
HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION

City and County of San Francisco

London N. Breed, Mayor



***African American Reparations
Advisory Committee***

Draft Meeting Transcription

November 14, 2022

5:30 p.m.

For more information, contact the Commission Secretary at 415-252-2500
Agenda and other information are available on the HRC website: www.sfgov.org/sfhumanrights

00:04

Good evening, everyone and thank you for gathering for our excuse me African American Reparations Advisory Committee meeting. We will call the meeting to order on this the November 14 meeting. I'm Chair Eric McDonald. Want to first recognize the staff who have been supporting our work for months now. Manager Juell Stewart, Zachary Manuel, and Anjeanette Coats and director Brittni Chicuata certainly want to thank John McKnight, Amelia Martinez Bankhead and Angelique Mahan as well as our amazing secretary, Mulkey Meyer. So with that, Secretary Meyer, do you have any announcements?

00:42

Yes, thank you. Um, this evening's meeting is being held remotely public comment will be available on each item on this agenda. Each speaker will be allowed three minutes to speak. If you are calling in using your telephone, please mute until your phone until you're asked to speak. Please use the raise hand icon or q&a feature to indicate you would like to participate in public comment this evening. Thank you Please come next time. Item number one is called to order a committee roll call. I will announce committee member names and they will announce their present. James Lance Taylor. Tinisch Hollins, present. Eric McDonnell, Present. Dr. Reverend Amos Brown, present. Rico Hamilton. Nikole Cunningham. Gloria Berry, present. Tiffany Carter. I see Gwen Brown. Anietie Ekanem, present. Star Williams, present. Laticia Erving. the meeting can come to order we have quorum

02:53

Thank you very much we can move to Item number two is our land acknowledgement and ancestral acknowledgement. I want to mention that, well, the Rico Hamilton had death in his family,

03:09

Okay, thank you very much for letting us know.

03:12

His aunt passed.

03:13

Thank you. Thank you. So sorry to hear. Okay, with that, we'll move to item number two, which is our land and ancestral excuse me acknowledgments. Member Taylor, you would read the ancestral acknowledgement, please.

03:31

We honor the gifts, resilience, and sacrifices of our Black ancestors, particularly those who toiled the land and built the institutions that established this city's wealth and freedom, despite never being compensated nor fully realizing their own sovereignty. We acknowledge this exploitation of not only labor, but of our humanity and through this process are working to repair some of the harms done by public and private actors. Because of their work, we are here and will invest in the descendants of their legacy.

04:03

Thank you so much. Tiffany Carter, Member Carter was scheduled to read our land acknowledgement this evening. Vice Chair Hollins, would you mind reading that for us?

04:16

Of course, We acknowledge that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the Indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As Guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the Ancestors, Elders and Relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples;

05:01

Thank you so much Vice Chair Hollins. Secretary Meyer, next item, please.

05:07

Thank you. Item number three is a resolution to allow teleconference meetings under California Government Code section 54953. This is an action item. In accordance with the 45th mayoral directive. This resolution allows the African American Reparations advisory committee to convene remote meetings allowing members to attend remotely and allowing the advisory committee to accept public comment remotely. These findings must be renewed every 30 days.

05:43

Thank you, Secretary Myer, we will now go to public comment on this item again, public comment on Item excuse me number three, which is the resolution to allow teleconference meetings of the California Government Code section 54953. Members of public if you'd like to share public testimony on this item, please raise your hand using the icon or q&a feature. And we'd be happy to call on you.

06:16

I don't see anybody indicating they want to participate in public comment on this side. Okay, thank you so much. Seeing none public comment is now closed. Members, I would welcome a motion to approve.

06:34

Thank you, Reverend Brown is there a Second. I Second, thank you. Is there any objection? Hearing none, then unanimous consent to approve. Thank you so much. Madam Secretary. Next item, please.

06:52

Item number four is general public comment. This is a discussion item. This is time when members of the public may address this committee on matters that are within this community jurisdiction, and are not on today's agenda.

07:13

Thank you, Madam Secretary, some members of the public. Again, we always appreciate having you with us. This is an opportunity for general public comment. Again, for items that are not on the agenda. If if something you want to speak to is in fact, on the agenda, we welcome you to wait until we come to that agenda item. And then we'd welcome your public comment on that item at that time. With that, again, please use the raised hand icon or q&a feature and we'd be happy to call on you.

07:45

First, I would like to recognize Raina Johnson. I hope I said your name properly.

07:54

This is actually Alyssa Jones, Raina provided me with the link. So my first question is can I be added to the communications for the Reparations committee because it is something that directly impacts me as a Black resident of San Francisco, and of this country. So I would like to be a part of this process. And I would also like to ask if a separate subcommittee could be created to address the cultural needs that can be that can be addressed during the Reparations process. And no one from the last meeting that I attended, that there were aspects of Black culture that were partially addressed in different committees. But I really think that there should be a separate subcommittee created to address all of those needs. And it might take some of the burden off of the other committee, the other subcommittees as far as developing a plan moving forward and recommendations. Thank you.

09:06

Thank you, and I just want to let anybody know who is attending this evening remotely? If you are not have not been receiving an email from us, please and put your email in the q&a feature. So we can record your email and send you notices. And now I would like to welcome Dennis Williams. Welcome Dennis. Can you hear me? Yes, thank you.

09:35

Thank you. Good evening, everyone. This is Mr. Dennis Williams. D five. Sub Chair of the Fillmore merchants collaborative. No racism, no hate grassroots organization founder. This is my question for Cathy. I'm glad you're back and you had a conference. This is pertaining to our emails for the last two months pertaining to realist Black real estate developers and some of the problems that we face, I just want to highlight some of the things that you had stated that you were looking to and to see if you found anything. In your findings. You said that you were looking to access for contracting jobs, you knew that we were facing issues with expanding credit and bonding to ensure jobs. And you said you would follow up with other city departments. I'm just interested in 60 days, because I haven't heard anything back. And for this, for this body, we need to make sure that we have things in there. That includes Black real estate developers, since real estate industry is one of the largest in San Francisco in California, and is a way to generate immediate economic growth in our communities, and Black general contractors are being or not being included. And it's really decades old policies that have been discriminatory. And so we need really support that at City Hall, please call your supervisors. And please also included in this panel for financial reparation for Reparations immediately. Thank you.

11:13

Thank you, Dennis. I'll send you an update, you know, after this meeting. Now, are there any other members of the public who would like to participate in public comment on this item? This is general public comment on items not included in the agenda. I do see Linda hills. Thank you, Linda. Linda, Can you unmute? Okay, I think there's something happening because, Oh, I see. Linda's unmuted. Okay. Hi, Linda.

12:03

Thank you, I need to pass right now. Thank you.

12:08

Okay, I don't see any other raise hands Chair.

12:12

Thank you very much saying none public comment then is closed. Please call the next item.

12:39

Item number five is Dr. Albert S. Broussard presentation on the history of Black San Franciscans. This is a discussion item. This presentation will provide a historical context of Black San Franciscans migration to San Francisco in the experiences of harm. It is a presentation by Dr. Albert Esper starred Cornerstone Faculty Fellow Professor Afro American history, Texas A&M University and known author. There will be public comment and committee discussion on this item.

13:16

Thank you. We are privileged this evening to be joined by Dr. Broussard, who's a historian and professor, as has been noted, attended Stanford University than undergrad and also designed the African American history curriculum at Texas A&M University. And I will just as a footnote, it is late for Dr. Broussard and we appreciate him being with us this evening, Dr. Broussard happy to turn the floor over to you.

13:40

Well, thank you. And I also worked on the San Francisco Black Historical Context statement a couple of years ago. So that's one of the ways I keep my foot in the door, even though I'm living in the not so great state of Texas these days. So I want to thank, first of all, you personally and the entire human rights commission for the opportunity to take part in tonight's program. I want to remind everyone that I am a historian. So I'm going to talk about history and not necessarily policy, but I'll do whatever I can to answer your questions on that as well. So for those of you not knowledgeable about the history of Blacks in either San Francisco or the state of California, white people have a very intimate history with the state, they go back to the beginning of the state's history. To the Gold Rush period, they began migrating to the state of California, the San Francisco Bay area, like people from all over the world did hope for a better life for themselves and their family and primarily economic opportunity. So by 1860 are about 5000 Black people in the state of California. Most lived in the large urban areas like San Francisco and Sacramento, where they established not only communities but churches, newspapers, they had a conviction movement, a very active convention movement, where they push for for civil rights as well. Well, early campaigns for equal rights because California did hit desegregate African

Americans almost from the time they set foot in the state included segregated schools, the denial of the right to vote, denial and equal testimony in court cases by could not testify against whites. They were denied many of the same rights to public accommodations, particularly riding on public transportation. And not surprisingly, Black women because they depended upon public transportation so much for their jobs brought some of the earliest suits, many of whom which were successful against local railroad companies. By 1880, the state Supreme Court had struck down segregated schools. And from that time, Blacks who had lived in their own schools or attended rural schools began going integrated schools. By the early 20th century, the Black population of San Francisco was relatively modest, it will continue to be modest, really less than 1% of the entire state's population throughout the period until the Second World War. But nonetheless, there there was a very vigorous civil rights movement. And I have argued many times that there were a series of civil rights movement even when the population was small. But this was a time when Blacks were not migrating West in large numbers, Los Angeles would be the one exception. Instead, Black southerners in particular, were leaving the South, we're moving to industrial states, northern industrial states, like Illinois, Pennsylvania, Ohio, where they could get jobs, rarely unskilled jobs, and yet in California, there was a robust NAACP, there were robust churches, there was vigorous civil rights activity among women's organizations. There was a surprisingly large number of white progressives who often worked closely with these racial organizations. But again, because the population was relatively small, the gains were quite modest. There was far less opportunity prior to World War Two for Blacks to work in manufacturing, and industrial jobs. And one of the key obstacles was the inability to gain your union clearance. Thus, effectively, they were frozen out of many union jobs, even jobs that they had dominated in the 19th century, such as waiters are working to hotels by the early 20th century. They were, they were effectively someone mentioned a few minutes ago, how Blacks in certain areas today still struggle. They cannot work in the building trades and most areas, skilled jobs, carpenters, artists and speculators. These kinds of jobs were almost off limits entirely. teachers, doctors, lawyers, nurses, bus drivers, one of the exceptions would be the CIO unions in the 1930s. And even then only a small number relatively small number of Blacks work primarily as longshoreman under the leadership of men like Harry Bridges, Black women almost uniformly lagged behind every single category. They were over represented in domestic service, basically glorified maids, cooks, etc. Even those who were highly educated, Black doctors also face discrimination. They were denied admitting privileges to hospitals, well into the 1950s. Black teachers could not our prospective prospective Black teachers could not attend San Francisco State University to get teaching credentials. The idea was then why trained and when they cannot find jobs when we cannot recommend it for jobs. It's really World War Two, that is the most transformative period in San Francisco's history. The war changed the entire world. And for the first time, we see large numbers of Black southerners, particularly from the states of Texas, and Louisiana, and Oklahoma, leaving the south and moving to California, and particularly the San Francisco Bay area. Just to show you how dramatic this change was. The Black population was slightly shy of, of 5000 people, Black people in 1940. By 1945, it's exceeding about 32,000. And so Blacks are crowding into many of the established Black communities like Western Addition, but they're also living in finding new areas that are built specifically for war times, such as Bayview and Hunters Point, Blacks are being actively recruited to San Francisco to work in the shipyards. My grandmother, for example, left Kansas City, Missouri with two young children until I was born in San Francisco, but they took a chance so she took a chance I interviewed her before she died in the 1970s and she told me she had been a maid her entire life. But saw an advertisement in Kansas City, Missouri, took a welding class

and then took a train to San Francisco where she lived for the remainder of her life. So 10s of 1000s of Blacks, but also many whites crowded into San Francisco, they transformed the community. And yet they found many high paying jobs for the first time. But they also placed a great deal of discrimination. What they found was that yes, they could work, they were making much more money than they had ever made, particularly against the backdrop of 13 years of the Great Depression. But the main unions particularly the Boilermakers unions, which controlled much of the shipyard hiring, were initially segregated, that is, Blacks could not join the main union, they had to join, if they could join at all they had to join segregated ex-hilarate unions. There's a This was followed all the way to the California Supreme Court, which eventually overturned that particular policy. So we see for the first time also, during the war, a sizable number of Black doctors, Black lawyers, Black nurses, Black dentists, Black attorneys, like journalists. And so the kind of community that I grew up in the 1960s and 1970s, was basically the community that came out at that time. There's also an upsurge of civil rights activity during the war years, and the local chapter of the NAACP becomes far more assertive. The National Urban League for the first time organized as a chapter in San Francisco, as does the National Council of Negro Women. This is a byproduct of the 10s of 1000s of not just African American middle class people who come, but also people like Howard Thurman and his wife, Sue Bailey Thurman, who's primarily instrumental in organizing the National Council of liberal women in Thurman with shortly thereafter his arrival organize a what he called the first fully integrated church in the area, that would be the Fellowship Church, which still exists today. These multi multiple institutions are pushing for full equality, something that the small number of Black people have not had. And one of the constant problems in San Francisco was housing, African Americans, and from the very beginning of the city's history been restricted, not necessarily by law, but by custom to particular areas. And so this represented a challenge because as the 1000s, and 1000s of Blacks become pouring into San Francisco during the 1940s. And they stay, they don't go back home at the end of the war. They basically there's just not enough room in the Western Addition to the Fillmore or in Bayview, and Hunters Point. So they began to challenge many of the older restrictions, where Blacks could not live in particular areas. We also see an upsurge of direct action. protests led by both young people from the local high schools, the most important of those groups, I think, was the San Francisco Freedom Movement, which was a combination of core and the NAACP, and interestingly led by a young Black woman, who was a high school student, Tracy Sims at a particular time.

23:18

The 1960s, we began to see redevelopment encroach upon the Black community, including the community as a native of San Francisco. But I lived in the Fillmore district, when many Blacks I don't know the precise number, but basically pushed out of their houses. And as the community began this sort of phase of redevelopment. This was a also a time when many members of the Black middle and professional class would move out of the community. This was part of really suburban growth throughout the state of California. And so we see this phenomenon really all over the state. More Blacks are being promoted, or excuse me, working in jobs, such as teachers and the like. But because of the long standing prejudice and discrimination, the fact that so few Blacks have been able to get into the school district of varying choice Black teacher, interestingly, not until the 1940s. Just think 1942 fewer opportunities. So this has a long term benefits, just like not having housing has a long term benefit of being promoted upward mobility to principals, superintendents, consulars administration positions and the light. I can carry this forward all the way to the present with Silicon Valley. There's

been a recent book by historian Herbert Ruffin on how even today Silicon Valley as a disproportionately lower number of Blacks working in those jobs, there's heard a little outreach and there he believes a great deal of discrimination as well. Let me sort of wrap this up because I can talk all night literally about this that I think The other area that African Americans and I can talk from my own experience, have suffered from historically and perhaps even today is disparate policing. That can be from traffic stops, a disproportionate number of Black people being stopped for minor traffic violations to stop and frisk policies, receiving longer sentences from minor crime, like marijuana possession, to disparate, disproportionate sentences for the use of crack cocaine versus powder cocaine. I know that's been rectified in the criminal justice system. But that has been a problem that has certainly hurt many, many Black people. I think also the poverty in the Black community disproportionately, this led to different health outcomes. Poverty is one of the greatest drivers of poor health, the HIV AIDS epidemic clearly had a disproportionate impact on Black and brown people in the Black community. And that is, in part because of poverty. It's also part of neglect of those communities as well. So these things all have a toll on people both I think their mental health, but also their economic health, particularly the inability to get loans to buy houses, the inability to get loans, to start businesses, even small businesses, the lack of opportunity to start and professional jobs, where you built, you build up a certain amount of capital, and you can advance throughout your career. But also, areas like health care, or the lack thereof, certainly has played a tremendous toll on the Black community. So these are just some of the things I wanted to share with you tonight. And I'll be happy to answer any other questions that either the committee or the audience would like to ask.

26:51

Dr. Broussard, thank you so much appreciate your sharing that historical context. It's a great, it will be a great kind of segway into our next item as we talk about eligibility. So with that, what we're going to do is go to public comment, first rule here public comment. If you have questions, public members, please enter those in the q&a, because we won't be able to enter into an exchange with Dr. Broussard in this in this setting. But if you have comments, we welcome those. So we'll go to public comment first. And then we will return to comments questions from in with the committee. So with that we will open public comment again, a reminder that we invite your public comment on Dr. Broussard presentation. And if you're interested in doing so, please use the raise hand icon or the q&a feature. And we would be happy to call upon you.

27:50

Okay, I believe I see Elissa Jones Gardner. And the name says Raina Johnson on the list. Are you?

28:09

Yes, I'm here now. Thank you. Thank you, Dr. Broussard, for that wonderful presentation. Just a couple of things that I wanted to maybe expound upon a bit as a resident of the Bayview born and raised and third generation now. So within the Bayview many of the people that came here during World War Two, it wasn't a matter of escaping from poverty or seeking other opportunities. Many of them had established themselves. And those opportunities were taken from them systematically. And when I say systematically, I mean through the use of force by the police, either by interrogating or terrorizing people and forcing them into certain locations. Also, it would behoove you to maybe mentioned something about eminent domain since that is an issue that has recurred. Throughout our history,

especially in the Bay View, people weren't merely being pushed out. These were government systems, government laws and processes that were used to strip people of their properties of their homes of their businesses in order to proceed with gentrification. That is something that this committee really should keep an eye on, especially in terms of economics and housing, as that has been a route to remove any sort of progress from Black communities, not just here in California, but across the nation. Furthermore, many Black women were forced into not just service positions or being maids. Many of them did actually get doctoral degrees, but because of racism and discrimination and prejudice that they were facing in their work sites and of the hiring processes. They were not allowed to achieve the highest ranking careers. If you had a, a Black woman that became a doctor, for instance, she would never be called Doctor anything because she was Black, she would always be relegated to being a nurse. And you can verify that with the Black Nurses Association, which is also we have a chapter here as well. But I would like to end my statement by saying, our communities, no matter what has been taken from us or deprived from us, we've always made a way. And that's something that I really want to harken back to. We have made a way with whatever we had by relying on each other and by fostering community and trust. And that is something that we're definitely going to need to build into every single process and every single subcommittee, because there is not that foundation of trust any longer within the Black communities. So that is something that I hope is taken into consideration. Thank you.

31:11

Thank you. Now I want to welcome back Dennis Dennis. Welcome.

31:19

Um, yes, thank you. Thank you, Mr. Broussard for your excellent speech and your vast knowledge, specially pretending to the Fillmore which is my community that I am native to and everyone's largest families. And growing up, my grandmother had 15 Brothers and sisters. So my question is pertaining to the plight of the Fillmore, as you've seen, especially in the real estate as we lost hundreds of Victorians businesses and 60 blocks, I wanted to ask you, do you have any bullet points I could present to the board of supervisors and the department heads that I'm going to talk to you after the Thanksgiving holidays, because they are at least at least my supervisor of the district, Dean Preston, and his staff is interested in listening to things that, you know, to change legislation. And that's the only thing that we can really do to dispel some of these policies, decades old policies. As you know, as you have a vast knowledge, you know, that Black real estate developers and Black contractors build large parts of this city. And that money was trickled down through the communities. Right now, we've lost the ability to employ Black youth and being on site job training, and the young adults and also the women that's in that sector as well. So that's I'm very interested in any bullet points that you can, that you may have, because you have vast knowledge in that because we have to change some of this legislative pass new legislation, excuse me, to change some of these racial and discriminatory policies.

33:00

Thank you. Thanks. Thanks, Dennis. And what we'll do is ask Dr. Broussard to respond to that during our committee discussion.

33:10

Okay, now, I would like to call Jeffrey Greer. Can you hear me?

33:20

Yes. Thank you.

33:22

Hi, how you doing? I just wanted to acknowledge I think it's Dr. Broussard is that the name correct. Any rate? You know, the history, Black people, especially as it pertains to the microcosm of San Francisco is very interesting. And I think it's critical that we have this history. You know, without broadcasting all my stuff, I have a whole production that I do, and it covers a lot of the history into migration after World War Two, and I wanted to thank the doctor for confirming what I'm saying. It just it just is good to review this history. That is all. I will relinquish the west of my time to somebody else. Thank you.

34:09

Thank you, Jeffrey. Now I'd like to welcome Lonnie Mason

34:16

Good evening. Good evening to you Dr. Broussard, thank you for your time and visit. I'm also second generation born in Hunters Point actually on Navy road. Both of my families came from the 40s Oklahoma, Tulsa, Oklahoma mine, my mother's mother, my father, Jesse Mason, and my Auntie Dorothy Edwards, who still lived in Hunts Point. They came from Louisiana, you know, mending mending Louisiana. That's what they're originally from. And so my one of my things is I wanted to ask you a question. If you can do me a favor, if you can get Need some input? On the shipyard? What do you know about the shipyard? And what's taking place? And what's going on? And what took place back then? Also, I wanted to I didn't I didn't hear if you mentioned it or not, I didn't. Were you born in San Francisco? When we if you weren't, you know, when? And are? Where did you come from? What state? And when did you leave? Thank you.

35:29

Thank you. Now, I would like to welcome Frederick Martin.

35:39

Thank you for that presentation. I know it was a short time to talk about a lot of history. But I appreciate it. I know, a couple of things stood out to me. And I think it was Dennis from the public talked about the housing developers and contractors and the lack there of opportunities, and, you know, different areas, I think that really needs to be at the top of the list. Because while we're talking about doing all these things for people, 50% of the unhoused population are Black and brown identified. So if they get displaced out of the city, or for whatever reasons, are no longer here, or if they die on the streets, who are we really doing some of this for, and I feel like we're, you know, if we don't talk about and keep the least of us at the forefront, and really address those, those are the most marginalized, and the most discriminated against. So I just think that needs to be addressed. On a higher level, seniors and people with disabilities, I don't often hear a lot about it. And for those two populations, it's often said, Oh, well, they got a lot of money, or there's money thrown at them. No, they receive the worst of what they've built. You know, I really think our forefathers, our four mothers did a lot. And then the last thing, and they need to be respected and valued, and put at the top of the list for all of these Reparations. Um,

because I think they even probably experienced it worse than we have in this day and age. And then also, um, I don't hear this addressed a lot. I know, in different Black circles, I talked about doing this, or I tried to participate in it. But it just fizzled off the anti Black racism in the workplace, while we talk about building and having these great jobs. And yes, it comes from systemically white, or mostly white run organizations or other races. However, it does happen in Black LED and Black owned organizations, too. So I think, all across the board, we really need to take a look at that. Because once we get the jobs or once we're in these positions, or whatnot, people view us differently and treat us differently. And it's just a real serious issue. You know, and I just I think it needs to be addressed and put at the forefront because we're getting all these things in place. And yes, maybe that'll come later. But the maintenance and the sustenance, we really have to look at that too. And I think include this and put it in the Reparations advise advisements.

38:28

Thank you for your comments. Frederick, are there any other members of the public would like to comment on this item, please use the raise hand icon or q&a feature. I do not see any other hands raised chair McDonald.

38:51

Thank you so much saying none public comment then is closed. So we will now turn to the committee. Committee members. If you'd like to, excuse me, ask a question or make a comment. Please raise your hand just that I know that you're in the queue. I do that said want to start with Dr. Broussard. Give him an opportunity to respond to a couple of the questions that were raised, perhaps starting with the one. Where are you from? And where are you people from? And then we can we can go from there. Yeah, that's

39:25

the easiest one. That's where I'm gonna start up. So I was born in San Francisco, and I'm gonna give away my age and 1950. So my mother came from Kansas City, Missouri, my father from Louisiana. They met in California, and I was actually born on the Presidio and let them in hospital. So my father had served in the military, I don't know for how long I have actually written a book about another Black family over the course of two generations. So it's sort of triggered my interest in my own family. So I've been working on my own Family history for about a decade. But the problem is that it's hard finding records of Black people, even someone who has worked in Black history for almost half a century. And so in my father's case, for example, the records when he served in the military were destroyed. And one of the great fires that took place, I believe in St. Louis. And so it doesn't matter how many contexts I have, and how many techniques I have, how many times I've written, they're just no documents that are available. So what little I know is from what I gained from my mother, through conversations when she was still alive, and my grandmother, and a handful of electric workers, so I, I am a product of the San Francisco Public Schools from K through 12. I grew up in a Western Addition, I went to a Raphael Weill we all I don't know if it's still there. I actually grew up in public housing, something that most people, given where I am today just won't believe, right. But I lived in public housing until I was 20 years old. And as I told everybody, it was either public housing and no housing at all right, we had a roof over our heads, we had generally something to eat. My mother always stressed education. The schools back then, where I didn't understand what segregation really meant as a young child. And they weren't

legally segregated. But I went to the RAF. When I went to Ben Franklin, where I where I attended junior high school, it's gotten a different name now. 80 to 90% of the students were Black, right? Raphael Weill few all, about 80% of the students were Black, and about 12% of the students were Asian at that particular time. And from there I did one semester at City College of San Francisco and I, I went to Stanford for four years, applied to California universities, for graduate school. But then I got a full ride to go to Duke. So I went to Duke as graduate school, moved back to California to write a dissertation, which is on the Black community of San Francisco. And the only other time I've lived in San Francisco for any extended period of time, is when I was a visiting professor at UC Davis between 1970 and 1980. So I have not technically lived as a resident in San Francisco for more than four decades. And so I was just out there this summer on a collaboration with the National Park Service and the Organization of American history. I was part of the original group of people looking at the West when Western routed the underground railroad to Mexico. And so I was asked to lead a series of panel discussions over four or five days in San Francisco. And it's just amazed to see how the community has changed. And I don't mean just the Western Addition, which has changed from night and day, but but somebody says, Yeah, I will. Oh my god, I went to raphael weills.

42:52

Its Rosa Parks now Benjamin Franklin's not Benjamin Franklin anymore. Let me tell you a story quickly about Vidya Franklin, I'll try to get some of the other questions. So my mother came out and attended what was called Girls High in the 1940s. And so as part of doing this family history of my own family, I was working in Special Collections at the San Francisco Public Library, and they all know my work. So they go overtime to help me out. So I got all the yearbooks from girls high, you know, girls high became Benjamin Franklin, we went to the exact same school except it was called Girls High at the time. It's interesting to look at the yearbooks from the 30s, the late 30s to the early 40s. It is night and day, you don't see very many Black girls at girls high in the 1930s, early 40s. By about 1942. It is completely changed. This is what I meant when I said when Blacks started pouring into the Western tradition, they had to go somewhere, right? They had to live somewhere. They had to go to school somewhere. And my mother was a product of that as well. So I am a product of San Francisco. Let me let me talk. Try to address Mr. Mason's questions about the shipyards. So the San Francisco Chamber of Commerce in the San Francisco Bay Area had the largest shipyard employment in the entire world during World War Two. Now, I've never been able to actually verify that, but I often use that quote. So let's just say a whole lot of people Black and white, worked in the San Francisco shipyards, and for Black people, that was very, very important, because these were Black southerners, for the most part, not not entirely, who had not a whole lot of education. My grandmother came out to work at a shipyard and she had only had an eighth grade education. And and so they were making a lot of money. Yes, they faced discrimination. There were certain jobs they couldn't do. But they still made more money than they had ever made in their lives. They were prevented from certain jobs or promotion supervisory, it would actually be a migrant by the name of Joseph James who headed to San Francisco branch of the NAACP, who came out who fought this particular case to break down the segregated auxiliary unions in the 1940s. So they're there. I don't remember the precise number. I think seven or eight shipyards in the Bay Area marine ship was one of the biggest Kaiser was another big one. And so all up and down the Pacific coast, Black people are flocking to these major cities, San Francisco, Richmond, Vallejo, Oakland, LA, San Diego, Portland, Seattle, to work in and wartime industries, but the San Francisco Bay Area just explodes at this particular time. And when Blacks come in, remember, there's not enough

housing, there would not have been enough housing under any circumstance, because there just wasn't enough. But this is this was a time when the Japanese community had been taken away. They had been relocated during the wartime relocation, and Blacks began, these migrants began moving in to many of the houses and occupying many of the businesses in the Western Addition that the Japanese had had occupied. And so there was always this uneasy tension when the Japanese were released from those relocation camps and came back to their communities. One of the neighborhood community centers that occupied as a young kid was the Buchanan YMCA, which had as its head a Japanese man by the name of your a water. He was one of the most important people in San Francisco, he won the title of Mr. San Francisco one year, he was like a surrogate father, not just to me but hundreds and hundreds of other Black kids at that particular time. When I first started going to the Buchanan why Japanese people used it some days of the week, Black people used it some days of the week, and eventually only Black students used it to be canon. Why, prior to becoming a law, a joint Community Center Advan, a Black had been turned into a Black us soul during World War Two, as I was doing some research for a paper that I delivered a couple of years ago. Lo and behold, Dory Miller, the famous hero of Pearl Harbor, came through the Black uso, which was to be canon why as he swung through San Francisco, and one of his many, many times, the very first comment from the woman who grew up in the Bay View, I agree with almost everything you see it, gentrification. This is what I meant when I said that how these communities began to change in the 90x. I remember this mainly from the Fillmore because I knew people in my community, who basically were told they had to, to leave their homes, right out our business or sell their businesses. In order for redevelopment to take place they were giving given these, I'll call them certificates. I don't know, the precise word that was used to look for other kinds of housing, which was almost impossible. But that was a way and it's been a way traditionally to destroy Black communities all over the country. So I don't know what the communities are like. Now, you said we have the lack of trust. One of the things you noted, which I agree completely with is the persistence that Black people had in trying to better themselves by establishing in some cases, parallel communities, parallel institutions, churches, community centers, whatever it took, if you pointed out to get pot, Dennis's question about feel more real estate, I wish I had an answer to that how to stop the loss of Black property, changing discriminatory laws. Let me just say that this has taken place you ready for this doesn't matter if it's Willie Brown, or London breed or some white person who happens to be mayor, it has taken place, no matter who happens to sit on the set of San Francisco Board of Supervisors. So I don't know the answer to that. I know when I was living in San Francisco, Willie Brown are one of the most powerful and popular Black legislatures in the history of the state of California. homeless population just exploded, right. I mean, there was very little that he could do in that particular role. So I will certainly if you email me, I will certainly do my best to suggest we're really talking about political power. Dennis, which is something Black people haven't had a whole lot of in San Francisco. What exacerbates this problem is the fact that San Francisco has lost more Black people in terms of population than any major city from 1970 to the present. Think about that. And that's happening all over the country in western cities. It's happening in Denver, Colorado as well, where Blacks are leaving many of the long standing historical districts like the central district in Denver moving out to suburban communities like like Aurora. Let's see if I got everybody. I think I did.

50:08

Okay. Did. Yes. Thank you, Dr.Broussard. Appreciate that. All right. Let's go to committee members. Member Taylor, please.

50:16

Oh, Dr. Broussard. My name is James Taylor. I just want to take a moment of privileges to say thank you. I want to thank Joelle Stewart as well, because when she asked me a general question as to what scholars, committee members would recommend you, you want to top my list. I teach at USF. And I've been there 20 years. I've used your book so many times in my urban politics class. I think the committee needs to understand that there's not a single living scholar who's written a more important book that every member in this committee should read backwards and forwards. Then then your book, I've read Gretchen Lemke Santiago's book, on Black women that came to the San Francisco Bay area, I read the book, Black prophets of rage, that really documents East Bay of Black World War Two period in migration to Richmond and Oakland, but no scholar, alive, or in the past has written a book like yours. And so I just want to thank you as a, you know, I'm a full professor. But you know, I just, you know, I'm still, you know, as far as I'm concerned in the prime of my career, and I just want to thank you for writing that book, because I use it in my in my research as often as I possibly can, because nobody has documented the period that we need to focus on as a committee, the, you know, slavery, I don't know how, what your position is on this is, and Reverend Brown, I would love if I could get you and Reverend Brown, and John Templeton on a committee, we could reconstruct the entire history of San Francisco in one day with the three of you sitting there, and we'd have to get a sister or two on the committee tube. But you know, the brain trust that you represent and Dr. Brown represents, I respect it so much. And I just cannot thank you. And I hope the committee members who have not read your book, will order it tomorrow on Amazon or wherever they need to order it on, it needs to be read, because what you document is the injury we're trying to remedy. It's the main point we are not dealing with slavery, we're dealing with the point, the history from 1920, I think your book begins with on forward that you document the struggles and the injury. And that's what I've been trying to tell this committee and the entire time is our focus is not necessarily slavery, although the state played the game of the fugitive slave clause. And we know about the history of PG tivity in the city. But nobody has documented what you've documented. So I just want to say is one scholar to another, we could not have asked if this committee wanted to imagine a book that needed to be written for His purpose, your book would be the book that was written, and we need to have it on the top. In fact, I just wrote up a bibliography about four days ago for this committee, a nine page bibliography. And the number one book on my list was your book. So that's how much I respect you. And I want everyone to understand that. Thank you so much for your work. Thank you.

53:10

Thank you. I USF is dear to my heart. I want you to know my wife has graduated USF and I spent many, many, many months they're sitting in the library using their archives and special collections in their collection. Working on this book, so yeah, very much. So. Thank you. I really appreciate your comment.

53:27

Thank you so much, Dr. Prasad. If you don't have a publicist, you may have found one I have. Professor Taylor. Thank you member Taylor. Alrighty. Let's go to a member Barry, please. Thank you, Chair.

53:41

Thank you Mr. Broussard. I I went to RAF I will win pasture ground with his summer school there. So I've been in that building. Now's a great experience. Um, sir, thank you for your presentation. Could we hear your thoughts on harm through transportation and infrastructure and how it included destroying a lot of Black businesses, like how the Fillmore was bulldozed, Geary street expanded, so White's could get home to work faster. Divisadero gentrify and the T train on Third Street that force a lot of businesses to close. Also before you answer if member acronym could consider if not already in report free Muni and free hybrid cars. Also a member Landry, I believe proposition I just passed and it stated to repair harm due to transportation, so maybe you can include that money be really used to do that in our policy. So Mr. Broussard harm due to transportation and infrastructure.

54:47

So I'm going to focus on the communities that I know best and one was the widening of Geary Street, which did tremendous damage to the Black community and some damage to the Japanese community if I remember correctly And so that used to be just a regular narrow street. But the whole idea behind widening Geary Street, if I remember correctly was to allow whites particularly who lived, I think was called the Sunset District to be able to get downtown quickly to their jobs. And so they didn't have to go 25 or 30 miles for whatever the speed limit is on streets and paths to these predominantly minority neighborhoods. And you could see how even as a teenager, how it affected the businesses, the housing, just the sort of general flow of the way the community was developed. And I didn't understand what gentrification and redevelopment was as a teenager, probably none of us did. But we saw it with our own eyes. I saw this process. Also, as I got a little older, I was in college by this time, with how Market Street and parts of other communities were changed with Bart, if you're old enough to remember that, and there was a big cow and cry among those merchants, because it really did hurt him as well. But this idea of gentrifying communities is disproportionately hurt Black and brown communities the most, because they have less power, less voice, their politicians generally don't have the clout. It's generally businessmen and business women, white, who make these decisions. And and it doesn't matter as far as they concerned. In other words, they do this in the in the sort of bits, it's really about business as far as they're concerned. And that's going to outweigh everything else. I wish I know about more about some of these other communities. But I bet it's the same old song no matter what community you're talking about, and that they're going to tout this as progress, irrespective of what harm it does to the lives of people to the connections that people have in those communities. Even if they display cemeteries, we see this all over the country, right and final resting places for people, it doesn't matter if they're predominantly Black and brown areas, we see this with hazardous waste. Garbage Disposals, this is why there's more toxic air and Black communities all over the country, industrial racism, I think it's what is referred to, because they can get away with this kind of thing. And white communities just have more political clout, they just don't let this happen in our community. So I'm sorry to hear it's still going on. I unfortunately, only get to San Francisco by once a year now because of my other obligations. But this this has been an ongoing problem, ever since I was literally a teenager in San Francisco.

57:42

Thank you, doctor, Broussard. Member Ekanem please.

57:47

Thank you so much for everything that you talked about today. And I absolutely believe what Dr. Taylor has said. Your book is absolutely amazing. More people need to read it. And I think I have two questions. One, could you talk a little bit about the impact of Blacks not getting things like the GI Bill, for example? And what effect that that sort of had on us as a whole because I think there'll be federal programs that if you take a look present dollar today, I mean, trillions of dollars that went to pretty much build a white middle class, right? And RP, RP bill, our ancestors who actually fought just as hard if not harder, came back and they didn't get much of anything. So I'd love to like for you to touch base on that. And then to something else that you said about yourself, and sort of it was just hard to find records of my family's history, right. Like, I think that's one of the things that we're taking a look at. I'd love to sort of hear more about that. Because we might be asking a lot of people who don't have access to all of this to somehow try to figure it out. And if a scholar like you, who does this finds it difficult. I don't know how it's going to be any easier for anyone else. Okay,

59:10

so let me start with the GI Bill, which I talk about every year, my Black history and my American history classes. Not only did it impact the lack of Black wealth by their inability to get housing, cheap housing, but also the federal government. I believe it was the Federal Housing Agency. I just actually, my own notes on this early this afternoon, would not allow banks to approve loans. In many areas, they literally draw a line a red line among any many areas. The other thing we often forget is that the GI Bill also gave people access to pay for education, not just colleges, but also community colleges, technical schools, technical training, and this was an era when most Black people who would have qualified for the GI Bill, both and housing Black were from the south. And so the schools were segregated. And so they were at a disadvantage, because they often had less opportunity to take advantage of this. And they could not go to the best schools think about some of the segregation struggles, such as James Meredith, who an Air Force veteran who wanted to attend Ole Miss, right? Because he said it was the only school that had the program. And it caused the riot, right? The President of the United States had to send out troops for one student, and we see that played out again and again. So I think it has a terribly disproportionate impact and a disparate impact, a tremendous amount of harm, if you don't start how housing is how most of us, and I know this to be true in California, even more in Texas build up generational wealth, right? I mean, my mother left me nothing, but that was okay. Right, because she gave me the tool, she gave me a good education, right to take care of myself. But many people, most people, their parents do build up wealth over generations. And and housing is the best way to do that. The other way is through course, good jobs, if you have a good job, you have a pension program, most of my wealth, because I've taught for 46 years is in the stock market that doing so well today, but generally over the course of the decades, right? Black people have almost no assets as a group compared to whites, because they have not been able to build up generational wealth, through housing, through pensions through stocks and bonds. And much of that ties back to the lack of opportunities and things like the GI Bill, you could always you could go actually all the way back to World War One, when Black returning soldiers from World War One, were not allowed the same benefits by going to American Legions as white soldiers, they basically discriminated on the basis of race. And so are our two Black Civil War soldiers. If you want to go back that far as well, they struggled first of all, they didn't get the same pay as white soldiers. And then at the end of the war, they had to fight for their pensions, right. So after every but the GI Bill more recently, I think is a great example. Because it really set Black

people they man called Malcolm X use this sort of analogy, you don't start a race with someone 70 miles behind and tell them okay, now run the race, everything is fair, you're never going to catch up. Certainly when you have that kind of Start and life. And that's, I think what the GI Bill both with housing education has done. Let me talk just briefly about family history. So I say I'm having trouble I am having trouble. Because unlike the history of the Stuart family, which took me 10 years to write, they left an enormous body of hundreds of boxes of family papers, scrapbooks, photographs at Howard University. So I went there over the course of many, many summers and red those collections. But I also interviewed I literally went around the world to Hawaii and the Virgin Islands, and everywhere they had lived and interviewed surviving family members. In my particular case, more typical, we were a working class family, that's a nice way to say we were poor, right? So we don't, my family did not live leave much in the way of personal papers. My mother because I was historian by that time before she passed away in 1998. Made it certain made sure that she divvied up all of the family photographs to all of the children. I have two brothers and one sister, she also gave me every letter she had my father, they had been separated for a long time, not very many, three or four and, and some fine family records as well. So I have bits and pieces, right of my family. But it's hard to sort of write a narrative. And, again, I have a lot of training. I mean, I can go on ancestry, I can look at the world war one draft records. I mean, I know 1000 different ways to get at the history of people. And it's tough for me. So I can't imagine how difficult it is. What I would suggest to people is that when their parents are still alive, that's the time to talk to parents. Right? Don't Don't wait until they're 90 years old. Certainly don't wait until the guy because there's just a lot of things you're never going to find out. So I had the opportunity to interview my mother, my grandmother multiple times. Unfortunately, it's tough interviewing family members. They're just certain things they just don't want to talk about. Right. And so a lot of things I said, I have to speculate every every one of us have some skeletons in the closet. We don't want to bring out right, but that's the only way we're going to get it to histories of our families.

1:04:52

Thank you for that.

1:04:53

Thank you so much Dr.Broussard. I'm sorry, I'm American and we could say something else.

1:04:58

I'll just go Cardinal

1:05:03

Dr. Broussard, a couple of questions from community, I want to lift up and then committee members want to begin to turn towards closing on this item. So if you'd like to speak or ask a question, please lift raise your hand so that I know that you are in the queue. A couple of questions Dr. Broussard first. Can you speak at all to the impact of nuclear testing in the Naval Shipyard on Black longshoremen and their families?

1:05:29

I cannot, I was part of a group a panel did a keynote on the Chicago Port Chicago explosion last year where there they are building a visiting center and some kind of memorial. Robert Allen wrote a very

good book on that where he I believe, posits the thesis hypothesis that perhaps that was a nuclear explosion. But I don't know much. That's that's an area that's really kind of beyond my expertise.

1:06:00

Sure. Thank you very much. And then one other looking for your perspective, in terms of the outward migration of Black people. Do you What's your perspective on is that potentially due to daily anti Black racism, in community in jobs and in education?

1:06:18

I think it has to do and I'm going to confine this primarily to western communities where we're I've studied them all. Cost of living, I think is paramount. The fact that when Black people look around they look at California or Oregon or Washington, and they think well, this this is not much different than Atlanta, or or Charleston, or some of the Southern or Louisiana and well, maybe Louisiana is not a good example, but many other communities. I'll give you one short example. I was born in San Francisco, as were my two brothers. Were all living in College Station, Texas. Now. They both moved here a decade, decade and a half ago. Cost of living was one factor. But I think to be with extended family members is well, cost of living in California is prohibitive for many people. And it's one of the reasons though I had been offered jobs to come back over the years, the cost of housing alone was enough to say thank you, but no, thank you. So this reverse migration has been going on a long time. It's been going on for a couple of decades now. And I don't I don't know California was one of the states if I remember in the last census that lost a couple of congressional seats, because they lost population. Texas was one of those places that gained two seats, because they have gained population, most of it through the Hispanic population to be sure. But this reverse migration of Black people leaving other states and going back to the south, I don't think it's going to slow down anytime soon.

1:07:51

Yeah, I really appreciate that one. One final question, if I may. And that is, you referenced the you know, the importance of to the degree possible folks gathering family history? Are you aware of any templates guides that folks might find online or elsewhere that could help support having again, those sometimes, as you mentioned, difficult conversations with family members?

1:08:14

No, I mean, there are a couple of good books on oral history, one of which the eye I've used, it's just called doing or doing oral history by Donald Ritchie, Donald Ritchie has done a second edition was the Associate Head of the US Senate. He was a past president for many years ago of the Oral History Association. I am a former president, the Oral History Association. And so I assigned it from time to time when I work with upper level students or graduate students who want to do community work, for example, there's a particular way, there was an enormous Black and brown Oral History Project, which a number of Texas historians and it's online, it's called the Black. And if you just Google Black and Hispanic oral history project, those interviews were conducted all over the state of Texas, by graduate students who were trained, they use state of the art techniques, best practices are videotaped. And the important part is that they're great teaching A's because you can go online, and I can and just segments of the interview or put so you don't need to show an entire interview, you can just show whatever segment of the interview, 123 minutes, five minutes, 10 minutes. And it's something that I

use, actually, every semester. There's also a very short notice not too short now and think about it. But book published on the Black and Brown Oral History Project, which students can find it's in paperback, or even scholars can find and, and I bought a copy of it recently, I mean, in the spring at a conference, and so that is very useful, where they don't look, I don't compile all of the interviews. So those are great guides as well. But I think just first of all learning how to do oral history and it's not just having a casual conversation. I mean, there's a ticular way you, you want this to really be a historical document something that can stand the test of time and be useful you and useful for other people as well.

1:10:10

Thank you so much. Vice Chair Hollins.

1:10:16

Thank you Chair McDonald. Thank you, doctor broussard. We're sorry, this has been so informative. I really, I'm a history buff. So I really appreciate just taking a glimpse back at our city's history, I had two questions, wondering if you could speak to so one is if you have any insight on the historical relationship between banks and insurance institutions in San Francisco, like Wells Fargo and others, in their interactions with the Black community. The second is around the San Francisco waterfront, poor Embarcadero. Many of us I'm one of the cofounders of SF Black Wall Street in our organization, started our work. After we got more insight on the history of San Francisco, particularly William lead a store in Maryland pleasant, and learned about the establishment of the first businesses in the San Francisco waterfront. So just wanted to know if you had more insight around beyond our migration to port cities like San Francisco, and the economic boom that came with that migration. Any other participation we had in the development of the San Francisco waterfront of the poor or discrimination related to that?

1:11:31

Yeah, well, two things come to mind. One is a very short book by Liz Parker who did. And she might have collaborated with Jim abajian on this many, many decades ago. So I think it's a walking history of Blacks in San Francisco, that that's kind of an approximate title. And it's not very exhaustive, but at least it'll give you some sense of sort of where some Black historical sites are. Other than that, banks and insurance companies, you know, thing that comes to mind is that they simply did not employ Blacks for very long period of time, irrespective of their qualifications, right. And so and I think they would, they would probably acknowledge that, in fact, was the case, I actually worked for Bank of America as a summer intern for three summers, they at the world headquarters, and they offered me a full time job as a banker as a what I'm trying to think of the position where you give loans to can you imagine me as a banker? Well, I guess so. I don't think it would have been particularly fulfilling thing. But this this was in 7273. And so I think by that time, they had acknowledged the fact they were bringing in Black vice presidents, at least at the national headquarters that world headquarters it, as it was called, I believe, was on Kearney street. But for a long time. I mean, you didn't even have Wi Fi but the local branches in the Western Addition, in the Fillmore where I live, my wife actually worked in Wells Fargo as a teller when I was a graduate student, but that would have been 70 to 7677. So by that time, you will begin to see at least a smattering of Black and brown people working in those offices. But I don't think their history was very good. And I think they would acknowledge that as well. They're not going to probably give you access to personnel records. But interestingly, some of the some of the works that I cited in, I believe my San Francisco book, which was published now over 30 years ago,

looked at these were studies done by the Council for civic unity. And they looked at businesses and industries all over San Francisco, to see how many Blacks were employed in many of those major industries. So that might be that that study is still available. I mean, I can't remember where I got it. It's been such a long period of time, but it's available. I remember, I got it on your blog, interlibrary loan. But I also interviewed Edward Halligan, who was a big name in in San Francisco, and worked for a number of different agencies. And so he granted me an interview. And so we talked about that as well. I wish I could help you more on the San Francisco waterfront, I just don't know much more about the history except that there were a lot of Black people, particularly around the time or prior to the famous earthquake and fire in 1906, who lived along that waterfront area. And as you know, that devastated Blacks and, and whites as well. One of the reasons that the Black population declines relative to Oakland to Black population, I maintain is because so many of those homes that Blacks lived in the downtown area or the waterfront were destroyed. And so they simply went across the bay that that is what I speculated that time. And so Oakland is my population always been slightly ahead of San Francisco. But during the war, many more Blacks come into San Francisco and I don't know what the relative populations are. I would suspect today Oakland has a much larger Black population than San Francisco. If for no other reason, the cost of living

1:15:00

Excellent. Okay. If there are no other questions or comments from committee members Yes. Reverend Brown. Unmute, sir. You're muted now, you're still muted There you go.

1:15:27

Thank you, Mr. Chair, members of Task Force. Dr. Broussard, thank you for coming via technology Yes, I know for some it may be difficult to connect the pieces because of racism and because as a present Controversy indicates the powers that be come up with this foolishness about critical race theory, boogie man and always about the full self serving white folks mess it up is a race of people not experiencing historical racial and ethnic Alzheimer's they've insulted us by telling us again about your history. And some of us have been naive enough to say weak enough to believe and I say this respectfully. It my roots go back to Franklin County, Mississippi, five generations and I have right here before me this book thanks to the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints did and ancestors search on my maternal and you know what? My great great great grandfather Patrick Brown, born enslaved in Franklin County, Mississippi, in 1821. And in 1882 in this document, they are the receipts that he bought 150 acres of land paid for that land with three payments. He was born in Roxy. Same County where Richard Wright row like boy native song. On my mother's side, Rafe Robinson, and his brother William voted in every election and has gone to Mississippi from 1878 at 97 found the times when that Ku Klux Klan was that its heights keep us from being in franchise. I'm not saying all to be braggadocious but I'm saying we need to stop here and that boogie man. You can't get the records. Some maybe where there was some burnings? Yes. But there's nothing that you cannot find. You know, we will file Amala and I have it here before me. I also found that I was stopped by but I want to give everyone whose evidence Dr.Broussard you and your great work started in 1900. And you have some preceding chapters, but I have right before you. I see that. Yes. This lady who was the founder of Third Baptist Church.

1:19:45

Eliza Davis came here in 1850. Her husband Russell preceded her two years They were from Albemarle County, Virginia. And they own over there at heart of Vallejo piece of property. They used to be a powerhouse. But they turn that power house into a two story facility. And when the white first Baptist was such hypocritical, followed with Jesus, and would let them sit on the main floor, but they had to go up to the balcony that allows the deepness and let's get out of here. And Third Baptist was founded August 1 1852, which was the anniversary of abolition of slavery in the British West Indies. But I was able to get all this information about Eliza. I won't try to steal the time to tell it all. But I had this article blown up. Oh, an auto biographical interview.

1:21:13

Reverendan Brown, gonna pull the book down just so we can hear you clearly. Yeah, it's blocking your mouth.

1:21:19

Okay. She did an auto biographical interview with the examiner newspaper. She lived to be 103 four months and 18 days. And once she died, she was still able to see clear and could hear. But I sighted to say, don't throw up your hands and say what's impossible? Let's make the effort and connect with the right folks. Well, that church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints has the largest collection of ancestor information. And let me say also, I've always had this romance with history. Because at the age of 13, in Jackson, Mississippi, I happen to see all my father's bookshelf, a book that intrigued me, Dr. Prasad. It was the history of the Negro rates from 1619 to 1880. And who wrote it, it was not cottagey Woodson, as we've been ill informed. It was a Black Baptist preacher named George Washington, Williams, who wrote the first history of the Negro race. And that book of mine, I have longed to the Smithsonian so that those who go there will see that you can, if you keep on searching, and keep on digging, not let nobody tell you that you don't have a history. You can find it. And I've also gone all the way to Africa. And there's confirmed that my roots go back to Europe, Nigeria, on my dad's side, and on my mother's side camera. So y'all, let's get busy. Let's get in these communities and have our young people hook up was it was a church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, they have all the technology and pass it on one generation to the next. And that's really why I'm so excited about our making sure that no more comes out of this Reparations program. I hope much of what you want comes out of it, but we must not let that fillmore area go. That heritage building belongs to us. And if we let the folks wipe it out, we should be ashamed of ourselves. We should keep that which belongs to us, which we slayed for and they tricked us out of so that our children will be able to come by and see evidence of how we made it in spite of what Peter Burnett said, and did to us in 1857 - 58 when he voted against Arthur Lee, and wanted to send them back to Mississippi as an enslaved person of Charles Stovall. So God bless you. And I don't drop one other thing. As we come to the end of this report. Mr. Mr. Chairman, and members, since Christmas is a time of giving Are we looking forward to next year, given this report, but this year we ought to have in every Black church not looking for mistletoe not singing, I Saw Mommy Kissing Santa claws But we would get our people engaged Miss Barrett, on talking about preaching about Reparations, and the gift that this city owes African Americans. Well, they just placed us they push us out. It was not just economics. If it will own the economics, Dr. Broussard, why do we have all Asians here? I know part of his culture. But they are here, outnumbering us beating their chests and crowing. But we got to get away from this rugged individualism. And that came to us through the willie Lynch, let us check it out. He made every effort to divide us divide the light skinned from the dark skin,

tear up the tall families with that skin. Let us not say we don't need to experience buku because we are therefore I am. And out of this Reparations effort. If we ought to be concerned about the family making a family affair and not be any of these greedy, extreme capitalists. Were only looking out for me, my and I

1:26:41

Reverend Brown. God bless you. It's late for Dr. Broussard got a hold on me? Yes, it's late for doctor but we got to look out for each other. And make sure that this world will respect us and we will never become victims of historical amnesia and Alzheimer's. Keep an eye on memory and time. And never forget the blessings and the problems that God has been good to us. And we all to make sure that this commission hang tough not let that be inefficient. And we always concerned about what's good for the people, the people. Thank you.

1:27:33

Thank you, Dr. Brown. Dr. Broussard, again, on behalf of both the committee, community and certainly the the place of history you have represented for your career. We appreciate you not just tonight, but for all that you represent. So thank you so much for being with us this evening. If you want to make final comments before you sign off, you're welcome to do so.

1:27:59

I just want to thank everyone who asked questions. This was a great learning experience for me meeting the committee finding out and I'm still learning about the work you're doing because I didn't know much about this until a couple of months ago and I will be more than happy as you move forward to try my best to given my schedule to be a resource to you in the committee as well.

1:28:21

Thank you so much, Dr. Broussard, have a good evening. Okay, thank you. Alright, with that we will close this item. Madam Secretary, please call the next item.

1:28:33

Item number six is reviewed, discuss and approve Reparations eligibility recommendations for the final report to the Board of Supervisors. This is a discussion and possible action item. The San Francisco African American Reparations Advisory Committee will review different eligibility models presented to the advisory committee and lead a discussion about determining eligibility requirements. This will be led by our chair Eric McDonnell, our Vice Chair to ToNish Hollins and there will be public comment and committee discussion on this item.

1:29:10

Thank you so much. Vice Chair Hollins, did you want to open it you want me to open? Okay, so members, what we're going to do as per our prior discussion, our special meeting, I should say, last Monday, the seventh where we prior to that had determined that we would first determine the what of Reparations and where we would focus and we have a good robust set of recommendations that we're still working on working towards what will become the final draft and submission to the Board of Supervisors. And I'll come back to that in just a moment. And so we said we would do that and then we

would come to tonight's discussion on the who, who should be eligible for receiving all that we will recommend and certainly we want to hold that we will receive what we recommend. And so what we've what you're going to hear in just a moment from Vice Chair Hollins is an initial set of draft eligibility criteria. The idea being how can we frame and hold a set of criteria, that is clear. And that represents our intention to provide redress, and repair to all the harms we've discussed tonight and throughout our process. So with that, we're gone. I'm going to turn it over to Vice Chair Hollins, what we will do is hear from Vice Chair Hollins, we will then go to public comment on the eligibility criteria, and then the other ideas community might have, then we will come back for discussion. And as Secretary Meyer said, possible action on adopting a set of criteria that we certainly will have time to refine but at least have directional intentions that will become a part of the report that will submit with that, I'll turn it over to Vice Chair Hollins.

1:31:19

Thank you, Chair McDonnell. And thank you for just setting the context. I wonder if you would also go for the members of the public maybe stepping into this talk a little bit about the development or or how these recommendations have come to be just for framing?

1:31:39

Sure, I wouldn't like to to particular pieces that informed this criteria. One is that we wanted to capture and we've made several references throughout our process. And even again, tonight, that in large part, the harms that have taken place in San Francisco, are not direct chattel slavery harms their descendants. So but not direct chattel slavery harms, and sold the harms in San Francisco, really center around urban renewal, they center around harms related to real estate to property, to lost wages, to health impacts and harms etc. And so these criteria that focus on both the specifics of a time period against what I what I just referenced. And then secondly, they also represent and this will be will be part of our discussion. ways in which we can focus, dare I say, target the receipt of Reparations to Black folks, as we know, we've got both legal and I won't say I won't say the number or the words, because I don't want to get into a fight tonight. But we have legal barriers and hurdles to move around. And so this tries to create the proxies that give us a clearer way of saying who we intend and who we believe should receive the Reparations. So those are the two really main drivers of what you'll hear in the draft eligibility criteria.

1:33:29

Thank you so much, Chair McDonnell.

1:33:32

With that, team, can we go to the first slide in this? I really appreciate the framing. And I want to thank all the members of the committee and the members of the public who have participated in this conversation in this discussion, bringing forth ideas, a robust set of criteria for eligibility, I realized that when we talk about quantifying harm, specifically for Black Americans of like San Franciscans, it is nearly impossible for us to do so or to narrow down all the ways in which that harm has impacted us backwards and forwards, which does have a direct impact on how we do eligibility, who has the right to redress. But I think there's been a lot of thought put into this. And so what you see here before us, is a checklist for eligibility. And what we're proposing is that of the criteria that's been listed here, in order to

qualify for a San Francisco Operations Program, you would need to meet at least three of the following criteria. So I'm going to read them through and then I'm going to pause and I think we're going to move into I believe public comment on what we have presented in the discussion. So first, we have self identified as Black African American on public documents for at least the last 10 years. or the second criteria is a member of a community whose population has declined by 8%. From 1970 to 2010, is born in San Francisco between 1940 in 1996, and has proof of residency in San Francisco for at least 10 years. Next is migrates to San Francisco between 1940 in 1996 and lived I'm sorry, and lived in San Francisco for at least 10 years. The next is descendent for someone enslaved through us chattel slavery before 1865 displaced from San Francisco by urban renewal between 1954 and 1973. direct descendant of someone displaced by urban renewal between 1954 and 1973, member of historically marginalized group that experienced lending discrimination between 1937 and 1968, or subsequently experienced lending discrimination informally writ large communities between 1968 and 2008. That is our list of criteria for consideration.

1:36:20

Thank you Vice Chair Hollins. And again, what we're going to do is go to public comment at this time. So members of the public if you wish to share a public testimony on this item that being criteria for eligibility for Reparations in San Francisco, we welcome you to do so, again, if you have specific questions. We can't in this context, enter into an exchange of responses to those but we do welcome you to put those questions in the q&a. And we will take every opportunity to try and get you a response there to questions. But again, we welcome comments on this item. So please use the icon to raise your hand and we would be happy to call on you.

1:37:06

Um, first I want to welcome Andre Austin. Hello,

1:37:18

you have to look at it very hear me. Yes. Okay, fantastic. Fantastic. So eventually, the question I put into the chat was a and I want to know so I was wondering what what was the what was the motor method that that Japanese Americans used differently then then African Americans to get them Reparations ahead of us? And was it you know, that they are they see themselves as Japanese Americans we wish so calling us on Black Americans not necessarily bad for a particular nation? Was it? Is it that we were not necessarily attached to a nation or what's the reason or what's the what was what did they do differently than us?

1:38:05

Thank you. Um, now I would like to call Cora and koi Cora, Can you unmute? Okay, I open. Thank you. And last I'm talking in his mouth of what has been listed I feel is feasible and would accommodate most of us that are here.

1:38:52

Thank you. I'd like to welcome Larry Martin.

1:39:02

Yes. Can you hear me?

1:39:05

Yes. Thank you.

1:39:06

Okay. I just, I just want to thank Dr. Brown and everyone that spoke because I listened closely and I you know, I was trying to juggle another meeting but I I disconnected that meeting. And I just want to share that I have time. eyes to the state of Mississippi. You know, my great great grandparents is from Oxford, Taylor, Mississippi, and I got relatives right now that lives in Jackson, Mississippi, you know, I wasn't born there. But, you know, my, my parents, my great parents is here, you know, so I truly believe I meet the criteria. You know, my documentation might not be as extensive as some of y'all of the on this panel. But I just, I just hope and pray that This thing is become successful because we really need Reparations. You know? And I believe that we should, we should not let outside sources influence or dictate the outcome of this process. You don't say, I know, it's been a lot of controversy in the news about certain people, you know, but I just like I said, you know, just, you know, when, when Dr. Brown was speaking, it just, it just struck a chord, you know, because, you know, my bloodline is from Mississippi, you know, the state of Mississippi. So, you know, I think it'd be a disservice for people to not get Reparations, if they have some type of difficulties with documentation or whatnot, you know, it just that I just, it's actually it's an honor, you know, I applied for to be on this panel, but I didn't get selected. But I still can't come to the meetings, because I really, truly believe it's important. The information is important. You know, what I'm saying, you know, I'm in college right now get ready to transfer to San Francisco State, you know, this my lat why I got one more semester left at City College, and I truly believe is that education is the key for us Black people, and a lot of us need to get re educated. So we can start unifying, because that's what's keeping us from getting solid unification is a lot of us lack the education. And that's when it's going to be for a lot of us to get re educated. So we can be unified so we can deal with the forces of white supremacy. So I commend all of y'all for putting in the effort over the years to make it better for the younger people. So I just want to say thank you, Dr. Brown, and everyone else that has played a major factor in the realization of Reparations for the descendants of slavery. Thank you, once again.

1:42:08

Thank you, Mr. Martin. Now I'd like to welcome members of the public Neely. Welcome.

1:42:18

Hello, I wanted to thank everybody on the committee for all of their hard work and everything, I just find the criteria for eligibility for Reparations a bit too broad. I understand that while California was not a slave state originally, if it weren't for the, you know, the, if it weren't for Descendants of chattel slavery, there would be there would be nothing to set the groundwork for later discrimination laws that were passed, so forth and so forth. In addition to that, I would also say that Black immigrants of Caribbean and of African descent, should not fall into guidelines of Reparations, as it is a case for folks who are descended of slavery just in general. We all know that Black people in general, no matter their history in this country, they face discrimination. However, Black Americans have a very unique and distinct history here. And if it weren't for our civil rights, fight us fighting for civil rights, a lot of immigrants would

not even be here. So again, I would really urge the committee to have the criteria be put to us descendants of chattel slavery first, and then whether or not it could click off or check off to other criteria. Later, that would that would be fine. But I as it stands right now, I think that is way too broad. And if, again, folks who are you know, African immigrants or Caribbean immigrants, if they would like to have their own race based claims against the country or the city of San Francisco, they can do that they're free to do that. But under the umbrella of Reparations, it really, really needs to be us descendants of chattel slavery and then other criterias so I wanted to again thank everybody for their hard work in this but the criteria right now as I see it, is way too broad. Thank you very much.

1:44:27

Thank you for your comments. Now I'd like to welcome the caller who is on Raina Johnson's phone or sorry computer.

1:44:39

Yes, this is Alyssa Jones Garner. Um, thank you to the committee. First, I would like to to also agree with system McNeely statement that the definition should be narrowed further. Also, I would like to include a suggestion for that also including Negro, some of the time periods that you listed Black people were not called Black than they were called Negro or colored. So if you want to make sure that we're kept that we're fully and completely capturing everybody that is qualified, that probably should be included as well. Also, I also want to, again agree with the statement that there were other communities that were impacted by slavery. There's a book called Asian slaves of colonial Mexico, which again, if you go through it, it outlines how every Asian community was brought to South America and North America as slaves at one point in history, which would then qualify them for Reparations under Black Reparations, as well as the Reparations they received before. To answer the gentleman's question before how were Japanese Americans able to get Reparations before Black people, it's called the Civil Liberties Act of 1988. That is why Japanese American descendants were able to receive Reparations to the tune of \$20,000 per verified descendant. Second, when we speak about chattel slavery, let's look at the definition of there real quick. chattel slavery is a system which allow people to be considered as legal property to be bought, sold, owned forever, held by the United States government, we have very similar institutions. If you look at the penal system, which was just another which was a transformed version of chattel slavery, you lost your complete and full civil identity and was dead to the law in the Black in the Black's Law Dictionary being labeled as Black is a civil death, which is the same as if you are incarcerated, that is a civil death and complete and total loss of your rights as a person. So we really need to look at some of these definitions and make sure that they are in agreement with legal definitions, because that's what's going to reinforce them and keep them secure by reinforcing it with established legal protocols. And that is all I say about fat. Also, before I go, I would like to suggest to the committee that you read the 400 year Holocaust, the white Americans legal psychopathic and sociopathic Black genocide and the revolt against critical race theory, which has up to date information and goes further back to the 15th century and provides evidence based information. Thank you very much.

1:47:40

Thank you. Now, I would like to welcome back Dennis Williams. Welcome, Dennis.

1:47:47

Good evening, everyone. Excellent panel tonight. Excellent public comment. And I appreciate the panel, being patient, as it was brought up in the past has difficulty. So I thank you. Okay, I just want to just pinpoint a few things. Similar to what was already said, I want to see if you guys can look into how the Jewish community have received Reparations for their atrocities, and as our communities worldwide have stood in solidarity with those communities, so I think we should check and see how it was they were able to get that established, and even get loans and lines of credit, excuse me from European countries. I also think we need to look into how the recent Asian fund was brought into so fast. And maybe I'm looking to pass in an anti Black bill, which I think is needed, as 90 95% of our Black population are Democrats, we must put more pressure on like Speaker of the House, Nancy Pelosi who frequent San Francisco and resides here, Hillary Clinton, and find out how you know, some of these politicians in you know, included other nationalities and other countries in the Reparations and find out how to get large sums of money like Israel and others. Okay. And I don't agree on the inclusion of African and Caribbean the sense as it has been spoken before, and that's I say that humbly speaking, of course, but, you know, it's I think that's a totally different fight, that we have to be precise, and first get our Reparations for the hard work and destruction and desolation of our Black communities here in America, and definitely the ones that migrate to San Francisco. As you know, the Fillmore where I'm where I'm from, born and raised since 78. Born in Mount Zion Hospital, where it was a large contingency of Black nurses. Birthing Black baby In the rates of successful births was high. And we've seen a large East African population in the field more in the late 80s and 90s. So when you include everyone, I think that would be detrimental to not only our ancestors, but our grandparents still alive and our family's future going forward.

1:50:21

Thank you. Thank you, Dennis. We went and welcome Lonnie Mason.

1:50:32

Yes, thank you. Thank you, again, quick question in regards to the chart, for those who are accepting and are eligible to receive the reparation? Is there an agenda or some type of criteria, say, for instance, that person passed away and they were eligible to receive what will be the procedure in the process? Have you guys thought about that? That's it.

1:51:03

Thank you. Um, now we want to welcome Kenneth Johnson Welcome, Mr. Johnson. Mr. Johnson, it looks like you're unmuted now.

1:51:26

All right, yeah. I really enjoyed the meat. So far, man, Mr. Gentleman you had on. It was wonderful. It was really educational. And everything Rev Brown was saying was really and dynamic, especially about the we got to get to my heritage center. So I wanted to ask, how would one go about applying for Reparations? Would you submit your bio or? Well, because I'm a native San Franciscan, my parents had a cleaners on Third Street. I'm originally I'm from South Park, but I'm a member of from each community I used to, you know, so how would you apply for Reparations? Or will you be sending information out? So I'd like to know that how, how's that gonna be done? And how long? If you, you

know, once one is approved, how long before the Reparations is handed out? You know, or have you thought about that? And I'd love to know if I can get an answer on that now or when. Thank you.

1:52:53

Thank you, Mr. Johnson. Now, I would like to welcome LaDonna Williams. Thank you, LaDonna, for joining us today.

1:53:04

Yes, good evening, LaDonna Williams. And we're still commenting on this checklist for eligibility, correct?

1:53:13

That is correct.

1:53:14

Okay, soum, my question is, I guess that last one member of a historically marginalized group. So it appears that once again, we're including non Black folks in this Reparations, and if so, I just don't understand why it is that we cannot focus on American Blacks or Black Americans that are descendants of chattel slavery, and the harm that has been done to us, particularly in California and San Francisco. And for those that haven't saw it, I would highly encourage you guys to see this. It's called highly polluted. And as a matter of fact, is Dr. Amos Brown, is given commentary on it. And he gives some rich history about San Francisco and the racial discrimination that had occurred to a Black gentleman RSE Lee at the hands of Stovall, he goes into the history of it, those Black folks that weren't allowed on the wagon train, the Gold Rush, I mean, rich history of discrimination, that Black folks, not Japanese, not others. Not all these other marginalized groups were targeted. It was Black folks that were targeted. And this targeting has not stopped today. A Black man can't run down the street. He could be going to catch the bus. If the police think he running too fast. And he looking guilty. He's got guns drawn on, folks might think that's an exaggeration. But it has happened to friends and family members, and it still hasn't stopped today. We still have redlining, we're still paying more for loans, we're still being discriminated against because of our hair. When we go to a job, it may not be out in the open. And now it's more, you know, undercover. But the point is, is we are still the targeted population. That has continued to be the most marginalized group in in the world, actually. But since we're focusing on San Francisco, we were those that were misplaced, displaced and prevented from even purchasing homes, going to schools, just living life, yet, we're still filming, like in order to be valid, we got to add others in. It's wrong, it should be Black focused.

1:56:10

Thank you, Ms. Williams. Are there any other members of the public who want to comment on this particular item, which is the eligibility requirements? Okay, I see Latrice McNeely. Hello,

1:56:31

My name is Latrice McNeely. Born and raised in San Francisco, the comment that I would like to make is again, refocusing the eligibility back to descendants of chattel slavery. When we make such broad criteria, it will be a mess. In the end, there will be tons of people who will try and get Reparations where

as our ancestors who have been here, specifically in San Francisco, their entire legacies, and the things that they fought for, and the things that they stood for, like our families will really have been for not. And I want to also add that when you don't narrow these things down to the people who really have been impacted, historically, by the injustice is of the city. Um, it's just going to be worse than when it started. So again, I really urge the committee to have the criteria, again, focused on descendants of chattel slavery. And another thing that I would like to put is if there are folks who are unsure if they are meaning like folks who are in foster care for folks who are having his problems, tracing their ancestry, those services should be for free. And then that will help them see if they meet the criteria. But again, like even the California Reparations Task Force, of which Dr. Amos Brown is on the criteria is us descendants of chattel slavery. And that's what I have to say. Thank you very much.

1:58:24

Thank you. Are there any members of the public who want to comment on eligibility requirements? You can do so now by , I seen Linda Parker Pennington. Thank you, Linda. Linda's hand was raised and is now lowered. There are there. Okay. Okay, great, Linda.

1:58:56

Thank you. Yes, I can unmute myself. Thank you so much. And I appreciate you reposting the criteria. And when I review it, it looks as if I put the question in the q&a, but just and one qualify if only one of those criteria are met? Or do you need to meet multiple points of the criteria? Because there's five or six distinct things. So if only one applies, does that mean you're still potentially eligible? And then the other question and I know you won't be answering questions was How was the year 1996? Used as a cut off? How did we come up with that year? It just happens that, you know, my husband and I moved to San Francisco in 1998. But we are eligible based on other criteria, so But I'm just curious because I think most people will have that Question. And I apologize if you already covered that. So thank you for all of your work. I should have started by saying that I appreciate everything that this advisory committee has been doing and the thoughtfulness. And Dr. Broussard 's presentation earlier this evening was spectacular. So thank you for your work.

2:00:22

Thank you. Now, are there any other members of the public who want to comment on eligibility requirements? Okay, Chair McDonnell. I do not see anybody indicating they want to participate in public comment on this item right now.

2:00:40

Thank you Seeing none, then public comment is now closed. Okay, committee members, what we will do, as, excuse me Vice Chair Hollins facilitate, is have a discussion about the criteria. If you have if we could focus our discussion on if you have additional criteria, you want to recommend if you want if you have thoughts about modifying any of the recommendations as they read, if we could focus there, that would be helpful and most efficient for our time. This evening. Member Barry, please.

2:01:14

Thank you, Chair. One, I was curious to know if on some of the checkboxes for the criteria, if it was intentional or not, that San Francisco wasn't included on some of the checkbox. And then I'll be

concerned, because for example, the last one with redlining that was done all over the country. So Could someone use that happening to them in another state to qualify? And then my second issue is, as a former recruiter, and since this worker, I know there are several people from the Middle East and South America that consider themselves Black. But you when they came here, um, not so much in the community, you know, and I don't want to No way offend anyone, but it was. It was I see on this checklist, people from the Middle East and South America, and even India, easily qualifying for Reparations with three of the with three of the criterias that's listed if you look at how it's written.

2:02:43

Thank you remember, Barry Jeremy not Well, I'm I'm still saying this correct? Yes, ma'am. Gotcha. Thank you. We'll call our member Landry.

2:02:54

Thank you, Vice Chair. So yeah, I'm a little concerned. Or well, let me just say, in terms of narrowing the criteria, I think it really the one that sticks out to me is like what some of the public is speaking of the dissenters of someone enslaved through us, chattel slavery for 1865. You know, if we put something as simple on must be dissented, or someone enslaved through us chattel slavery before now at 65. And I don't know, this is just a question and so many words, would that eliminate? Or would that kind of like satisfy particularly focusing on San Francisco, Black people without changing like, the whole entire criteria? If not, I think we need to change the language or some of the language and use words like mandatory because if you said three out of out of eight, like was said before, I believe that you will, we will find that there. There'll be a lot of people even applying or and then that would be a whole process because then we would have to go through the possibility even someone filing a lawsuit. If they say well I meet the criteria No, you don't meet the criteria. So it's a lot to me, in terms of that probably needs to be tweaked before we go forward with the eligibility checklist as I see it for now. But you know, that's just I'm just putting that on the table. Thank you.

2:04:52

Thank you member Landry. Um, I also had some some thoughts I will facilitate I know we have a couple other hands up but I will I want to add my comments before I lose them, if y'all don't mind. So one is under item one self identified as Black African American, I did hear a couple members of the public mentioned that we should include Negro I do think that that is important depending on which birth record we're looking at and which time period. So I would also recommend that that be added. And I think we should be specific to birth records or, or name the type of public documents that we are talking about. I think that may be a little too broad. Second, the one that I think stuck out to me and this may be i dont want to speak for others, but I think the second criteria member of a community whose population has declined. I think that is very broad. And maybe we are speaking specifically of the San Francisco neighborhood, whose Black population declined by a certain percentage during this time. I think a member of a community may be too broad. If we're talking about Black Americans specifically. There's been a lot of conversation about the other types of identifying eligibility criteria that we want to have. I think it's important while we have time periods put here to name specifically, individuals who have been directly impacted by the war on drugs, whether that's through incarceration, or the foster care system, the child welfare system, especially when we talk about public records and documents, and also redress and harm, right? We know that Black people, specifically Black Americans, disproportionately

were impacted and identified through those systems. So having a criteria to speak to that, I think would be helpful. I'm gonna pause there, because I know there are other hands. I just wanted to add my thoughts before we continue. So thanks for indulging me. I am going to scroll down here because I'm on my iPad and it's a little crazy the way it looks right now. We'll do member Ekanem followed by member Erving, I think her hand up as well.

2:07:11

Actually, his hand has been up before mine.

2:07:14

Okay. Apologies. Thank you, Member Ekanem. Okay, Member Erving.

2:07:18

Member Ekanem, thank you, I can appreciate that. I want to echo us thinking, and I apologize for my camera being off, gonna have to be awkward today, I want to echo us thinking about Black San Francisco, San Franciscans who have been harmed and us figuring out a way to address that through this eligibility, and I can't, for them, at the moment think of all the different ways, but I definitely think we have to call that out. I also want us to expand the terms for Black and African American, as it may relate to our birth records, I am still concerned about putting as a criteria a descendent of chattel slavery as it may act as a barrier. For some folks, it may act as a barrier for our elderly, it may act as a barrier for those who are less resourced. And though we may say, you know, we can find it, they can get it for free. As we heard from our experts, the last time we met about this, that it is a process and it isn't as easy as going to your library or Lincoln, it could take a long time. And so and what the displacement of our folks and the ways that Black families have been torn apart, it's not as easy as going to talk to a relative and I will say that for a fact thinking about myself and my history, and you know, what I have to work with, which is not much. And so I am not in favor of adding the chattel slavery, I mean, you can add it, but as one of them, but that is not what the criteria that I would go for. I will say though, for sure that it should be self identified as Black American on public documents, and we can explore what those public documents are as number one, that you have to have that and maybe to others. So like in order to be eligible, you must be this, right? And then you can pick two other categories. But for us to make this so broad and not just say this is for Black folks worries me. This is who we are getting Reparations for and I don't want anyone else, though they may deserve it for what the harms their communities. I don't want them to be able to jump in on this because we continuously will continue to take away from Black folks. And the last thing is I agree with San Francisco being put on this we're talking about San Francisco and only Blacks in San Francisco. And and those who were just you know, residents of San Francisco, so if we could just add the that language to that that would be great.

2:09:50

Thank you member Erving. Member Ekanem

2:09:55

Thank you so much Vice Chair Hollins. I think for me I like The idea of again, adding in some Black, African American awesome Negro or some of the other terms that were used for number one, I guess a question that I do have are the cut off dates. So the second one is 2/10. the 3rd One is 1996, etc. I do

want to sort of get a better understanding of why that was done. And I take a look specifically at like, urban renewal, right. So 1954 to 1973. Understand that was when urban renewal, the actual term was happening, but we've had so much other redevelopment happen, that forced our folks out, right, and so even past 1973, so I want to sort of be able to add space and sort of take a look maybe at some of this languaging to be able to capture them too.

2:10:57

Could just No, just one quick moment, come back to member ekanem appreciating the comments. And I'll say this to you, because you're speaking now. And I will just invite others as you speak, appreciating all of the perspectives, what will be helpful as, as you have these thoughts, if they're baked in, they may not be, but recommendations around some of this, that would be helpful as we consider. Right. So just to be specific, for example, if your thought is it should be 2005. I made that up. Right, that just lifting that up so that we can begin to, to the degree possible, grapple with specific recommendations.

2:11:35

So my, I guess my recommendation would be just overall, because I don't know why those things were sort of chosen. I would love to sort of if there's a working group that sort of taking look at this be part of that, to sort of get a better understanding, because as we're taking a look on the economic empowerment side of all the things that have sort of happened, I would just love to have make sure that our timeline matches up with this criteria timeline, sort of moving forward. So I'd be willing to be part of more conversations, but I don't have an exact date, like in this particular point in time. Oh, and then one other piece, I absolutely appreciate the fact that folks in the community sort of lifted up how other people could potentially take advantage of that. So I know one of the things. One, I actually appreciate this, I think I would love to sort of not only be part of the working group to sort of talk about the end dates, but then also be able to go back and talk to lawyers and say, hey, does this pass legal muster? Right? Because I think that's going to be critically important before I actually feel comfortable in sort of voting on this, like up or down. But I think this is a great start. For us sort of moving forward.

2:12:51

I'm sorry, one other interjection. My apologies Vice Chair Hollins, I should have said this at the beginning in terms of context, to the very last point that member ekanem may infer for everyone's information, both where we land on the criteria as well, as well as where we land on the recommendations. All will be reviewed, both by city attorney through HRC. And city attorney's office will have some recommendations that they will make to HRC with regard to them, not I don't anticipate that they will make that's not it's not their role to determine up or down go to bat as much as to advise the city through HRC. The the impacts on the city should they take this action or that. Secondly, it'll be reviewed by independent counsel, which will will offer legal counsel to kind of us as a as a committee to make some determinations whether we, you know, refined tighten, broaden etc. And we'll have some decisions to make with as concerned as well. Thank you Vice Chair Hollins. My apologies.

2:14:04

No, no worries. Thank

2:14:05

you Chair McDonnell. Member Taylor, and then member Berry.

2:14:09

I just wanted to thank the people and committee members who put their efforts into putting this together knows is not easy. And I'm sure you thought through a lot of scenarios and a lot of different considerations. And I hope it also reflects, you know, I guess consulting the California definition of, of lineage or criteria. I guess a couple things I wanted to point out was I really do agree that we should qualify how we talk about slavery, because we can't use it as part of the direct injury around what we're talking about Reparations, although it is the it is the mothership. Its particular relationship to Black folks in California is late. It's not like Georgia or Alabama or South Carolina. It's very different. And there's other people who had been enslaved here. First. We were kind of late and an afterthought. And the state created itself as a free state because Texas created itself as a slave state. Right. So I don't know, I don't know if, in other words, I think there's a better legal argument, to cover the period that Dr. Broussard book focuses on, where you can trace it, almost to your you know, to your grandparents, those who came in the 40s, and 50s. Because you can find that the city has that county documentation itself, a lot of that a lot of those records exist in at the county level, because counties keep those those records. And this is after the fire. So I would just suggest that we if we talked about slavery, we qualify it with an understanding that that was not the main crime against Black people in California, as it relates to reparation that we're focusing on, I think the comment made about about the war on drugs is much more relevant to the injury to Black San Francisco. And I really think the definition of who should receive the Reparations should be qualified to only Black San Francisco, not Black, everybody. I'm from New York, born and raised my mother and my grandmother, my great grandmother, I know my aunts, and I know my last slave ancestors names both of them. I don't think I deserve a penny. But whatever happened to Black San Francisco, I got to deal with New York, if New York couple of Reparations plan, let me go back to New York and get it from New York. If somebody's in New York, that's from San Francisco, let them come home and deal with it. But I don't think we should be for anybody but Black San Francisco, only not Black California, not Black Bay Area, Black San Francisco is, as Reverend Brown has told us repeatedly, we have to do something prak practical, and that we're going to win is going to be that we have a narrow definition. And one that is very specific to the injury. And again, I'm trying to help this in some science I'm dropping here, I really think in a in a backdoor way, we can actually challenge prop 209 And, and affirmative action, which is a 14th amendment issue that allows everybody to be in, you know, claim of injury, and we therefore have to show the specific discrimination we experienced. But we but with with the 13th Amendment, no other group can get in and I gaze unless they're Black, not Native Americans, not women, unless they're Black. The only group that can get in the 13th Amendment is Black people, everybody else at our 14th amendment and our movement to dope on the 14th amendment for equality, when we should have focused on the justice of the 13th amendment. And that's where the injury is. And what I'm saying is Reparations. If we are very specific to the Black injury, we can undermine affirmative action, which says Black people can't always prove reverse discrimination. They're saying we don't qualify for affirmative action anymore, because our injuries like every other groups, well, by going specific to Reparations, harming Black California Black San Francisco, you cut out all that other white meat around the state, I'm talking about cutting a steak, you cut out the fat, white meat, you know, the moment my mom has to cut out the fat, so you get to the red meat, we can cut out all that extra meat and argument by only focusing on Black, you're only up we're only obligated to Black San Francisco, and nobody else if the state of California wants to take

care of Black California, Reverend Brown more power to them. But this committee, it seems to me would be more successful if we moved our argument and define the criteria by the injuries that have happened to Black, the injuries, plural, that have happened to Black San Francisco, that, you know, that's SFPD should be mentioned. I'm being asked to be on a committee, one SFPD without thinking about trying to figure out how to do racial reconciliation, and maybe try to offer some apology. And I talked to brother Daniel about that recently. I shut up in a second. But I just think we should focus more on what the war on drugs did. What the How we development did what Justin Herman did what we what what dislocation did, what out migration did. But But I think if we go back to slavery, it's going to be more difficult and it's my last point. If you go back to study Tulsa, Oklahoma, there were a lot bunch of lawsuits. And this is a good precedent for us to understand how we have to proceed. Black Tulsa Oklahomans who was so who were injured by the whose family were injured by the massacre in Tulsa, recently tried to sue in federal court in the state. And the court would not even allow them to have standing. So just because you're the descendants of of slaves directly or indirectly is probably not enough. We got we're gonna have a hard time selling the injury with Redevelopment Agency, I'm showing you that in Tulsa, these Black folks showed a grandma's house got burned down, and the court didn't give them standing. So please be clear that we haven't we haven't, we haven't touched the devil yet where the devil is going to respond to our efforts. But as soon as we make more progress, you'll see where the devil is coming from. But please do look at Tulsa, because the Black community did something like this. It wasn't Reparations, per say, but they wanted some kind of redress apology recognition. In Tulsa, the state and city refused. But they also flipped it on the Black community in Tulsa. And the Court said that the Black community did not assets. And I'm sure I'm leaving out some key points. But in general, the Black community of Tulsa did not have standing to get ready to get recompense for the injury of Tulsa. And I'll shutup after that. I'll be quite there. Thank you.

2:21:02

Mr. Taylor, I was ready to let you go all night. Because you, you touched on so many great points. And thank you so much for all that. And just as you know, myself and a couple other members as a Black Wall Street were in Tulsa for the centennial. And that was one of the most striking things about that process that we've even even with all of the physical evidence that still there today, that so many of those people still have not and will not receive justice. And I agree that we need to be hyper focused on San Francisco, I think we have a good scaffold with the eligibility criteria, this here, the foundation, and where we are layering in right now is exactly what you said, getting down to the red meat, we have the opportunity here to be hyper specific and hyper local to San Francisco, into the harms that have existed here. I think the timeframes member and me made a very, very good point about making sure that that the timeframes that we have aligned with the recommendations in the subcommittee reports, and also how they hold up to legal muster. All those things are really important. But I do think that getting hyper specific down to neighborhoods, zip codes, I do think naming San Francisco, specifically, even San Francisco Public Records, you know, with the criteria around chattel slavery, it's it's one of 10. While we don't focus exclusively on that one, I think it's fine. It's my personal opinion, that it's fine to name that. But I think where we're really going to the rubber will meet the road will be when we get hyper specific about San Francisco and justices and time periods. So I agree with you there. Member Hamilton. And then I see member berry here at hand up again.

2:22:46

I think member Berry was first. If you want to go out.

2:22:51

This would be her second her second. Thank you,

2:22:57

Madam Chair.

2:22:59

Yes, sir. my hand been up for some time.

2:23:03

Yeah, there must be something wrong again.

2:23:06

We can call on you next.

2:23:10

Yeah, I was just gonna say like, in looking at a lot of things that different races go for. A lot of times, somehow they must be using some loophole. Because when they advocating for certain certain things they specifically say or say their name, they specifically say they race they do not go around the corner to try to appease prop 209 For some reason, and I'm not 100% Sure on why when Black people are advocating for themselves and advocating for things we have to like always worry about Prop 209 was was prop 209, specifically for us till that we can't get certain things because it just doesn't make sense to me. And for example, the Asian hate crime situation and I feel very empathetic to that community. But they don't go around the corner to say all those that was impacted by hate crimes. They specifically call out their personal names and say Asians in their in their group. So I think what all of the recommendations, I think Black San Franciscans should be should be in there. I think we shouldn't call out Black and we should call out who we are. And figure out like what is that actual loophole with the redevelopment? I can't actually see the recommendations on the screen anymore, but I know it said 1973 I would just think and maybe it should say until redevelopment sunset in San Francisco because redevelopment still continued although it wasn't in the Western Addition that kind of went over into the Bayview and some of the other communities like view and some of them other communities until the actual sunset, which now they go by a whole nother name. Oh see i or something like that. So I think maybe Looking into the actual sunset of redevelopment and what was all of the impact that they actually caused, From their inception all the way to their sunset. So those were the two recommendations I had.

2:25:16

Thank you, member Hamilton. Dr. Brown, your I'm sorry, your hand wasn't raised on the screen. But you are welcome to go sir.

2:25:27

Thank you, Madam Chair. Thanks for the frame of reference that you have given us tonight. I would like to say it My house is on fire. The fire department does not run to your house up and down. Right Street. The whole what goes on my house. Black folks house so to speak. Then on fire, that we should be specific. And I'd be apologetic about Black folks here in San Francisco.

2:26:20

Yes, the scene is a crime. That's Ground Zero. Number two. I've think that we should be aware that this redevelopment agency started in 1948. That's on record with Al elrow. And Justin Herman, evidence is that and then this group that was called Redevelopment Agency, did a self study. And I have a copy up. And they admitted. Friends admitted that study, they have it in their files that they did wrong to the Black community. When they pursued redevelopment, the way they did well if you did wrong, show some atonement and some fruits of repentance. So that's the other area that's very specific where, Black folks are home. And then that shipyard in the last 15 to 20 years. You all know the damage. So let's make amends plan for reparation for those persons who suffered in the area of education. Dr. Broussard touched on it but I'm living witness that Ms. Leola habit owned that school out there in Bayview Hunters Point is. Far after when I was recovering from my stroke and 2010 in the hospital, reading Dr.Broussard book educational system did not let Black people even teach in this district until about 1960. There was only for whites as administrators as teachers. The evidence is there yall They've discriminated against us in education. So whatever measures we can come up with, to make amends for how we have been shortchanged. And we have been victims after use words of causal savage inequality. The other area that brother ekanem has been telling us about economics, economics, economics. You check the script cities records, how they have discriminated against us in terms of what and contracts. So we know the areas all we need to do it nail it down and say this is for Black folks redlining these banks. Evidence is that all we need to do is be specific and not be apologetic about this Reparations for Black folks because we will harm and we discriminated against in these specific areas in this city and county of San Francisco. And I agree with others 10,000% The brothers and sisters who came here recently we yes we love you, we know our history and our heritage, but those other nations It was the guilty ones. Britain, France, Belgium, you all know what I'm talking about. They all go after them. We're talking about what San Francisco at the state level, the national level we talked about here on this Americans here. So say to them, if you want to get your movement going late on, we will support you right now is about us, who felt the immediate pain and whose house was immediately on the fire. So going up to about 1990. Say About 25. Again, that's, that's a span of time where all the harm is going on. This whole thing of the war on drugs and all y'all touch on that, these are specific areas that we can nail them on. And we won't be all over the field just saying goes out Black. I suffered here because I had a headache one day, we're talking about major public policies. Thank you.

2:31:23

Thank you, Dr. Brown, appreciate you, member Berry and then chair McDonald.

2:31:28

Thank you, Vice Chair, I'm looking at the criteria. First, I want to thank whoever started the grind work on this part of the the heavy lifting. But I know the devils in the details, and I'm looking at this as if a white person is looking at this list, and they be able to get three qualifiers at for example, migrated to

San Francisco would be one displaced from San Francisco by urban renewal, because even though that harmed us the most, there were always white people in our neighborhoods that is also affected. And then being a direct descendant of someone displaced by urban renewal, that would be another qualifier, and then a member of a red line community. We know there was always white people in 94115 and 94124. So maybe a suggestion is to put Black in each one of those categories. So it's clear. Thank you. Yeah.

2:32:35

Great. Thank you remember, Barry. Dr. Brown, you put yourself on mute, please. Cheer McDonnell.

2:32:43

Thank you very much for Hollins. A couple of things in terms of my perspectives. One, I hold a distinction between this checklist wherever we land for eligibility, and the recommendations that we ultimately finalize, and, and and push forward. And in particular, I say that because I agree 100%, with both the content and the strategy that Professor Taylor lifted up, however, I would say it for me, all of what he said falls in in the recommendations, the level of specificity, the level of again, receipts for harm to Black folks across city departments, certainly police and others, I agree with 100%. And so I think it rightfully sits in the context of the recommendations. Were the criteria are concerned. A few thoughts there one, one right back to what remember, Barry just lifted up. I do think it important. And I think it was remember Erving who said this specifically to make the first one that being the self identified as Negro Black African American, be a must. So it's must with that one and then to others would be my perspective, to ensure that again, it doesn't just open it up to anyone finding their three that that suit them or fit them and then they can qualify. The other thing I would say is the qualifying is also distinct from the demonstration of harm. So in other words, the criteria gets you in the door. The harm you can demonstrate determines and this is crude but the size of the check. Right. So to what Rev Brown said if you can demonstrate I qualify, but the harm you can demonstrate as the code you caught, you get \$5 Right. You qualify but you can demonstrate that you caught pneumonia and spent three months in the hospital you get a bigger check by or whatever, right? So I hold that these criteria simply get you in the door. And I'm not trying to minimize them, they are critically important. So I do think that they need to represent to the degree possible. And I'll qualify that in just a moment, who fits in. So that's why I think number one, sets the framework, the comments about making sure it's Black San Franciscans and the harm to Black San Franciscans, I also agree with. And so if folks are suggesting it says it for each one, I'm open to that. I mean, I feel like the opener is in order to qualify for San Francisco's Reparations programs you must meet, and then we can decide on the number of criteria. So I feel like we've captured the must. It's about San Francisco, it's not about, you know, Bay Area or other parts of the state or country, for that matter. And then in terms of the chattel slavery, again, I absolutely agree from a strategy perspective. We can't lay this whole thing on chattel slavery for all the reasons that Professor Taylor referenced, in terms of the the criteria, I'm sorry, the checklist for eligibility, there's only one reference to chattel slavery, all the rest are not. I am my perspective, I am for including a reference for those descendants who have been San Franciscans for again, the length of time we represent here at least 10 years. For as an eligibility criteria, not the only one, and not even the primary one. And then the oh, I also agree with thinking about and I don't have a point of view right now I need to think about a little more qualifying the public documents. I feel like that's that is too broad. So with his birth records, or some other health records or something that is more specific and clear.

Okay, there was one other point I was going to make and it is. And so my recommendation, Vice Chair Hollins, in terms of where we are in this in this discussion is lots of input has been given that we hear from member Barry one more time. And then we give opportunity for some offline work staff can help capture because they've been taking notes. As we've been having this discussion. And we work towards bringing back a refined doc at our next meeting, we will need to land there at that moment, just given the timing of everything else. But that gives us time to do some offline work and bring it back would be my recommendation.

2:37:56

Thank you, Chair McDonnell. And it looks like Member Berry, your hand is up but you don't have additional comments.

2:38:01

Correct. Okay.

2:38:04

Chair, appreciate all of your insight there and for laying out the next steps in the process. If there are no other members of the committee that wish to share thoughts or insight before we close out this item, I'm going to hand it back over to chair McDonald to close the item and continue on to the next agenda.

2:38:28

Thank you so much. So let me just say now while we're on this item, so it acts staff to who've been taking notes, please incorporate that. And let me ask you to do a redline version. So we see both, we still see the original language and then the redline version of the the perspectives recommendations that folks have have offered so that we have it in one place and then we can have have a follow up discussion. And then related to that one, ensure that we get it get the redline version out in in sufficient time to allow folks the opportunity to chew on it offline so that when we come into our meeting, we aren't starting this conversation. We're in essence, continuing and picking up from where we left off, that'd be great. So with that, we will close this item and please call the next item.

2:39:25

Item number seven is review and discuss the draft executive summary and recommendations for the final report to the mayor's office and Board of Supervisors. This is the discussion and possible action item. The African American Reparations Advisory Committee will present a draft executive summary to be submitted to San Francisco boards Board of Supervisors in compliance with ordinance number 259 - 20 This presentation will be from Juell Stewart manager Economic Rights Division, San Francisco Human Rights Commission. There's public comment and committee comment on this item.

2:40:10

Thank you for that. With that, we will welcome and invite Juell. Stewart to take the mic.

2:40:17

Hi, good evening, everyone. Thanks for a great meeting so far, I've wanted to introduce this executive summary draft that we've been working on. And I don't think it shouldn't take too much time. Because,

yeah, because the recommendations are really what we want to shine. But I just want to provide some additional context to what we are planning to, you know, how we're planning to summarize this. And so I wanted to, you know, it kind of starts off talking about the context for why we find ourselves talking about Reparations at this moment in time. And, you know, since Reparations, obviously, Reparations has been talked about since the since Abraham Lincoln signed the Emancipation Proclamation. But I wanted to put the kind where we wanted to talk about framing the context, in terms of the contemporary sort of discourse around Reparations as it relates to the responsibility of city governments and local governments to respond to redress and to respond to the ways that they have been uniquely responsible. All city or all city governments basically went through this urban renewal process, as Dr. Broussard talked about, but rooting it in this and with the distinction that chattel slavery obviously is at the root of is an original sin of the United States in general, broadly, but uniquely, since San Francisco did not engage directly in chattel slavery, we wanted to ground the context of the harm in urban renewal and that time period. So I just brought upon a hockey coach, because he, I think it resonates a lot with people who may not have been involved who may not have been as intimately familiar with Reparations, people outside of maybe the Black community will perhaps recognize that context as well. And so as you can see, we talked about urban renewal as this catalyst for Black displacement, that really, really goes into hyperspeed, as Dr. Broussard and others have mentioned, the night in the mid 1940s, but laughing during the 1970s. And quite honestly, I think I'm gonna have to edit this to say, to talk more about the ongoing effects of displacement as well. But you know, talking about the film, or the third sheet chord or Bayview Hunters Point, and how all of these geographies sort of fit into that framework. And so then we talk about the legacy of civic disinvestment that the the committee really centers on throughout since June 2021. And so talking about how not investing in opportunities for the Black community and disproportionately depriving us depriving them. I mean, I can say us I'm Black, depriving us from these, of these services has really exacerbated the disparities that we see. And also mentioning the missing the historical documents that go from the 1960s as recently as 2020, that continually examine, as we've mentioned, many, many times, both the community and or the committee and members of the public have mentioned there's been, I think the phrase that Miss Felicia uses is three reports in 30 years that enumerate all of the problems that are highlighted by this iteration of the African American reparation Advisory Committee, and they have a lot of suggestions that are very similar to the ones that this committee puts forth, but they were not. They were subsequently sort of not acted upon by the city as an institution. And we point out the dream Keeper Initiative as a successful start for investing and Black land and Black serving institutions, but also argue that there's more that's needed to really fully achieve redress for that civic disinvestment. And then we also speak about how the report is a living document and it's For tool for community action, so the strategy is to release sort of this executive summary rather than being like 100 pages of a report. Initially, we want this document to be an action document. And so it's going to enumerate sort of like the recommendations, and also the agencies that are responsible for implementation as well. Yeah, just a little bit about the methodology about how the committee is formed or having committee structured with before subcommittees and then how we brought in the listening sessions, as well as public comment. So to talk about the, to discuss the harms, and I wanted to go really quickly to another document that I thought I had open, but I did not. That shows the so there were, there have been recommendations that the public suggests it suggested that we're sort of beyond the scope of the four subcommittees. And we want to highlight those two. So they like I think we actually did talk about the HBC new satellite but my colleagues, Brittin Chicuata. And Zach Manuel have listened, have gone through the the public meetings and monthly

meetings, and also the listening sessions, to draw out the the other recommendations that have been made, that have been brought up by community members. And so this, I mean, this includes the recommendations that have been brought forward in the these are all the recommendations, in other words, but they weren't found that weren't necessarily reflected by the subcommittee's, and so we wanted to make sure that those were incorporated as well. And then lastly, so the the, the recommendations, this is the recommendations are still in separate documents will be copied and pasted into here. But what I also wanted to offer some method of feedback for the general public to to share with us and I don't really have access to the I don't have access to send that to everyone, but I just put the link in the chat, anybody who has host privileges to copy and paste that to the public, that would be great. But basically, that link goes to a forum where you can read all of the draft recommendations, and weigh in with feedback no later than December first. So we want to know, you know, we want to be comprehensive and collected with feedback. And we I wanted to give a an easy way for people to provide feedback directly to the documents themselves rather than just emailing us. So I mean, you can email Reparations@ssa.gov, as well. But you can also submit via that form. I just wanted to give people options. So yeah, that's the executive summary is taking place thus far. Thank you, Chair McDonnell, and members of the community.

2:48:21

Thank you. Just before we go first to invite public comment, and in just a moment, do I want to ask you to put that back up on the screen so that as well can do both. I just realized that it was safe for for the community to see it as they offer public comment. But I want I do want to make reference to it. I do want to share the timeline. Secretary Meyer, do you have the timeline available to share? Yes, I do. I'll share my screen now.

2:48:57

Thank you.

2:49:01

Oops, sorry, I just opened the wrong document. Here. It's up there. It's up now. Thank you, John.

2:49:09

Okay, would you go to next slide. Okay, so this was done before November 8, but you'll you'll get the point. One, each of you should have received outreach to have an interview done with you, um, around this overall process as as a committee member. So hopefully that was done. We're on the November 14 As we speak now. And then there is a upcoming meeting. I'll come back to that when we do announcements on that agenda item. As you can see here, just want to note that December 2, will be the last day for each of us to offer request additions, removal of sections from the draft report, etc. So that there's time to incorporate all of those requests and changes and then Have a draft report ready for the DC, our December 12 meeting. And so at the December 12 meeting, we'll focus on two things, separate things. One, the draft report, and then to discuss advocacy, not about the report, but in the context of the budgeting process, context of add backs, etc. So that there's opportunity to bring voice to where and how resources are allocated in the budget process. So more to come on that. And then you see, finally, December 16, we will see HRC, on our behalf will submit the draft report to the Board of Supervisors, period. And just as a footnote to that, I spoke with President Walton and we are going to

request a public hearing on the draft report at the beginning of the of the new year and the new session when they all return. So more to come on that. So it isn't just a quiet submission of a report, but there's actually a public presentation and opportunity for public comment. Thank you, you can pull it back down now. So with that, then we want to go to public comment, public comment on this item, which is the outline of the report, and the timeline for moving the report to conclusion. So again, members of the public if you'd like to offer public testimony on this item, on the executive summary, and the final report, we welcome you to use the icon to raise your hand. Again, if you have questions, you can type them into the q&a and we'll we'll work at getting responses to you. Public comment, we invite you to offer it now.

2:51:56

I'd like to I'd like to welcome Dennis Williams first. Welcome back, Dennis.

2:52:03

Okay, that's my last comment. And I appreciate everyone that's still on here. I just want to lastly say the overdraft I feel is as well, what written, as long as we've taken consideration with public comment has stated I also want to thank Mr. James for speaking eloquently and boldly stating that, you know, he doesn't qualify that he doesn't think he should qualify. And I think as we keep the agenda strictly San Francisco because sometimes even I forget and I think others do that it's not the totality Black pReparations, as Mr. Amis Brown is on for California or nationally. This is specifically San Francisco. So I appreciate the board for staying true to that and overview. Thank you.

2:52:32

Thank you, Mr. Williams. Now I'd like to welcome Mr. Kenneth Johnson Welcome, Mr. Johnson.

2:53:12

I'd like to know when, when all this has gone through and decided on, is there an estimate of when the funds would be allocated to individuals or when do you anticipate this was finished? When? When would whatever you finalize and come up with? What is the estimated date that things will start happening? Is there an estimated date? Isn't in a year from now or six months from now or next week? Not next week. But anyway, could you address that? Question. Thank you.

2:54:17

Thank you, Mr. Johnson. Now, I would like to welcome Phyllis Bowie.

2:54:26

Hi, everybody. This is Phyllis Bowie. And I'd like to give an a congratulations like I always like doing just to give love and grace at 830 on a Monday of all the work that's been done with the committee I bow down and give you grace for putting together something that is so broad. So the comment that I'd like to make about so thank you for comment I'd like to make about the timeline is something that I brought up a couple of times, and one I'll put in the question I'll make Comment. I'll put this in the questions. And that is what's going to be the name of this report. And the other comment that I make as far as deadlines, I think it's urgent that within this report that there is a deadline for them to reply in some way. What's their plan? What's the next movement? And then another thing that I want to add? And I'll

probably I'll put in the questions, which is, what are some of the reasons why other people that are in cities and states have not had difficulty getting Reparations? And maybe can we kind of avoid that? before it happens? Do you know what I mean? So like at the city, we do all this work city comes back and says, Yeah, according to you know, San Francisco's rules and regulations we cannot give money to. So that's just a question. I'll put in the put in the questions. And that's it, that they're definitely needs to be a ask with a deadline. Otherwise, it's just they're gonna say, Okay, nice and put the report on the side.

2:56:01

Thank you, everybody.

2:56:04

Thank you. Now, I'd like to welcome back, Alyssa.

2:56:11

Thank you. And first and foremost, I apologize if I'm talking a bit too much. But this is a really serious topic, and I want to make sure that I've done my best to help contribute to some positive change for our communities. I wanted to speak specifically to the section titled urban renewal as a Black catalyst for Black displacement, as well as the section titled A legacy of civic divestment. I'm noticing a pattern of detail and specificity that's only allocated to the Fillmore but not so much into the Bayview. They were parallel communities. There were theaters, there were hubs of culture within Bayview Hunters Point, we had our own community centers, we developed our own program, and we had our we were one of the few Black communities that had doctors that were in house that still went door to door did house visits, we had our own pharmacy, we had a community here that was just as vibrant and thriving as the Fillmore and it was destroyed in much the same way. And I would like to ask that a bit more research. And detail is given to the Bayview Hunters Point. Because for people who are not from here who may be reading that document, it would appear as though it's not as important as what happened in the fillmore. And I don't want anyone to mistake or to wait, the plight of one section of our Black community against another. They're equally as important. They've been harmed equally, and are still being harmed. So I would just like to ask that. Thank you.

2:58:11

Thank you. I'd like to welcome back with LaDonna Williams. Welcome LaDonna.

2:58:20

Yes, I would also like to see with the agendas and the information, there is very hard to find it to prepare in advance. So I apologize when my comments appear all over the place, but in particular to this report. Are you guys prepared to put in the definition of chattel slavery, I get it that there are strategies that are needed to get this Reparations done. But at the same time it appears that we keep tippy toeing around just calling it out of what we are demanding are overdue Reparations for we're going all around chattel slavery. And I believe it was Ms. Stewart that mentioned you know, San Francisco did not engage if I heard that right. I may have heard it wrong. But I thought I heard her say San Francisco did not engage in chattel slavery, when in fact they did. And there is plenty of history to show that. And thank you, Dr. Amos Brown, if we just take the time to listen to him. As matter of fact,

we need to give him his platform to speak because he's been given a wealth of information out and we seem to be sort of dissing him, but he talked about Archie Lee gold chains, the hidden history of slavery in California that connects directly to San Francisco. We have the military Black men who had to be in hiding. When they came to San Francisco, Black folks couldn't own homes until the mid 1940s. He's made the late 1940s. All of that is documented even in the book, the color of law by Richard Rothstein, we look at the current movement of them trying to give Reparations are not trying to, they're gonna give Reparations to comfort women, Asian comfort women, yet, they are totally ignoring the Black American comfort women that were the original comfort women for white supremacy that has went unchecked. And we apologize to all these others in their suffering. But yet, when it comes to ours, we've got to have this real real, you know, strategy to, to not say slavery, not claim our harm. And I'm just wondering, in this report, there should be a clear definition of what chattel slavery is, there should be also a clear a very clear definition, that it is due to the harm, and all these other things, you know, the other things that are mentioned, those are harms, too, but we're starting, we're supposed to be starting a precedent here, or presenting a precedent here, where we can finally speak openly and clearly on Black suffering and be paid for it.

3:01:22

Thank you. Are there any members of the public who want to comment on this particular item on the executive summary recommendations? I do see? public member make me Lee. Thank you.

3:01:44

Hello, again, I, unfortunately, was booted out and I'm just trying to catch up. But I heard a previous comment talk about urban renewal as a catalyst for Black displacement. Also want to talk about how they're like Black on click small Black enclaves around the city. Like in Lakeview, for example, where I was born and raised where my where we were red line there, my father was a teacher. And he literally got redlined to Lakeview. And that's where I grew up. I additionally want to talk about Reparations, some Reparations guidelines that I wanted to see on there, I don't know if this is the part for it. But I wanted to talk about guarantee guarantees of non reputation, meaning like, we will still continue to be eligible for Reparations, as long as we are still being harmed because I feel that even when we are, you know, awarded, and all is said and done, there will still be targeting of us. So I just kind of want to see that somewhere like guarantee of non repetition. As of as you know, I don't know if it's supposed to be in the in the executive summary or not, because I was booted and trying to catch up and reading. But again, thank you to everybody for your hard work. And I really appreciate being able to speak Thank you.

3:03:02

Thank you. Are there any other members of the public want to comment on this item, please use the raise hand icon. Okay, chin up, L Shepherd. Please. welcome and please unmute yourself.

3:03:36

Hi, um, I want to say to all you guys, thank you so much, and Pastor brown just completely appreciate you your wisdom, your knowledge, everything that you bring forward, you are so abundantly appreciated, and everybody gets on this panel, and everybody is here and all the hard work and time that we're taking, I just want to say that I'm thinking the document is great, is is good. I'm just thinking

that when we're talking about the lines, and that perhaps we want to mention on each line, that you need to be Black, African American Negro, you know, on each line like that has to just be a qualification across the board. And if we had that in there to me, there would be no questions that you know, others would come and, you know, try to proclaim Reparations, not saying that other folks are not entitled but we talking about African Blacks in San Franciscan and and I think if that is put there in each line, I think it would just be very, very clear, and no questions asked. So that's that's all Then I'd like to say, thank you for letting me share. Okay, thank

3:05:05

you. Are there any other members of the public who want to comment on the executive summary information?

3:05:19

I don't see any other members of the public indicating they'd like to comment at this time. Chair.

3:05:26

Thank you Seeing none public comment. Closed. Committee members. Again, this is a discussion item. So I would invite you if you have comments about the summary, or questions related to the timeline, to getting to the finish line for submission of the interim report in December. We'd welcome that now. Ben Brown, I see you trying to Yeah, something's wrong on your end, because you're the it's still not showing. It looks like you're trying to raise your hand. Now, you're muted now. Yes, yes, sir.

3:06:18

My hand is raised.

3:06:20

It just not showing on this side. Yeah, I'm not sure what's going on.

3:06:22

All right. I just want to make a comment that one person I like to give enlightenment on a matter. I mean, one caller said that we weren't focusing on the Western Addition. And I'd debut it we've been listening very closely. Rather. Ekanem talked about economic empowerment very heavily. And also, there's a brand new building is blended. And we got to put programs in that have substance.

3:07:18

And number three, the Health Committee zeroed in on that matter of what happened to our people and that shipyard. So for the record, this task force has not been about just the Western Addition. The Western Addition was the place but basically, our ancestors were relegated to in the Fillmore. It was internationally known as a holom of the West. And you have here in this area for is historic institutions. I would be here all night to recite what third Baptist first AME Zion and BeverlyMMED . Before way before that the 1940s this is back in the 1850s Reverend J J. Moore. Now the preachers ame. Zion Church established the first real ongoing school for us when other folks wouldn't even educate us. Attorney Gibbs, Great man to lead that group, the left San Francisco in 1858. On April the 13th. Why? Because this was such a racist mean town to Black folk. And they went up 800 up to British Columbia,

and settled on Victoria Island. And I've been up to Victoria Island, I've seen that huge play in that cemetery dedicated to Blacks of San Francisco who had to leave because of injustice, oppression, and discrimination.

3:09:36

Thank you, Dr. Brown. Mr. Taylor. Wow, that's how that's how that's how to speak after. Just quickly. I wanted to ask Juell, if there's going to be an appendix, including the slavery disclosure ordinance, the unfinished agenda, the Redevelopment Agency report that Brown mentioned earlier, and perhaps out migration study or any other more Recent studies that look at other aspects of education or income, on top of the work that the committees have done. So I was wondering if the because as I understand that I was involved in slavery disclosure ordinance. And even if you look at it now online, I think it's on the city administrators website, you can see Bank of America, a concedes that it consumed or incorporated absorb about 56 companies that did participate directly in slavery. So I'm not, you know, again, I'm trying to qualify what I'm saying when I mean, the injury of slavery to Black California, is not because of California slavery. But California is certainly participated in different ways. And understanding, we should be clear in how we qualify our our claim about slavery as it relates to the injury in terms of the ways it did participate, like many people be rented out, California, let you be here for 21 days, work the mines, and you had to be taken back out the state, California recognize the fugitive slave law, we can acknowledge all of that in terms of relationship to slavery. But part of what I'm trying to get at is we already have the infrastructure for this committee to build off of or just attend or append the slate, we disclose it, what next, which documents Chase Wells Fargo Bank of America today, recent disclosures, I showed how these banks and companies have participated directly or indirectly, and it would be a political strategy for us to use that and then go to these people and sort of say, you know, this is not a good publicity for Bank of America, if we, you know, make an issue around Reparations and the injury even if it tries to claim itself once removed. So we do have an infrastructure I'm suggesting, and I'm hoping Juell that we will include those items as references to the larger document. Juell, yes, are you unmuted?

3:12:07

Yeah, yes. Chairman, May I respond? Yes. Okay, great. I Yes. Thank you, member Taylor, we will be including not the full text of the previous reports, but rather sort of like a matrix that illuminate sort of illuminates the redundancies are just like really a numerate the commonalities between all of those historical reports. So it's going to be like a matrix or a spreadsheet or whatever that shows like The the goals, a lot of those reports has similar goals and similar harms that they were trying to adjust that are echoed and reverberate throughout history. And so we want to highlight that so yes. And then from a slavery disclosure ordinance that does come up in the policy subcommittees recommendations. And so there's a citation so that we can include the full text of the document in the appendix of your committee would like us to definitely reference so thank you for that, for highlighting that.

3:13:15

Thank you. member Barry?

3:13:25

I apologize. I don't know why my hand keeps going.

3:13:28

Sorry. Okay.

3:13:30

Thank you so much. Any other comments from committee members? Mr. Hamilton?

3:13:39

Yeah, I just want to ask a quick question to Juell. In terms of the part where it kind of goes into what happened in the Fillmore, is there any way that it can actually be framed in a way that actually talks about all the different communities in the cause? Like when we think about the Fillmore in the way that the Fillmore was this big, economic engine for the Black community in San Francisco, I know nowadays, we kind of separate Bay View and all these different communities where I know, back then, and talking to my grandmother and a bunch of elders, they seen it as Black San Francisco and folks from Lakeview and all these different communities gave contribution to the Fillmore in making it this big Harlem of the West. And once it fail, the whole heart fail, right because it works in chambers. So once the heart failed the chambers in in that community to Lakeview to the Bayview kind of fails. So I mean, I'm I know I'm saying it in my analogy, but is there a way that you can kind of push that in a way that can attest to the fall or due to redevelopment or urban renewal? It actually caused a trickle effect Within all communities, because because it's, I know that it's intentional on how they kind of like separate the communities and then it causes us to kind of gang bang on on it. When I don't think that that's that we should be doing it. I think it's more so like, how do we actually uplift that it was actually a collective? What is what made it feel more what it was, it wasn't just the people who lived in that community, it was Black San Franciscans, making that community thrive the way that it actually thrive. So so like, I'm just trying to figure out like, how can that be somehow articulated in the actual document, because when I read it, I'm not actually filling that vibe. It's making it like Bayview and FillMore, and some other and other communities that are kind of separate when they're when in that time, I think they will kind of morsel together as one. And maybe Reverend Brown can help me with that. And as I speak to that, I think that brother Rico is on to truth. There's no redaction of history. And the facts reveal exactly what he's saying. And in recent times, when I was on that board of supervisors, there's all said it became divided into districts because the so called progressive liberals won an easy way to establish their little faith terms. That's what it was all about. And we become a balkanize. City. We are not a New York, or Chicago, because we only have 49 square miles. And definitely, that was the case for African Americans. Back in the day. When I read documents of Dr. Frederick Douglas Haynes, senior, he was the first Black to run for Board of Supervisors. And was a delegate to the 1948 Democratic National Convention in Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, where who would wear Hubert Horatio Humphrey gave that classic speech on civil rights. Miss Charlie may hayes first Black woman, Black beyond this board of education in this city. So, you know, let's tell our history right. And what brother Rico has said is the truth. We will one hole. But politics split us up.

3:18:02

Thank you Reverend Brown.

3:18:06

Thank you, Reverend Brown and member Hamilton. Yes. And I thank you for the feedback about those dynamics in Black San Francisco. I think that could be Yeah, I think that in the full report, we will this is thank you for that feedback. And we'll make sure to incorporate more of that sort of nuance. I think that the way that we approach that in the full report, keep in mind that the presentation that we just had was the executive summary. But the way that we approach that in the full report is to talk about how the vote so more became what it was because Black people were so redlined out of other communities out from and banned from owning businesses and things like that, that the Fillmore became the Fillmore and other places became the sort of hubs of community of the Black community in different ways. But I will be forthcoming and say that, I think my limitations as a relative newcomer to San Francisco are that that reveals some of the limitations that I have. And so I will speak more in depth with community members and committee members about how to approach that in a way that makes the most sense considering the rich and long legacy of Black San Francisco, I definitely do not want to make any, you know, leave anything out, because every part of it is so critical. And I pay special attention to that. So thank you for pointing out those oversights as well. One real quick, quick a reason why so many of us ended up in the Fillmore was because we had alliances with the Japanese community Listen, Howard Thurman, who established the first interfaith iteration of church in America in 1943, along with a professor over at San Francisco State that gave us an entree to the Fillmore. So the Japanese were living in these Victorians here. But when they put them in the camps, what happen, the houses became vacant, we move White in, and that was those who were friends. And then we had people from the Jewish community who even bought houses that other communities would not let us get into. And then they moved into those homes. Even will amaze couldn't get out there in Forest Hill. He was very loud. And even the place where Dianne Feinstein used to live the gingerbread house, it was under restrictive covenants. That whole area out there around Lake and Aquila, friends, those are the facts. And I have all members of this church who told me how they got their home because jewis people in Japanese, the friend of them. And that's why that why over there, as Brother British are referred to earlier was a welcoming place for us. That why was first place for Japanese community.

3:21:50

Thank you, Mr. Brown. So with that we will close Item number seven. Please call next item Secretary Meyer.

3:21:58

Item number eight is announcements. It's a discussion item. This is time for the committee members and members of the public art committee members to just make announcements on things they were working on in community that are either upcoming or recently passed. And there will be public comment on the side.

3:22:19

Thank you. So members of the committee. Let's again, let's just call on everyone. I will and if you don't have one, just say no pass. Rev Brown.

3:22:30

Yes, Mr. Chairman, members of our task force on the 28th on the 28th on the 28th. Don't forget it. Yet third Baptist, the Human Rights Commission and the acp will host a family meeting at fair meeting, in

which we will hear from the family what input you have for that heritage building. So pass the word on. And make sure that the family shows up. And we respectfully sit, look and listen with each other and come to the common ground that will give us a successful outcome for that building. Number two, on last, just yesterday, Sunday, it was very significant meeting over at the Jones United Methodist Church, which is the oldest independent, self determining United Methodist, Black at Methodist Church in this town. At the church, you know what they were concerned about. While we get all of these demands out there, and we talked about what must be addressed, and getting rid of the homes and the evils of this oppressive society, but also there's some responsibility that we must assume. And brother landers are going to be joining with us. We're going to get a meeting scheduled with all the merchants here in the fillmore beginning with Safeway. Why? Because friends that area, Webster Geary fillmore been infected with drugs. And that parking lot. There is ground zero for people coming from all over putting a bad rap a bad frame and an image on this committee. And we feel that if people can go out to West Portal and they all to to show concern about crime there. We got to do the same thing here. Else we're going to implode and it will be a material mute issue. Who else to talk about having heard this building? We need to with sensible, responsible compassion, not this reckless compassion will help us deal with this homeless situation. But we are persons, many of them posing to be homeless, but they're not. Unfortunately, they have issues. Yes. But what they are doing, they are shooting drugs in that lot. And they are points from connection for crime. And just this past, this past Friday, Friday, full last young lady from the school right here, I won't call the name out to embarrass them. But a young lady from our community was stabbed right as O'Farrell and fillmore. And they will moving around and on, like Lady behavior. So I hope that we will take this very serious. I remember, it takes two wings of an airplane to fly two wings on an airplane stay in there. And we're going to have to approach our concerns. I feel personally. And common sense dictates that my sadness that we be responsible people, although people in chat, speak truth to power, yes. But there's some things that we got to do to educate our children. Give them safe havens to go to. And make sure that they have elders, who are their father, and they will not be moving around like a pack of dogs fighting, killing each other. At a young man was murdered. Right here across from the African American historical and cultural society. This weekend. Another young man would was run over, down the tenderloin just last night, and he had been working in the garden project out there in Bayview. But what happened? Again, folks who look like us, calls tragedy and death far too soon. So let's pray. We had three to four killings within the week. And so join us and a balanced effort, a movement of responsible leadership. Thank you.

3:27:47

Thank you, Rev Brown. Members, any others have any announcements, upcoming events. Member Erving. Thank you.

3:27:59

And thank you to the members of the public for staying with us so long, and prayers for the families that have been impacted by all of what is going on in our city and in a world right now. So tomorrow is the Samsung Unified School District's Board of Education meeting during that meeting, our African American parent advisory council will give their annual report. That meeting starts at 630. It's in person and virtual. In addition to that the Board of Education or the superintendent's office will review student data and outcomes and progress monitoring, monitoring. And as many of us know, many of our children were greatly impacted by a number of things with the pandemic being one. And test scores for

Black children, as you all may have seen, have declined. And it's going to be important that we share a whole picture of what is happening for African American students outside of test scores. That doesn't tell the whole story. And we also just want to make sure that we are supporting Black children in all spaces. And trying to shift the narrative that continues to say underperforming, lowest performing because we can begin to manifest that if we don't show the other narrative, tell the whole picture and really uplift our children as brilliant and that the system needs to do a better job of supporting that system means community, city and schools. So any love and calling in showing up and giving some support tomorrow for our African American parents and our students will be beautiful. And then on Thursday at 530 the 17th the African American parent advisory council will hold their monthly meeting and this meeting is going to be focused on early literacy. So these are Black parents trying to make sure that we are having these conversations giving our families the skills and knowledge necessary in order to support their children academically. So it is open to the meanings for APEX are for Black for families of Black children. However, it is open and it is going to be in person at Leola. Harvard at 5:30pm. On the 17th. And again, the school board meeting starts at 630. Tomorrow, November 15, here at phi phi phi Franklin or you can join virtually, and we can put the link in the chat.

3:30:17

Thank you Member Erving. Any other announcements from members? Okay, seeing none, thank you. We will go to public comment on this item. Again, members of the public has an opportunity to share announcements of upcoming events you may be a part of or happening in your particular neighborhood or community. So please use the raise hand icon to raise your hand. We'll be happy to hear from you. And as Member Erving said, we appreciate you being with us. As so long tonight.

3:30:49

Hello, Melody Downey Huff, welcome. Please share your event are you able to unmute? Okay, I think there's a problem with Melody Downey puff.

3:31:18

Oh, I'm sorry. I was I was on mute. I apologize. Thank you.

3:31:23

Thank you. Um,

3:31:25

my, my question is about the November 28 event, is there a flyer for that event to share with the family to get them there? And also for the full report? Will we be able to see the draft prior to this December? Date? And my other question was about how to join a committee to help support with the writing of the research that's already been done as far as coming out coming in a little bit late. Thank you.

3:31:57

Thank you. Um, I'm to call public member McNeely to comment about these. The community meetings that have we discussed being scheduled on this particular item?

3:32:19

Oh, no, I'm sorry, I made of saying.

3:32:23

Thank you. Is there? Do you have public comment on this item or not?

3:32:32

No. Okay. Thanks. Are there any other members of the public who would like to comment on this particular item? The announcements that were made about the community engagement events? Our members are participating in? Okay, I don't see any other hands raised Chair.

3:32:53

Thank you. Seeing none public comment is closed. We can close this item and move to the next item nine.

3:33:02

Okay, item. Item nine is adoption of the October 12 2020. Meeting recording and transcription. We did not have this available until late this afternoon. So I would recommend that we share it the draft meeting meant transcription online and approve this at the next meeting. That's what

3:33:29

we will do. Thank you very much. That brings us to item number 10.

3:33:33

Item number 10 is a German.

3:33:37

Excellent. Members entertain a motion to adjourn. I move to a second. I'll second. Excellent. Thank you all members of community and certainly members of the committee committee. Thank you for a good long meeting. We appreciate everyone. Meeting is adjourned.