



# **CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO**

## **MINUTES Regular Meeting October 17, 2022**

**2:00 p.m.  
Room 400, CITY HALL  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place**

**This meeting will be held in person at the location listed above. As authorized by California Government Code Section 54953(e) and Mayor Breed’s 45th Supplement to her February 25, 2020, emergency proclamation, it is possible that some members of the Civil Service Commission may attend this meeting remotely. In that event, those members will participate and vote by video. Members of the public may attend the meeting to observe and provide public comment at the physical meeting location listed above or by calling (415) 655-0001 and entering meeting id #2489 031 8739. Instructions for providing remote public comment are below.**

**LISTEN/PUBLIC COMMENT CALL-IN  
USA is (415) 655-0001 | Access Code: 2489 031 8739# #**

**LONDON N. BREED, MAYOR**

**COMMISSIONERS**

**JACQUELINE MINOR**

**President**

**KATE FAVETTI**

**Vice President**

**DOUGLAS CHAN**

**F.X. CROWLEY**

**ELIZABETH SALVESON**

**SANDRA ENG**

**Executive Officer**

The public is encouraged to submit comments in advance of the meeting in one of three ways: (1) email [civilservice@sfgov.org](mailto:civilservice@sfgov.org), (2) leave a voicemail message in the CSC Office main line at 628-652-1100 or (3) use the Civil Service Commission’s dedicated public comment line 1-415-655-0001, Access Code 2489 031 8739. Comments submitted by 5:00 pm the Friday before the meeting will be included in the record.

**CALL TO ORDER**

2:00 p.m.

**ROLL CALL**

President Jacqueline P. Minor	Present
Vice President Kate Favetti	Present
Commissioner Douglas S. Chan	Present
Commissioner F. X. Crowley	Present
Commissioner Elizabeth Salvesson	Present

President Jacqueline Minor presided.

(2) **REQUEST TO SPEAK ON ANY MATTER WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION BUT NOT APPEARING ON TODAY’S AGENDA**

Naj Daniels, SEIU Local 1021, CSC needs to train analyst on the reversion process, Rules 117 and 114. It is an undue hardship to employees. Consider requiring a report from the Department of Human Resources and a refresher on reversion, reappointment and reinstatement rules.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES (Item No. 3)**

Regular Meeting of October 3, 2022 – 2:00 p.m.

**Action:** Adopted the Minutes. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS (Item No. 4)**

None.

**HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR’S REPORT**

**0170-22-1 Overview of the Government Operations Recovery Initiatives. (Item No. 5)**

**Speakers:** Ben Rosenfield, Controller  
Carmen Chu, City Administrator  
Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** No action taken.

**0174-22-1 Progress Report on the Implementation of the Mayor’s 48<sup>th</sup> Supplement – Exempt to Permanent Status Program. (Item No. 6)**

**Speakers:** Kate Howard, Department of Human Resources

**Action:** No action taken.

**EXECUTIVE OFFICER’S REPORT**

**0171-22-1 Civil Service Commission Quarterly Report on the Goals and Objectives for Fiscal Year 2022-23. (Item No. 7)**

**Speakers:** Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

**Action:** Accepted the Report. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0173-22-8 Review of Request for Approval of Proposed Personal Services Contracts. (Item No. 8)**

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
40365-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$135,400	The San Francisco African American Arts & Cultural District (SFAAACD) was approved as part of our application to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to provide work as part of the state funded Bayview Community Shuttle Project. The scope of work for SFAAACD include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Serve on Project committee</li> <li>• Review and comment on Project plans and materials for accuracy and cultural competence</li> <li>• Organize, promote, and host engagement and marketing events with an emphasis on the African American community</li> <li>• Evaluate outreach events through surveys, focus groups and other methods</li> </ul>	Regular	6/30/2026
42070-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$114,500	Mission Neighborhood Centers – Evans Campus was approved as part of our application to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to provide work as part of the state funded Bayview Community Shuttle Project. Mission Neighborhood Centers – Evans Campus was previously listed in the grant as Bayview El Centro. The scope of work for Mission Neighborhood Centers – Evans Campus include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Serve on Project committee</li> <li>• Review and comment on Project plans and materials for accuracy and cultural competence</li> <li>• Organize, promote, and host engagement and marketing events with an emphasis on reaching the Spanish-language community</li> <li>• Evaluate outreach events through surveys, focus groups and other methods</li> </ul>	Regular	6/30/2026
43479-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$101,860	Bay Area Community Resources (BACR) was approved as part of our application to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to provide work as part of the state funded Bayview Community Shuttle Project. The scope of work for BACR include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop training materials and hold training sessions with Youth Champion program</li> <li>• Review and comment on Project plans and materials for accuracy and cultural competence</li> <li>• Organize and promote services for the Transportation Resource center, a “one-stop-shop” for the community to receive help on transportation services</li> </ul>	Regular	6/30/2026

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45633-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$1,000,000	<p>As-needed administrative support services utilizing California Multiple Award Schedule (CMAS) contract CMAS NO. 4-21-07-1017 to support the Finance and Information Technology Division's various business administration functions. The consultants will provide direct support to the section's operational tasks and indirect support to the division's capital and operating projects. The scope of services shall include but not be limited to the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review grant funding requirements to setup requisitions for purchase orders and contract encumbrance released from contracts, updated and monitor payment and PO balances</li> <li>• Monitors technology division expenditure and ensures the procurement meets federal, state, and various grant restrictions.</li> <li>• Develops financial analysis reports, including expenditure reports, vendor analysis, and contractor staff analysis to make sound recommendations on technology budget and purchasing decisions.</li> <li>• Assist in divisional projects and process improvement in areas of human capital, project budget, schedule delivery management utilizing system automation, working with potential users to gather requirements, and collaborating with PMO to develop and improve existing processes</li> <li>• Administration and management of any as-needed SharePoint workflows</li> <li>• Assist with all divisional recruitment, project delivery, and operational budget-related inquiries or requests.</li> <li>• Assist with coordination of the recruitment process, interviews set up, and Human Resources events and maintain agendas</li> <li>• Redirect project-related calls or distribute correspondence to the appropriate person on the team. 6. Produce and submit reports on general activity</li> <li>• Support Technology procurement 8. Facilitate divisional contract management</li> </ul>	Regular	9/25/2025

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
45928-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$500,000	<p>Priority access to a Harris systems engineer and a program manager.</p> <p>Project Management Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-coordinate activities with L3Harris tech to perform on-site maintenance, troubleshooting, etc.</li> <li>-ensure proper updates are communicated to San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) (issue, cause, resolution)</li> <li>-conduct ad-hoc meetings as necessary, take meeting notes, send out updates</li> <li>-track actions/issues list and provide updates when required</li> <li>-prepare quarterly invoice packages for SFMTA</li> <li>-assist in coordinating additional resources when required (Patriot, Conduent, additional L3Harris staff)</li> <li>-assist in RMA (Remote Network Management) coordination and ensure timely delivery of materials back to SFMTA</li> </ul> <p>Systems Engineering Activities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Review of various network management systems in response to emails describing system events and notification of possible system problems.</li> <li>-Regular review of the tunnel system using Intermapper, the radio system using the remote network management and system center operations manager review of network devices using CiscoPrime, and review of Conduent servers using WhatsUpGold. Report any issues that have been discovered.</li> <li>-Correction of problems when a remote solution is possible                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- e.g. remote reboot of a base station device, configuration reload on a tunnel Lantronix module when it is reporting "no SNMP response"</li> </ul> </li> <li>-Periodic review (via browser) Alarm Point Duplicator (APO) status, Duracomm control center, Netclocks, and power systems (rectifiers and inverters). Report any issues that have been discovered</li> <li>-Support for Harris personnel: primarily Brian Gonsalves, Robyn Ferguson, and Tom Brown</li> <li>-Support for SFMTA personnel: Roi Kingon and Jacky So</li> <li>-Support for Conduent - generally with respect to configuration changes to WhatsUpGold.</li> <li>-System configuration changes as required. Historically that has included system database changes (in the user access system, Maestro console layout configuration, managing user accounts, and access as required.</li> </ul>	Regular	10/17/2024
47092-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$414,000	<p>The Community Youth Center of San Francisco (CYC) was approved as part of our application to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to provide work as part of the state funded Bayview Community Shuttle Project.</p> <p>The scope of work for CYC include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review and comment on project public outreach plans and public engagement activities</li> <li>• Review and translate project materials into Chinese for accuracy and cultural competence</li> <li>• Organize, promote, and host engagement events with emphasis on the Chinese-language community</li> <li>• Hire, train and provide staffing for the Transportation Resource Center (TRC), a community resource for transportation information and services.</li> <li>• Promote TRC through marketing and outreach activities within the project area through ad-buys, mailers, street teams, posters, doorknockers or flyers</li> </ul>	Regular	6/30/2026

Civil Service Commission Meeting Minutes

Regular Meeting of October 17, 2022

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
47937-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$119,000	Hunters Point Family was approved as part of our application to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to provide work as part of the state funded Bayview Community Shuttle Project. The scope of work for Hunters Point Family include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Serve on Project committee</li> <li>• Review and comment on Project plans and materials for accuracy and cultural competence</li> <li>• Organize, promote, and host engagement and marketing events with an emphasis on reaching youth and families</li> <li>• Evaluate outreach events through surveys, focus groups and other methods</li> </ul>	Regular	6/30/2026
48063-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$174,000	Amplify Impact LLC was approved as part of our application to the California Air Resources Board (CARB) to provide work as part of the state funded Bayview Community Shuttle Project. Amplify Impact LLC was previously listed in the grant as OneBayview and Social Niche Guru. The scope of work for Amplify Impact, LLC include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Serve on Project committee</li> <li>• Review and comment on Project plans and materials for accuracy and cultural competence</li> <li>• Organize, promote, and host engagement and marketing events with an emphasis on online engagement</li> <li>• Evaluate outreach events through surveys, focus groups and other methods</li> </ul>	Regular	6/30/2026
49703-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$5,000,000	This request is for a Software As A Service Agreement for the SFMTA Enterprise Hexagon Enterprise Asset Management software that is currently in use. The Hexagon (previously INFOR) Enterprise Asset Management software for asset and work order management has been used by SFMTA for about 7 years. We continue to implement new business units and have projects on our roadmap until about 2027.	Regular	8/28/2026
49788-22/23	Municipal Transportation Agency	\$9,000,000	The consultant will provide comprehensive environmental review (EIR) and analysis for the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) in accordance with the California Environmental quality Act (CEQA) and as-needed documentation pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) as required and as it relates to SFMTA 's Building Progress Program's Facilities Framework (Framework). The Framework is a guiding document for capital improvements to SFMTA operations, maintenance, and support facilities to modernize the oldest and largest bus, rail, other aging facilities, and accommodate transit fleet growth and support functions through 2040. Other services to be performed may also include public outreach and engagement, economic and transportation facility analyses, structural and geotechnical engineering, and financial analyses of joint development options, including as needed, re-entitlement of the property through all the required approvals for the proposed five projects: Presidio Modernization Project, Kirkland Battery Electric Bus and Other Improvement Project, Islais Creek Battery Electric Bus Pilot Program, Cable Car Barn Master Plan, Joint Development for the 4th-5th/Mission Garage and Moscone Garage, and/or other facility projects as needed.	Regular	1/1/2029
40076-22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$8,000,000	Provide technical evaluation, project development, financial analysis, design, permitting, and construction management of renewable energy and energy storage technologies.	Regular	9/1/2027
45144-22/23	Public Utilities Commission	\$450,000	Regular trash pickups for Moccasin Camp. Regular trash pickup is necessary because of public health concerns. Accumulated trash creates a health hazard to the environment, public, and employees. If denied CCSF could face fines for such hazards.	Regular	7/31/2027

PCS	Department	Amount	Type of Service	Type of Approval	Duration
48316-18/19	Public Library	Current Approved Amount \$163,400 Increase Amount Requested \$181,898 New Total Amount Requested \$345,298	Contractor shall build and maintain a Local Music Collection Site for San Francisco Public Library that provides streams and downloads of music content in multiple digital formats. Contractor shall provide means for the authentication of Library cardholders for downloading or streaming content according to Library's licensing agreements with artists, and provide interfaces for the export of and access to MUSICat MARC records for Library's catalog. Contractor shall provide administrative tools through MUSICat that support and streamline Library's implementation of and processes for collection development, licensing, and promotion, as well as displaying usage statistics and providing administrative and technical support for Library's staff and community of users. Contractor shall serve as payor to musicians that the Library contracts with for the non-exclusive use of their recordings, and will charge the Library \$20 service fee per \$200 payment.	Modification	3/1/2026
48568-18/19	Municipal Transportation Agency	Current Approved Amount \$6,000,000 Increase Amount Requested \$2,000,000 New Total Amount Requested \$8,000,000	Provide garment rental & maintenance for Municipal Transportation Agency staff that are required to perform their duties as per job description and Memorandum of Understanding	Modification	9/30/2025
45627-21/22	Department of Technology	Current Approved Amount \$2,500,000 Increase Amount Requested \$21,500,000 New Total Amount Requested \$24,000,000	1. To provide professional services to implement and configure modules and processes within the City ServiceNow platform. 2. Attain a high level of user adoption Prospective vendors shall provide project plan that would describe how they will guide Project execution. This should include clear outline of the project methodology and approach that will be used along with listing of all the assumptions the vendor makes in preparing the plan/proposal. Furthermore, to gain the full understanding of the overall scope of the project, if selected, prospective vendors are required to: 1. Develop Technical Requirements - Conduct/facilitate a Process Workshop to confirm business and technical requirements by analyzing the CCSF business processes and documenting functional requirements. This shall include business analysis and requirements definition, data migration analysis and planning, interface analysis and planning, functional design considerations, as well as training framework/training plan followed by defining the design approach for the functional requirements 2. Design and Develop Solution - Provide detailed designs, configuration of any identified gaps that were agreed to proceed, followed by building and configuring the solution. The proposed design must also be able to scale to meet CCSF's future needs in any of ServiceNow™ categories, 3. Conduct Unit, System and User Acceptance Testing - Provide test plan with use cases tracing back to business/functional requirements for testing, incorporating changes as required. 4. Training – Participate in knowledge transfer sessions and provide inputs into training plan. 5. Solution Implementation/Deployment – Perform dry-run activities, provide detailed deployment plan, preparing users to go live and going live with the solution. 6. Post Implementation Support – Monitoring system/application(s) performance and performing necessary action(s) to mitigate any observed, reported issues (showstoppers items) post deployment (deployment of emergency fixes).	Modification	12/31/2031

**0173-22-8 Continued (Item No. 8)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopt the report. Approve the requests for proposed Personal Services Contracts; Notify the Office of the Controller and the Office of Contract Administration. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0089-22-6 Appeal by Robert Moore of the Human Resources Director’s Determination to Administratively Close Appellant’s Complaint of Retaliation. (Item No. 9)**

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postpone to the meeting of November 7, 2022, at the request of the appellant. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0200-19-2 Appeal by Kevin Jackson of the Minimum Qualifications for Class 3434 Arborist Technician. (Item No. 10)**

**September 19, 2022:** Continued the appeal to October 17, 2022.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Postponed to the meeting of November 7, 2022, at the request of the Department of Human Resources. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0162-22-3 Certification of the Highest Prevailing Rate of Wages of the Various Crafts and Kinds of Labor Paid in Private Employment in the City and County of San Francisco. (Item No. 11)**

**October 3, 2022:** Postpone to the meeting of October 17, 2022, at the request of the department.

**Speakers:** None.

**Action:** Adopted the report of the Office of Labor Standards Enforcement. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0092-22-5 Proposed New Rule to Civil Service Commission Rule 411: Examinations Authorization for Exempt to Permanent Status Program on behalf of the Director of Transportation. (Item No. 12)**

**July 18, 2022:** Adopted the report and approved the supplemental staff report to Rule 411 – Examinations to include authorization for the temporary rule change – exempt to permanent status program, including the eligible list decision criteria.

**August 15, 2022:** Accepted the report; Post the proposed amendments to Rule 411 Examinations for meet and discuss.



**0092-22-5**      **Continued**

**Speakers:**            None.

**Action:**                Accepted the staff report for the proposed amendments to Rule 411 – Examinations.

**0172-22-5**      **Request for Status Grant to 8173 Legal Assistant Classification for Incumbents of 8132 District Attorney’s Investigative Assistant Classification. (Item No. 13)**

**Speakers:**            Richard Ng, District Attorney’s Office  
Angela Long, IFPTE Local 21  
Shawn Sherburne, Department of Human Resources

**Action:**                Adopted the report and grant incumbents in 8132 District Attorney’s Investigative Assistant class status into 8173 Legal Assistant class pursuant to Rule 109.15 and they will not serve a new probationary period. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**Public Comment:**    Tracy Sacca  
Erica Dixon

**0054-22-6**      **Appeal by Thomas A. Bower of the Director of Transportation’s Determination to Administratively Close His Complaint of Harassment and discrimination. (Item No. 14)**

**July 18, 2022:**        Postpone to a future meeting at the request of the appellant.

**August 15, 2022:**    Postpone to a future meeting at the request of the appellant.

**Speakers:**            Carlos Cueva-Alegria, Department of Human Resources  
Thomas Bower, Appellant

**Action:**                Adopted the report, upheld the decision of the Director of Transportation and denied the appeal by Thomas A. Bower. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0104-22-4**      **Appeal by Sam K. Ho of the Rejection of Application for the 1408 Principal Clerk (CBT-1408-REF14671A) Examination. (Item No. 14)**

**Speakers:**            None.

**Action:**                Adopted the report and denied the appeal by Sam K. Ho. Sam K. Ho failed to appear. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**Public Comment on all matters pertaining to Items 17 and 18 (Item No. 16)**

None.

**Vote on whether to hold Item 18 in closed session. (Item No. 17)**

The Commission voted to go into closed session. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**0083-22-1 Performance Evaluation – Executive Officer – PERSONNEL EXCEPTION – San Francisco Administrative Code Section 67.10(b) and California Government Code Section 54957 (b)(1). (Item No. 18)**

**The Commission went into closed session at 4:41 p.m. and the following were present:**

- Jacqueline P. Minor, President
- Kate Favetti, Vice President
- Douglas Chan, Commissioner
- F.X. Crowley, Commissioner
- Elizabeth Salveson, Commissioner
- Sandra Eng, Executive Officer

**The Commission reconvened in open session at 4:58 p.m.**

**Reconvened in Open Session. Vote to elect whether to disclose any or all discussions on Item 18 in closed session (S.F. Admin. Code §67.12 (a)) (Item No. 19)**

**June 22, 2022:** The Commission voted not to disclose any discussion held in closed session. Continue discussions to a future meeting.

**August 31, 2022:** Postpone to the meeting of September 19, 2022.

**September 19, 2022:** The commission voted not to disclose any discussions held in closed session but will continue discussion.

**Action:** The commission voted not to disclose any discussions held in closed session. The Performance Evaluation has been completed. (Vote of 5 to 0)

**COMMISSIONERS’ ANNOUNCEMENTS/REQUESTS (Item No. 20)**

Kate Favetti requested the Executive Officer look into the agreement/procedure for status grant between Michael Brown, former Executive Officer, Civil Service Commission and Ted Yamasaki, former Deputy Director, Department of Human Resources; it may be something the commission needs to review. Also, provide follow-up on Ms. Daniels public comment (refresher on reversion, reappointment and reinstatement rules), include in the Executive Officer report at the next meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT (Item No. 21)**

5:05 p.m.