San Francisco Traffic Stops
Analysis of 2019 San Francisco Traffic Stop Data
● SPUR
● Data and Analysis
● Traffic Stops in San Francisco
● Pretext Stop Analysis
Data and Analysis

- This analysis uses the 2019 Racial and Identity Profiling Act (RIPA) data
  - The most recent year for which we have data where driver behavior was normal
  - Pandemic disrupted driving behaviors and make 2020 and 2021 data not useful for analysis
  - 2022 promises to be more representative of true patterns
- Demographic data comes from the 2019 5-year American Community Survey
Traffic Stops in San Francisco

- California has some of the most expensive traffic citations in the United States
- High cost of traffic citations have a disproportionate impact on lower income people
- While traffic stops and citations are intended to make our roads safer, many stops have nothing to do with road safety but have severe economic consequences for people who receive citations
- In 2019, there were more than 60,000 traffic stops conducted by the San Francisco Police Department
Traffic Stops by Race and Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Share of Traffic Stops</th>
<th>Share of Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Traffic Stops by Race, Ethnicity, and Gender

- **Share of Traffic Stops**
- **Share of Population**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Ethnicity</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black Male</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black Female</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Male</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Female</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latinx Male</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latinx Female</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Male</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Female</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Per Capita Stop Rate, by Race and Ethnicity

Per 10,000 residents
Reason for Stop by Race and Ethnicity

- **Moving**: Purple bars
- **Equipment**: Dark gray bars
- **Nonmoving**: Light gray bars

### Breakdown by Race and Ethnicity

- **Black**
  - Moving: 50%
  - Equipment: 19%
  - Nonmoving: 31%

- **White**
  - Moving: 75%
  - Equipment: 12%
  - Nonmoving: 14%

- **Latinx**
  - Moving: 60%
  - Equipment: 18%
  - Nonmoving: 22%

- **Asian**
  - Moving: 74%
  - Equipment: 10%
  - Nonmoving: 17%

- **Total**
  - Moving: 65%
  - Equipment: 16%
  - Nonmoving: 19%
Result of Traffic Stop by Race and Ethnicity

- **TOTAL**:
  - Citation: 64%
  - No Citation: 35%
- **BLACK**:
  - Citation: 40%
  - No Citation: 56%
- **WHITE**:
  - Citation: 28%
  - No Citation: 71%
- **LATINX**:
  - Citation: 39%
  - No Citation: 59%
- **ASIAN**:
  - Citation: 77%
  - No Citation: 23%
Result of Stop by Race, Ethnicity, and Gender

- **Citation**
  - BLACK MALE: 39%
  - BLACK FEMALE: 44%
  - WHITE MALE: 28%
  - WHITE FEMALE: 28%
  - LATINX MALE: 39%
  - LATINX FEMALE: 40%
  - ASIAN MALE: 24%
  - ASIAN FEMALE: 20%

- **No Citation**
  - BLACK MALE: 57%
  - BLACK FEMALE: 54%
  - WHITE MALE: 71%
  - WHITE FEMALE: 72%
  - LATINX MALE: 59%
  - LATINX FEMALE: 59%
  - ASIAN MALE: 80%
  - ASIAN FEMALE: 63%
  - MALE: 35%
  - FEMALE: 34%
Per Capita Citation Rate, by Race and Ethnicity

Per 10,000 residents
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FIRST</th>
<th>SECOND</th>
<th>THIRD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>Display license plates incorrectly</td>
<td>Failure to obey signs or signals</td>
<td>No registration for vehicle, trailer, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>Failure to stop vehicle at stop sign, crosswalk, etc.</td>
<td>Failure to obey signs or signals</td>
<td>Unsafe speed for prevailing conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>Local ordinance violation</td>
<td>Failure to obey signs or signals</td>
<td>Failure to stop vehicle at stop sign, crosswalk, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>Failure to stop vehicle at stop sign, crosswalk, etc.</td>
<td>Local ordinance violation</td>
<td>Unsafe speed for prevailing conditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>Local ordinance violation</td>
<td>Failure to stop vehicle at stop sign, crosswalk, etc.</td>
<td>Failure to obey signs or signals</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Spatial Analysis of Traffic Stops
Pretext Stops Analysis

- Demographic analysis of the proposed traffic stops banned
- Per capita analysis
- Search and arrest analysis
- Only pretext stops in the California Code
Failure to Display Both License Plates

**Share of Stops and Share of Population**

- **BLACK**: 5% Share of Stops, 46% Share of Population
- **WHITE**: 21% Share of Stops, 40% Share of Population
- **LATINX**: 19% Share of Stops, 15% Share of Population
- **ASIAN**: 6% Share of Stops, 35% Share of Population
- **MIDDLE EASTERN**: 5% Share of Stops, 1% Share of Population
- **PACIFIC ISLANDER**: 1% Share of Stops, 1% Share of Population

*Source: SPUR*
Failure to Display Both License Plates

![Bar Chart](chart.png)

- **Share of Stops Given a Citation**
  - **BLACK**: 22%
  - **WHITE**: 45%
  - **LATINX**: 32%
  - **ASIAN**: 58%
  - **MIDDLE EASTERN**: 51%
  - **PACIFIC ISLANDER**: 26%

*Source: SPUR*
Failure to Display Both License Plates

Per 10,000 residents

Per Capita Stop Rate

- BLACK: 409
- WHITE: 25
- LATINX: 57
- ASIAN: 8

SPUR
Failure to Display Both License Plates

Per Capita Citation Rate

- **BLACK**: 90
- **WHITE**: 11
- **LATINX**: 18
- **ASIAN**: 5

Per 10,000 residents
Failure to Display Both License Plates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Search Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Failure to Display Both License Plates

- 4,122 total stops
- 6% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- Less than 1% of stops resulted in discovery of a gun
- 1% of stops resulted in an arrest
Failure to Display Registration Tags or Expired Registration
Failure to Display Registration Tags or Expired Registration

Share of Stops Given a Citation

- **BLACK**: 28%
- **WHITE**: 49%
- **LATINX**: 35%
- **ASIAN**: 58%
- **MIDDLE EASTERN**: 54%
- **PACIFIC ISLANDER**: 36%
Failure to Display Registration Tags or Expired Registration

Per Capita Stop Rate

- BLACK: 305
- WHITE: 34
- LATINX: 65
- ASIAN: 10

Per 10,000 residents
Failure to Display Registration Tags or Expired Registration

Per Capita Citation Rate

BLACK: 85
WHITE: 17
LATINX: 22
ASIAN: 6

Per 10,000 residents
Failure to Display Registration Tags or Expired Registration

![Search Rate Chart]

- **BLACK**: 19%
- **WHITE**: 6%
- **LATINX**: 14%
- **ASIAN**: 4%
- **TOTAL**: 15%
Failure to Display Registration Tags or Expired Registration

- 4,086 total stops
- 5% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- Fewer than 1% of stops resulted in recovery of a gun
- 0.7% of stops resulted in an arrest
Failure to Illuminate License Plate

Share of Stops and Share of Population

- BLACK: 25% (5% stops)
- WHITE: 40% (25% stops)
- LATINX: 29% (15% stops)
- ASIAN: 35% (11% stops)
- MIDDLE EASTERN: 7% (1.40% stops)
- PACIFIC ISLANDER: 1% (0% stops)
Failure to Illuminate License Plate

Share of Stops Given a Citation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Share</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Failure to Illuminate License Plate

Per Capita Stop Rate

- Black: 6
- White: 1
- Latinx: 2
- Asian: 0

Per 10,000 residents
Failure toIlluminate License Plate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Search Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latinx</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Failure to Illuminate License Plate

- 105 stops in 2019
- 1% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- No guns were recovered during these stops
- No stops resulted in an arrest
Driving Without Illuminated Tail Lights

Share of Stops and Share of Population

- BLACK: 29% Share of Stops, 5% Share of Population
- WHITE: 27% Share of Stops, 40% Share of Population
- LATINX: 26% Share of Stops, 15% Share of Population
- ASIAN: 35% Share of Stops, 7% Share of Population
- MIDDLE EASTERN: 8% Share of Stops, 1% Share of Population
- PACIFIC ISLANDER: Less than 0.4% Share of Stops, 0% Share of Population

SPUR
Driving Without Illuminated Tail Lights

Share of Stops Given a Citation

- BLACK: 26%
- WHITE: 43%
- LATINX: 33%
- ASIAN: 52%
Driving Without Illuminated Tail Lights

Per Capita Stop Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Stop Rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Per 10,000 residents
Driving Without Illuminated Tail Lights

![Bar chart showing search rates for different demographics]
Driving Without Illuminated Tail Lights

- 379 total stops
- 4% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- 1% of stops resulted in recovery of a gun
- 2% of stops resulted in an arrest
Driving Without Illuminated Brake Lights

Share of Stops and Share of Population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race/Background</th>
<th>Share of Stops</th>
<th>Share of Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIDDLE EASTERN</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACIFIC ISLANDER</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- Share of Stops
- Share of Population
Driving Without Illuminated Brake Lights

Share of Stops Given a Citation

- BLACK: 30%
- WHITE: 50%
- LATINX: 45%
- ASIAN: 50%
Driving Without Illuminated Brake Lights

Per Capita Stop Rate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Rate (Per 10,000 residents)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Per 10,000 residents
Driving Without Illuminated Brake Lights

![Bar chart showing search rate for different ethnic groups.](chart.png)
Driving Without Illuminated Brake Lights

- 714 total stops
- 1% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- No guns were discovered at these stops
- 0.3% of stops resulted in an arrest
Objects Affixed to Mirror

![Bar chart showing the share of stops and share of population for different ethnic groups.](chart)

- **Share of Stops**:
  - BLACK: 5%
  - WHITE: 10%
  - LATINX: 15%
  - ASIAN: 6%
  - MIDDLE EASTERN: 4%
  - PACIFIC ISLANDER: 1%

- **Share of Population**:
  - BLACK: 44%
  - WHITE: 40%
  - LATINX: 32%
  - ASIAN: 35%

The chart compares the share of stops and the share of population for different ethnic groups.
Objects Affixed to Mirror
Objects Affixed to Mirror

Per Capita Stop Rate

- **BLACK**: 36
- **WHITE**: 1
- **LATINX**: 9
- **ASIAN**: 1

Per 10,000 residents
Objects Affixed to Mirror

![Bar Chart]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Search Rate</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LATINX</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASIAN</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Objects Affixed to Mirror

- 373 total stops
- 5% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- Fewer than 1% of stops resulted in recovery of a gun
- 1% of stops resulted in an arrest
Failure to Signal

Share of Stops and Share of Population

- **Black**: 23% (Share of Stops), 5% (Share of Population)
- **White**: 23% (Share of Stops), 40% (Share of Population)
- **Latinx**: 28% (Share of Stops), 15% (Share of Population)
- **Asian**: 17% (Share of Stops), 35% (Share of Population)
- **Middle Eastern**: 4% (Share of Stops), 1% (Share of Population)
- **Pacific Islander**: 0% (Share of Stops), 0% (Share of Population)

Legend:
- Purple: Share of Stops
- Gray: Share of Population
Failure to Signal

Share of Stops Given a Citation

- BLACK: 18%
- WHITE: 36%
- LATINX: 38%
- ASIAN: 25%
Failure to Signal

![Bar Chart: Search Rate by Race/Ethnicity]

- Black: 45%
- White: 9%
- Latinx: 23%
- Asian: 25%
- Total: 23%
Failure to Signal

- 51 total stops
- 11% of searches resulted in recovery of contraband
- 2% of stops resulted in the recovery of a gun
- 0% of stops resulted in an arrest
Proposed Pretext Stop DGO Effect

- Result in at least 10,000 fewer traffic stops
- Stop an estimated $830,000 in fines and fees annually
- Would help reduce racial disparities in traffic stops by eliminating the number one reason Black drivers are stopped in San Francisco
Q+A

Jacob Denney
@JacobJDenney
JDenney@spur.org