



# Committee on Information Technology

Office of the City Administrator

San Francisco City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Suite 352

## Minutes

Committee on Information Technology Meeting

**Thursday, September 19, 2024**

10:00 am – 12:00 pm

City Hall 305, WebEx Online Event

---

### Members

Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair

Mike Makstman, Interim City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Nathan Sinclair, Acting Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Sophia Kittler, Director, Mayor's Office of Innovation

Aaron Peskin, President, Board of Supervisors

Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

Greg Wagner, Controller

Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources

Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health

Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission

Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library

Mary Ellen Carroll, Director, Department of Emergency Management

Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director, Municipal Transportation Agency

Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency

Mawuli Tugbenyoh, Acting Executive Director, Human Rights Commission

### 1. Call to Order by Chair

Katie Petrucione called the meeting to order at 10:02 AM, provided instruction on how to give public comment, and conducted the roll call.

### 2. Roll Call

#### Members Present

Katie Petrucione for Carmen Chu, City Administrator, Chair

Mike Makstman, City Chief Information Officer, Executive Director, Department of Technology

Nathan Sinclair, Acting Chief Information Security Officer, Department of Technology

Tiffany Young for Sophia Kittler, Director, Mayor's Office of Innovation

Edward De Asis for Angela Calvillo, Clerk, Board of Supervisors

ChiaYu Ma for Greg Wagner, Controller

Kate Howard for Carol Isen, Director, Department of Human Resources

Eric Raffin for Dr. Grant Colfax, Director, Department of Public Health

Ramsey Williams for Dennis Herrera, General Manager, Public Utilities Commission  
Maureen Singleton for Michael Lambert, City Librarian, Public Library  
Ray Ricardo for Ivar Satero, Director, San Francisco International Airport  
Natalie Toledo for Trent Rhorer, Executive Director, Human Services Agency

COIT Staff

Danny Thomas Vang  
Julia Chrusciel  
Damon Daniels

**3. General Public Comment**

Chris Ward Clein recommended departments look into the security of extended wireless contracts.

**4. Approval of the Meeting Minutes from April 18, 2024 (Action Item)**

There was no public comment.

Kate Howard initiated a motion to approve the minutes, Natalie Toledo seconded.  
The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Mike Makstman, Nathan Sinclair, Tiffany Young, Edward De Asis, ChiaYu Ma, Kate Howard, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Maureen Singleton, and Natalie Toledo.

**5. Update on the Digital Accessibility and Inclusion Standard (Informational Item)**

Danny Thomas Vang, Cyd Harrell, Debby Kaplan, and Hellena Ruiz presented on the status of digital accessibility implementation and compliance across the city.

Committee members asked the following questions:

- For departments not moving to SF.gov, has the team looked into reasons behind the hesitation?
- For departments who have not shown progress in auditing and remediation, what are the challenges and barriers they face?
- Are there plans for a central database for ADA complaints across the city?
- What are realistic non-compliance outcomes for departments who do not meet the Department of Justice's timeline?
- Where are other cities in implementation, and how do we compare?

Committee members made the following suggestions:

- Designate an official DAIS Coordinator for each department
- Develop different communication strategies for small versus large departments surrounding avenues for compliance

There was no public comment.

**6. Surveillance Technology Policy – Police Department – Location Management Technology – Electronic Location Tracking Devices (Action Item)**

Asja Steeves and Chris Del Gandio presented their Electronic Location Tracking Devices Surveillance Technology Policy and Surveillance Impact Report for review.

Committee members asked the following questions:

- Was there a union agreement for instances in which an employee misuses the info, and the sequential consequences?

There was no public comment.

Ray Ricardo initiated a motion to move the policy forward, Tiffany Young seconded. The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Mike Makstman, Nathan Sinclair, Tiffany Young, Edward De Asis, ChiaYu Ma, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Maureen Singleton, Ray Ricardo, and Natalie Toledo.

**7. Surveillance Technology Policy - Airport – Automated License Plate Reader – Ground Transportation Management System and Park Assist – Parking Guidance System (Action Item)**

Guy Clarke and Eugene Chang presented their Automated License Plate Readers – Ground Transportation Management System and Park Assist – Parking Guidance System Surveillance Technology Policy Amendments for review.

There was no public comment.

Mike Makstman initiated a motion to move the policy forward, Nathan Sinclair seconded. The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Mike Makstman, Nathan Sinclair, Tiffany Young, Edward De Asis, ChiaYu Ma, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Maureen Singleton, Ray Ricardo, and Natalie Toledo.

**8. Surveillance Technology Policy – Fine Arts Museum - Social Media Monitoring Technology – Social Media Monitoring Software Amendments (Action Item)**

Paul Peterson presented their multidepartmental Surveillance Technology Policy Amendments for review.

There was no public comment.

Maureen Singleton initiated a motion to move the policy forward, Mike Makstman seconded. The motion was approved by Katie Petrucione, Mike Makstman, Nathan Sinclair, Tiffany Young, Edward De Asis, ChiaYu Ma, Eric Raffin, Ramsey Williams, Maureen Singleton, Ray Ricardo, and Natalie Toledo.

**9. Chair Update**

Katie Petrucione let committee members know that the COIT Director search is ongoing, and that the quarterly updates on the AI Working Group will resume moving forward.

There was no public comment.

## **10. CIO Update**

Mike Makstman provided an update on the AI Working Group, including the San Francisco Generative AI guidelines video, the results of the use case survey, and ChatGPT Enterprise.

Committee members asked the following questions:

- What is the difference between the public version of ChatGPT, and the enterprise version?
- How much is an enterprise license after the three-month trial?
- Is the city able to view what ChatGPT Enterprise is being used for?

There was no public comment.

## **11. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 12:00 PM.