



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes

COIT Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting City and County of San Francisco

Friday, February 24, 2023

9:00 am – 11:00 am

Webex Online Event

Members

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services

Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office

Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology

Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services

Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 9:04 AM, provided instruction on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

2. Roll call

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mikela Clemmons – Technical Director, Digital Services

Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office

Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology

Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services

Molly Peterson – Contract Reform Manager, Office of the City Administrator

COIT Staff

Julia Chrusciel

Danny Thomas Vang

Neil Dandavati

Guests

Asja Steeves Mark Powell Sohail Warsi Sean Cunningham Ray Shine Rob Miller Roland Tolosa		
--	--	--

3. General Public Comment

There was no public comment.

4. Approval of the Consent Agenda (Action Item)

- 4.1 Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings under California Government Code Section 54953(e)
- 4.2 Approval of Meeting Minutes from January 27, 2023

There was no public comment.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to approve, Guy Clarke seconded.
The consent agenda was approved by Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, Mikela Clemmons, Mark de la Rosa, Jillian Johnson, Michelle Littlefield, and Molly Peterson.

5. Department Updates & Announcements

- Jillian Johnson announced the following:
- The Annual Surveillance Report will be introduced to the Board of Supervisors
 - The COIT team is in the process of moving the surveillance policy toolkit to LogicGate
 - A survey was sent out to subcommittee members asking for their availability for meetings starting in March, there might be an alignment on Thursday afternoons
 - Updates on the security camera policies from Animal Care & Control and the Fine Arts Museum, in relation to the feedback from the full committee

There was no public comment.

6. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Camera, Non-Security (Action Item)

Sohail Warsi and Sean Cunningham presented their policy for the ongoing use of:

- Municipal Transportation Agency: Driver-Safety Video Analytics

Mikela Clemmons and Jillian Johnson recommended the following:

- Add language stating that the vendor is contractually restricted from viewing live footage
- Add language describing the type of encryption that is being used

There was no public comment.

Mikela Clemmons made a motion to move this item forward with the amended language, Jillian Johnson seconded.

The motion was approved by Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, Mikela Clemmons, Mark de la Rosa, Jillian Johnson, Michelle Littlefield, and Molly Peterson.

7. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Data Forensics Technology (Action Item)

Asja Steeves and Mark Powell presented their policy for the ongoing use of:

- Police Department: Data Extraction Tool for Computers and Cell Phones

Guy Clarke, Mikela Clemmons, Molly Peterson, Jillian Johnson, Michelle Littlefield, and Mike Makstman asked questions about the following: informed consent of the public, data storage on the cloud, data retention practices, health data collection, connection to the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act, and documentation of specific language in vendor contracts.

The following was recommended:

- Reference the California Electronic Communications Privacy Act (CalECPA), and give a brief description of what it entails
- Add language stating that data is deleted once appeals are exhausted, as data retention appears to be endless
- Delineate that any data outside of the warrant is sealed and not accessed for other investigations
- Clarify that officers have a different level of access than lab staff, in the section labeled "Data Access"
- Speak to the legal and investigation teams to draft health data language that will not hinder a warrant, while protecting the privacy of people living or visiting California
- Review the consent form required to collect data from someone when there is no applicable court-ordered warrant. Confirm that the details of the requested search are made clear to the consenter in the form, and if not already present, consider including a provision that allows the consenter to limit the scope and terms of the search similar to how warrants operate.

There was no public comment.

This item will continue to the next PSAB Meeting.

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:12 AM.