

COMMITTEE ON CITY WORKFORCE ALIGNMENT

Draft Minutes of The

April 24, 2024

War Memorial Veterans Building, Green Room, 2nd Floor
San Francisco, CA 94102

**CCWA
Voting
Members
Present**

Ren Floyd-Rodriguez, OEWD
Tony Lugo, HSA
Maria Su, DCYF
Ben Poole, PUC
Julia Ma, DHR
Richa Dhanju, DPH
Philip Anih, Public Works
Anthony Bush, DSHS
Taras Madison, APD

Anni Chung, Self-Help for the Elderly
Vince Courtney Jr., Northern California
District Council of Laborers
Tiffany Jackson, Hospitality House
Ruth Barajas, Bay Area Community
Resources
Bart Pantoja, San Francisco Building
and Construction Trades Council

**CCWA
Additional
Members
Present**

Brittni Chicuata, HRC

**CCWA Staff
Present**

Ken Nim, Chair
Tai Seals-Jackson, Secretary
Chad Houston, OEWD
Jen Hand, OEWD
Glenn Eagleson, OEWD
Miriam Palma-Trujillo, OEWD

**CCWA
Members
Absent**

Shamann Walton, BOS
Dion-Jay Brookter, Young
Community Developers

**Ohlone Land
Acknowledgement,
Announcements &
Housekeeping
(Discussion
Item)**

Chair Nim called the meeting to order at 9:10 a.m. Secretary Tai Seals-Jackson (OEWD) opened the meeting by reciting the Ohlone Land Acknowledgement and reviewing housekeeping rules.

Roll Call
(Discussion Item)

Chair Nim requested that Secretary Seals-Jackson conduct roll call. Secretary Seals-Jackson conducted roll call and announced that a quorum was present.

Chair's Welcome
(Discussion Item)

Chair Nim welcomed Committee Members and introduced himself as the Interim Director of OEWD's Workforce Division.

Chair Nim stated that the priority for this meeting was to review the Citywide Workforce Development Plan's structure and framework, seek feedback, and determine the approval process. The discussion would focus on aligning the plan with strategic priorities and outcomes from previous meetings. The Chair emphasized the importance of accurately reflecting collective insights and thanked all members for their contributions.

Adoption of the Agenda
(Action Item)

Chair Nim requested CCWA members to review the agenda. Next, Chair Nim solicited comments from CCWA members. Seeing none, Chair Nim requested a motion to adopt the meeting agenda. Member Courtney made the motion, which was seconded by Member Poole and passed unanimously.

Approval of the Minutes from January 31, 2024
(Action Item)

Chair Nim directed CCWA members to review the minutes from January 31, 2024. Next, Chair Nim solicited comments from CCWA Members. Seeing none, Chair Nim requested a motion to approve the minutes. Member Poole made the motion which was seconded by Member Courtney. The motion passed unanimously.

Citywide Workforce Development Plan Review and Approval Process
(Action Item)

Director Chad Houston introduced Jen Hand, Workforce Impact Manager, to present on the FY 2024-2029 Citywide Workforce Development Plan ("FY 24-29 Plan").

Ms. Hand outlined the next steps:

- Adopt the FY 24-29 Plan Content.
- Enhance content through graphic design for attractiveness.
- Submit the final version to the Board of Supervisors by 6/30 as per legislative mandate.
- Launch working groups in June/July to drive implementation.
- Present initial project management plans and priorities at the July meeting.

Ms. Hand provided an overview of the stakeholders involved in shaping the FY 24-29 Plan, which included the 17 members representing City departments, community-based workforce organizations, and labor organizations. Over the past year, substantial stakeholder engagement had occurred through quarterly meetings, community gatherings, and ongoing research by the committee staff.

The FY 24-29 Plan covers various components, such as the history of the Alignment work, labor market data, existing workforce development systems, partnerships, funding, and strategic goals. Critical themes raised by members include family-sustaining wages, intentional strategies, equity and inclusion, future of work, skill development, and inclusivity.

Feedback from community meetings emphasizes the importance of incorporating lived experience, accessibility, social rehabilitation, and employer services in the workforce pathway. The definition created by the team and community members focuses on providing workforce navigation, employment, training, and supportive services to achieve family-sustaining wages and career pathways, prioritizing economically vulnerable participants.

Ms. Hand outlined five key goals of the workforce development plan and provided details on

each goal's objectives, outcomes, example actions, and lead agencies. The goals include:

1. Coordination of partners' plans and priorities
2. Equitably invest in workforce programs for our most vulnerable
3. Invest in workforce development across the life course
4. Enhance apprenticeship and pre-apprenticeship programs that lead to careers
5. Enable data-sharing for better coordination between workforce and other systems

Member Ma proposed a modification to the first bullet point under Goal 2 section "What Does Success Look Like?" currently stated as: "Clients are placed into employment after completion of services." Member Ma suggested revising the language to reflect the City's employment framework and civil service rules for hiring.

The proposed change is to state that "clients are able to attain employment after completion of services" or "clients are able to successfully compete for positions or employment after completion of services." This suggestion arises from the concern that City programs cannot place participants directly into permanent positions.

Member Courtney agreed, highlighting that individuals are initially ineligible upon entering the program but become eligible upon completion.

Director Houston proposed the revision: "Clients are eligible for employment after completion of services."

Member Ma emphasized that participation in a program should not imply guaranteed employment. Eligibility should be based on meeting minimum qualifications for effective job competition.

Ms. Hand inquired if Member Ma's suggestion applied solely to City and County of San Francisco ("City") apprenticeships or included all workforce programs for vulnerable populations.

Member Ma clarified that for any job in the City, individuals will need to meet qualifications and compete for the job opportunity.

Member Courtney noted that participants in the ApprenticeshipSF program typically attain state certification and secure journey-level employment with the City. However, this outcome hinges on meeting minimum qualifications and undergoing a competitive process. Member Courtney highlighted the difference between public and private sectors: while completing the program may lead to automatic eligibility in the public sector, it doesn't guarantee the same in the private sector.

Member Lugo recognized the City agency's viewpoint and suggested a broader perspective, acknowledging that the City is not the only job option for agency-trained clients. Member Lugo suggested focusing on the broader goal of facilitating employment rather than solely enabling clients to become eligible to compete.

Member Jackson voiced concern about the definition of "vulnerable populations" potentially creating exclusionary categories and posed the question of whether the adopted definition might exclude certain individuals and sought clarity on the term "vulnerable population."

Ms. Hand clarified that the vulnerable populations definition approved in October ("unemployed, underemployed, and historically excluded from the workforce") aimed for inclusivity though set parameters for workforce-specific, economically vulnerable populations. Ms. Hand listed various vulnerable groups, emphasizing the broad intention of the list to

encompass ongoing work while prioritizing economic vulnerability. Ms. Hand welcomed feedback from partners like Hospitality House to ensure the plan meets its objectives.

Member Pantoja questioned whether the Alignment Committee would continue to meet after approving the Citywide Workforce Development Plan.

Ms. Hand confirmed that there is no specified end date for the Committee's meetings, as there is no sunset date in the legislation.

Member Pantoja likened workforce development to cultivating a field, emphasizing the need for continuous effort rather than immediate results. Member Pantoja suggested approaching the plan as a living document, allowing for adjustments over time to ensure effectiveness. Member Pantoja inquired about the possibility of refining the guidance during subsequent meetings to best meet the Committee's objectives.

Ms. Hand highlighted the legislative requirement for the Committee to submit annual updates, starting the following March, and every two years thereafter. Ms. Hand emphasized the plan for working groups to further refine the content, contingent upon plan approval.

Member Pantoja emphasized that despite some uncertainties, the Committee should move forward; he proposed approving the plan, with the understanding that ongoing adjustments would be made.

Member Barajas sought clarity on the Committee's responsibility to be accountable to the people, including through identifying measures and benchmarks to track progress. Member Barajas requested information on how this work would occur within the work groups and how progress would be communicated to the Committee and other stakeholders.

Director Houston emphasized viewing the plan as a framework and stressed the importance of the working groups refining definitions, fine-tuning objectives, and developing action plans. Progress within the working groups would then be shared with the full Committee.

Member Barajas raised a question regarding the process for joining work groups in the future and emphasized the Committee's accountability to the community. Member Barajas inquired about involving stakeholders not on the committee in the work groups and how the Committee plans to report back to the community.

Director Houston outlined a process similar to community engagement efforts in developing the definition. OEWD would present work to the community, gather feedback through meetings, and then bring that feedback to the full Committee.

Chair Nim opened the agenda item for public comment.

Classic Cauley inquired how individuals would be able to join work groups in the coming months.

Director Houston clarified that the working groups are designated for Committee members to further engage with the work. Specific breakout groups would focus on particular action items and community meetings would also be held to gather input on specific actions.

Chair Nim called for a motion to approve the Citywide Workforce Development Plan.

Director Houston proposed revisiting the discussion under Goal 2, regarding clients successfully attaining employment upon program completion.

Member Lugo suggested adding "competitive" to recognize a wider range of job opportunities beyond City employment.

Director Houston proposed adding suggestions and making the amendment based on the language agreed upon by the Northern CA District Council of Laborers, DHR, and HSA. Ms. Hand then stated the amended statement: "Clients are placed into competitive employment after completion of services."

Member Ma suggested rephrasing to "clients will be able to compete effectively for employment." Member Lugo proposed "clients will become competitive for placement and employment" or "clients will compete or find employment or be placed in jobs." Member Pantoja highlighted the importance of the term "eligible" to convey the goal without guaranteeing a job. Member Pantoja recommended the amendment: "Clients are eligible for employment after completion of services." Member Courtney emphasized the dual aspects of eligibility and placement, suggesting including both to address DHR and real-world needs.

Member Chicuata suggested framing the goal more broadly, proposing "clients obtain employment after completion" as the goal. Director Floyd-Rodriguez agreed, suggesting the phrase: "clients are eligible and competitive for employment after completion of services, with the goal to be placed in permanent employment." Member Ma suggested amending the phrase to "clients are eligible and competitive for employment after completion of services, with the goal to attain permanent employment."

Chair Nim requested a motion to amend Goal 2, bullet point stated as, "Clients are placed into employment after completion of services." Director Houston stated the amendment: "Clients are eligible and competitive for employment after completion of services with the goal to obtain employment." Member Lugo made the motion which was seconded by Member Pantoja. The motion passed unanimously.

Director Kim solicited additional comments from CCWA members.

Director Floyd-Rodriguez proposed adding language to address Member Jackson's concerns about potentially adversely affecting vulnerable populations. Member Jackson expressed satisfaction with the content as written.

Member Chicuata suggested under Goal 2, emphasizing the need to recognize existing policies that may need to be addressed or new policies to uplift to the Board of Supervisors and Mayor's Office. Director Houston proposed addressing this within Goal 1's focus on coordination with existing policies and plans. Member Chicuata highlighted that the current wording did not fully capture their intent. Ms. Hand suggested looking at Goal 5, particularly Outcome 5.2, which focuses on enabling data sharing for better coordination between workforce and other systems, where the inclusion of policy considerations could fit, and perhaps adding an action to that section. Member Chicuata reiterated the request for the explicit mention of policies.

Member Chicuata suggested amending the Goal 5 impact measure to "strategic alignment or summary of how strategic plans, policies, and services work together."

Member Poole raised the importance of considering unintended consequences of policies, echoing Member Chicuata's position. Director Houston suggested that addressing unintended consequences is implicit in discussions about policy alignment. Member Chicuata agreed with Director Houston's perspective.

Chair Nim requested a motion to amend Goal 5, second bullet point to: "Strategic alignment or summary of how strategic plans, policies, and services work together." Member Poole made the

motion which was seconded by Member Bush. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Nim solicited additional comments from CCWA members.

Member Poole asked about the interaction between Goals 2 and 3, emphasizing the need for a clear connection and coordination to avoid duplication of efforts and conversations. Ms. Hand clarified that Goal 2 focuses on developing an equitable strategy for vulnerable populations, while Goal 3 addresses investment in workforce development across various life stages and highlighted the importance of integrating discussions on vulnerable populations into the broader workforce development framework. Member Lugo emphasized the interconnectedness of all Goals and indicated that the working groups have responsibility to eliminate duplication and address different ideas in the larger Committee.

Chair Nim requested a motion to adopt the FY 24-29 Citywide Workforce Development Plan with the two amendments made during the meeting. Member Pantoja made the motion which was seconded by Member Courtney. The motion passed unanimously.

Chair Nim expressed gratitude for the valuable comments, changes, and amendments made to the plan, highlighting the ongoing process of innovation and adaptation through the working groups to better serve the community.

Ms. Hand outlined the next steps, including finalizing the Plan's editing and graphic design, with a deadline for topical edits by the end of May. The final product will be submitted to the Board of Supervisors by the end of June.

Ms. Hand proposed initiating working groups in June, with the goal of presenting project management plans and preliminary discussions at the July meeting.

Ms. Hand facilitated the process of identifying leaders for each group. Director Houston emphasized that multiple individuals could lead or co-lead specific areas of focus, and OEWD staff would support the working groups. Members self-selected into leadership roles as follows:

Group 1: Coordination of Partners' Plans and Priorities

- Northern California District Council of Laborers
- Hospitality House
- Human Services Agency of San Francisco (HSA)
- Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD)

Group 2: Equitably Invest in Workforce Programs for our Most Vulnerable

- Bay Area Community Resources
- Homelessness and Supportive Housing (HSH)

Group 3: Invest in Workforce Development Across the Life Course

- Self-Help for the Elderly
- Bay Area Community Resources
- Human Rights Commission (HRC)
- Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (DCYF)

Group 4: Enhance Apprenticeship & Pre-Apprenticeship Programs that Lead to Careers

- Northern California District Council of Laborers
- San Francisco Building and Construction Trades Council
- Department of Human Resources (DHR)
- San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (PUC)
- Department of Public Works (DPW)

Group 5: Enable Data-Sharing for Better Coordination Between Workforce & Other Systems

- Department of Children, Youth and Their Families (DCYF)
- Human Services Agency (HSA)
- Human Rights Commission (HRC)
- Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD)

Ms. Hand addressed the achievability of the timelines, suggesting that this could be a topic for discussion within the working groups. Communications regarding joining the working groups would be forthcoming, with leads being contacted first before extending invitations to others.

Opportunities for Partnership and Collaboration *(Discussion Item)*

Member Ma provided an update on the City Hall Career Center, noting its success in serving 216 unique clients over six weeks, with 45 repeat clients. The center assists both job seekers and current City employees with career development. Member Ma encouraged promoting the Career Center and offered partnerships for organizing group sessions. Member Barajas shared positive community feedback about the Career Center, emphasizing its accessibility and effectiveness.

Member Chicuata shared information about an initiative to establish an HBCU satellite in San Francisco. This initiative emerged from public engagement around the Dream Keeper Initiative and the reparations process. Historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs) were established primarily in the southern and northeastern United States to serve Black students. The San Francisco initiative aims to host HBCU and local students and provide internships in City positions and private employment. Member Chicuata invited interested parties to learn more about the initiative and to consider hosting a student.

Member Jackson announced that Hospitality House will be hosting their annual Career Connect Job Fair at the San Francisco Public Library in July. More details will be provided.

Director Floyd-Rodriguez highlighted the effectiveness of hiring events as a means of partnership and announced the third annual Hospitality and Small Business Hiring Fair, scheduled for next week on May 1st at the Ferry Building. The event, held in honor of May Day, is organized in collaboration with various community partners, including Self-Help for the Elderly, Mission Hiring Hall, Hotel Council San Francisco, and the Golden Gate Restaurant Association. Director Floyd-Rodriguez encouraged attendees to participate and noted the success of past events, emphasizing the opportunity for immediate employment.

Chair Nim mentioned the recent opening of the Ikea Food Court, Saluhall, where 26 participants were hired, emphasizing the diverse job opportunities available beyond traditional roles.

Member Courtney shared an update on the labor unions' recent agreements with the City, highlighting the ratification of a new agreement. One significant aspect of this agreement is that the 9916 classifications will now have a minimum pay rate of \$25 per hour plus benefits, marking an improvement for pre-apprenticeship positions. Member Courtney credited the Department of Human Resources for their role in this achievement. Additionally, Member Courtney mentioned the establishment of a citywide pre-apprenticeship committee through ApprenticeshipSF, with participation from various departments such as the Department of Public Works and the Recreation and Parks Department. Member Courtney expressed optimism about further involvement from other departments and joint efforts to apply for grants to support the program.

Public Comment Chair Nim opened the meeting for public comment on any agenda or non-agenda items.

on Non-Agenda

Items (Discussion Item) Seeing none, Secretary Seals-Jackson provided guidance on the public comment process. Seeing none, Chair Nim closed public comment.

Adjournment (Action Item)

Chair Nim expressed heartfelt gratitude to Glenn Eagleson for his service to the City and his impactful contributions to the workforce system. Chair Nim highlighted Glenn's mentorship and the significant impact he has made on many individuals within the community and the workforce system. Other members, including Member Su and Member Barajas, also expressed their appreciation for Glenn's leadership, innovation, and mentorship over the years. They acknowledged his role in paving the way for youth workforce development and his contributions nationally. The members expressed gratitude for Glenn's dedication and wished him well in his future endeavors.

Chair Nim thanked Members and the public for attending and reminded members that the next meeting would be on Wednesday, July 31 at 9 A.M. in the Green Room.

Chair Nim called for a motion to adjourn. Member Su offered a motion to adjourn which was seconded by Member Pantoja. The vote was unanimous, and the meeting adjourned at 10:49 A.M.

DRAFT