

COMMITTEE ON CITY WORKFORCE ALIGNMENT

Draft Minutes of The
July 31, 2024
War Memorial Veterans Building, Green Room, 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

**CCWA
Voting Members
Present**

Ren Floyd-Rodriguez, OEWD
Tony Lugo, HSA
Ben Poole, PUC
Kate Howard, DHR
Richa Dhanju, DPH
Anthony Bush, DSHS

Dion-Jay Brooker, Young Community
Developers
Tiffany Jackson, Hospitality House
Bart Pantoja, San Francisco Building and
Construction Trades Council

**CCWA
Additional Members
Present**

Ruth Barajas, Bay Area Community
Resources (*remote*)
Anna Pineda, HSA

Warren Hill, Public Works (*remote*)

CCWA Staff Present

Chad Houston, Chair
Tai Seals-Jackson, Secretary
Jen Hand, OEWD
Miriam Palma-Trujillo, OEWD

**CCWA
Members Absent**

Shamann Walton, BOS
Anni Chung, Self-Help for the Elderly
Vince Courtney Jr., Northern California
District Council of Laborers

Taras Madison, APD
Maria Su, DCYF
Sheryl Davis, HRC

**Ohlone Land
Acknowledgement, Announcements &
Housekeeping
(Discussion Item)**

Chair Houston called the meeting to order at 9:14 a.m. Secretary Tai Seals-Jackson (OEWD) opened the meeting by reciting the Ohlone Land Acknowledgement and reviewing housekeeping rules.

**Roll Call
(Discussion Item)**

Chair Houston requested that Secretary Seals-Jackson conduct roll call. Secretary Seals-Jackson conducted roll call and announced that a quorum was present.

Chair Houston expressed gratitude to members joining online, noting that while they cannot vote, their participation is valuable, especially as many have been actively involved in the working groups over the past months.

**Chair's Welcome
(Discussion Item)**

Chair Houston welcomed Committee Members and introduced himself as the Director of Workforce Strategy of OEWD's Workforce Division.

Chair Houston emphasized that the main priority of this meeting was to ensure that our efforts reflect collective insights and priorities, fostering collaboration and advancing Citywide workforce development following the adoption of the Five-Year Plan. Over the past six weeks, working groups have been diligently refining and prioritizing actions to align with strategic goals. Group leaders were scheduled to present their progress during the meeting. Additionally, the meeting agenda included a review of the FY 22-23 Citywide Workforce Services Inventory Preliminary Results.

Adoption of the Agenda
(Action Item)

Chair Houston solicited comments on the agenda from CCWA members. Seeing none, Chair Houston requested a motion to adopt the meeting agenda. Member Brookter made the motion, which was seconded by Member Lugo and passed unanimously.

Approval of the Minutes from April 24, 2024
(Action Item)

Chair Houston directed CCWA members to review the minutes from April 24, 2024. Next, Chair Houston solicited comments from CCWA Members. Seeing none, Chair Houston requested a motion to approve the minutes. Member Lugo made the motion which was seconded by Member Pantoja. The motion passed unanimously.

Citywide Workforce Development Plan Submission
(Discussion Item)

Chair Houston introduced Workforce Impact Manager, Jen Hand, to present the update on the on the FY 2024-2029 Citywide Workforce Development Plan ("FY 24-29 Plan"). Chair Houston acknowledged the significant work and coordination involved in developing the FY 24-29 Plan, thanking Benson Tran, Workforce Communications and Community Engagement Manager, for his efforts in enhancing its presentation.

Ms. Hand outlined the progress made, including the completion of the public body's formation, the uniform adoption of a workforce development definition, and the development of the FY 24-29 Plan. This Plan, to be updated annually to the Board of Supervisors, aims to integrate the City's racial equity policy goals and set benchmarking objectives. It emphasizes aligning resources with sector strategy best practices and achieving client deduplication.

All CCWA members contributed to the Plan's development, which involved six public meetings, including two community-focused sessions, with 30 to 55 attendees from community-based organizations, job seekers, and employers. The Plan was submitted to the Board of Supervisors by the June 30th deadline, without feedback, and is now publicly available online.

The Citywide Workforce Development Plan can be accessed here:
<https://www.sf.gov/sites/default/files/2024-06/CWDP%202024-29%20-%20Citywide%20Workforce%20Development%20Plan.pdf>

Ms. Hand highlighted the efforts to make the plan visually appealing and engaging, noting the use of data storytelling to communicate labor market data and highlight San Francisco's inequities.

With no questions from the members, Chair Houston moved to the next agenda item.

Committee on City Workforce Alignment Meeting Working Groups Updates
(Discussion Item)

Chair Houston introduced agenda item #7, which covered updates from the Committee on City Workforce Alignment Meeting Working Groups. Over the past month, the five ad-hoc committees held their inaugural meetings, operating within the framework provided by the bylaws. These meetings focused on reviewing Goals 1-5 of the Five-Year Plan, narrowing the scope to high-priority actions, discussing logistics and structure for future meetings, and nominating co-chairs to lead efforts and ensure collaboration. Updates from working group members and co-chairs on their discussions were then presented.

Working Group #1: Coordination of Partners' Plans and Priorities

- Presenter: *Tiffany Jackson, Hospitality House*

The first meeting of CCWA Working Group #1 was held on Friday, June 28, followed by a second meeting on Friday, July 26. The purpose of this working group is to foster a cohesive workforce development system in San Francisco by strategically coordinating partners' plans and priorities to support economically vulnerable populations.

- Co-Chairs: Nominations will be made once all members are present.
- Members: Include the Human Services Agency, Department of Human Resources, Office of Economic & Workforce Development, Hospitality House, and the Northern California District Council of Laborers.
- Meeting Schedule: Monthly meetings have been scheduled initially, with reassessment planned quarterly.

- **Completion Date:** The timeline was extended to July 2029 to ensure alignment and coordination.

ACTIONS:

- **Outcome 1.1:** Prioritize partnerships with CBOs, labor organizations, and educational institutions to develop career pipeline programs. Feedback emphasized including local employers and integrating essential services like housing and healthcare.
 - **Updated Action:** Expanded partnerships to include employers.
- **Outcome 1.2:** Enhance the workforce inventory to better disseminate service delivery information. Feedback called for a unified strategy for best practices.
 - **Updated Action:** Suggest enhancements to the inventory for cross-departmental learning.
- **Outcome 1.3:** Address the specific needs of economically vulnerable populations, with a focus on adaptable services.
- **Outcome 1.4:** Integrate quarterly consortiums and resource fairs for collaboration and stakeholder engagement.
 - **Updated Action:** Combine consortiums and resource fairs into single events for better resource utilization.

Member Jackson thanked working group members Chad Houston (OEWD), Julia Ma (DHR), Tiffany Jackson (Hospitality House), Sylvia Tiongson (HSA), and community members. The next meeting is being scheduled to hear from additional members and finalize special projects.

Chair Houston invited questions or discussion from the Committee. Seeing none, Chair Houston thanked Member Jackson and moved to the next working group.

Working Group #2: Equitably Invest in Workforce Programs for our Most Vulnerable

- Presenter: *Tiffany Jackson, Hospitality House*
- Presenter: *Anthony Bush, Homelessness and Supportive Housing*

The first meeting of Working Group #2 was held on Monday, July 22. The purpose of this working group is to create an equitable workforce system that empowers the most vulnerable populations by providing targeted programs and wraparound services that support career success.

- Co-Chairs: Tiffany Jackson (Hospitality House) and Anthony Bush (HSH).
- Members: Include Bay Area Community Resources, Homelessness & Supportive Housing, Adult Probation Department, Hospitality House, and Young Community Developers.
- Meeting Schedule: The next meeting is planned within three months, with quarterly meetings scheduled and flexibility to adjust as needed.
- Completion Date: The timeline is set for July 2027.

ACTIONS:

- **Outcome 2.1:** Prioritize collecting pre/post program data, service monitoring, trauma-informed care models, and flexible delivery. Feedback highlighted the need for robust data collection, trauma-informed care, and non-traditional practices for continued support.
 - **Updated Action:** Consolidating tracking efforts for both individual data and program evaluations, adopting flexible service delivery timelines, and implementing trauma-informed care practices.
- **Outcome 2.2:** Focus on pre-program interventions, partnerships, community-driven outreach, and recruitment during incarceration. Feedback emphasized the role of community organizations in outreach, the importance of pre-program support, and co-locating services with essential supports.
 - **Updated Action:** Expanding partnerships with community organizations, enhancing pre-program interventions, co-locating services with other supports, and implementing recruitment and skill-building initiatives during incarceration.
- **Outcome 2.3:** Develop tailored training and programs for unemployed, underemployed, and historically excluded workers, with special programs for those without right-to-work documentation. Feedback emphasized tailored vocational training and income opportunity programs for migrant

communities.

- **Updated Action:** Developing vocational training, language learning, and educational programs, and creating special programs for income opportunities for migrants, including entrepreneurship and worker co-operatives.

Members Jackson and Bush thanked working group members Ren Floyd-Rodriguez (OEWD), Ruth Barajas (Bay Area Community Resources), Dion-Jay Brookter (Young Community Developers), Roosevelt Pye (Young Community Developers), and Taras Madison (APD), as well as community members. The next meeting is being scheduled to finalize part 2 of the activity.

Chair Houston addressed the Committee, noting that there may be overlap in priorities and outcomes across different goals of the working groups due to the interconnected nature of the workforce development system. Chair Houston emphasized the importance of considering equity in the system, pointing out that different populations require tailored approaches. Member Bush stressed the need for infrastructure and tailored strategies to support migrant workers and other vulnerable populations without forcing them to compete for resources with groups such as BIPOC community members, people with disabilities, and aging individuals.

Member Bush suggested that transparency about resources and leading with a clear equity definition are crucial. Partnering with community-based organizations and providing capacity-building support were highlighted as key strategies for tailoring resources to specific populations.

Member Barajas added that flexibility in timeframes for achieving outcomes is essential, as different groups may face unique barriers. For instance, English language barriers may require more time to meet certain career sector requirements. Member Barajas advocated for a practice that accommodates these differences within the workforce system.

Member Lugo expressed interest in HSA participating in the workings group, sharing that HSA has initiated a self-sufficiency program for undocumented immigrants, which could align with the Committee's strategic plan. Chair Houston welcomed participation from HSA, encouraging the assignment of staff to attend meetings regularly.

With no further questions or comments, Chair Houston moved to the next working group.

Working Group #3: Invest in Workforce Development Across the Life Course

- Presenter: *Dion-Jay Brookter, Young Community Developers*
- Presenter: *Ruth Barajas, Bay Area Community Resources*

The first meeting of Working Group #3 was held on Tuesday, July 2. The purpose of this working group is to design intentional workforce programming and activities that meet jobseekers' needs at various stages of their life course. The group aims to strategically differentiate its focus from other groups while acknowledging overlaps with vulnerable populations.

- Co-Chairs: Ruth Barajas (Bay Area Community Resources) and Dion-Jay Brookter (Young Community Developers).
- Members: Include the Human Rights Commission, Self-Help for the Elderly, Bay Area Community Resources, Young Community Developers, and the Department of Children, Youth, and Their Families.
- Meeting Schedule: The next meeting is planned within three months, with quarterly meetings scheduled.
- Completion Date: The timeline is set for July 2026.

ACTIONS:

- **Outcome 3.1:** Ensure workforce systems meet individuals' needs across their life course, from pre-employment through retirement. Feedback emphasized life stage mapping, flexible and human-centered training programs, and a holistic, adaptable system.
 - **Updated Action:** Actions are being updated to include mapping life course stages and ensuring training and development programs address evolving needs, including retirement

planning and career transitions.

- **Outcome 3.2:** Increase awareness of programs and career options. Feedback highlighted community-based outreach to overcome accessibility challenges and emphasized in-person support and guidance.
 - **Updated Action:** Expanding outreach with multilingual materials, door-to-door campaigns, social media, partnerships with libraries and schools, and participation in community events.
- **Outcome 3.3:** Develop additional workforce programs and services. Feedback stressed the importance of coordination processes and resourcing mechanisms for new programs.
 - **Updated Action:** Focus on developing coordination processes for proposed workforce programs and services as the initial step.
- **Outcome 3.4:** Provide young people with access to work experience and career opportunities. Feedback highlighted the importance of financial empowerment, wealth building, and avoiding duplication with state legislation on financial education.
 - **Updated Action:** Improve coordination among youth workforce programs and incorporate financial literacy education focusing on empowerment, wealth building, and financial justice.
- **Outcome 3.5:** Improve employer engagement in the workforce development system. Discussion on supporting workers without right-to-work documentation and entrepreneurship pathways will continue in the next meeting.

Members Brookter and Barajas thanked working group members Ren Floyd-Rodriguez (OEWB), Brittini Chicuata (HRC), Anni Chung (Self-Help for the Elderly), Aumijo Gomes (DCYF), and Maria Su (DCYF), as well as community members.

Chair Houston invited CCWA members to share how their departments increase awareness of programs and ensure accessibility for community members. Member Bush noted that HSH provides multilingual materials for the top languages spoken in the community and partners with CBOs to enhance language access and service translation.

Member Lugo explained that HSA offers workforce development programs tailored to individuals' readiness for work, with multilingual access available for at least five languages. HSA's tiered program approach meets individuals where they are in their employment journey.

Member Barajas highlighted the importance of deepening outreach strategies beyond language accessibility. Further emphasizing the need for strategies that provide equitable access across the life course, from youth to seniors, and encouraged deeper outreach mechanisms.

Chair Houston provided context for the Committee's focus on life course workforce development, which aims to prevent competition for resources among different age groups. Member Howard shared that DHR recently opened a career center in City Hall, offering career counseling and tailored workshops for job seekers, City employees, and high school students, fostering career growth and development.

Member Dhanju noted that DPH's human resources department focuses on career mobility and aims to maintain a diverse applicant pool. The Behavioral Health Services team offers workforce development opportunities to the community. Member Dhanju expressed a commitment to bringing more information about their outreach efforts to the group.

With no further questions or comments, Chair Houston moved to the next working group.

Working Group #4: Enhance Apprenticeship & Pre-Apprenticeship Programs that Lead to Careers

- **Presenter:** *Bart Pantoja, San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council*

The first meeting of Working Group #4 was held on Monday, July 1. The purpose of this working group is to foster equitable and sustainable career pathways through comprehensive apprenticeship and pre-apprenticeship programs, empowering economically vulnerable populations with the skills, opportunities, and support needed for long-term employment and economic stability.

- Co-Chair: Bart Pantoja (San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council).
- Members: Include the Northern California District Council of Laborers, San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council, Public Utilities Commission, Public Works, Department of Human Resources, and Department of Public Health.
- Meeting Schedule: The next meeting is planned for August, with the frequency and timelines to be revisited based on progress and priorities.
- Completion Date: The timeline is set for July 2025.

ACTIONS:

- **Outcome 4.1:** Achieve long-term jobs, skill development, and livable wages for apprentices. Feedback emphasized aligning apprenticeship programs with labor market trends, developing opportunities in non-traditional sectors, and enhancing employer participation and union representation.
 - **Updated Action:** Align programs with industry demands, secure commitments for job placements and continuing education, and ensure equitable access through multilingual support and technology.
- **Outcome 4.2:** Enhance existing City apprenticeship opportunities. Feedback highlighted prioritizing City-funded apprenticeships for vulnerable populations, centralizing coordination through Apprenticeship SF, and increasing awareness of opportunities.
 - **Updated Action:** Prioritize City-funded apprenticeships for vulnerable populations and promote Apprenticeship SF as the centralized hub for coordination.
- **Outcome 4.3:** Establish clear career pathways, starting with traineeships and fellowships. Feedback stressed the importance of aligning classifications with departmental and industry needs and developing peer-to-peer support networks.
 - **Updated Action:** Refine job classifications, increase visibility of opportunities through a strategic communications plan, and ensure apprenticeships are beneficial for participants and employers.
- **Outcome 4.4:** Increase employer engagement in apprenticeship. This outcome will be discussed further in the next meeting.

Member Pantoja thanked working group members Ken Nim (OEWD), Julia Ma (DHR), Ben Poole (PUC), Richa Dhanju (DPH), Althea O'Brien (Public Works), and Philip Anih (Public Works), as well as community members.

Chair Houston invited CCWA members to share their departments practices for raising awareness of apprenticeships and how they implement these programs. Member Bush highlighted the need for City-sponsored apprenticeships to align with minimum qualifications for City employment, emphasizing the importance of collaborative work across departments, CBOs, and DHR to ensure that apprenticeship experiences serve as valid qualifications for City positions, thus bridging the gap between training and employment.

Member Howard explained that 60 structured apprenticeship programs in the City--such as those for plumbers, gardeners, and automotive mechanics--provide pathways to permanent civil service work. Member Howard mentioned efforts to expand apprenticeships beyond traditional trades and noted changes to minimum qualifications to reduce barriers to entry, aligning job requirements with labor market needs.

Member Dhanju discussed exploring apprenticeships beyond conventional trades and expanding fellowships, internships, and training opportunities to diversify the applicant pool.

Member Poole shared that the PUC's focus is on aligning apprenticeship opportunities with market needs through project labor agreements. The emphasis is on fine-tuning existing craft apprenticeships and focusing on areas with significant project work to make training most effective.

Member Floyd-Rodriguez suggested partnering with DHR to explore potential apprenticeship expansions, leveraging external funding sources to support these initiatives, and using labor market information to inform the development of non-traditional apprenticeships.

With no further questions or comments, Chair Houston moved to the next working group.

Working Group #5: Enable Data-Sharing for Better Coordination Between Workforce & Other Systems

- Presenter: *Jen Hand, OEWD*

The first meeting of Working Group #5 was held on Wednesday, July 24. The purpose of this working group is to enable data-sharing for better coordination between workforce and other systems, aiming to identify and reduce service gaps, increase cross-agency collaboration, and streamline data-informed decision-making to enhance the effectiveness and efficiency of workforce development services.

- **Co-Chairs:** The nomination for the co-chair role was postponed to the next meeting. OEWD staff presented on behalf of the group.
- **Members:** Include the Human Rights Commission, Office of Economic and Workforce Development, Human Services Agency, Department of Children, Youth, and Their Families, and the Department of Human Resources.
 - These departments were selected due to their extensive data systems, covering about 150 providers and over 30,000 employees, making them crucial for coordinating data-sharing efforts.
- **Meeting Schedule:** The next meeting is planned within three months, with quarterly meetings scheduled, allowing for adjustments based on project progress.
- **Completion Date:** The timeline is set for June 2029.

ACTIONS:

- **Outcome 5.1:** Identify and reduce duplication and gaps in services. Feedback emphasized the importance of using comprehensive landscape analysis to assess programs against best practices and understand unmet demands. There was also a focus on addressing underserved communities and incorporating feedback loops.
 - **Updated Action:** Use landscape analysis to identify gaps and assess programs, incorporating best practices and feedback loops to enhance program effectiveness and responsiveness.
- **Outcome 5.2:** Increase collaboration and efficiency across agencies and organizations. Feedback highlighted the need to identify use cases for shared clients and vulnerable populations for targeted interventions, suggesting moving this priority to another goal to avoid redundancy.
 - **Updated Action:** Leverage landscape analysis to develop targeted interventions for shared clients and vulnerable populations, enhancing service delivery.
- **Outcome 5.3:** Streamline data, data-informed decisions, and validation of service models. Feedback emphasized the need for comprehensive metrics and a unified data system integration plan to support consistent program evaluation and decision-making.
 - **Updated Action:** Create a unified data system integration plan and develop comprehensive metrics for better coordination and evaluation of program outcomes across departments.

Ms. Hand thanked working group members Chad Houston (OEWD), Rose Johns (HSA), Heidi Chu (HSA), Aumijo Gomes, and Julia Ma (DHR), as well as community members.

Chair Houston then moved onto the next agenda item.

Access the Meeting Minutes for CCWA Working Groups #1-5:

<https://www.sf.gov/departments/committee-city-workforce-alignment/past-meetings>

FY 22-23 Citywide Workforce Services Inventory Results (Discussion Item)

Chair Houston welcomed back Workforce Impact Manager, Jen Hand, to present on the FY 2022-2023 Citywide Workforce Service Inventory Results.

Ms. Hand explained that the current analysis is preliminary, with a peer review by the City's analyst group scheduled for August.

The Inventory reflects a \$10 million increase in workforce services funding from FY 21-22 to 22-23. This increase is primarily due to additional State and Federal investments.

The preliminary results indicate a \$106 million investment in community services, with the remaining funds allocated to wages and stipends for City staff and workforce participants. Most of the funding comes from City General Funds, totaling \$91 million, with Federal and State funding increasing by \$2 million and \$5 million, respectively.

Ms. Hand reported that over 35,000 unique clients were served by various departments, with 62,000 touchpoints recorded across the system. These touchpoints account for individuals receiving multiple services within a department. The report also highlighted significant increases in training completions and job placements, attributed to job readiness programs and enhanced reporting.

Ms. Hand noted that unsubsidized placements have increased significantly, primarily due to improved reporting across the system and increased placements by OEWD. Additionally, the period saw an increase in subsidized placements, influenced by COVID-19 response programs and Dream Keeper Initiative (DKI) funding.

Ms. Hand concluded the presentation by noting that a more comprehensive update, including demographic breakdowns and detailed outcomes, will be provided at the next meeting. Chair Houston thanked Ms. Hand and moved on to the next agenda item.

**Public Comment on
Non-Agenda Items**
(Discussion Item)

Chair Houston opened the meeting for public comment on any agenda or non-agenda items. Secretary Seals-Jackson provided guidance on the public comment process.

James Mabry, a San Francisco resident and small business owner in Bayview Hunters Point, expressed gratitude for the opportunity to speak. With 14 years of experience and 40 employees, he works with City departments like the PUC and DPW, hiring young people from the community. He noted that five employees have successfully transitioned from prison to full employment with DPW through his workforce development program. James Mabrey recently founded the African American International Sports, Academics, and Arts Program, a nonprofit in Bayview Hunters Point. As a journeyman carpenter, he is passionate about helping lower-income communities and expressed interest in collaborating with Director Houston on workforce development initiatives. He emphasized the importance of community organizations like YCD in their journey and requested support to share ideas and enhance workforce development efforts.

Seeing no additional public comments on Zoom or in person, Chair Houston closed public comment.

Adjournment
(Action Item)

Chair Houston opened the floor to members for any additional remarks. Noting none, Chair Houston mentioned that OEWD will be reaching out regarding upcoming procurement planning.

Chair Houston acknowledged the retirement of HSA's Tony Lugo, expressing gratitude for the years of partnership. Chair Houston highlighted the collaboration during the pandemic, particularly the workforce hotline that assisted over 10,000 individuals with unemployment resources and the COVID-19 Right to Recover program for vulnerable populations. Member Lugo's contributions to workforce development across the City were recognized, and appreciation was expressed for his public service.

Member Lugo thanked the Committee for the opportunity to work together over the past 34 years and introduced Anna Pineda as the Deputy Director of Economic Support and Self-Sufficiency, who will continue representing HSA.

Chair Houston called for a motion to adjourn. Member Lugo offered a motion to adjourn which was seconded by Member Brookter. The vote was unanimous, and the meeting adjourned at 11:06 A.M.