Committee on Information Technology
Office of the City Administrator
San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

Minutes

Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board Meeting
City and County of San Francisco

Friday, January 28, 2022
9:00 am – 11:00 am
WebEx Online Event

Members
Taraneh Moayed – Chair, Assistant Director, Office of Contract Administration
Jillian Johnson – Director, Committee on Information Technology
Mark de la Rosa – Director of Audits, City Service Auditor, Controller's Office
Maria McKee – Director of Research & Planning, Juvenile Probation
Mike Makstman – Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology
Guy Clarke – IT Governance Director, San Francisco International Airport
Nnena Ukuku – Public Member

1. Call to Order by Chair

Taraneh Moayed called the meeting to order at 9:00 am. She noted that Ken Bukowski no longer is a Privacy and Surveillance Advisory Board member as of today's meeting.

2. Roll Call

Taraneh Moayed
Jillian Johnson
Mark de la Rosa
Maria McKee
Mike Makstman
Guy Clarke

COIT Staff
Julia Chrusciel

Guests
Keaboka Molwane
Randy McClure
Roland Tolosa

3. Approval of Minutes from January 14, 2022 (Action Item)

The minutes of the January 14, 2022 PSAB meeting were approved without changes.

4. Department Updates & Announcements

There were no department updates or announcements.

5. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Third-Party Camera (Action Item)

Keaboka Molwane and Guy Clarke presented on Third-Party Cameras on behalf of the San Francisco Airport to address a previously raised concern around what controls exist for third parties and what agreements were made with such third parties regarding any video data that might be requested.

To address this question, SFO provided a copy of Chapter 7.5 which is a section of the lease agreement between third parties and the San Francisco Airport dedicated to video monitoring and devices as well as airport systems.

At PSAB's recommendation, SFO agreed to incorporate Chapter 7.5 in the department's policy documents and to state that any substantive changes to it would require bringing the policy back to PSAB, COIT and BOS for review and approval.

A motion was made to vote on the policy. Taraneh Moayed, Mark de la Rosa, Mike Makstman, Jillian Johnson, Maria McKee, and Nnena Ukuku voted to approve. Guy Clarke recused himself from the vote. The policy was approved, pending the above agreement regarding Chapter 7.5 and review of the revised Policy by City attorney Zachary Porianda before being presented to the full COIT committee to ensure it doesn't interfere with the jurisdiction of the Board of Supervisors.

6. Review and Approval of Surveillance Technology Policy: Non-Security Camera (Action Item)

Randy McClure presented on SenSource Patron Counters on behalf of the San Francisco Public Library.

There was discussion around what kind of information is captured and what can be seen. Face blurring was discussed and Randy McClure explained why they would prefer to not have that as part of their policy as sometimes they need to live view the footage for data verification. Library patron privacy was discussed in the context of live camera viewing requests by entities outside of the Public Library department.

It was decided that more information was need about the data collected by the technology, and changes needed to be made to the policy to clarify potential use cases before it could be brought to a vote.

7. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

8. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:13 am.