

## **MEETING OF THE CIVIC DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE**

**Monday, February 14, 2022  
2:00 p.m.  
Remote Meeting**

### **Minutes**

Chair Stryker called the meeting to order at 2:02 p.m.

#### **1. Roll Call** (00:27)

**Commissioners Present:** Kimberlee Stryker, Yakuh Askew, Abby Schnair, Paul Woolford

**Commissioners Absent:** Yiyi Lu

**Staff Present:** Joanne Lee, Alyssa Ventre, Paris Cotz

Chair Stryker announced the hybrid meeting instructions.

Paris Cotz announced public comment instructions.

Chair Stryker began the meeting reading the Arts Commission's land acknowledgement statement.

#### **2. General Public Comment** (7:48)

There was no public comment.

#### **3. YBI Westside Bridges Retrofit Project – Phase 3** (9:35)

Muzae Sesay, Project Artist + Designer  
Kevin Conger, Landscape Architect  
Liz Hirschhorn, Assistant Development Program Manager, Treasure Island  
Development Authority  
Michael Scott, WSP

The artist took suggestions from the team's last visit to CDR and refined the design, texture, and color of artwork. Artist wants to ensure that the work is not obtrusive from whichever point of entry and not read as a large infrastructure project. This will be achieved by using a blend of earth tones taken from the island itself to create a palette of eleven colors so the artwork blends into the island seamlessly. Artist visited the island multiple times to create a reference palette that honors the colors of the landscape.

Based on previous suggestions, the artist changed the texture to a smooth finish rather than rock texture while also pushing forth bold, fine art aesthetic. Some walls will be abstract, while some will have boat and island imagery. The walls seen from a distance from the bridge, ferry or embarcadero will be blended and abstract.

Commissioners had questions about the textures, in particular what the textures are with the color stains. The artist described the textures as smooth but rocky, an earthen texture but not dramatic. There was a concern about it looking like super graphic, but based on explanation, the materials won't come off that way.

Commissioners commented on how far along this project has come.

Commissioner Schnair, second by Commissioner Woolford moved to approve Phase 3 of the **YBI Westside Bridges Retrofit Project**.

There was no public comment.

The motion unanimously carried by the following vote:  
Ayes: Stryker, Askew, Schnair, Woolford

#### **4. Southeast Treatment Plant Biosolids Digester Facilities Project – Post-Phase 3**

(28:00)

Anthony Esterbrooks, Project Designer & Landscape Architect, SF DPW  
Rosanna Tse, Project Engineer, SFPUC  
Greg Robley, Architect, MWA Architects

The actual construction of digesters will begin in March of this year, while the project is expected to reach full completion by May 2028. Due to cost challenges, the team eliminated the water fountain from the plaza to save costs and save water. The project team's goal is to maintain site function and visual aesthetics.

The layout of the plaza had to be rethought with the removal of fountain. The team developed what they call a 'ripple concept,' with the narrative of water. The team incorporated water droplets into the paving pattern and included round planters, pedestrian lighting, and added a screen adjacent to large transformer structure. It is a place to gather for both large and small groups.

Raw shotcrete will cover the surface of digester tanks due to a value-engineering process. The team proposes a painted solution to mitigate the raw shotcrete, and have proposed four super graphic solutions, with the wave imagery fitting best into the water narrative. These tanks be seen from the CalTrain and 280.

Commissioners expressed concerns about the large public artwork (that is also about flow and movement) on the border of the site, and that the super graphic on the tanks will conflict with that and might suggest that it is another artwork.

Commissioners commented that the plaza redesign is an improvement, that it's great for various sizes of groups to gather and maintains the theme of water. There was a question about how the acrylic panels on the screen will hold up in UV light. The team answered that material is very durable and is used in other areas around the city like bus shelters. The colors will be a gradient of shades of blue referencing the water treatment process.

There were questions about the paving material. The team answered that ideally the paving material will be a pre-cast concrete paver but if the cost is too high, they can use integral color concrete with sand blasted finishes.

Deputy Director Lee offered to set up a meeting between the project team and public art staff for a brainstorming session to address the super graphic.

Commissioner Schnair, seconded by Commissioner Woolford moved to approve **Post-Phase 3** of the **Southeast Treatment Plant Biosolids Digester Facilities Project** with the following contingencies: digester tank design be worked on in meetings with the public art staff, and landscape plaza design can be workshopped in an informal meeting with Commissioner Stryker for final approval.

There was no public comment.

The motion unanimously carried by the following vote:  
Ayes: Stryker, Askew, Schnair, Woolford

## **5. China Town – Rose Pak Central Subway Gate – Small Project Review**

*(1:17:53)*

Jumoke Akin Taylor, Project Manager, SF DPW  
Charles Dilworth, Principal, Dilworth Eliot [DE+]  
Cinda Gilliland, Principal, ReedGilliland Landscape Architects  
Jordan Canayan, Associate, Dilworth Eliot [DE+]

The station is located at the corner of Stockton and Washington Streets. The team is looking at how to control after-hours access to stairs and plaza. The team gave a quick overview of the station history.

The team is proposing a two or three segmented gate that stack up when opened and are considering either a bamboo patterning or terracotta baguettes for a minimal look. The team also considered a perforated metal off the shelf, as well as a polycarbonate screen, but this was not preferred

by MTA due to high maintenance and questionable durability. The team proposed a rolling gate with possible imagery on it, but planning staff preferred the sliding gate over the rolling gate.

Commissioners preferred the bamboo gate, it wouldn't be easily graffitied, and would be complimentary with the overall design. Commissioners don't want the gate to be visually in competition with the planned artwork, so the bamboo gates provide a nice counterbalance.

Commissioners were concerned and wanted to ensure that no one can climb up with horizontal pieces of the gate. The project team confirmed that there is a mesh layer that prevents people from getting their feet on the horizontal bars.

Commissioners had questions about transparency and opacity of the person gate

and noticed a corner where railing and the gate meet, leaves horizontal gap which might be a problem.

Commissioners would like to review this project once more and suggested that the team return in March for an informal work session.

There was no public comment.

## **6. Staff Report**

*(1:58:31)*

Joanne Lee, Deputy Director of Programs, SFAC

Deputy Director reminded commissioners and public about San Francisco Art Commission's annual convening, Tuesday Feb 15.

There was no public comment.

## **7. New Business and Announcements**

(2:00:26)

There was no new business or announcements.

There was no public comment.

## 6. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:04p.m.

Posted 2/28/22, 11:00 a.m., pc

---

### Archives Available

A recording of this meeting will be available online after the meeting at the following address: **ENTER AUDIO ARCHIVE LINK.**

### Language Accessibility

Translated written materials and interpretation services are available to you at no cost. For assistance, please notify Paris Cotz, 415-252-2252, [paris.cotz@sfgov.org](mailto:paris.cotz@sfgov.org).

我們將為閣下提供免費的書面翻譯資料和口譯服務。如需協助， Paris Cotz, 415-252-2252, [paris.cotz@sfgov.org](mailto:paris.cotz@sfgov.org).

Materiales traducidos y servicios de interpretación están disponibles para usted de manera gratuita. Para asistencia, notifique a Paris Cotz, 415-252-



2252, [paris.cotz@sfgov.org](mailto:paris.cotz@sfgov.org).