

# Memorandum

**Date:** November 5, 2024

**To:** Laurie Green, President, San Francisco Health Commission and Members of the Health Commission

**Through:** Naveena Bobba, Deputy Director of Health  
Sneha Patil, Director, Office of Policy and Planning

**From:** Claire Altman, Senior Health Program Planner, Office of Policy and Planning  
Max Gara, Senior Health Program Planner, Office of Policy and Planning

**Re:** Prop Q – Follow-up from CPMC Hearing on October 15, 2024

---

On October 15, 2024, the Health Commission held one of two planned Proposition Q hearings regarding the permanent closure of labor and delivery services at California Pacific Medical Center's (CPMC) Mission Bernal Campus (MBC). During the October 15 hearing, the Health Commission requested additional information from CPMC and the Department of Public Health (DPH) about the services provided at the CPMC Van Ness Campus (VNC) labor and delivery unit, transportation options for patients, and birth rate data. Specifically, the Health Commission requested information pertaining to the following items:

- I. Data and information regarding quality of care and patient safety at VNC
- II. Patient satisfaction data and the assessment questionnaire used by CPMC
- III. Patient transportation information and data on utilization of transportation services by patients
- IV. Information regarding translation or interpreter services
- V. Birth rate data – zip code births by hospital (rate/100 zip code births)
- VI. Data regarding labor and delivery hospital choice for families who have had multiple births in San Francisco (this data is not available)

The following sections address the follow-up items with information collected by the Department of Public Health. Additionally, CPMC has submitted slides in response to the follow-up items and these slides will be shared at the Health Commission Meeting on November 5, 2024.

## **I. Services Provided & Quality of Care at CPMC Van Ness Campus**

### About Van Ness Campus (VNC) Neonatal Intensive Care Unit

According to CPMC, VNC is approved by California Children's Services (CCS) as a Regional (Level III) NICU, meaning it has the highest level of equipment and professionals on staff. The Neonatology Team at VNC diagnoses and treats the entire spectrum of neonatal conditions, including surgical problems. Services at VNC include:

- Perinatal team that provides pre-birth consultations and maternal care for high-risk mothers
- Attendance at high-risk births occurring at VNC
- Transport to VNC for high-risk infants in the first four weeks of life
- NICU care of critically ill pre-term and full-term infants
- Neonatal surgery

### Van Ness Campus Maternity Care Awards and Recognitions

According to CPMC, VNC has received the following maternity care awards and recognitions:

- Maternity Care Honor Roll for the past 4 consecutive years (2020, 2021, 2022, 2023). This honor roll recognizes hospitals that have met or exceeded a statewide target aimed at reducing C-sections in first-time mothers with low-risk pregnancies. The 2024 honor roll has not yet been published.
- A Quality & Sustainability award from the California Maternal Quality Care Collaborative for the past 3 consecutive years (2022, 2023, 2024). This award recognizes that CPMC Van Ness helped avoid unnecessary C-sections for first-time mothers with low-risk pregnancies.
- Named one of Newsweek’s “America’s Best Maternity Hospitals” for the past 2 consecutive years (2023, 2024). Only 64 hospitals in California made this list in 2024.
- Earned Silver in the best Birth Center category, Bronze in the best Hospital or Medical Center category and Bronze in the best Doctor or Pediatrics Group category – for the San Francisco Region – in the Bay Area Parent readers’ choice contest.

### Quality of Care Data Post Mission Bernal Campus (MBC) Labor & Delivery Closure

The Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ) Quality Indicators are standardized, evidence-based measures that provide a perspective on the quality of care provided in hospitals. It is important to recognize that each hospital serves distinct populations which may impact quality of care data results. According to AHRQ, observed rates for quality indicators are usually not appropriate for direct comparison across hospitals because patient case mixes can vary. Additionally, hospital characteristics (e.g., being a referral center where other hospitals send complex cases) may explain why rates differ from other facilities. For example, CPMC explained that MBC primarily served patients with low-risk pregnancies and lower risk of birth complications. Patients with high-risk pregnancies or risk for birth complications have been served at CPMC VNC since its opening, and formerly at California campus.

The following section provides the cesarean delivery rate, the primary cesarean delivery rate, and the vaginal birth after cesarean delivery rate for each hospital in San Francisco compared to the state of California average. Data is provided for 2019 (before the closure of MBC’s labor and delivery) and 2022 (after the closure of MBC’s labor and delivery). This section also provides hospital breastfeeding initiation data for each hospital in SF compared the state of California before the closure and since the closure. The data indicates that VNC quality metrics are comparable to other SF hospitals and the cesarean delivery rate, vaginal birth after cesarean delivery rate, and hospital initiation of breastfeeding indicators often outperform the state average.

**A. Cesarean Delivery Rate, Uncomplicated:** Number of Cesarean Section Deliveries per 100 deliveries. Cesarean delivery may be overused in some facilities, so lower rates may represent better care.

<b>Cesarean Delivery Rate, Uncomplicated</b> <i>(rate per 100 deliveries)</i>		
	<b>2019</b>	<b>2022</b>
CPMC MBC	19.6	Closed
CPMC VNC	23.3	24.1
Kaiser SF	21	24.3
UCSF	23	24.4
ZSFG	16.3	19.8
<b>Statewide Average (comparison)</b>	<b>26.1</b>	<b>26.4</b>

Source: California Department of Health Care Access and Information (HCAI).  
Utilization Rates for Selected Medical Procedures in California Hospitals.  
Notes: source does not report margin of error; excludes deliveries with complications (abnormal presentation, preterm delivery, fetal death, multiple gestation diagnoses, and breech procedure).

**Primary Cesarean Delivery Rate, Uncomplicated:** First-time Cesarean Deliveries per 100 deliveries. Cesarean delivery may be overused in some facilities, so lower rates may represent better care.

<b>Primary Cesarean Delivery Rate, Uncomplicated</b> <i>(rate per 100 deliveries)</i>		
	<b>2019</b>	<b>2022</b>
CPMC St. Luke’s/MBC	12.9	Closed
CPMC VNC	15.2	15.5
Kaiser SF	13.9	18.3
UCSF	16.6	16.8
ZSFG	10.3	13.5
<b>Statewide Average (comparison)</b>	<b>13.9</b>	<b>15.1</b>

Source: California Department of Health Care Access and Information (HCAI).  
Utilization Rates for Selected Medical Procedures in California Hospitals.  
Notes: source does not report margin of error; excludes deliveries with complications (abnormal presentation, preterm delivery, fetal death, multiple gestation diagnoses, and breech procedure)

**Vaginal Birth After Cesarean (VBAC) Delivery Rate, Uncomplicated:** Number of vaginal births per 100 women with previous Cesarean deliveries. VBAC may be underused in some facilities, so higher rates may represent better care.

<b>Vaginal Birth After Cesarean (VBAC) Delivery Rate, Uncomplicated</b> <i>(rate per 100 deliveries)</i>		
	<b>2019</b>	<b>2022</b>
CPMC St. Luke’s/MBC	35.7	Closed
CPMC VNC	16.4	17.2
Kaiser SF	26.3	27.5
UCSF	25.1	25.6
ZSFG	38.9	39.4
<b>Statewide Average (comparison)</b>	<b>15.4</b>	<b>16.4</b>

Source: California Department of Health Care Access and Information (HCAI).  
Utilization Rates for Selected Medical Procedures in California Hospitals.

Notes: source does not report margin of error; excludes deliveries with complications (abnormal presentation, preterm delivery, fetal death, multiple gestation diagnoses, and breech procedure)

**Hospital Initiation of Breastfeeding:** California in-hospital infant feeding practices are monitored using data collected by the Newborn Screening (NBS) Program. In addition to tracking genetic diseases and metabolic disorders, the NBS program gathers data on all infant feedings from birth to time of specimen collection, usually 24 to 48 hours since birth.

<b>Hospital Initiation of Breastfeeding</b> <i>Percent of Births, % (margin of error)</i>		
<b>Any Breastfeeding</b> <i>(formula + human milk)</i>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2022</b>
CPMC St. Luke’s/MBC	97.6% (96.2 – 98.5)	Closed
CPMC VNC	96.8% (96.1 – 97.3)	96.3% (95.6 – 96.9)
Kaiser SF	97.7% (97.1 – 98.2)	97.2% (96.4 – 97.8)
UCSF	98.4% (97.8 – 98.8)	97.1% (96.2 – 97.8)
ZSFG	96.0% (94.4 – 97.2)	97.0% (95.7 – 98.0)
<b>California (comparison)</b>	<b>93.7%</b>	<b>93.9%</b>
<b>Exclusive Breastfeeding</b> <i>(human milk only)</i>	<b>2019</b>	<b>2022</b>
CPMC St. Luke’s/MBC	83.0% (80.1 – 85.6)	Closed
CPMC VNC	71.5% (69.9 – 73.1)	76.3% (74.8 – 77.7)
Kaiser SF	84.3% (82.8 – 85.6)	79.5% (77.8 – 81.1)
UCSF	93.3% (92.2 – 94.2)	87.7% (86.1 – 89.1)
ZSFG	88.6% (86.2 – 90.6)	89.1% (86.9 – 90.9)
<b>California (comparison)</b>	<b>70.0%</b>	<b>68.8%</b>

Source: California Department of Public Health, Center for Family Health, Genetic Disease Screening Program, Newborn Screening Data, 2019 and 2022

## II. Patient Satisfaction

CPMC explained that they don't specifically have patient satisfaction surveys for Mission Bernal Campus patients who have received care at Van Ness Campus since the closure of labor and delivery. CPMC did provide Van Ness Campus 2023 (rolling average) Consumer Assessment of Healthcare Providers and Systems (CAHPS) scores for Mom/Baby, which are as follows:

- "Overall rating of hospital" score - 73.1%
- "Would recommend hospital" score - 84.0%
- "Communications with doctors" score - 85.5%

CPMC provided patient satisfaction data by zip code for 2023 and 2024 in its submitted slides in response to the follow-up items, which will be shared at the Health Commission Meeting on November 5, 2024.

## III. Patient Transportation Provided by CPMC

Patient transportation information was provided by CPMC and is addressed in the attached slides which will be shared at the Health Commission Meeting on November 5, 2024.

#### **IV. CPMC Translation Services**

Patient translation services information and data was provided by CPMC and is addressed in the attached slides, which will be shared at the Health Commission Meeting on November 5, 2024.

## V. Zip code births shown by hospital (Total # | Rate/100 Zip Code Births)

Zip codes 94110, 94112, 94124, 94131, and 94134 are highlighted below. These zip codes represented the greatest proportion of labor and delivery patients at Mission Bernal Campus prior to closing.

2017-19												
Zip Code	CPMC Cal/VNC		St. Luke's/MBC		Kaiser		UCSF		ZSFG		SF Total	
	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 SF births
94102	167	24.31	46	6.70	143	20.82	155	22.56	176	25.62	687	2.87
94103	137	20.95	40	6.12	144	22.02	181	27.68	152	23.24	654	2.73
94105	195	43.82		0.00	72	16.18	178	40.00		0.00	445	1.86
94107	256	24.17	42	3.97	193	18.22	502	47.40	66	6.23	1,059	4.42
94108	116	63.74		0.00	37	20.33	29	15.93		0.00	182	0.76
94109	745	51.63	37	2.56	279	19.33	243	16.84	139	9.63	1,443	6.02
94110	399	18.18	290	13.21	455	20.73	580	26.42	471	21.46	2,195	9.16
94111	62	100.00		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00	62	0.26
94112	642	28.15	228	10.00	552	24.20	328	14.38	531	23.28	2,281	9.52
94114	347	35.12	74	7.49	217	21.96	350	35.43		0.00	988	4.12
94115	516	46.03	35	3.12	247	22.03	262	23.37	61	5.44	1,121	4.68
94116	432	42.23	29	2.83	298	29.13	232	22.68	32	3.13	1,023	4.27
94117	413	36.39	42	3.70	281	24.76	364	32.07	35	3.08	1,135	4.74
94118	636	55.21	22	1.91	253	21.96	199	17.27	42	3.65	1,152	4.81
94121	462	44.42	27	2.60	307	29.52	188	18.08	56	5.38	1,040	4.34
94122	590	38.74	40	2.63	454	29.81	388	25.48	51	3.35	1,523	6.35
94123	700	68.63		0.00	127	12.45	193	18.92		0.00	1,020	4.26
94124	239	14.97	146	9.14	313	19.60	296	18.53	603	37.76	1,597	6.66
94127	180	40.54		0.00	117	26.35	147	33.11		0.00	444	1.85
94129	42	48.84		0.00	23	26.74	21	24.42		0.00	86	0.36
94130		0.00		0.00		0.00	23	100.00		0.00	23	0.10
94131	288	30.13	77	8.05	213	22.28	350	36.61	28	2.93	956	3.99
94132	184	35.32	26	4.99	146	28.02	116	22.26	49	9.40	521	2.17
94133	329	60.15		0.00	97	17.73	93	17.00	28	5.12	547	2.28
94134	392	29.63	107	8.09	320	24.19	169	12.77	335	25.32	1,323	5.52
94158	87	18.95		0.00	75	16.34	297	64.71		0.00	459	1.92

Proposition Q – CPMC Closure of Labor and Delivery at Mission Bernal Campus – Follow-up

2020-22												
Zip Code	CPMC VNC		MBC		Kaiser		UCSF		ZSFG		SF Total	
	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 births	#	Rate/100 SF births
94102	145	25.31		0.00	131	22.86	98	17.10	199	34.73	573	2.87
94103	146	26.40		0.00	120	21.70	124	22.42	163	29.48	553	2.73
94105	176	44.78		0.00	67	17.05	127	32.32	23	5.85	393	1.86
94107	275	27.17		0.00	213	21.05	453	44.76	71	7.02	1,012	4.42
94108	91	81.25		0.00		0.00	21	18.75		0.00	112	0.76
94109	583	51.87		0.00	218	19.40	157	13.97	166	14.77	1,124	6.02
94110	595	30.56	22	1.13	390	20.03	499	25.63	441	22.65	1,947	9.16
94111	42	59.15		0.00	29	40.85		0.00		0.00	71	0.26
94112	624	32.45		0.00	511	26.57	262	13.62	526	27.35	1,923	9.52
94114	411	47.68		0.00	147	17.05	279	32.37	25	2.90	862	4.12
94115	442	49.00		0.00	183	20.29	211	23.39	66	7.32	902	4.68
94116	389	44.05		0.00	258	29.22	198	22.42	38	4.30	883	4.27
94117	361	41.73		0.00	201	23.24	262	30.29	41	4.74	865	4.74
94118	572	54.12		0.00	255	24.12	200	18.92	30	2.84	1,057	4.81
94121	372	40.66		0.00	316	34.54	190	20.77	37	4.04	915	4.34
94122	483	36.70		0.00	409	31.08	377	28.65	47	3.57	1,316	6.35
94123	544	70.65		0.00	92	11.95	134	17.40		0.00	770	4.26
94124	267	19.57		0.00	269	19.72	263	19.28	565	41.42	1,364	6.66
94127	189	43.85		0.00	95	22.04	147	34.11		0.00	431	1.85
94129	73	57.94		0.00	29	23.02	24	19.05		0.00	126	0.36
94130		0.00		0.00		0.00		0.00	22	100.00	22	0.10
94131	354	42.81		0.00	171	20.68	276	33.37	26	3.14	827	3.99
94132	156	34.67		0.00	127	28.22	89	19.78	78	17.33	450	2.17
94133	223	52.84		0.00	88	20.85	77	18.25	34	8.06	422	2.28
94134	312	31.87		0.00	254	25.94	147	15.02	266	27.17	979	5.52
94158	112	22.86		0.00	91	18.57	256	52.24	31	6.33	490	1.92