



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes

Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting City and County of San Francisco

Friday, August 26, 2022

9:00 am – 11:00 am

WebEx Online Event

Members

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office

Jillian Johnson – Director, Committee on Information Technology

Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services

Taraneh Moayed – Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration

Nnena Ukuku – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 9:03 am.

2. Roll Call

Jillian Johnson

Guy Clarke

Mark de la Rosa

Michelle Littlefield

Mike Makstman

Taraneh Moayed (present for agenda/minutes items 1-4)

Nnena Ukuku (present for agenda/minute items 1-8)

COIT Staff

Julia Chrusciel

Danny Vang

Guests

Guy Clarke

Annie Chung

Humphrey Loe

Eric Pawlowsky

Maria Mejia Rojas

Teresa Young

Robert Eickwort

3. Approval of the Consent Agenda (Action Item)

3.1 Resolution Making Findings to Allow Teleconferenced Meetings under California Government Code Section 54953(e)

3.2 Approval of Minutes from July 7, 2022

Mike Makstman announced that agenda item number 6 would follow immediately after the agenda item 3.

Chair Mike Makstman asked the board if both consent agenda items could be voted on at the same time. There was no objection. Jillian Johnson brought the motion to a vote and Taraneh Moayed seconded this motion. Mike Masktman, Jillian Johnson, Guy Clarke, Mark de la Rosa, Michelle Littlefield, Taraneh Moayed, and Nnena Ukuku voted to approve. The resolution and the minutes were approved unanimously.

4. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Location Management Systems (Action Item)

Guy Clarke and Annie Chung returned to present changes to their ABCT policy on behalf of the Airport.

Jillian Johnson moved to recommend the policy for COIT review and Taraneh Moayed seconded the recommendation. Mike Makstman, Mark de la Rosa, Jillian Johnson, Michelle Littlefield, Taraneh Moayed and Nnena Ukuku voted to recommend the policy. Guy Clarke recused himself from the vote. The policy was recommended for COIT review.

5. Department Updates & Announcements

Jillian Johnson introduced the group to Danny Vang, who recently joined COIT as a Policy Analyst. She also updated the group that COIT staff were investigating different methods for distributing the Annual Surveillance Report.

6. Project Updates

Julia Chrusciel presented on STP and SIR template changes.

Mike Makstman expressed excitement about the template changes, especially the expanded impact section, but also recognized that there should not be an excessive burden placed on departments. Michelle Littlefield was excited to help support the work with the Data SF team.

7. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Social Media Monitoring Technology (Action Item)

Maria Mejia, Teresa Young, and Robert Eickwort presented on Social Media Monitoring Software on behalf of Human Services Agency.

Mike Makstman asked how is the information handled by the Human Services Agency. The department answered that the technology is used to field questions from the public, so that the department will be able to answer questions or connect people to social workers as needed. The technology is used for communication and outreach work by the department.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to send the policy for COIT review, pending the inclusion of their departmental social media policy in the documents. Michelle Littlefield seconded the motion.

Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, Mark de la Rosa, Jillian Johnson, Michelle Littlefield, and Nnena Ukuku voted to recommend the policy. Taraneh was absent during the vote. The policy was recommended for COIT review pending the requested changes.

8. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Cameras, non-security (Action Item)

Eric Pawlowsky presented on People Counting System on behalf of Human Services Agency.

Mike Makstman asked about the Sensus company's remote viewing of images for calibration and if it could be used for remote viewing by a law enforcement agency. Eric Pawlowsky responded that theoretically this could happen, but that this technology is not a good one for surveillance. Jillian Johnson clarified that if the San Francisco Police Department wanted to use this technology to surveil any sites with the cameras, they would need to go to Sensus and not to the department for those images, which Erik Pawlowsky confirmed. Guy Clarke asked that the word "airport" would be removed.

Jillian Johnson requested that REC add to the policy (a) terms of service regarding livestreaming access and (b) add language where the departments commits to only working with entities that work with law enforcement when legally required through a warrant, subpoena, etc., but not in other circumstances.

Mike Makstman suggested that the board members recommend the policy for COIT review, pending the addition of language about doing business with privacy-leading companies and references to specific terms of service for this particular vendor about how it handles livestreaming access. Jillian Johnson agreed and moved to vote on the policy. Guy Clarke seconded the motion.

Mike Makstman, Guy Clarke, Mark de la Rosa, Michelle Littlefield, and Jillian Johnson all voted to recommend the policy for COIT review. Taraneh Moayed and Nnena Ukuku were absent during the vote. The policy was recommended for COIT review pending the requested changes.

9. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

10. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:23 am.