PSAB Member Policy Evaluation Rubric

Category	Fulfills	Minimally Fulfills	Partially Fulfills	Does Not Fulfill	
Approved Use Cases – Needs to clearly define each use case and address all questions about each use case.	Each use case is clearly defined. The reason for each use case is well-articulated. No use cases are left out.	Each use case is defined. The reason for each use case is articulated. No use cases are left out.	Some use cases are defined, but others are left out. Some use cases do not have clear or complete reasons/ not all are included or some are incomplete.	Not all use cases are included. The reasons for use cases are poorly defined or undefined.	
Financial Costs – All financial costs and funding sources should be clearly addressed and explained.	All financial costs and funding sources are clearly listed. All funding sources are made explicit.	All financial costs and funding sources are listed. All funding sources are listed.	Some financial costs and funding sources are missing. Some funding sources are listed.	Few or no financial costs and funding sources are disclosed. Funding sources are not listed or listed incorrectly.	
Data Life Cycle – includes Data Governance, Data Collection, Data Processing & Use, Data Sharing, Data Retention, and Data Disposal. All sections must be through and consistent.	All parts of the data life cycle are addressed clearly and completely. The answers in all sections of the data life cycle complement each other, with no contradictions. Security and data privacy concerns are considered and addressed.	All parts of the data life cycle are addressed. The answers in all sections of the data life cycle do not contradict each other. Cybersecurity and data privacy concerns are considered.	Some parts of the data life cycle are addressed. Some of the answers in the data life cycle section contradict each other. Cybersecurity and data privacy concerns are partially considered and addressed.	Few or no parts of the data life cycle are addressed. Few or none of the answers in the data life cycle section complement each other. Cybersecurity and data privacy concerns are not sufficiently considered and addressed.	
Civil Liberties Impacts – Potential civil liberties are addressed in detail. Administrative, technical, and/or physical safeguards are considered, described and applied.	All potential risks are well addressed and considered, even if unlikely. All administrative, technical, and physical safeguards are fully considered, described and applied, where applicable.	All potential risks are addressed and considered, even if unlikely. All administrative, technical, and physical safeguards are considered, described and applied, where applicable.	Some potential risks are addressed and considered. Some administrative, technical, and physical safeguards are considered, described and applied, where applicable.	Few or no potential risks are addressed and considered. Few or no administrative, technical, and physical safeguards are considered, described and applied, where applicable.	
General – The policy documents can be read and understood by a layperson or subject matter expert. Materials are complete, thorough & consistent.	The document is free of industry jargon & language is clear to a layperson. Formatting is consistent. The document is complete, thorough, & consistent.	The document includes little to no industry jargon & language is clear to a layperson. Formatting is mostly consistent. The document is complete & consistent.	The document includes industry jargon & language is not clear to a layperson. Formatting is inconsistent. The document is not complete & consistent.	The document includes industry jargon & language is not clear to a layperson or subject matter expert. Formatting is very inconsistent. The document is incomplete & inconsistent.	

PSAB Member Policy Evaluation Rubric

	Do the STP/SIR documents fulfill the basic requirements of 19B?			
Category	Does Not Fulfill	Partially Fulfills	Fulfills	Comments
Approved Use Cases – Needs to clearly define each use case and address all questions about each use case.				
Financial Costs – All financial costs and funding sources should be clearly addressed and explained.				
Data Life Cycle - Data Governance, Dara Collection, Data Processing & Use, Data Sharing, Data Retention, and Data Disposal. All sections must be through and consistent.				
Civil Liberties Impacts – Potential civil liberties are addressed in detail. Administrative, technical, and/or physical safeguards are considered, described and applied.				