R. Williams	06/05/23	5/25/2023			
0348-18-7	7	Requesting a hearing on future employment restrictions with CCSF	09/28/18	10/02/18	Callahan Gard Gee	12/17/18	12/6/2018	10/12/22	4	10/12/22 Resolved administratively through settlement agreement - rescinded restrictions; 4/2/19 Arbitration scheduled for 7/15/19; 3/29/19 Arbitration tentatively scheduled for June; October 30, 2018: Pending grievance
0136-17-7	7	Request for hearing on her future employability with the City & County of San Francisco	05/08/17	05/10/17	Callahan Gard Kim Ellison	08/07/17	07/27/17			10/12/22 Requested status from HSA; 3/28/19 Department checking on status; 6/26/18 Contacted DHR for update on status
0149-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employment restriction with the City and County of San Francisco.	09/13/22	09/14/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman R. Williams S. Dines	12/05/22	11/23/22	03/06/23	1	3/6/23 -1.No Municipal Transportation Agency (MTA) job class that involves customer service until 2 years demonstrated/documented satisfactory service in customer service outside MTA. 2.No other City position that requires class B license until 2 years of demonstrated/documented outside satisfactory service operating a vehicle requiring class B license. 3.Cancel current eligibility and exam for transit operator; 2/6/23 - Appellant requested item be postponed to the meeting of 3/6/23, the CSC stipulated this will be last postponement that will be granted; 12/19/22 - Appellant requested item be postponed to the meeting of 2/6/23.
0007-23-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	01/11/23	01/13/23	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas S. Sherburne L. Kim R. Williams	04/03/23	03/23/23			
0182-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	10/20/22	10/26/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman S. Dines R. Williams	02/06/23	01/26/23	02/28/23	5	2/28/23 - Appellant withdrew appeal.
0128-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on her future employability as a 2320 Registered Nurse with the Department of Public Health.	08/22/22	08/24/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas L. Kim R. Williams	11/07/22	10/27/22			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 10/18/22 Pending grievance per DHR/DPH

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0005-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability with the City and county of San Francisco.	01/25/21	01/25/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh G. Wagner M. Brown R. Simmons	03/15/21	03/04/21			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/21/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/14/22 Requested status from DPH; DHR informed the CSC that the staff report recommending employment restrictions is on hold until the arbitration has been resolved.
0194-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on her future employability with the Municipal Transportation Agency.	10/31/22	11/01/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman S. Dines R. Williams	02/06/23	01/26/23	01/20/23	2	1/18/23 - MTA informed CSC appeal untimely.
0130-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a H-2 Firefighter with the San Francisco Fire Department.	08/23/22	08/25/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson J. Bushong	11/21/22	11/10/22	11/14/22	5	11/10/22 received letter from appellant's attorney withdrawing appeal; 11/8/22 Submitted staff report for meeting of 11/21/22
0116-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 7432 Electrical Line Helper with the City and County of San Francisco.	07/16/21	07/21/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg	10/04/21	09/23/21			9/26/22 ADM pending litigation.
0046-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employment as a 1426 Sr. Clerk Typist with the CCSF.	3/10/21 (postmark on envelope)	03/30/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh B. Houston	06/21/21	06/10/21			10/13/22 Requested status update from department; 9/20/22 - Requested status update; 9/29/21 Pending case at DFEH; 7/26/21 Department requesting item be postponed to 10/18/21; 6/8/21 Department requesting item be postponed to the meeting of 8/16/21; 5/11/21 Department requesting item be postponed until after the DFEH complaint has been resolved.
0179-20-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 7373 Sr. Stationary Engineer with the City and County of San Francisco.	08/17/20	08/26/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh J. Hinderliter	11/16/20	11/05/20			9/16/22 - PUC waiting on the arbitrator's decision. 9/1/20 - DHR informed the CSC of Pending Arbitration
0042-23-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	03/06/23	03/09/23	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman S. Dines D. Garcia	06/05/23	05/25/23			
0264-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on future employment restrictions with MTA as a 9163 Transit Operator	12/28/22	12/29/22	Tumlin Ackerman S. Dines	03/20/23	03/09/23			

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0194-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability with the Department of Public Works.	11/18/21	11/23/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg	03/07/22	02/24/22			10/12/22 Requested status from DPW; 3/7/22 - Postponed the request for hearing to a future meeting pending arbitration.
0125-21-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 2604 Food Service Worker with the City and County of San Francisco.	07/22/21	07/28/21	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh L. Kim L. Brooks-Houston	10/18/21	10/04/21			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 11/21/22 Requested status from DPH; 9/14/22 Requested status from DPH;
0241-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	12/05/22	12/07/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh S. Sherburne L. Kim R. Dhanju R. Williams	03/06/23	02/23/23	01/13/23	5	1/10/23 - Received email from appellant's representative withdrawing the appeal.
0244-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	12/08/22	12/09/22	J. Tumlin K. Ackerman S. Dines R. Williams D. Garcia	03/06/23	02/23/23			
0235-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on their future employability with the City and County of San Francisco.	11/30/22	12/01/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas S. Sherburne L. Kim R. Dhanju R. Williams	03/06/23	02/23/23			
0042-20-7	7	Requesting a hearing on his future employability as a 2579 Medical Examiner Investigator III with the City and County of San Francisco.	02/12/20	02/14/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg	05/04/20	04/23/20			10/13/22 Although pending litigation, CSC clarified appellant is still appealing restrictions; 9/26/22 ADM pending litigation; not appealing restrictions

Civil Service Commission  
Fiscal Year 2022-23 Appeals Log

Register No.	Type	Subject	Date Received	Date Trans	Referred To	Tentative Date	Report Due Date	Resolved On	No.	Comments
0136-22-7	7	Requesting a hearing on her future employability as a 2320 Registered Nurse with the Department of Public Health.	08/23/22	08/30/22	C. Isen J. Buick K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas S. Sherburne L. Kim	11/21/22	11/10/22			3/28/23 Requested status from DPH; 12/13/22 Requested status from DPH; 10/18/22 Pending grievance per DHR/DPH
0180-20-7	7	Requesting a hearing on behalf of Sandra Zuniga on her future employability as a 0932 Manager IV with the City and County of San Francisco.	08/26/20	08/26/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh C. Ikeda S. Vaksberg A. Degrafinried	11/16/20	11/05/20			9/26/22 ADM requested tentative meeting for early 2023. 10/19/20 - DHR requests postponing the appeal until after EEO investigation is complete.

**POSITION BASED TESTING**

0102-22-4	4	Appealing the disqualification of his application for the 1822 Administrative Analyst (PBT-1822-121782) examination.	6/6/2022	7/26/2022	C. Isen K. Howard M. Tugbenyoh A. Biasbas D. Johnson S. Mayorga Tipton M. Palma K. Williams C. Lewis	10/3/2022	9/22/2022		3	10/12/22 Resolved; upon further investigation, the appellant did not meet the minimum qualifications.
0119-20-4	4	Appealing the rejection of his application for the 0942 Manager VII, Bureau Manager, Street Use and Mapping (PBT-0942-098228) examination.	05/15/20	05/20/20	Callahan J. Buick M. Tugbenyoh C. Ikeda A. Ignao	08/17/20	08/06/20	10/13/22	3	10-13-22 Resolved; Disqualification under PBT Examinations is not appealable to CSC; CSC and DHR conducted an inspection service request completed on 2-2-21
0213-22-4	4	Appealing the minimum qualifications for 6124	11/10/22	11/10/22	C. Isen	12/05/22	11/23/22	12/01/22	5	11/29/22 - Appellant withdrew appeal.

**Number of Appeals**

Carried Over from FY2021-22	46
Appeals Received in FY2022-23	76
<b>Total Number of Appeals in FY22-23</b>	<b>122</b>

**Total Appeals by Category**

Classification (2)	2
Compensation (3)	1
Examination (4)	54
EEO/Discrimination (6)	25
Future Employment Restrictions (7)	39
Personal Services Contracts (8)	0
Position-Based Tests	3

**Resolutions**

Hearing at CSC (1)	26
Untimely (2)	5
Not Appealable (3)	4
Resolved Administratively (4)	16
Other (5)	15
<b>Total Resolved</b>	<b>66</b>
<b>% Resolved</b>	<b>54%</b>

# **ATTACHMENT B**



<b>Total for 2022-23</b>	<b>55</b>			<b>Total for 2022-23</b>	<b>55</b>
--------------------------	-----------	--	--	--------------------------	-----------

Totals by Category					
Letter or Email	50	58%	Appointments (1)	8	58%
Phone - Walk in	5		Examinations (2)	12	
Resolved in 60 days	32		Conflict of Interest (3)	3	
			ERO Administrator (4)	0	
			Salary Setting (5)	0	
			Rule Application (6)	5	
			Certification/Selection (7)	12	
			Classification (8)	2	
			Miscellaneous (9)	10	
			Layoffs (10)	0	

Code	Received Date	Letter or Email	Phone Walk in	Requested By	Issue	Job Class	Dept.	Resolution/Remedy	Date Resolved	60 days
1	7/5/2022	1		Redacted	If there is no eligible list for the appointments made through the 37th Supplement to temporarily waive Civil Service Rules to make appointments as a result of vacancies due to vaccination requirements, how is the serioity date deterined for bumping and layoffs?		DPH/TW UI Local 250	Although a traditional eligilbe list is not established, the seniority date and ranking is still established for these direct hires; therefore they will have seniority dates and bumping rights. SE	7/8/2022	Y
6	7/6/2022	1		Redacted	Review of hiring process for 7238 at Moccasin	7238	PUC	Position was filled in accordance with Mayor's 37th supplement for expedited hiring - no violations - LM	7/6/2022	Y
8	7/12/2022	1		Redacted	Released from promotion probationary period of 1942 and reverted to previous 1936 position but still performing the work of a 1942	1942	MTA	Rule 109.16 Temporary Out-of-Class Assignments Policy and Definitions; CS Adviser Out-of-Class Assignments; referred to HR Labor Relations and union SE	7/12/2022	Y
1	7/19/2022	1		Redacted	Review of appointments for 7355	7355	PUC	PUC & DPW conducted expedited hiring - due to 37th Mayoral Proclomation - LM	8/24/2022	Y
9	7/21/2022	1		Redacted	Alleges his supervisors are not qualified for their positions	9149	MTA	Lavena		
3	8/2/2022	1		Redacted	Favoritism - Superintendent given additional position due to favoritism by acting Dept Head	0941	ADM	Superintendent was assigned as Superintendent over BBR and SSR as a result of an untimely death. No position upgrade, no wage increase - no violations - Lavena	9/9/2022	Y
3	8/2/2022	1		Redacted	Favoritism – Manager and direct report hired a family friend under the Mayor's 37th Supplement	0933	PUC	LH - PUC response pending	11/1/2022	N
2	7/28/2022	1		Redacted	Minimum qualifications - 1053 applicant falsified degree to meet MQs	1053	HSA	LH- HSA Response pending	11/1/2022	N
3	7/12/2022	1		Redacted	Manager inappropriately hired P103s	P103	DPH	LH - DPH response pending		
2	8/3/2022	1		Redacted	Employee qualified for the 7216 Exam but disqualified from 7253 Exam	7216 7253	MTA	Employee was qualified and participated on both examinations. SE	8/10/2022	Y
7	8/15/2022	1		Redacted	Post-referral process for class 9116 & 9117 positions at MTA	9116/ 9117	MTA	No violations to substantiate the allegations brought forward, selection process was fair, competitive, consistent ad complation with selection procedre. 10/12/22 MTA finalizing response will submitt in the next 2 weeks; 10/11/22 CSC requesting an update; 9/16/22 MTA requesting extra time respond; 9/13/22 sent letter to MTA. EA	1/5/2023	N

7	8/17/2022	1		Redacted	Post-referral process for class 9116 & 9117 positions at MTA	9116/ 9117	MTA	No violations to substantiate the allegations brought forward, selection process was fair, competitive, consistent ad completion with selection procedre. 10/12/22 MTA finalizing response will submitt in the next 2 weeks; 10/11/22 CSC requesting an update; 9/16/22 MTA requesting extra time respond; 9/13/22 sent letter to MTA. EA	1/5/2023	N
7	8/16/2022	1		Redacted	Post-referral process for class 9116 & 9117 positions at MTA	9116/ 9117	MTA	No violations to substantiate the allegations brought forward, selection process was fair, competitive, consistent ad completion with selection procedre. 10/12/22 MTA finalizing response will submitt in the next 2 weeks; 10/11/22 CSC requesting an update; 9/16/22 MTA requesting extra time respond; 9/13/22 sent letter to MTA. EA	1/5/2023	N
2	8/18/2022	1		Redacted	REC Class 3422 - applicant who missed the deadline was allowed to take the exam	3422	REC	LH - REC response pending		
7	8/19/2022	1		Redacted	Top ranks were not selected for interviews; dept. selected rank 18 for interviews; how many vacancies: how were they able to reach rank 18?	2716	AIR	AIR had 5 vacancies but Smart Recruiters had additional vacancies citywide which allowed AIR to reach up to rank 18 SE	8/23/2022	Y
1	9/12/2022	1		Redacted	Allegation that MaThida Moe does not meet MQ's - cook	2654	DPH	Review completed - appointee meets MQ's - LM	10/5/2022	Y
2	9/12/2022	1		Redacted	Disqualified for class 1823 but claims she meets MQ's	1823	CCD	Review completed - applicant did not meet MQ's - LM	10/12/2022	Y
6	9/13/2022		1	Redacted	What is a promotive position when referring to reversion rights?		SHF	Rule 117.9.3 Reversion to Former Class-Released Promotive Probationary Employee; Employees released from a promotive probationary period shall revert to a position in the class from which promoted; displacements may occur; promotive is not defined by only by promotions within a class series. SE	9/13/2022	Y
2	9/16/2022	1		Redacted	Requesting an investigation on the 7253 examination process with MTA.	7253	MTA	Review completed, no viiolations; 12/1/22 received info from MTA; 10/13/22 sent letter to MTA - EA	1/11/2023	N
7	9/19/2022	1		Redacted	Requesting an investigation on the post-referral selection for the 8108 with the Sheriff Dept.	8108	SHF	Review completed; nothing wrong with post-referral selection. EA	11/30/2022	N
1	9/23/2022	1		Redacted	Favoritism - alleges selected candidate for Interim Labor Relations Director does not meet the Mqsand was appointed due to favoritism by the HR Director	0932	DPH	LH - DPH response pending		

2	9/30/2022	1		Redacted	Alleges that two applicants are not qualified to take exam	7329	MTA	Review completed; applicants meet MQ's. - LM	10/13/2022	Y
6	10/3/2022	1		Redacted	Member released from promotive probationary period but it's almost 30 days and the department has delayed placing the employee in any position			Rule 117.9.3 Reversion to Former Class-Released Promotive Probationary Employee; Employees released from a promotive probationary period shall revert to a position in the class from which promoted; displacements may occur; reversion shall be accomplished not later than 30 days from release; delays due to 3-4 weeks because of the need for medical clearance; department followed up with employee. SE	10/5/2022	Y
6	10/4/2022	1		Redacted	Member released from promotive probationary period but department is denying reversion rights; moved to step 3 in the grievance process			Rule 117.9.3 Reversion to Former Class-Released Promotive Probationary Employee; Employees released from a promotive probationary period shall revert to a position in the class from which promoted; displacements may occur; promotive is not defined by only by promotions within a class series; employee is not guaranteed the same position in the same department and employee may revert to the same classification in another department. Informed ERD SE	10/5/2022	Y
8	10/12/2022	1		Redacted	Reclassification process for class 7362.	7362	SFO	Provided CSC Rule 109 Position Classification and direction on how to proceed. - LM	10/12/2022	Y
2	10/13/2022	1		Redacted	Entire recruitment and hiring is outdated and not forward thinking when posting positions that only internal applicants are can be qualified for due to the requirement of 1 year of TEX CAT 18 experience. The City is excluding outsiders. Entire HR system needs to be overhauled.			Due to high number of vacancies and high number of TEX CAT 18 employees, Mayor's 48th Supplement allowed HRD to establish program to give TEX CAT 18 employees expedited opportunity to move into PCS positions; posting for transparency SE	10/14/2022	Y

2	10/13/2022	1	Redacted	Could not pass the Supervisory Battery Exam for a previous but different class examination and now prevented from participating in the examination for another class because they did not pass the SBE taken 8 months ago. Already in acting assignment for 1.5 years and limited opportunities to take the exam again because there are only 2 supervisory positions in the department. Worked over 20 years in the City and was not given time to study in advance for the earlier exam taken 8 months ago and is now better prepared. Superintendent encouraged him to take the exam and now HR will not allow him although he's met the MQs.	7253	MTA	DHR reviewed scantron sheet and verified the complainant's responses; scores are correct; because all applicants who failed the Supervisory Battery Exam must wait one year after the last examination was taken, the City cannot make an exception for one applicant, otherwise all applicants would need to be allowed to retake the examination after less than a year. Candidate encouraged to learn from taking the initial exam and now knows what to study in preparation for the next exam. SE	10/25/2022	Y
1	10/19/2022	1	Redacted	Alleges that Donte Quinn is not qualified for 7322 position.	7372	PUC	Appointee meets MQ's - LM	11/21/2022	Y
9	10/19/2022	1	Redacted	How does a person lift future employment restrictions?		SHF	If a former employee has conditional future employment restrictions, they must submit documentation verifying how they met the conditional restriction to the Human Resources Director. Permanent citywide restrictions cannot be lifted; CSC Policy ad Procedures on Future Employment Restrictions SE	10/20/2022	Y
1	10/21/2022	1	Redacted	Allegation that Elliot Johnson is not qualified for 9145	9145	MTA	Completion of review was delayed due to MTA's process not being completed- Candidate does not meet MQ's and will be removed from eligible list - LM	1/9/2023	N
2	10/31/2022	1	Redacted	examination process for 7258 Electrical Transit Mechanic Supervisor I at MTA.	7258	MTA	2/3/23 no violations to substantiate the allegations. The selection process conducted by MTA for the Class 7258 position was fair, competitive, consistent, and compliant with se-lection procedures; 2/2/23 sent draft response to SE&LH; 12/1/22 sent ltr to MTA - EA	2/3/2023	N
7	11/2/2022	1	Redacted	Questions why she was not hired for PEX status and nor current PCS position	2992	GSA	provided verbally to complainant 12-22 and written report in January 23 sent to complainant - LM	12/13/2022	Y
7	11/7/2022	1	Redacted	Alleges that J Bretz is not qualified for hire to 6231	6231	DPW	No merit to allegation - appointee meets MQ's - LM	12/8/2022	Y
1	11/30/2022	1	Redacted	Alyssa Mendoza not meeting MQs for 1244	1244	DPH	Meets MQs no violations. EA	12/16/2022	Y
7	12/2/2022	1	Redacted	Allegation that a manager inappropriately gave an unfair advantage in the hiring process to a friend	1052	HSA	No merit to allegation - appointee meets MQ's and was highest scoring candidate in post-referral process- LM	2/1/2023	Y
9	12/9/2022	1	Redacted	Request for inspection review regardig class 5260 and 5601 out-of-class work.	5260	PUC	Appeal was held on 8/15/22 which Commissioners denied & PUC at the request of the Commission conducted a review and audit of the hiring process and duties for the class - so response is to clarify there wil be no inspection review. LM	1/1/2023	Y
2	12/21/2022	1	Redacted	Exam process in limiting applicants to re-take an examination after 1 year limits opportunities to fill hard-to-fill vacancies in the City Are there Rules or DHR procedures that explain this process?	7335	DHR	DHR procedures: Exam announcement stated that applicant may re-test after 1 year from the last exam; applicants who pass the test may re-test and the system will just bank the most recent score SE	12/27/2022	Y

2	12/27/2022	1		Redacted	Unfair hiring process that only qualifies TEX 2903 for PCS positions	2903	DPH	3/2/23 Requested update; 2/9/23 Requested extension to 2/17/23; 1/11/23 requested extension to 1/23 SE		
9	12/30/2022	1		Redacted	Nepotism in the hiring of Dominique Nash ny brother-in-law Robert Pineda	2903	DPH	LM - request sent to DPH 1/5/23		
9	1/5/2023	1		Redacted	Post-referral interview of Yilin Ma when she was not reachable	2914	HSA	Appointee was reachable due to "special condition" - LM	2/3/2023	Y
7	1/6/2023		1	Redacted	Inquiries regarding certification and post-referral process		MTA	LM - in-person discussion	1/6/2023	Y
9	1/10/2023	1		Redacted	Post-Referral Selection Process for the 6230 Street Inspector Hirings with the Department of Public Works.	6230	DPW	No violations in the post-referral process at DPW for class 6239; 2/1/23 sent ltr to DPW - EA	3/16/2023	N
2	1/26/2023	1		Redacted	Inquiries about passing scores for 7334 and 7335 exams.t	7334		discussed scoring process - LM	2/1/2023	Y
9	2/2/2023	1		Redacted	Requested Leave from PCS position to Accept TEX Cat. 18 position; in the TEX position with still no response from HR; concerned on the ability to return to PCS position after 3 years in TEX position.	7238	SFUSD	Rule 120.31 allows PCS employee who completed probation to request leave of absence for the duration of employment; Rule 120.42 Denials of leave of absence may be appealed to HRD; due to several changes in staffing, department will follow up and approve leave for one year SE	2/17/2023	Y
6	2/15/2023	1		Redacted	If PCS employee who just completed probationary period accepts TEX Cat. 18 position, is there protection to return to PCS position after TEX position ends in 3 years?			Rule 120.31 allows PCS employee to request leave of absence to accept TEX position; if denied, the employee may appeal to HRD Rule 120.42; dept. may or may not approve for duration of TEX appointment; if employee stays in TEX position, they may request reinstatement Rule 114.8 before the separation from TEX position but this is not a guarantee. SE	2/15/2023	Y
9	2/22/2023	1		Redacted	Received final job offer with signatures from the department then on the Friday before the start date, was informed they were not reachable eligibles; dept. stated candidate was initially on the certified eligible list but after other departments filled positions, the candidate was no longer a reachable eligible.	1224	DPW/DH R	Due to transfer of eligible list from the previous system to the current system, there was an error; candidate is confirmed reachable. SE	2/28/2023	y
9	2/17/2023	1		Redacted	Promoted to position requiring Class B License; DMV still required medical examination that could not be scheduled for 2 months; being trained by dept.; then reinstated to former position without his knowledge; submitted Class B License to dept but was informed that they could not stop the reinstatement to the former position because it was completed; supervisor from the promotive position informed employee they were not released from probation and did not yet pass probation; probationary period was extended for any time missed; Employee would like to return to promoted position and complete the probationary period.	7410	MTA	3/10/23 HR checking with Division; Requested information from MTA SE		
9	2/24/2023		1	Redacted	Received certified eligible list; conducted selection process with reachable eligibles; conducted background for finalist; made final offer; informed eligible was no longer reachable because the other vacancies were filled	8216	MTA	Operations had 3 referrals for this classification; candidate was reachable on the first 2 referrals; because vacancies were filled from the first 2 referrals, candidate was no longer reachable on the 3rd referral. SE	2/28/2023	Y

