



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

Sent via Electronic Mail

March 10, 2023

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

**SUBJECT: ANNUAL REVIEW REPORT FOR PERSONAL SERVICE CONTRACT
NUMBER 48746-20/21.**

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **March 20, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.**

This item will appear on the Regular Agenda. Please refer to the attached notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is recommended. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Cynthia Avakian, Airport
Chung Park, Local 39 cpark@local39.org
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

A. Commission Office

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is civilservice@sfgov.org and the web address is www.sfgov.org/civilservice/. Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

B. Policy Requiring Written Reports

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4th) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement

A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

G. Procedure for Commission Hearings

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at www.sfgov.org/civilservice/.

I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the "Requests to Speak" portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended.

J. Public Comment and Due Process

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Information on Disability Access

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email civilservice@sfgov.org to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: soff@sfgov.org, or on the City's website at www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine.

San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

Sent via Electronic Mail

March 8, 2023

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ACTION

**SUBJECT: ANNUAL REVIEW REPORT FOR PERSONAL SERVICE CONTRACT
NUMBER 48746-20/21.**

At its meeting on **March 6, 2023**, the Civil Service Commission had for its consideration the above matter.

The Civil Service Commission continued this item to the meeting of March 20, 2023.

If this matter is subject to Code of Civil Procedure (CCP) Section 1094.5, the time within which judicial review must be sought is set forth in CCP Section 1094.

NOTE: *It is important that a copy of this action be kept in the department files as you will need it in the future as proof of Civil Service Commission approval. Please share it with everyone responsible for follow-up.*

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer

Cc: Cynthia Avakian, Airport
Chung Park, Local 39 cpark@local39.org
Commission File
Chron



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

Sent via Electronic Mail

February 23, 2023

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING

**SUBJECT: ANNUAL REVIEW REPORT FOR PERSONAL SERVICE CONTRACT
NUMBER 48746-20/21.**

The above matter will be considered by the Civil Service Commission at a hybrid meeting (in-person and virtual) in Room 400, City Hall, 1 Dr. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, California 94102 and through Cisco WebEx to be held on **March 6, 2023, at 2:00 p.m.**

This item will appear on the Regular Agenda. Please refer to the attached notice for procedural and other information about Commission hearings.

Attendance by you or an authorized representative is recommended. Should you or your representative not attend, the Commission will rule on the information previously submitted and testimony provided at its meeting. All calendared items will be heard and resolved at this time unless good reasons are presented for a continuance.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer

Attachment

Cc: Cynthia Avakian, Airport
Chung Park, Local 39 cpark@local39.org
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

NOTICE OF COMMISSION HEARING POLICIES AND PROCEDURES

A. Commission Office

The Civil Service Commission office is located at, 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. The telephone number is (628) 652-1100. The fax number is (628) 652-1109. The email address is civilservice@sfgov.org and the web address is www.sfgov.org/civilservice/. Office hours are from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday.

B. Policy Requiring Written Reports

It is the policy of the Civil Service Commission that except for appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing, all items appearing on its agenda be supported by a written report prepared by Commission or departmental staff. All documents referred to in any Agenda Document are posted adjacent to the Agenda, or if more than one (1) page in length, available for public inspection and copying at the Civil Service Commission office. Reports from City and County personnel supporting agenda items are submitted in accordance with the procedures established by the Executive Officer. Reports not submitted according to procedures, in the format and quantity required, and by the deadline, will not be calendared.

C. Policy on Written Submissions by Appellants

All written material submitted by appellants to be considered by the Commission in support of an agenda item shall be submitted to the Commission office, no later than 5:00 p.m. on the fourth (4th) business day preceding the Commission meeting for which the item is calendared (ordinarily, on Tuesday). An original copy on 8 1/2-inch X 11 inch paper, three-hole punched on left margin, and page numbered in the bottom center margin, shall be provided. Written material submitted for the Commission's review becomes part of a public record and shall be open for public inspection.

D. Policy on Materials being Considered by the Commission

Copies of all staff reports and materials being considered by the Civil Service Commission are available for public view 72 hours prior to the Civil Service Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission's website at <https://sf.gov/civilservice> and in its office located at 25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720, San Francisco, CA 94102. If any materials related to an item on this agenda have been distributed to the Civil Service Commission after distribution of the agenda packet, those materials will be available for public inspection at the Civil Service Commission's during normal office hours (8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m. Monday through Friday).

E. Policy and Procedure for Hearings to be Scheduled after 5:00 p.m. and Requests for Postponement

A request to hear an item after 5:00 p.m. should be directed to the Executive Officer as soon as possible following the receipt of notification of an upcoming hearing. Requests may be made by telephone at (628) 652-1100 and confirmed in writing or by fax at (628) 652-1109.

A request for a postponement (continuance) to delay an item to another meeting may be directed to the Commission Executive Officer by telephone or in writing. Before acting, the Executive Officer may refer certain requests to another City official for recommendation. Telephone requests must be confirmed in writing prior to the meeting. Immediately following the "Announcement of Changes" portion of the agenda at the beginning of the meeting, the Commission will consider a request for a postponement that has been previously denied. Appeals filed under Civil Service Commission Rule 111A Position-Based Testing shall be considered on the date it is calendared for hearing except under extraordinary circumstances and upon mutual agreement between the appellant and the Department of Human Resources.

F. Policy and Procedure on Hearing Items Out of Order

Requests to hear items out of order are to be directed to the Commission President at the beginning of the agenda. The President will rule on each request. Such requests may be granted with mutual agreement among the affected parties.

G. Procedure for Commission Hearings

All Commission hearings on disputed matters shall conform to the following procedures: The Commission reserves the right to question each party during its presentation and, in its discretion, to modify any time allocations and requirements.

If a matter is severed from the *Consent Agenda* or the *Ratification Agenda*, presentation by the opponent will be for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes and response by the departmental representative for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes. Requests by the public to sever items from the [*Consent Agenda* or] *Ratification Agenda* must be provided with justification for the record.

For items on the *Regular Agenda*, presentation by the departmental representative for a maximum time of five (5) minutes and response by the opponent for a maximum time limit of five (5) minutes.

For items on the *Separations Agenda*, presentation by the department followed by the employee or employee's representative shall be for a maximum time limit of ten (10) minutes for each party unless extended by the Commission.

Each presentation shall conform to the following:

1. Opening summary of case (brief overview);
2. Discussion of evidence;
3. Corroborating witnesses, if necessary; and
4. Closing remarks.

The Commission may allocate five (5) minutes for each side to rebut evidence presented by the other side.

H. Policy on Audio Recording of Commission Meetings

As provided in the San Francisco Sunshine Ordinance, all Commission meetings are audio recorded in digital form. These audio recordings of open sessions are available starting on the day after the Commission meeting on the Civil Service Commission website at www.sfgov.org/civilservice/.

I. Speaking before the Civil Service Commission

Speaker cards are not required. The Commission will take public comment on all items appearing on the agenda at the time the item is heard. The Commission will take public comment on matters not on the Agenda, but within the jurisdiction of the Commission during the “Requests to Speak” portion of the regular meeting. Maximum time will be three (3) minutes. A subsequent comment after the three (3) minute period is limited to one (1) minute. The timer shall be in operation during public comment. Upon any specific request by a Commissioner, time may be extended.

J. Public Comment and Due Process

During general public comment, members of the public sometimes wish to address the Civil Service Commission regarding matters that may come before the Commission in its capacity as an adjudicative body. The Commission does not restrict this use of general public comment. To protect the due process rights of parties to its adjudicative proceedings, however, the Commission will not consider, in connection with any adjudicative proceeding, statements made during general public comment. If members of the public have information that they believe to be relevant to a matter that will come before the Commission in its adjudicative capacity, they may wish to address the Commission during the public comment portion of that adjudicative proceeding. The Commission will not consider public comment in connection with an adjudicative proceeding without providing the parties an opportunity to respond.

K. Policy on use of Cell Phones, Pagers and Similar Sound-Producing Electronic Devices at and During Public Meetings

The ringing and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

Information on Disability Access

The Civil Service Commission normally meets in Room 400 (Fourth Floor) City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place. However, meetings not held in this room are conducted in the Civic Center area. City Hall is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART station is the Civic Center, located 2 ½ blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving City Hall are 47 Van Ness Avenue, 9 San Bruno and 71 Haight/Noriega, as well as the METRO stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call (415) 923-6142. Accessible curbside parking has been designated at points in the vicinity of City Hall adjacent to Grove Street and Van Ness Avenue.

The following services are available on request 48 hours prior to the meeting; except for Monday meetings, for which the deadline shall be 4:00 p.m. of the last business day of the preceding week. For American Sign Language interpreters or the use of a reader during a meeting, a sound enhancement system, and/or alternative formats of the agenda and minutes, please contact the Commission office to make arrangements for the accommodation. Late requests will be honored, if possible.

Individuals with severe allergies, environmental illness, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities should call our ADA coordinator at (628) 652-1100 or email civilservice@sfgov.org to discuss meeting accessibility. In order to assist the City’s efforts to accommodate such people, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical-based products. Please help the City to accommodate these individuals.

Know your Rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code)

Government’s duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils, and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people’s business. This ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people’s review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance or to report a violation of the ordinance, or to obtain a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance, contact Victor Young, Administrator of the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 244, San Francisco, CA 94102-4689 at (415) 554-7724, by fax: (415) 554-7854, by e-mail: soff@sfgov.org, or on the City’s website at www.sfgov.org/bdsupvrs/sunshine.

San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance

Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (San Francisco Campaign and Governmental Conduct Code Section 2.100) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the San Francisco Ethics Commission at 25 Van Ness Ave., Suite 220, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 252-3100, fax (415) 252-3112 and web site <https://sfethics.org/>.



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION REPORT TRANSMITTAL (FORM 22)

Refer to Civil Service Commission Procedure for Staff - Submission of Written Reports for Instructions on Completing and Processing this Form

1. Civil Service Commission Register Number: _____ - _____ -
2. For Civil Service Commission Meeting of:
3. Check One: Ratification Agenda
 Consent Agenda
 Regular Agenda
 Human Resources Directors' Report
4. Subject: PSC 48746-20/21
5. Recommendation: Adopt the report.
6. Report prepared by: Cynthia Avakian Telephone number: 650-821-2014
7. Notifications: **(Attach a list of the person(s) to be notified in the format described in IV. Commission Report Format -A).**
8. Reviewed and approved for Civil Service Commission Agenda:

 Human Resources Director:

 Date:
9. Submit the original time-stamped copy of this form and person(s) to be notified (see Item 7 above) along with the required copies of the report to:

**Executive Officer
Civil Service Commission
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720
San Francisco, CA 94102**

10. Receipt-stamp this form in the ACSC RECEIPT STAMP box to the right using the time-stamp in the CSC Office.

Attachment

CSC-22 (11/97)

<u>CSC RECEIPT STAMP</u>



San Francisco International Airport

February 15, 2023

Ms. Sandra Eng
Executive Officer
Civil Service Commission
25 Van Ness Avenue, Suite 720
San Francisco, CA 94102

Re: Airport's annual classification review report as requested by the Civil Service Commission for PSC 48746-20/21 Operations and Maintenance of Terminal 2 Baggage Handling Systems and domestic terminals Passenger Boarding Bridges.

Dear Ms. Eng:

At the Civil Service Commission meeting on July 19, 2021, the Civil Service Commission approved PSC #48746-20/21 for Operations and Maintenance of Terminal 2 Baggage Handling Systems and domestic terminals Passenger Boarding Bridges, provided that the Airport report back annually to the Commission on the status of the classification review and discussions between Airport and Local 39.

Attached is the Airport's status report for year one of the status of the classification review.

We hope that this addresses the Commission's request. Please let us know if there are further questions. You can reach me at (650) 821-2014. Thank you.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Cynthia Avakian".

Cynthia Avakian
PSC Coordinator, Airport

Cc: Cynthia Maltez, People, Performance & Development, Airport

AIRPORT COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR

ELEANOR JOHNS
PRESIDENT

MALCOLM YEUNG
VICE PRESIDENT

EVERETT A. HEWLETT, JR.

JANE NATOLI

JOSE F. ALMANZA

IVAR C. SATERO
AIRPORT DIRECTOR

Airport’s classification review report as requested by the Civil Service Commission (CSC) for PSC 48746-20/21 Operations and Maintenance of Terminal 2 Baggage Handling Systems (BHS) and domestic terminals Passenger Boarding Bridges (PBB).

Background:

This background section provides an overview of the timeline and events related to the CSC’s approval of PSC 48746-20/21 for Operations and Maintenance of Terminal 2 BHS and domestic terminals PBB, and covers the following related PSCs:

PSC Number	Submission Date	Start Date	End Date	Approved by CSC
PSC 47087-15/16	2/4/2016	04/01/15	12/31/21	05/16/16
PSC 47087-15/16 Mod 1	5/21/2021	10/01/21	09/30/22	06/21/21
PSC 44057-19/20	2/7/2020	04/06/20	04/05/28	N/A
PSC 48746-20/21	2/5/2021	09/01/21	12/31/29	07/19/21

On May 16, 2016, the CSC approved PSC 47087-15/16 for Operations and Maintenance of Terminal 2 BHS and domestic terminals PBB. Airport awarded Contract 50030.01 for these services under PSC 47087-15/16.

On February 2, 2020, with Contract 50030.01 set to expire, Airport submitted PSC 44057-19/20 intended to be used for a new Request of Proposals (RFP) for these services. International Union of Operating Engineers, Local 39 (Local 39) appealed the PSC on the basis that 7334 Stationary Engineers and 7335 Senior Stationary Engineers can perform this work.

The Airport had follow-up discussions with Local 39 in which: 1) Airport prepared and presented a scope of work/job classification analysis detailing that the scope of work cannot be broken down or performed by the classifications proposed by Local 39; and 2) Local 39 did not agree with Airport’s analysis and re-stated that the scope of work in this PSC can be performed by Local 39 represented City employees. Airport and Local 39 were not able to reach an agreement on the issue.

Due to the ongoing discussions, Airport extended the existing contract under the existing PSC 47087-15/16 to allow time to resolve Local 39 concerns. PSC 44057-19/20 was never approved, and Airport was advised by Department of Human Resources (DHR) to submit a new PSC.

On February 5, 2021, Airport submitted PSC 48746-20/21. Local 39 appealed this PSC on the basis that this work can be performed by Stationary Engineers 7333, 7334, 7335, 7205 and other Local 39 CCSF employees. During March and April of 2021, two conference calls, an Airport equipment tour, and multiple email communications followed between the Airport and Local 39 to try and arrive at an agreement.

On May 21, 2021, Airport submitted PSC 47087-15/16 Modification 1 to allow time to resolve issues with Local 39. Local 39 appealed the modification request on the same basis as PSC 48746-20/21. On May 28, 2021, Airport responded to Local 39 stating that without an extension

to PSC 47087-15/16, Airport will be unable to maintain its highly critical equipment which would have detrimental consequences to the airlines and significant impacts to stakeholders. Airport also discussed the need for PSC 48746-20/21 to procure a new contract for continued maintenance services beyond Contract 50030.01 as there cannot be a gap in the maintenance of this critical equipment.

On June 21, 2021, CSC approved PSC 47087-15/16 Modification 1 and advised the Airport and Local 39 to continue to work to resolve their differences and to return to the July 19, 2021 CSC meeting for PSC 48746-20/21.

On July 19, 2021, the Airport and Local 39 returned to the CSC after additional discussion, still unable to reach an agreement. CSC approved PSC #48746-20/21, and requested the Airport conduct a classification review. Additionally, CSC requested the Airport provide an annual report on the status of the classification review and discussions with Local 39.

Issues:

The Airport has prepared and presented to Local 39 equipment service standards, scope of work and job classification analysis expressing that the scope of work cannot be performed or broken down as proposed by Local 39. Local 39 has taken the position that this scope of work can be performed with these classifications (7333, 7334, 7335, 7205 Stationary Engineers).

Discussions and Analysis:

The Airport has had the following discussions with Local 39:

- 1) 2/11/20 Conference call- discussion of scope of work.
- 2) 3/24/20 Conference call- scope of work and job classifications comparison.
- 3) 3/30/21 Conference call- service standards and scope of work discussion.
- 4) 4/20/21 Airport BHS and PBB equipment tour for Local 39.
- 5) 7/9/21 Conference call- Local 39 and the Airport presented their positions to DHR on the equipment service standards, scope of work and classifications.

As stated above, after multiple discussions, an equipment tour and numerous emails between Local 39 and the Airport, both parties have agreed as directed by the CSC to perform a job classification study of the BHS and report back annually on the progress of that study.

In late 2021, Airport's Human Resources office (AIR-HR) started work on the classification study related to the BHS; however, progress has been delayed due to lack of staff. Currently, the AIR-HR hiring team has a 44% vacancy rate and is actively working on filling over 260 positions at the Airport.

To date, Airport has completed the following tasks in the classification study phase: a review of the job descriptions, a site tour, meeting with Airport managers and employees, and consultation with the DHR's Classification and Compensation Division. By November 2023, AIR-HR will complete the process of meeting with subject area experts and reviewing comparable industry positions.

If it is determined that the City should create new classification(s), AIR-HR will draft and submit the classification specification(s) to DHR for review by the end of calendar year, 2023. Local 39 and other unions covering the CCSF classifications will be notified of the new classification(s).

Conclusion:

The Airport will reach out to Local 39 and other unions as the job classification study progresses to keep them informed of the progress and continue communications as necessary per CSC's recommendation.

PERSONAL SERVICES CONTRACT SUMMARY ("PSC FORM 1")

Department: AIRPORT COMMISSION -- AIR

Dept. Code: AIR

Type of Request: Initial Modification of an existing PSC (PSC # _____)

Type of Approval: Expedited Regular Annual Continuing (Omit Posting)

Type of Service: Operation, Maintenance, Repair of Airport-owned Baggage Systems and Passenger Boarding Bridges

Funding Source: Airport Operating Funds

PSC Amount: \$35,000,000

PSC Est. Start Date: 09/01/2021

PSC Est. End Date 12/31/2029

1. Description of Work

A. Scope of Work/Services to be Contracted Out:

Contractor shall operate, maintain, repair, and provide on-call services to designated San Francisco International Airport (Airport) owned passenger boarding bridges (PBBs) and baggage handling systems (BHSs).

Maintenance and repair work includes: (1) ensure that the BHS Sortation and Maintenance Diagnostics System computers are operational; (2) support of the Low-Level Controls (LLC) including all Programmable Logic Controls (PLC) hardware and software components and PLC programs for operating and maintaining the BHS; (3) maintenance of all accessories including components of pre-conditioned air aircraft ground power and potable water supply, troubleshooting faults and inspecting components to ensure systems are properly functioning; and (4) provide routine maintenance, scheduled maintenance/preventive maintenance, non-scheduled maintenance and repairs, resetting and adjusting equipment other on-call repair services and maintenance/repair documentation reports.

Operational work includes mobilization, system monitoring, reporting of system alarms, assisting Transportation Security Administration (TSA) of baggage screening system start-up and operation, implementation of normal and irregular operational plans, assigning resources, maintaining spare parts inventory, system reporting and record keeping as well as providing 24-hour on call response, 365 days per year.

B. Explain why this service is necessary and the consequence of denial:

PBBs and BHSs service ensures Airport safety and is essential to 24/7 Airport operations. Any interruption in service would cause flight delays and financial exposure to the Airport.

C. Has this service been provided in the past? If so, how? If the service was provided under a previous PSC, attach copy of the most recently approved PSC.

These services were previously provided under PSC 47087-15/16.

D. Will the contract(s) be renewed?

Yes, if there continues to be a need for such services at the Airport.

E. If this is a request for a new PSC in excess of five years, or if your request is to extend (modify) an existing PSC by another five years, please explain why.

The duration of the PSC will allow the long-term support of the passenger boarding bridges and baggage handling systems which are essential to airport operations.

2. Reason(s) for the Request

A. Indicate all that apply (be specific and attach any relevant supporting documents):

- Services that require resources that the City lacks (e.g., office space, facilities or equipment with an operator).

B. Explain the qualifying circumstances:

The contractor will provide A-frame stands and electronic equipment for testing of the Programmable Logic Controller (PLC) and its components of the PBBs. For the BHSs, the contractor will provide specialized rigging equipment to remove conveyor sections for maintenance and/or repairs.

3. Description of Required Skills/Expertise

- A. Specify required skills and/or expertise: PBBs and BHSs technicians and managers require a combination of expertise in all the following areas: integration of programming, electronics, motor control and conveyor systems. PBBs and BHSs inspections require knowledge of preventative maintenance requirements for the PBB and BHS equipment.
- B. Which, if any, civil service class(es) normally perform(s) this work? 1052, IS Business Analyst; 1093, IT Operations Support Admn III; 7238, Electrician Supervisor 1; 7263, Maintenance Manager; 7318, Electronic Maintenance Tech; 7329, Electr Maint Tech Asst Sprv; 7334, Stationary Engineer; 7335, Senior Stationary Engineer; 7344, Carpenter; 7345, Electrician; 7514, General Laborer; 0922, Manager I; 9232, Airport Mechanical Maint Sprv; 9240, Airport Electrician; 9242, Head Airport Electrician; 1093, IT Operations Support Administrator III ;
- C. Will contractor provide facilities and/or equipment not currently possessed by the City? If so, explain: Yes. The contractor will provide A-frame stands and electronic equipment for testing of the Programmable Logic Controller (PLC) and its components of the PBBs. For the BHSs, the contractor will provide specialized rigging equipment to remove conveyor sections for maintenance and/or repairs.

4. If applicable, what efforts has the department made to obtain these services through available resources within the City?

Civil Service classifications were reviewed, and none included the combined knowledge and experience required. There are currently no civil service classes that can perform the entire scope of the work required for the maintenance and repair of Airport-owned PBBs and BHSs.

5. Why Civil Service Employees Cannot Perform the Services to be Contracted Out

- A. Explain why civil service classes are not applicable.
This work requires a unique combination of engineering discipline that integrates controls with computer programming, conveyors and electrical equipment for the PBBs and BHSs. The existing civil service classifications do not have the required combination of knowledge and experience to operate, maintain and repair the PBBs and BHSs. In addition, there is no current civil service class with essential duties that match the scope of work required for PBBs and BHSs at the Airport, and therefore, employees would be working out of class.
- B. If there is no civil service class that could perform the work, would it be practical and/or feasible to adopt a new civil service class to perform this work? Explain. No, it would not be practical to adopt a new civil service class because this work is highly specialized and only performed at the Airport (not Citywide). In addition, the number of Airport-owned PBBs and BHSs requiring operations, maintenance and repairs is dependent upon the airlines' agreements with the Airport; therefore, we could not hire permanent civil service. Under the current Lease and Use Agreement, the Airport's tenant airlines can request to maintain the PBBs and BHSs assigned to them on a preferential basis.

6. Additional Information

- A. Will the contractor directly supervise City and County employee? If so, please include an explanation.
No.

- B. Will the contractor train City and County employees and/or is there a transfer of knowledge component that will be included in the contract? If so, please explain what that will entail; if not, explain why not.
No. No. Training will not be provided as part of these services.
- C. Are there legal mandates requiring the use of contractual services?
No.
- D. Are there federal or state grant requirements regarding the use of contractual services? If so, please explain and include an excerpt or copy of any such applicable requirement.
No.
- E. Has a board or commission determined that contracting is the most effective way to provide this service? If so, please explain and include a copy of the board or commission action.
No.
- F. Will the proposed work be completed by a contractor that has a current PSC contract with your department? If so, please explain.
No.

7. Union Notification: On 02/05/2021, the Department notified the following employee organizations of this PSC/RFP request:
Carpenters, Local 22; Electrical Workers, Local 6; Laborers, Local 261; Municipal Executive Association; Professional & Tech Engrs, Local 21; Stationary Engineers, Local 39

I CERTIFY ON BEHALF OF THE DEPARTMENT THAT THE INFORMATION CONTAINED IN AND ATTACHED TO THIS FORM IS COMPLETE AND ACCURATE:

Name: Cynthia Avakian Phone: 650-821-2014 Email: cynthia.avakian@flysfo.com

Address: P.O. Box 8097 San Francisco, CA 94128

FOR DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN RESOURCES USE

PSC# 48746 - 20/21

DHR Analysis/Recommendation:

action date: 07/19/2021

Commission Approval Required

Approved by Civil Service Commission

07/19/2021 DHR Approved for 07/19/2021

SFO agreed to a 5 year contract.



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO

Sent Via Electronic Mail

July 21, 2021

NOTICE OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ACTION

SUBJECT: REVIEW OF PROPOSED PERSONAL SERVICES CONTRACT NUMBER 48746-20/21 FROM THE AIRPORT - OMIT POSTING.

At its meeting on **July 19, 2021 at 2:00 p.m.** the Civil Service Commission had for its consideration the above matter.

The Civil Service Commission adopted the report and approved PSC #48746-20/21 – Omit Posting for 5 years with the condition for a classification review. In addition, Airport will provide an annual report on the status of the classification review and discussions between Airport and Local 39. Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration.

If this matter is subject to Code of Civil Procedure (CCP) Section 1094.5, the time within which judicial review must be sought is set forth in CCP Section 1094.

NOTE: It is important that a copy of this action be kept in the department files as you will need it in the future as proof of Civil Service Commission approval. Please share it with everyone responsible for follow-up.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

/s/

SANDRA ENG
Executive Officer

Cc: Cynthia Avakian, Airport
Andrea Caporale, Airport
Eva Cheong, Airport
Sung Kim, Airport
Enrique Guadamos, Airport
Erin Zadlo, Airport
Emylene Aspilla, Airport
Veronica Davis, Airport
Cynthia Maltez, Airport
Mike Adams, Airport
Bill Wong, Airport
Ricardo Valle, Airport
seichenberger@local39.org
jvega@local39.org
Commission File
Commissioners' Binder
Chron

Notification List:

Cynthia Avakian, Airport	cynthia.avakian@flysfo.com
Andrea Caporale, Airport	andrea.caporale@flysfo.com
Eva Cheong, Airport	eva.cheong@flysfo.com
Sung Kim, Airport	sung.kim@flysfo.com
Enrique Guadamos, Airport	enrique.guadamos@flysfo.com
Veronica Davis, Airport	veronica.davis@flysfo.com
Cynthia Maltez, Airport	cynthia.maltez@flysfo.com
Bill Wong, Airport	bill.wong@flysfo.com
Ricardo Valle, Airport	ricardo.e.valle@flysfo.com
Stan Eichenberger, Local 39	seichenberger@local39.org
Jay Vega, Local 39	jvega@local39.org