



**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

**LONDON N. BREED
MAYOR**

**MINUTES
Regular Meeting
December 5, 2022**

**2:00 p.m.
Room 400, CITY HALL
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed's 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020, emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the Civil Service Commission may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2491 092 9604. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: 2491 092 9604 # #**

LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR

COMMISSIONERS

JACQUELINE MINOR

President

KATE FAVETTI

Vice President

DOUGLAS CHAN

F.X. CROWLEY

ELIZABETH SALVESON

SANDRA ENG

Executive Officer

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting by email at civilservice@sfgov.org, or by voicemail message at the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record. During commission meeting use the Civil Service Commission's dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code 2491 092 9604.

CALL TO ORDER

2:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL

| | |
|---------------------------------|---------|
| President Jacqueline P. Minor | Present |
| Vice President Kate Favetti | Present |
| Commissioner Douglas S. Chan | Present |
| Commissioner F. X. Crowley | Present |
| Commissioner Elizabeth Salveson | Present |

President Jacqueline Minor presided

(2) **REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY'S AGENDA**

Brenda Virella-Vasquez 2908 Sr, Hospital Eligibility Worker, DPH

Questioned the fairness of the hiring process through the Mayor's 48th Supplement and whether all candidates on active eligible lists were notified.

Cynthia Carrillo – 1406 Senior Clerk, DPH

Questioned the fairness of the hiring process through the Mayor's 48th Supplement, concerned that temporary exempt employees with less seniority are receiving privileges, and felt all applicants should be required to take the same examination.

Claudia Coffman – 2903 Hospital Eligibility Worker, DPH

Expressed that the Mayor's 48th Supplement favored candidates with less seniority and promotes discrimination. Candidates on active eligible lists should have been notified in advance of how the 48th Supplement would affect them.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)

Regular Meeting of November 7, 2022 – 2:00 p.m.

Action: Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)

Item #20 Closed Session has been resolved administratively.

HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT

0227-22-1 Report on the Status of De-Identification for Classification-Based Testing Recruitments. (Item No. 5)

Speakers: Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
 Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources
 Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

Public Comment: Sandra Morales
 Scott DeWolfe, Department of Public Health

Action: Adopted the report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT (Item No. 6)

Sandra Eng, Executive Officer, stated that although the proposed amendments for Rule Series 005, 110, and 410 was approved for posting by the Commission on November 7 and 21 of 2022, Commission staff is waiting for the Department of Human Resources to schedule any necessary meet and confer with the affected unions.

0228-22-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 7)

| PSC | Department | Amount | Type of Service | Type of Approval | Duration |
|-------------|---|-----------|---|------------------|-----------|
| 40284-22/23 | District Attorney | \$250,000 | The pre-qualified vendors will be selected through an RFQ issued on June 22, 2022 by the District Attorney’s Office (SFDA). The vendors are to provide as-needed communications consulting services to educate the public about crime prevention, consumer protection, office initiatives, and how to access services. The intended services for SFDA’s public awareness campaigns include messaging, branding, strategizing, and/or designing materials and public service announcements targeting San Francisco’s diverse population. | Regular | 9/30/2024 |
| 46100-22/23 | Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing | \$720,000 | This request pertains to Department of Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH)’s COVID-19 response efforts to acquire properties to serve as Permanent Supportive Housing (PSH) options for guests exiting Shelter In Place (SIP) hotels and emergency COVID-19 shelter sites. Acquiring properties to house current SIP guests is a critical component of the City’s SIP Rehousing Plan, and for vulnerable guests with comorbidities, successful rehousing could mean the difference between life and death. The Contractor will assist with coordination of property acquisition due diligence and related activities, including but not limited to: •Initial Feasibility Assessments as requested prior to the City entering into Letter of Intent (LOI) for acquisition, including site reports and preliminary physical needs assessments •Closing Due Diligence and Financial Modeling, including due diligence reports and analysis and project management. | Regular | 1/31/2024 |

| PSC | Department | Amount | Type of Service | Type of Approval | Duration |
|-------------|---------------|---|--|------------------|------------|
| 41067-22/23 | Public Health | \$10,000,000 | The Contractor will provide crisis call services 24-hours, 365 days-per-year, including crisis intervention, telephone triage, counseling and support, referrals to mental health and substance use treatment programs, coordination of deployment of City and County of San Francisco mobile crisis teams, and outreach training to all San Francisco residents, community partners and the San Francisco Behavioral Health System of Care through the Citywide Suicide Prevention and Crisis Line, Drug Relapse Prevention Line and HIV Crisis Line, as well as off-hours coverage for the Behavioral Health Access Line. These crisis lines aim to reduce the incidence of suicide, substance use, and HIV transmission; to promote awareness, prevention, and support for people living with mental illness, substance use, and HIV; and to coordinate crisis response system resources throughout the City and County of San Francisco. | Regular | 1/31/2024 |
| 42383-18/19 | Fire | Current Approved Amount \$1,750,000 Increase Amount Requested \$750,000 New Total Amount Requested \$2,500,000 | Contractor provides clinical quality assurance services for Fire Department's Emergency Medical Services (EMS) Division and the Department of Emergency Management's (DEM) Dispatch Division. The Department currently has a contract on behalf of the San Francisco General Hospital Clinical Practice Group for Emergency Medicine Services, to provide these services. This contract expires in December 2019. | Modification | 6/30/2029 |
| 44680-14/15 | Public Health | Current Approved Amount \$1,795,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$3,795,000 | Tuberculosis physician services for the delivery of prevention, diagnostic and treatment services for and related to all forms of tuberculosis and to build capacity for the elimination of Tuberculosis (TB) in San Francisco. Additional services to be provided by physicians include and are not limited to X-Rays, Computerized Tomography (CT) scans, collaborative mentorship of medical students, residents, junior faculty, interns, resident fellows and public health officials. | Modification | 06/30/2034 |

Speakers: Mark Corso, Fire Department spoke on PSC #42383-18/19
Dean Goodwin, Department of Public Health spoke on PSC #44680-14/15

Action:

- 1) Approved PSC #42383-18/19 from the Fire Department with the condition to amend the duration of the contract. (Vote of 5 to 0)
- 2) Approved PSC #44680-14/15 from the Department of Public Health with the condition to report back every five (5) years in 2027 and 2032. (Vote of 5 to 0)
- 3) Adopted the report. Approved the remaining requests for proposed Personal Services Contract; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0229-22-1 Request by Bryan Salotti for reconsideration of a Civil Service Commission Action. (Item No. 8)

Speakers: Bryan Salotti, Appellant
Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

Action: Granted to reconsider Bryan Salotti's appeal. Requested the Executive Officer to schedule his appeal at a future meeting. (Vote of 4 to 1; Commissioner FX Crowley dissented)

0185-22-4 Appeal By Daniel Brugmann of the Rejection of their Application for CBT-6319-E00020 Senior Construction Inspector. (Item No. 9)

Speakers: Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources
David Barajas, Appellant
Kimberly Castillo, Office of the City Administrator
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources
Elizabeth Aldana, Civil Service Commission
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission
Kate Kimberlin, Deputy City Attorney

Public Comment: Kimberly Castillo, Office of the City Administrator
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021
Karen Hill, Department of Public Works

Action: Voted to hear items #9 and #10 together but vote separately.
(Vote of 5 to 0)

Action: Adopted the report, denied the appeal by Daniel Brugmann and recommended to the Department of Human Resources to extend Eligible List 903687 for Class 6319 for one (1) year; Notify the appellant when the 6319 Exempt to Permanent Eligible List or Class Based Test Eligible List is utilized by any department. Daniel Brugmann failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0186-22-4 Appeal By David Barajas of the Rejection of their Application for CBT-6319-E00020 Senior Construction Inspector. (Item No. 10)

Speakers: Dave Johnson, Department of Human Resources
David Barajas, Appellant
Kimberly Castillo, Office of the City Administrator
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources
Elizabeth Aldana, Civil Service Commission
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission
Kate Kimberlin, Deputy City Attorney

Public Comment: Kimberly Castillo, Office of the City Administrator
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources
Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021
Karen Hill, Department of Public Works

Action: Adopted the report, denied the appeal by David Barajas and recommended to the Department of Human Resources to extend Eligible List 903687 for Class 6319 for one (1) year; notify the appellant when the 6319 Exempt to Permanent Eligible List or Class Based Test Eligible List is utilized by any department. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0196-22-4 Appeal by Gilbert Laga of the Rejection of their Application for CBT-2708-E00088 Custodian. (Item No. 11)

Speakers: Melissa White, Public Utilities Commission
Gilbert Laga, Appellant

Action: Denied the appeal and adopted the report of the Public Utilities Commission. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0189-22-4 Appeal by Jack Livolsi of the Rejection of their Application for CBT-1767-E00075 Media Programming Specialist.

Speakers: Kimberly Castillo, Office of the City Administrator
Lizzette Henríquez, Civil Service Commission

Action: Denied the appeal and adopted the report of the Office of the City Administrator. Jack LiVolsi failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0209-22-4 Appeal by Phillip Lowenthal of the rejection of their application for CBT-2803-E10137. (Item No. 13)

Speakers: Diane Zhou, Department of Public Health
Scott DeWolfe, Department of Public Health
Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources
Phillip Lowenthal, Appellant

Action: The Civil Service Commission granted the appeal by Phillip Lowenthal. (Vote of 4 to 1; Commissioner Jacqueline P. Minor dissented)

0212-22-4 Appeal by Lynnette M. Hollins of the rejection of their application for CBT-1241-E00064. (Item No. 14)

Speakers: Liezel Cruz, Department of Public Health
Anna Biasbas, Department of Human Resources

Action: Denied the appeal and adopted the report of the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0230-22-8 Response to Commission Inquiry Regarding Radiologic Technologist Classifications (2471-2472-2473-2474) PSC No. 4134-08/09. (Item No. 15)

Speakers: Heather Johnson, Department of Public Health
Scott DeWolfe, Department of Public Health

Action: Adopted the report of the Department of Public Health. (Vote of 5 to 0)

0231-22-11 Response to the Civil Service Commission’s Request to Address the Hiring Decisions of the Public Utilities Commission regarding the 5260 Architectural/Landscape Architectural Assistant I and 5601 Utility Analyst Positions. (Item No. 16)

Speakers: Melissa White, Public Utilities Commission

Public Comment: Diana Chung

Action: Accepted the report. (Vote of 4 to 1; Commissioner Douglas Chan dissented)

0154-21-1 Findings and Recommendations of William B. Gould IV Regarding the Review of City Equal Employment Opportunity Practices, Policies, and Procedures. (Item No. 17)

September 20, 2021: No action taken; item continued for further consideration. President Minor requested that Director Isen update the Commission in sixty (60) days on its response plan, the Controller’s workflow analysis, and the status of negotiations with the unions regarding the selection of remedy and the arbitrator being authorized to award damages. Discussions will continue on December 6, 2021.

December 6, 2021: No action taken. President Minor requested that Director Isen update the Commission again on April 4, 2022, implementing Dr. Gould’s report and the Controller’s workflow analysis; requested a preliminary review from the City Attorney’s Office with a detailed analysis and Charter implications and the use of hearing officers for appeals.

April 4, 2022: No action taken. President Minor requested that Director Isen update the Commission again at the meeting of November 7, 2022.

Speakers: Carol Isen, Department of Human Resources
Mawuli Tugbenyoh, Department of Human Resources
Amalia Martinez, Department of Human Resources

Action: Accepted the report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

Public comment on all matters pertaining to Items #19 and #20. (Item No. 18)

Vote on whether to hold Item #20 in closed session. (Item No. 19)

CLOSED SESSION AGENDA

Basis for Closed Session: Personnel Exception (Gov. Code § 54957(b)(1), Admin Code § 67.10(b); Peace Officer Confidentiality Statutes (Penal Code §§ 832.5, 832.7, 832.8))

NOTE: The Commission may hold Item #20 in open session, closed session, or partial open/partial closed session. They have been agendized as closed session items to preserve the Commission's ability to go into closed session if the Commission so decides.

0157-22-7 Closed Session – Request for Hearing by Julia D. Fox on behalf of appellant on their Future Employment Restrictions against all City Departments with all Sworn Law Enforcement. (Item No. 20)

Speakers: None.

Action: No closed session conducted and no action taken. Appeal resolved administratively.

Reconvene in Open Session. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions held on Item #20 in closed session (San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.12 (a)) – (Item No. 21)

COMMISSIONERS' ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 22)

None.

ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 23)

7:01 p.m.