



Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Draft Minutes

Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting City and County of San Francisco

Friday, July 8, 2022

9:00 am – 11:00 am

WebEx Online Event

Members

Mike Makstman – Chair, Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport

Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office

Jillian Johnson – Chair, Director, Committee on Information Technology

Michelle Littlefield – Chief Data Officer, Data SF and Digital Services

Taraneh Moayed – Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration

Nnena Ukuku – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Mike Makstman called the meeting to order at 9:06 am.

2. Roll Call

Jillian Johnson

Guy Clarke

Mark de la Rosa

Michelle Littlefield

Mike Makstman

Taraneh Moayed

Nnena Ukuku

COIT Staff

Julia Chrusciel

Guests

Justin Wong

Veronica Oldenberg

Humphrey Loe

Annie Chung

3. Approval of Minutes from May 27, 2022

Mike Makstman asked if there were any questions or recommended changes to the minutes. As there were none, he asked if the board members wanted to bring the minutes to a vote. Jillian Johnson moved to vote and Guy Clarke seconded the motion.

Mike Makstman, Jillian Johnson, Guy Clarke, Michelle Littlefield, Taraneh Moayed, and Mark de la Rosa voted to approve the minutes, while Nnena Ukuku abstained.

The minutes of May 27, 2022 were approved without changes.

4. Department Updates & Announcements

Jillian Johnson announced that the next meeting will be on Friday, August 26, 2022, due to summer absences as well as upcoming COIT departmental initiatives.

She also announced that the departments will be introducing a variety of improvements in the next few months, including allowing departments to bring policies to the Board of Supervisors on their own; revising the Surveillance Technology Policy and Surveillance Impact Report templates; improving the procurement process to screen for surveillance technology; and improving education for departments so they can better self-screen for surveillance technology before the procurement process.

Taraneh requested that OCA be looped in early to any changes to procurement. Michelle said DataSF is looking at Surveillance Technology Inventory to find metadata. Mike said that the Department of Technology would be happy to help automate the annual reporting process based on their own experience with automation.

5. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Audio Recorders (Action Item)

Justin Wong presented on Gunshot Detection Hardware and Services on behalf of the Department of Emergency Management.

Taraneh asked what the differences there are between the San Francisco Police Department policy and the Department of Emergency Management policy for this same technology. Justin stated that the Department of Emergency Management accesses and transfers the data but does not retain it as the Police Department does.

Nnena Ukuku moved to vote on the policy and both Michelle Littlefield and Mark de la Rosa seconded.

The policy was unanimously recommended for COIT review by all PSAB members.

6. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Audio Recorders (Action Item)

Guy Clarke and Veronica Oldenberg returned to present their amended policy on Gunshot Detection Solution on behalf of the Airport.

Jillian asked the department to describe how the system is triggered by different levels of noise and the department agreed to include it.

Taraneh suggested to PSAB members and COIT staff that changes to returning policies be tracked in red font so PSAB can more easily identify updates made from prior hearings.

Jillian Johnson made a motion to recommend the policy contingent upon adding language explaining how the machine learning algorithm works. Taraneh Moayed seconded.

Guy Clarke recused himself from the vote. Mike Makstman, Jillian Johnson, Nnena Ukuku, Michelle Littlefield, Taraneh Moayed, and Mark de la Rosa voted to recommend.

The policy was recommended with changes for COIT review.

7. Surveillance Technology Policy Review: Location Management Systems (Action Item)

Guy Clarke, Humphrey Loe, and Annie Chung presented on Application-Based Commercial Transport (“ABCT”) on behalf of the Airport.

Taraneh asked the department to clarify how the technology works. Humphrey and Annie explained that the data is provided and generated by permitted Transportation Network Companies (TNC’s; companies like Uber and Lyft) and they are required to provide information on the on-duty vehicles which enter and exit the San Francisco International Airport geofence. There is no information provided to the City on the identity of the TNC passenger.

It was requested that the following changes be made and the policy presented again at a future PSAB meeting:

- Clarity around the fact that that individual user information (i.e. passenger information) would not be collected
- A thorough explanation about how and why the data would be used for punitive purposes such as ticketing or fines
- A streamlining of the definitions of data

8. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

9. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:37 am.